MAKING RIGHTS A REALITY?

Disability Rights Activists and Legal Mobilization

Lisa Vanhala
Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford
## Contents

**List of Figure and Tables**  
page xi

**Acknowledgments**  
xiii

**Abbreviations**  
xvii

1 Introduction: Legal Mobilization and Accommodating Social Movements  
   Through the Courtroom Doors  
   Understanding Legal Opportunity: Balancing Structure and Agency  
   Accommodating Social Movements: Framing Processes and Collective Identity  
   Realizing Disability Rights in Court in Canada and the United Kingdom  
   1 5 24 36

2 Rights and Political Identity in the Canadian Disability Movement  
   Introduction  
   The Emergence of a Disability Rights Consciousness  
   A Disability Rights Consciousness and the Charter of Rights and Freedoms (1982)  
   Disability Organizations and Strategic Litigation  
   Conclusions  
   48 50 57 62 105
Contents

3 Disability Equality and Opportunity in the Supreme Court of Canada 108

Introduction 108
Formulating a Substantive Approach to Equality: Laying the Foundation 111
Disability Rights Cases Reach the Court: Eve and Rodriguez 117
The Promise and Pitfalls of Proactive Disability Rights Cases: Eaton and Eldridge 121
Latimer and Auton: Losing Control of the Agenda 130
Recapturing the Agenda: The Immigration Cases and VIA Rail 136
Conclusions 144

4 Disability Organizations and the Diffusion of Rights in the United Kingdom 146

Introduction 146
The Emergence of a Disability Rights Consciousness 147
Organizations of Persons with Disabilities versus Organizations for Persons with Disabilities: The Social Model and Legal Mobilization 156
Disability Charities, the Diffusion of Meaning Frames, and Legal Action 162
The Unique Role of the Disability Rights Commission 186
Conclusions 199

5 Framing Disability Equality in the UK Courts 203

Introduction 203
Human Rights and Disability Equality in British Law 204
Early Cases: Clarifying the Meaning of Disability and Discrimination 212
Disability and the European Court of Human Rights 224
Disability and Dignity 229
The Right to Life as a Right to Die? 232
The Right to Life as a Right to Treatment: Seizing and Reframing the Issue 235
Disability and the Politics of Caregiving in the European Court of Justice 240
Conclusions 244
Contents

6 Conclusions: Litigation, Mobilization, and Social Movements 247
   Introduction 247
   The Courts, Disability, and Equality: A Cross-National Comparison 249
   Disability Rights Organizations and Strategic Litigation 252
   Explaining the Empirical Findings: The Limits of Existing Theoretical Approaches 256
   Disability Rights, Legal Mobilization Theory, and Sociological–Institutionalism 261
   Further Issues for Disability Studies, Law, and Policy 268

Bibliography 273

Index 283