## Contents

*Table of Cases*  
*Table of Legislation*

### 1. Introduction 1

### 2. Instability of ‘Remedy’ 7

#### A Introduction 7

#### B Literal and Non-Legal Meanings of Remedy 8

#### C Broad Functional Definition of Legal Remedy 9

#### D Narrow Meanings of Legal Remedy 11

1. An action or cause of action as a remedy 11
2. A substantive right as a remedy 13
   (a) Kinds of substantive rights: primary and secondary 13
   (b) Confusion as to secondary rights 15
   (c) A secondary right as a remedy 16
   (d) A primary right as a remedy 16
3. A court order as a remedy 17
   (a) An order made ‘as of right’ 17
   (b) An order given in court’s ‘strong’ discretion 18
4. Means of enforcing a court order as a remedy 18
5. Final outcome as a remedy 21

#### E Conclusion 22

### 3. Writers on ‘Remedies’ 23

#### A Introduction 23

#### B Lawson — Remedies of English Law 23

1. The work 23
2. Scope of the concept of a remedy 24
3. Taxonomy of remedies 25
4. Summary 28

#### C Burrows — Remedies for Torts and Breaches of Contract 29

1. The work 29
2. Scope of the concept of a remedy 29
3. Taxonomy of remedies 30
4. Summary 31
4. Stable Core Meaning of ‘Remedy’

A Introduction

B Stable Core Meaning of Remedy

1 Core usage of remedy

2 The nature of a court order or pronouncement

3 A note on self-help ‘remedies’

C Rejection of Various Definitions

1 Broad definition of remedy not adequate

2 Rejected narrow meanings of ‘remedy’

(a) An action or cause of action ought not to be called a remedy

(b) A secondary right ought not to be called a remedy

(c) A primary right ought not to be called a remedy

(d) Means of enforcement of a court order ought not to be called a remedy

(e) Final outcome ought not to be called a remedy

D Relationship Between Substantive Rights and Remedies

1 Line between substance and remedy

2 Fitting substantive rights, remedies, and enforcement together

3 Existence of substantive rights

4 Substantive rights before remedies or vice versa?

5 Remedies without substantive rights

6 Substantive rights without remedies

E Conclusion
5. Classification of Remedies

A Introduction 63

B Classifications of Remedies 64
   1 Most common classifications 64
   2 Received classification 65

C What is Being Classified? 65
   1 Effect of imprecise definition on taxonomy 65
   2 Definition of 'remedy' 66
   3 Foreign matter must be excluded 66

D What Criterion Operates? 67
   1 What is the criterion for the categories of compensation, restitution, and punishment? 68
   2 Are specific enforcement, coercion, and declaration goal-based categories? 70
   3 What are the criteria for the specific enforcement category? 70
   4 What is the criterion for the coercion category? 72
   5 What is the criterion for the declaration category? 74
   6 Criteria must not be mixed 75

E What Could a Disciplined Classification of Remedies Look Like? 75
   1 First principles of taxonomy 75
   2 Features of remedies and possible criteria 76
   3 The summa divisio or first level 77
   4 Lower levels of the hierarchy 81

F Conclusion 82

G Appendix 84

6. Discretion and Remedies 85

A Introduction 85

B A Closer Look at Discretion 86
   1 Definition of discretion 86
   2 Discretion and rules 86
   3 Constraints on discretion 87
   4 Reasons for discretion 87

C Discretion as to Replicative Remedies 88
   1 Introduction 88
   2 Discretion as to common law remedies 89
   3 Discretion as to equitable remedies 91
      (a) Characterized as discretion to grant or refuse the remedy 91
      (b) Characterized as discretion as to whether a 'bar' to the remedy operates 92
      (c) Downplaying the term 'discretion' in relation to equitable remedies 94
      (d) 'Discretion' to impose conditions 96

D Conclusion 97
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>D Remedial Discretion as to Transformative Remedies</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Remedial discretion distinguished from discretion as to equitable replicative remedies</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Remedial discretion distinguished from judicial development of the law</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Law-making at the institutional level (or 'rule-making')</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) 'Law'-making at the instance-specific level (or 'remedy-making')</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Conclusion</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Replicating Primary Rights: Common Law Remedies</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Introduction</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Replication of Primary Rights</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Primary rights capable of replication</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Primary rights not capable of replication</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Primary rights not replicated for policy reasons (bars)</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Replication at Common Law and in Equity</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Award of Sum Due Under a Contract</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Function of the remedy</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Effect on substantive rights</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Advantages of the remedy</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Right to the payment of an agreed sum</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Right to the payment of an unspecified sum</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement of the remedy</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Award of Restitution for Unjust Enrichment at the Expense of Another</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement of the remedy</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F Order for the Recovery of Land</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The claimant's substantive right</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The nature of the right's replication</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement of the remedy</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Replicating Primary Rights: Equitable Remedies 121

A Introduction 121

B Injunction Replicating a Primary Right 121
   1 Form of the order 122
   2 Nature of the remedy
      (a) Duration of operation 124
      (b) Function of the remedy 124
      (c) Advantages of the remedy 125
      (d) Effect on substantive rights 126
   3 Nature of the substantive right replicated
      (a) Negative primary right (prohibitory injunction)
         (i) Common law rights 128
            (a) Replication of negative contractual rights 128
            (b) Replication of negative non-contractual legal rights 129
         (ii) Equitable rights 129
            (iii) Statutory rights 129
      (b) Positive primary non-contractual right (mandatory injunction)
         (i) Common law rights 130
         (ii) Equitable rights 130
         (iii) Statutory rights 133
   4 Enforcement of the remedy 133

C Decree of Specific Performance of a Contract 134
   1 Form of the order 134
   2 Nature of the remedy
      (a) Function of the remedy 135
      (b) Advantages of the remedy 137
      (c) Effect on substantive rights 137
   3 Nature of the substantive right replicated
      (a) Right to the transfer of an asset 139
      (b) Right to the provision of a service 139
      (c) Right to the payment of money 141
      (d) Two senses of 'specific performance' 141
   4 Enforcement of the remedy 142

D Order for the Execution of a Trust and Order for a
   Common Account 142
   1 Form of the order
      (a) Order for execution of a trust 143
      (b) Order for a common account 143
   2 Nature of the remedy
      (a) Function of the remedy 144
      (b) Advantages of the remedy 144
      (c) Effect on substantive rights 145
   3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 145
   4 Enforcement of the remedy 146
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E Rectification 'Order'</th>
<th>146</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Function of the remedy</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Effect on substantive rights</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>F 'Order' for Rescission</th>
<th>148</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>9. Replicating Primary Rights: Statutory Remedies</th>
<th>153</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Introduction</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Order for the Recovery of Goods (or their Value)</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Function of the remedy</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Advantages of the remedy</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Effect on substantive rights</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement of the remedy</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Declaration of Primary Right</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the judgment</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Nature of the remedy</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Function of the remedy</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Advantages of the remedy</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Effect on substantive rights</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Nature of the substantive right replicated</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Common law rights</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Contractual rights</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Property rights usually protected by the law of tort</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Equitable rights</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(c) Statutory rights</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Enforcement of the remedy</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A Introduction</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Replication of Secondary Rights</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Award of Damages</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Form of the order</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2 Nature of the remedy 168
   (a) Function of the remedy 168
   (b) Effect on substantive rights 169
   (c) Advantages of the remedy 170
3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 170
   (a) Compensation 172
      (i) Arising from a breach of contract 172
         (a) Loss of expected enrichment 173
         (b) Loss of bargain 173
         (c) Reliance loss 174
      (ii) Arising from a tort 174
   (b) Restitution 175
      (i) Arising from a breach of contract 175
      (ii) Arising from a tort 176
   (c) Punishment 176
      (i) Arising from a tort 177
      (ii) Arising from a breach of contract 177
4 Enforcement of the remedy 177

11. Replicating Secondary Rights: Equitable Remedies 179
   A Introduction 179
   B Award of Equitable Compensation 179
      1 Form of the order 180
      2 Nature of the remedy 180
      3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 181
         (a) Beneficiary's secondary right to direct payment 181
         (b) Beneficiary's secondary right to have the trust fund restored 182
   4 Enforcement of the remedy 183
   C Orders Giving Effect to Secondary Rights to an Account 183
      1 Order for an account on the basis of wilful default 183
         (a) Form of the order 183
         (b) Nature of the remedy 183
         (c) Nature of the substantive right replicated 184
            (d) Consequential remedy (equitable compensation) 184
      2 Order for an account of profits 185
         (a) Form of the order 185
         (b) Nature of the remedy 186
         (c) Nature of substantive right replicated 186
            (i) Arising from an equitable wrong 186
            (ii) Arising from a breach of contract 187
               (d) Consequential remedy (equitable restitution) 188
      3 Enforcement of the remedies 189
D Mandatory Injunction to Undo or Prevent a Wrong 189
   1 Form of the order 189
   2 Nature of the remedy 190
   3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 191
      (a) Arising from a breach of contract 194
      (b) Arising from a tort 195
      (c) Arising from an equitable wrong 195
      (d) Arising from an infringement of an intellectual property right 195
   4 Enforcement of the remedy 196

12. Replicating Secondary Rights: Statutory Remedies 197
   A Introduction 197
   B Order for the Recovery of the Value of Goods (or the Goods Themselves) 197
      1 Form of the order 197
      2 Nature of the remedy 198
      3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 198
      4 Enforcement of the remedy 198
   C Award of Damages ‘in Addition to’ Specific Relief under Section 50 of the Supreme Court Act 199
      1 Form of the order 199
      2 Nature of the remedy 199
      3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 200
      4 Enforcement of the remedy 201
   D Declaration of a Secondary Right 201
      1 Form of the order 201
      2 Nature of the remedy 201
      3 Nature of the substantive right replicated 201
         (a) Arising from a breach of contract 201
         (b) Arising from an equitable wrong 201
      4 Enforcement of the remedy 202

13. Transformative Remedies 203
   A Introduction 203
      1 Distinction between constitutive and immediately enforceable remedies 204
      2 Example of statutory power to grant transformative remedies 205
      3 Discretion and transformative remedies 206
   B Statutory Transformative Remedies 207
      1 Constitutive remedies 207
         (a) Jurisdiction to grant the remedy 207
         (b) Form of the ‘order’ 208
2 Enforceable transformative remedies 210
(a) Jurisdiction to grant the remedy 210
(b) Form of the order 213
C Equitable Transformative Remedies 214
1 Constitutive remedies 214
(a) Jurisdiction to grant the remedy 214
(b) Form of the order 216
2 Enforceable transformative remedies 216
D Common Law Transformative Remedies 217
E Enforcement of Transformative Remedies 217
1 Constitutive remedies 217
2 Enforceable transformative remedies 217

14. Conclusion 219

Bibliography 225
Index 231