Contents

Table of Cases xxiii
Preface xxv

Chapter One • Introduction to International Children's Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child 3

I. International Children's Rights as a Separate Field of Study 3
   A. Background to International Children's Rights 3
      Notes and Questions 11
   B. The Origins and Early Development of the UNCRC 11
      Notes and Questions 23
   C. Application and Implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child 23
      1. UNCRC Committee Implementation 23
         Notes and Questions 29
      2. Examples from Country Reports, NGO Alternative Reports, and Concluding Observations by the Committee on the Rights of the Child 30
         Brazil State Party Report 31
         Report of Civil Society on the Situation of the Rights of the Child and the Adolescent in Brazil 32
         United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child [CRC], Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child 34
         Kenya State Party Report 34
Korea State Party Report 40
United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child [CRC], Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child 43
India State Party Report 44
The Status of Children in India 45
United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child [CRC], Concluding Observation of the Committee on the Rights of the Child 47
Notes and Questions 47
D. Beyond the Committee on the Rights of the Child: How Individual States Approach UNCRC Implementation 48
1. National judicial application 48
Notes and Questions 55
2. Case Study on Integrating CRC Principles into a National Constitutional Order 55
Notes and Questions 59
3. National Reservations to the UNCRC 60
United Nations Treaty Collection 60
Notes and Questions 63
II. Critical Perspectives on the UNCRC 64
A. The UNCRC and the Developing World: Is There a “Universal Child”? 65
Vanessa Pupavac, The Infantilization of the South and the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child 65
Eva Brems, Children’s Rights and Universality 69
Notes and Questions 75
Problem for Discussion 76
Child Marriage 76
Early Marriage Child Spouses 76
Elizabeth Warner, Behind the Wedding Veil: Child Marriage as a Form of Trafficking in Girls 79
FGM 80
Female Genital Mutilation/Cutting: A Statistical Exploration 80
Questions for Discussion 83
B. The UNCRC As a “Mythic” Document 84
David M. Smolin, A Tale of Two Treaties: Furthering Social Justice Through the Redemptive Myths of Childhood 84
Notes and Questions 88
C. The UNCRC and American Ratification: Will It Ever Happen? 89
1. The Anti-Ratification Position 89
## CONTENTS


Notes and Questions 98


Notes and Questions 100

2. Advocates for U.S. Ratification 101


Notes and Questions 105

Tamar Ezer, *A Positive Right to Protection for Children* 106

Notes and Questions 110


A. Conflicting Assessments of Effectiveness 111


Notes and Questions 113

UNICEF, *Convention on the Rights of the Child: Setbacks and Successes* 113


Notes and Questions 120

The Human Rights Watch assessment of the UNCRC at Ten 120


Notes and Questions 127

B. Children's Lives versus Children's Rights? 127


Notes and Questions 129

IV. Critical Perspectives on the United Nations Human Rights Regime 130

A. Improving the Human Rights System 130

The UN Human Rights Regime: Is It Effective? 130

Hilary Charlesworth, *Not Waving but Drowning: Gender Mainstreaming and Human Rights in the United Nations* 133

Notes and Questions 136

B. The UNCRC and Its Ultimate Paradox: Reconciling Protection and Liberation 136

Michael Freeman, *Beyond Conventions — Towards Empowerment* 137

Notes and Questions 141

Chapter Two  •  Child Labor: The Children's Rights Dimension 143

I. The Child Labor Debate: Prevention, Empowerment, and “Worst Forms” 143


Notes and Questions 152

Bozena Maria Celek, *The International Response to Child Labor in the Developing World: Why Are We Ineffective?* 153
Notes and Questions 157
Notes and Questions 162
Notes and Questions 166
II. International Labor Organization Standards 166
A. Overview of the ILO 166
Matteo Borzaga, *Accommodating Differences: Discrimination and Equality at Work in International Labor Law* 167
Notes and Questions 172
Notes and Questions 175
B. The Recent Emphasis on Worst Forms of Child Labor 176
Mary Gray Davidson, *The International Labour Organization’s Latest Campaign to End Child Labour: Will It Succeed Where Others Have Failed?* 179
Notes and Questions 183
III. Case Studies in Worst Forms of Child Labor 184
A. Bonded Labor in South Asia: A Tradition of Child Slavery 184
India and Bonded Child Labor 185
Human Rights Watch, *Small Hands of Slavery: Bonded Child Labor in India* 185
Notes and Questions 192
Notes and Questions 197
Ranjan K. Aharwal, *The Barefoot Lawyers: Prosecuting Child Labour in the Supreme Court of India* 197
Notes and Questions 201
Amelia Gentleman, *Indian Ban on Child Labor: Who Will Clean the Houses?* 202
Notes and Questions 204
Aine Smith, *Child Labor: The Pakistani Effort to End a Scourge upon Humanity — Is It Enough?* 204
Notes and Questions 208
B. Child Labor in Its Worst Forms in Ecuador’s Banana Sector 209
Human Rights Watch, *Tainted Harvest: Child Labor and Obstacles to Organizing on Ecuador’s Banana Plantations* 209
Human Rights Watch, *Tainted Harvest: Child Labor and Obstacles to Organizing on Ecuador’s Banana Plantations* 216
Notes and Questions 219
IV. Child Labor in the United States, Including Worst Forms 219
CONTENTS

Notes and Questions 229
Notes and Questions 236
V. Possible Remedies in the Child Labor Arena 236
A. The Alien Tort Claims Approach: A Potent Remedy for a Narrow Band of Abuses 238
Notes and Questions 243
*Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain* 246
Notes and Questions 248
United States District Court, S.D. Indiana, Indianapolis Division, John Roe I, et al., *Plaintiffs v. Bridgestone Corporation, et al., Defendants* 248
Notes and Questions 250
B. Trade-Based Strategies to Eliminate Child Labor 251
Frank Garcia & Soohyun Jun, *Trade-Based Strategies for Combatting Child Labor* 251
Notes and Questions 257
Sara Dillon, *A Deep Structure Connection: Child Labor and the World Trade Organization* 258
Notes and Questions 261
Frederick Jonassen, *A Baby-Step to Global Labor Reform: Corporate Codes of Conduct and the Child* 261
Notes and Questions 267
C. International Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC) 267
IPEC (International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour) Action Against Child Labour 268
Notes and Questions 271

Chapter Three · Children in the Sex Industry 273
I. Overview of the Exploitation of Children in the Global Sex Industry 273
A. The Generic Approach: Human Trafficking as a Unitary Phenomenon 274
Kevin Bales, *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy* 275
Notes and Questions 278
Notes and Questions 280
II. Historical and Contemporary Legal Approaches to Trafficking for Purposes of Sexual Exploitation 280
A. Background to the United Nations Trafficking Protocol 280
Kathryn E. Nelson, *Sex Trafficking and Forced Prostitution: Comprehensive New Legal Approaches* 281
Notes and Questions 285

B. On What Constitutes Trafficking 285
Abigail Schwartz, Sex Trafficking in Cambodia 285
Notes and Questions 288

C. How National Legislatures Should Respond 288
Mohamed Y. Mattar, Incorporating the Five Basic Elements of a Model Antitrafficking in Persons Legislation in Domestic Laws: From the United Nations Protocol to the European Convention 289
Notes and Questions 295
Judge Nimfa Cuesta Vilches, Trafficking of Women and Children 295
Notes and Questions 297

III. Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children: The Same Issues from a Different Conceptual Angle 298

A. Introduction to the UNCRC’s Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children 298
Amy McCoy, UN Report: Children “Playing Sex for Money”: A Brief History of the World’s Battle Against the Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children 299
Notes and Questions 301
Notes and Questions 305

B. Child Sexual Exploitation in Southeast Asia 305
Abigail Schwartz, Sex Trafficking in Cambodia 306
Notes and Questions 315
Kevin Bales, Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy 315
Human Rights Watch, A Modern Form of Slavery: Trafficking of Burmese Women and Girls into Brothels in Thailand 319
Notes and Questions 321

C. Sex Trafficking in India 321
Notes and Questions 325
Human Rights Watch, Rape for Profit: Trafficking of Nepali Girls and Women to India’s Brothels 325
Notes and Questions 334

D. Sex Trafficking in Eastern Europe 334
ECPAT European Law Enforcement Group, Joint East West Research on Trafficking in Children for Sexual Purposes in Europe: The Sending Countries 334
Notes and Questions 340

E. Sex Trafficking to and within the United States 340
Peter Landesman, The Girls Next Door 341
Notes and Questions 352

F. Legal Response to Sex Trafficking in the U.S. 352
Susan W. Tiefenbrun, Sex Slavery in the United States and the Law Enacted to Stop It Here and Abroad 352
Notes and Questions 361

IV. The U.S. Government and International Sex Trafficking 361
U.S. Department of State, 2008 Trafficking in Persons Report 362
Chapter Four · Children Living on Their Own: A Global Cohort 445


A. Defining the Problem 447

Lynn D. Wardle, Parentlessness: Adoption Problems, Paradigms, Policies, and Parameters 447

Notes and Questions 449

UNICEF, Child Protection Information Sheet: Children without Parental Care 450

Notes and Questions 451

B. Confronting the Problem: In Search of Best Practice 451

Draft UN Guidelines for the Protection and Alternative Care of Children without Parental Care 452

Notes and Questions 458

II. Children in State Care and the Intercountry Adoption Debate 458

A. Children Out of Family Care 459

1. Human Rights Watch Revelations from Orphanages in China and Russia: The 1990s 460

Human Rights Watch, Death by Default: A Policy of Fatal Neglect in China's State Orphanages 461

Notes and Questions 464
CONTENTS

1. Abandoned to the State: Cruelty and Neglect in Russian Orphanages

   Human Rights Watch, *Abandoned to the State: Cruelty and Neglect in Russian Orphanages* 465
   Notes and Questions 470

2. More Hidden Camera Revelations

   Mental Disability Rights International, *Hidden Suffering: Romania’s Segregation and Abuse of Infants and Children with Disabilities* 470
   Notes and Questions 476

3. Damaging Effects of Residential Care

   UNICEF Press Center, *Children in Residential Institutions Desperately Vulnerable to Abuse* 477

B. The Heated Debate over Intercountry Adoption: What Place Should It Have in National Child Welfare Policies?

   Kathleen Ja Sook Bergquist, *International Asian Adoption: In the Best Interest of the Child?* 480
   Notes and Questions 484

   Elizabeth Bartholet, *International Adoption: Propriety, Prospects and Pragmatics* 485
   Notes and Questions 486

   David Smolin, *Intercountry Adoption as Child Trafficking* 487
   Notes and Questions 494

   Notes and Questions 504

C. Intercountry Adoption — The Case of Romania

   Elisabeth Rosenthal, *Law Backfires, Stranding Orphans in Romania* 504
   UNICEF Romania Media Center, Letter to Prime Minister Regarding Inter-Country Adoption 507
   Notes and Questions 510

III. Sex-Selective Abortion and Abandonment of Girls

   Lesley Wexler, *Allowing Girls to Hold Up Half the Sky: Combining Norm Promotion and Economic Incentives to Combat Daughter Discrimination in China* 511
   Notes and Questions 514

   Uma Girish, *For India’s Daughters, A Dark Birthday: Infanticide and Sex-Selective Abortion Yield a More Skewed Gender Ratio* 515

   Alison Wood Manhoff, *Banned and Enforced: The Immediate Answer to a Problem without an Immediate Solution — How India Can Prevent Another Generation of “Missing Girls”* 516
   Notes and Questions 522

IV. Children Living on the Streets

   A. Setting the Scene: Introductory Articles

      Mona Pare, *Why Have Street Children Disappeared? — The Role of International Human Rights Law in Protecting Vulnerable Groups* 523
      Notes and Questions 523

   B. UN Recognition of the Problem of Street Children

      United Nations, *The Plight of Street Children* 525

   C. Street Children and International Human Rights 527
Mona Pare, Why Have Street Children Disappeared? — The Role of International Human Rights Law in Protecting Vulnerable Groups 527

Notes and Questions 537

Marc D. Seitles, Effect of the Convention on the Rights of the Child upon Street Children in Latin America: A Study of Brazil, Colombia, and Guatemala 538

Notes and Questions 544

Casa Alianza, Our Integrated Approach 544

Notes and Questions 545

D. Response of State Law Enforcement to Street Children 546

Egypt: Arbitrary Arrest and Detention 546

Human Rights Watch, Charged with Being Children: Egyptian Police Abuse of Children in Need of Protection 546

Notes and Questions 550

Vietnam: One Child’s Story 550

Human Rights Watch, “Children of the Dust”: Abuses of Hanoi Street Children in Detention 550

Notes and Questions 554

V. Unaccompanied Minors — Juvenile Refugees and Asylum Seekers 554

E. Unaccompanied Minors in the United States 555

Christopher Nugent, Whose Children Are These? Towards Ensuring the Best Interests and Empowerment of Unaccompanied Alien Children 555

Notes and Questions 561

F. Unaccompanied Minors in Spain: A Case Study 562

Human Rights Watch, Nowhere to Turn: State Abuses of Unaccompanied Migrant Children by Spain and Morocco 563

Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child: Spain 572

Notes and Questions 573

Chapter Five • Children and Punishment 575

I. Introduction to Children and Punishment: The Anti-Corporal Punishment Movement and Juvenile Justice Issues 575

II. The Anti-Corporal Punishment Movement 577

A. Whether to Ban the Practice of Physical Punishment 577

Deana Pollard, Banning Corporal Punishment 578

David Benatar, Corporal Punishment 585

Notes and Questions 589

B. Europeans Out in Front on Banning Corporal Punishment 590

Europe-Wide Ban on Corporal Punishment of Children 590

Notes and Questions 596

C. Creating a European Consensus against Physical Punishment 596

Portugal: Condemned for Tolerating Violence against Children 597

Notes and Questions 598

Global Initiative to End All Corporal Punishment of Children 598

Notes and Questions 603

D. Ending Corporal Punishment by Judicial Decision: Israel and the Plonit Case 604

Tamar Ezer, Children’s Rights In Israel: An End to Corporal Punishment? 604
Notes and Questions 607

E. The Argument for a U.S. Anti-Spanking Statute 607
Notes and Questions 612

III. Corporal Punishment in the Educational Context: Physical Discipline in Schools 612
A. Corporal Punishment in U.S. Schools 612
Notes and Questions 618

B. Contrasting Judicial Views of Punishment and the Educational System: The United States and South Africa 619
*Ingraham v. Wright* 619
*Christian Education South Africa v. Minister of Education* 623
Notes and Questions 632

C. Changing an Educational Culture: The Case of Kenya 633
Human Rights Watch, *Spare the Child: Corporal Punishment in Kenyan Schools* 633
Notes and Questions 637

D. The State and the Family: From Non-Intervention to Absolute Bans on Corporal Punishment 638
Notes and Questions 648

IV. Juvenile Justice — Children in Conflict with the Law 649
A. International Principles and Social Realities 649
Geraldine Van Bueren, *A Curious Case of Isolationism: America and International Child Criminal Justice* 650
Notes and Questions 656

B. The Reality of Juvenile Justice Standards 657
Anthony N. Doob and Michael Tonry, *Varieties of Youth Justice* 657
Notes and Questions 662
Erika Rickard, *Paying Lip Service to the Silenced: Juvenile Justice in India* 663
Notes and Questions 667
Matthew Solis, et al., *International Legal Updates* 668
Human Rights Watch, *In the Dark: Hidden Abuses against Detained Youths in Rio de Janeiro* 669

C. The Death Penalty for Juveniles 671
*Roper v. Simmons* 671
Notes and Questions 680
Amnesty International, *Philippines: Something Hanging Over Me — Child Offenders under Sentence of Death* 681
Notes and Questions 684

D. From Punishment to Child Rights: The Case of South Africa 684
Notes and Questions 692
Chapter Six • Children and Armed Conflict  

I. The Machel Report and Its Fallout — An Introduction to Children and Armed Conflict  
   A. Machel and Her Report  
      Graça Machel, *Impact of Armed Conflict on Children*  
      Notes and Questions  
   B. Aftermath of the Machel Report  
      Stephen Hick, *The Political Economy of War-Affected Children*  
      Notes and Questions  

II. International Laws Relating to Children and Armed Conflict  
   A. The Evolution of an International Law on Children and Armed Conflict  
      Nsongurua J. Udombana, *War Is Not Child’s Play! International Law and the Prohibition of Children’s Involvement in Armed Conflicts*  
      Notes and Questions  
   B. Culpability of the Child Soldier: Should Juveniles Ever Be Treated as War Criminals?  
      Nienke Grossman, *Rehabilitation or Revenge: Prosecuting Child Soldiers for Human Rights Violations*  
      Notes and Questions  
      Amnesty International, *Child Soldiers: Criminals or Victims?*  
      Notes and Questions  

III. Beyond the Legal Norms: Recent Global Reaction to Children and Armed Conflict  
   A. Have We Begun to Care?  
      P.W. Singer, *Talk Is Cheap: Getting Serious about Preventing Child Soldiers*  
      Notes and Questions  
      Notes and Questions  
      Press Release, Office of the Special Representative for Children and Armed Conflict, *UN Security Council Establishes First Comprehensive Monitoring and Reporting System to Protect Children Affected by Armed Conflict*  
      Notes and Questions  
      The Secretary-General, *Report of the Secretary-General on Children and Armed Conflict*  
      Notes and Questions  
   B. Machel at 10: Another Retrospective  
      Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict, *Report of the Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Children and Armed Conflict* (*“Machel 10 Year Review”*)  
      Notes and Questions  

IV. Child Soldiers in Particular Conflicts  
   A. The Case of Uganda  
      1. Background to the Tragedy  
         Hema Chatlani, *Uganda: A Nation in Crisis*  
         Human Rights Watch, *The Scars of Death: Children Abducted by the Lord’s Resistance Army in Uganda*
Notes and Questions 776

2. Legal Response to the Ugandan Conflict 776
   Press Release, International Criminal Court, Warrant of Arrest
     Unsealed against Five LRA Commanders 777
   Noah Benjamin Novogrodsky, Challenging Impunity 779
   Notes and Questions 781
   Manisuli Ssenyonjo, Accountability of Non-State Actors in Uganda
     for War Crimes and Human Rights Violations: Between
     Amnesty and the International Criminal Court 781
   Notes and Questions 789
   Maggie Alerotek, Bad Timing: ICC Justice Should Wait 789
   Notes and Questions 791
   Luis Moreno-Ocampo, Keynote Address, Integrating the Work of the
     ICC Into Local Justice Initiatives 792
   Notes and Questions 795

B. The Case of Sierra Leone 796
   1. Background to the Conflict 796
      Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Sierra Leone, Witness to
      Truth: Report of the Sierra Leone Truth and Reconciliation
      Commission 797
      Notes and Questions 799
      Human Rights Watch, Sowing Terror: Atrocities Against Civilians in
      Sierra Leone 800
      Human Rights Watch, Forgotten Children of War: Sierra Leonean
      Refugee Children in Guinea 807
      Notes and Questions 809
   2. Legal Response to the Conflict in Sierra Leone 810
      Statute of the Special Court for Sierra Leone 812
      Stephanie Bald, Searching for a Lost Childhood: Will the Special
      Court of Sierra Leone Find Justice for Its Children? 813
      Notes and Questions 814
      Press Release, Special Court for Sierra Leone, Appeals Chamber
      Rules Recruitment of Child Combatants a Crime under
      International Law 815
      Lisa Clifford & Katy Glassborow, ICC Examines Child Soldier
      Convictions 816
      Notes and Questions 818

C. The Case of Colombia 818
   1. Background and Description of the Conflict 818
      Notes and Questions 820

D. Effect of Economic Sanctions on Children 821
   Graça Machel, Impact of Armed Conflict on Children 821
   Amy Howlett, Getting “Smart”: Crafting Economic Sanctions That
   Respect All Human Rights 823
   Notes and Questions 828
   Robin Geiss, Humanitarian Safeguards in Economic Sanctions Regimes:
   A Call for Automatic Suspension Clauses, Periodic Monitoring,
   and Follow-Up Assessment of Long-Term Effects 828
   Notes and Questions 832
Chapter Seven · Enforcement of Children's Rights through Regional Human Rights Systems

I. The Emerging Role of Regional Human Rights Systems in the Enforcement of Children's Rights
   Bernardine Dohrn, *Something's Happening Here: Children and Human Rights Jurisprudence in Two International Courts* 835
   Notes and Questions 845

II. The Enforcement of Human Rights in Europe
   A. Overview of the European Human Rights System
      Dinah Shelton, *The Boundaries of Human Rights Jurisdiction in Europe* 846
      Notes and Questions 852
      Council of Europe, European Court of Human Rights 852
      Notes and Questions 855
   B. The European System as a Model for American Advocates for Children's Rights
      Tania Schriwer, *Establishing an Affirmative Governmental Duty to Protect Children's Rights: The European Court of Human Rights as a Model for the United States Supreme Court* 855
      Notes and Questions 860
   C. The European Human Rights System and the UNCRC
      Notes and Questions 866
   D. The European System in Focus
      Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
      *Marckx v. Belgium* 868
      Notes and Questions 873
      *Johnston v. Ireland* 874
      Notes and Questions 885
      *Pini and Bertani and Manera and Atripaldi v. Romania* 886
      Notes and Questions 897
      *Odièvre v. France* 898
      Notes and Questions 907

III. The Inter-American Human Rights Systems
   A. Overview of Regional Human Rights in Latin America
      Víctor Rodríguez Rescia & Marc David Seitles, *The Development of the Inter-American Human Rights System: A Historical Perspective and a Modern-Day Critique* 909
      Notes and Questions 918
      Christina M. Cerna, *The Inter-American System for the Protection of Human Rights* 918
      Notes and Questions 923
   B. The Inter-American System in Focus
      Organization of American States, American Convention on Human Rights
      Ann Birch, *State of Guatemala Condemned in Historic Court Case Case of the “Street Children” (Villagrán-Morales et al.) v. Guatemala* 923
Notes and Questions 942
Jennifer Bol, Using International Law to Fight Child Labor: A Case Study of Guatemala and the Inter-American System 943
Israel de Jesús Butler, The Rights of the Child in the Case Law of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights: Recent Cases 949
Notes and Questions 957

IV. The African Human Rights System 957
A. Overview of the African Human Rights System 957
Notes and Questions 966
Vincent O. Nmehielle, Development of the African Human Rights System in the Last Decade 966
Notes and Questions 967

B. The African System in Focus 967
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child 967
Notes and Questions 973

Index 975

Appendices
(The appendices are contained in an Adobe Acrobat PDF file on the included CD. The Acrobat Reader program can be downloaded for free at http://www.adobe.com.)

Appendix to Chapter One  •  Introduction to International Children's Rights and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child A1
Declaration of the Rights of the Child A1

Appendix to Chapter Two  •  Child Labor: The Children's Rights Dimension A20
Convention Concerning Minimum Age for Admission to Employment (ILO No. 138) A20
R 146 Recommendation concerning Minimum Age for Admission to Employment (June 26, 1973) A26
Convention Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (ILO No. 182) A30
R 190 Recommendation Concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour, June 17, 1999 A33
International Labour Organization, ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work A37

Appendix to Chapter Three  •  Children in the Sex Industry A41