DEVELOPMENT AS A HUMAN RIGHT

Legal, Political and Economic Dimensions

2nd edition

Editors
Bård A. ANDREASSEN
Stephen P. MARKS
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS** ........................................... v

**FOREWORD TO THE SECOND EDITION** ........................ vii

**FOREWORD TO THE FIRST EDITION** ........................ ix

**INTRODUCTION** ............................................... xxiii

**PART I**

**CONCEPTUAL UNDERPINNINGS** ............................... 1

**CHAPTER 1**

**HUMAN RIGHTS AND DEVELOPMENT**

Amartya Sen ......................................................... 3

1. Doubts: General and Specific ................................ 3
2. What Are Human Rights? ...................................... 5
3. Consequent Legislation and the World Beyond ............ 6
4. Development, Justiciability, and Feasibility .............. 8
5. Conclusion ..................................................... 9

**CHAPTER 2**

**THE HUMAN RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT**

Arjun Sengupta .................................................... 13

1. Introduction .................................................... 13
2. Definition of the Right to Development .................... 15
3. The Process of Development ................................ 23
4. Economic Growth .............................................. 24
5. Recognition of the Right to Development in International Law ........................................ 26
6. Rights and Obligations ........................................ 29
   6.1. Human Rights as Rights................................ 33
7. The Rights-Holder as Individual and as Group ............ 34
8. The Notion of Meta-Rights and Basic Rights ............. 36
9. Implementing the Right to Development ................... 38
CHAPTER 3
THE IMPLICATIONS AND VALUE ADDED OF A HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH
Jakob Kirkemann Boesen and Hans-Otto Sano 45

1. Introduction 45
2. Background 47
3. Defining Human Rights-Based Approaches 50
   3.1. The Scope of Rights-Based Development 53
   3.2. Justifying Human Rights-Based Approaches in Development 54
4. Implementation of Human Rights Principles 57
   4.1. The Relationship Between Concepts and Operationalization 57
   4.2. Common Principles of Human Rights-Based Approaches 58
   4.3. Universality and Inalienability 58
   4.4. Indivisibility, Interdependence and Interrelatedness 60
   4.5. Accountability and the Rule of Law 61
   4.6. Participation and Inclusion 62
   4.7. Equality and Non-Discrimination 63
5. Operationalizing Human Rights-Based Approaches 63
   5.1. Implications and Assumptions 65
6. Conclusions 68

PART II
DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES 71

CHAPTER 4
OBLIGATIONS TO IMPLEMENT THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT:
PHILOSOPHICAL, POLITICAL, AND LEGAL RATIONALES
Stephen P. Marks 73

1. Philosophical Rationale 74
2. Political Rationale 85
3. Legal Rationale 90
4. Conclusion 98
CHAPTER 5
THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT AND ITS CORRESPONDING OBLIGATIONS
David Beetham

1. Definition of the Right to Development .............................. 101
2. Inflationary Tendencies in the Concept .............................. 104
3. Obligations Not to Damage or Harm .................................. 107
   3.1. Trade .................................................................. 111
   3.2. Finance .................................................................. 111
   3.3. The Environment .................................................... 112
4. National Priorities and International Obligations .................... 113
5. Infringements of the Right to Development by Domestic Governments ....................................................... 118
6. Conclusion ................................................................. 119

CHAPTER 6
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS OBLIGATIONS IN CONTEXT: STRUCTURAL OBSTACLES AND THE DEMANDS OF GLOBAL JUSTICE
Margot E. Salomon

1. Global Structural Obstacles and the International Law of Human Rights ................................................................. 122
2. Collective Duties of International Cooperation and the Right to Development ............................................................. 126
3. Collective Obligations of International Cooperation and the Position of Treaty-Bodies ...................................................... 129
4. The Demands of Global Justice: International Obligations Revisited .......................................................... 140
   4.1. Due Diligence and the Undifferentiated International Community ................................................................. 142
   4.2. Power, Authority or Control and the Parameters of International Cooperation ......................................................... 143
   4.3. International Obligations to Remedy and to Prevent Human Rights Violations ................................................. 144
5. Conclusion .................................................................... 146
### CHAPTER 7
**DEVELOPMENT AND THE HUMAN RIGHTS RESPONSIBILITIES OF NON-STATE ACTORS**

Bård A. ANDREASSEN ............................................. 149

1. **The Salience of Non-State Actors** .................................. 149
2. **Counter Arguments** ............................................. 152
3. **Non-State Actors, Obligations, and the Right to Development** ... 154
4. **Indirect and Direct Human Rights Responsibilities of Non-State Actors** ............................................. 158
   4.1. **Indirect Responsibilities of Non-State Actors: State Responsibilities for Non-State Activities** ............................................. 159
   4.2. **Direct Obligations of Non-State Actors** ..................... 161
5. **International Initiatives for Strengthening Direct Accountability** .... 162
6. **Trends and Outstanding Issues** .................................. 169
7. **Voluntarism and the Obligation of Corporations Under International Human Rights Law** ............................................... 171
8. **The Way Forward: Non-State Actors, Responsibilities, and Development** ............................................. 172

### PART III
**NATIONAL REALITIES AND CHALLENGES** .................................. 175

### CHAPTER 8
**REDESIGNING THE STATE FOR "RIGHT DEVELOPMENT"**

Yash GHAI .......................................................... 177

1. **Introduction** .................................................. 177
2. **Importance of Constitutions** ................................... 180
3. **The Process of Constitution Making** .......................... 183
4. **Substantive Orientation of the Constitution** .................. 186
5. **The Decomposition of the Post-Colonial State?** ............. 190
6. **The Kenyan Struggle to Achieve the Right to Development Through a Constitution** ............................................... 191
   6.1. **The Reform Agenda** ...................................... 192
   6.2. **Substantive Proposals** .................................... 194
      A. **Popular Participation** ..................................... 196
      B. **Representation** .......................................... 197
      C. **The Judiciary** ........................................... 198
   6.3. **Accountability** .......................................... 199
      A. **Beyond Institutional Reform** ............................ 199
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4. The Path to Adoption</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Understanding the Obstacles</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Conclusions</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 9</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAKING A DIFFERENCE: HUMAN RIGHTS AND DEVELOPMENT - REFLECTING ON THE SOUTH AFRICAN EXPERIENCE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra Liebenberg</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Social and Economic Context</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Role of the Courts in Enforcing Socio-Economic Rights</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The Grootboom Case</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. The TAC Case</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Implementation of the Judgments</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Role of the South African Human Rights Commission</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Pro-Poor Policies and Legislation and the Role of Civil Society</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1. The Struggle Against the HIV/AIDS Epidemic</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Realizing the Right to Education</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Protection Against Evictions and Demolitions</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4. Toward Universal Access to Social Assistance</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5. Free Basic Services</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6. Budgetary Measures</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conclusion</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER 10</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOWARDS IMPLEMENTING THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT: A FRAMEWORK FOR INDICATORS AND MONITORING METHODS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rajeev Malhotra</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Notion of a Right to Development - A Recap</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Elaboration at the Global Consultation</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Interpretation of the Independent Expert</td>
<td>251</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Approach to Implementing Human Rights</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Some Considerations for a Framework for Indicators</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A Framework for Indicators</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Quantitative and Qualitative Indicators</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Objective and Subjective Indicators</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Indicators for the Right to Development</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4. Indicators for Human Rights Principles</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5. Indicators for Substantive Human Rights</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART IV
INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND GLOBAL PROCESSES .............. 273

CHAPTER 11
HUMAN RIGHTS-BASED DEVELOPMENT IN THE AGE OF ECONOMIC GLOBALIZATION: BACKGROUND AND PROSPECTS
Asbjørn Eide ................................................................. 275

1. Visions and Commitments: Setting Out the Visions: 1941 to 1948 .... 275
1.1. Establishing Responsibility ........................................ 277
1.2. Recognizing Responsibility for the Implementation of Human Rights .................................................. 278
1.3. Duties of International Cooperation? ......................... 279

2. From Visions of Cooperation to Post-War Confrontation .............. 279
2.1. Keynesians Face Neo-Liberals in the West .................. 281
2.2. North-South and the Quest for a New International Economic Order ..................................................... 282
2.3. The Power Over Capital and Credit .............................. 285
2.4. The Debt Crisis and the Resurgence of the Neo-Liberals .... 287
2.5. The Bretton Woods Institutions at the Forefront of Development Policies .................................................. 288
2.6. The Washington Consensus ........................................ 289
2.7. WTO: Trade, but Not Necessarily Development ............. 290
2.8. Concepts of Development in the UN Discourses ............... 291
2.9. Death of the Washington Consensus? ........................... 292

3. Values and Contents of Rights-Based Development: Why Now? .... 293
3.1. The Values of Human Rights-Based Development ............ 294
3.2. Not “Value Added” but Value Change ............................ 295
3.3. Combining Outcome and Process .................................. 295
3.4. Rights and Responsibility, Not Needs and Charity ........... 296
3.5. Freedom of Self Is Linked to the Freedom of Others ......... 296

4.1. The Content and Indivisibility of the Human Rights System .. 299
4.2. Not Only Freedom from the State, but Also Freedom Through the State ................................................. 301
4.3. Responsibilities for Human Rights-Based Development .......... 301
4.4. Strategies for Rights-Based Development .......................... 303
5. Enabling and Assisting: Desirable Roles for International Actors .... 308
6. In Place of Conclusion: 11 Propositions ............................... 310
  6.1. Proposition 1: From Neglect to Rhetoric – But Not Much Rights-Based Action ............................................. 310
  6.2. Proposition 2: The Agents of Rights-Based Development – Clarification Required .............................................. 310
  6.3. Proposition 3: Distinctions Are Necessary ......................... 311
  6.4. Proposition 4: Indivisibility Should Be Maintained, but Human Rights Fundamentalism Avoided ............................. 311
  6.5. Proposition 5: Foundations in International Law Should Be Recognized and Used ................................................. 312
  6.6. Proposition 6: Strategies for Human Rights-Based Development Exist and Should Be Further Developed ..................... 312
  6.7. Proposition 7: Not Value Added, but Value Change ............... 312
  6.8. Proposition 8: Still Absent: Value Consensus ..................... 313
  6.9. Proposition 9: Testing Commitment to Human Rights-Based Development .............................................................. 313
  6.10. Proposition 10: A Human Rights-Based Development Is Desirable and Possible, but Not Yet Probable ....................... 314
  6.11. Proposition 11: Broadening an Overlapping Consensus Is Possible ............................................................................. 314

CHAPTER 12
GLOBALIZATION AND THE HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH TO DEVELOPMENT
Siddiqur Osmanii ................................................................. 315

1. Some Potential Constraints to the Human Rights Approach to Development in the Age of Globalization ................................. 316
   1.2. Fiscal Autonomy of Nation States ..................................... 319
   1.3. Winners and Losers from Structural Change ....................... 324
2. Globalization and Growth: Opportunities for the Human Rights Approach to Development ......................................................... 329
3. The Principles of the Human Rights Approach to Development ....... 332
   3.1. The Rights-Based Process of Policy Formulation ................. 333
### Table of Contents

#### 3.2. Principles Shaping the Contents of Policies Under the Human Rights Approach ........................................... 335
#### 3.3. The Human Rights Approach Towards Monitoring of Policy Implementation ................................................. 336

#### 4. Concluding Observations ................................................................. 336

#### CHAPTER 13
ADVOCATING THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT THROUGH COMPLAINT PROCEDURES UNDER HUMAN RIGHTS TREATIES
Martin Scheinin ................................................................. 339

1. Introduction ................................................................. 339
2. Experiences from Existing Mechanisms. ................................. 340
   2.1. The International Covenants of 1966 ........................................ 340
   2.2. The American Convention on Human Rights .......................... 345
   2.3. African Charter of Human and Peoples' Rights ....................... 346
   2.4. The European Convention on Human Rights .......................... 348
3. Some Conclusions. ............................................................. 351

#### CHAPTER 14
THE ROLE OF THE INTERNATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS IN A RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPMENT
Emilie E. Secker and Sigrun I. Skogly ..................................... 353

1. Introduction ................................................................. 353
2. Qualitative Characteristics of a Rights-Based Approach to Development ......................................................... 356
3. Challenges Faced by the IFIs as Separate Entities ..................... 360
4. The Process of the Right to Development Incorporated into Policies and Programs ........................................... 361
   4.1. Participation ............................................................ 361
   4.2. Information and Expression ............................................ 364
   4.3. Non-Discrimination .................................................... 365
   4.4. Accountability .......................................................... 365
5. Substantive Aspects of Human Rights Incorporated into Policies and Programs ....................................................... 367
   5.1. Health ................................................................. 367
   5.2. Food ................................................................. 368
   5.3. Access to Justice ...................................................... 369
6. Poverty Reduction Strategies .................................................... 370
7. Challenges Faced by States Members of the International Financial Institutions .................................................... 372
Table of Contents

8. Obligations Related to the Human Rights-Based Approach to the Process of Development ........................................ 374
9. Sources of International Human Rights Law Obligations ............... 375
10. State Obligations Relating to the Right to a Process of Development . . 377
11. The Merger of the Challenges for the IFIs and Their Members .... 378
12. Conclusion ......................................................................... 380

PART V
CONCLUSIONS ............................................................................. 381

CONTRIBUTORS ........................................................................... 389

INDEX .......................................................................................... 395