Regulating Health and Environmental Risks under WTO Law

A Critical Analysis of the SPS Agreement

LUKASZ GRUSZCZYNSKI

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
## Contents

### List of Abbreviations

xvii

### Table of Cases

xix

**Introduction**

1. Introduction 1

2. Objectives 3

3. Methodology 4

4. Plan of the book 5

1. **Risk and Risk Regulation** 7

1.1 Introduction 7

1.2 Notion of risk 7

1.3 Measurement of risk, scientific developments, and social change 14

1.4 Risk as a subject of regulation 16

1.4.1 Risk regulation in the historical context 17

1.4.2 Contemporary regulatory approaches to risk 18

1.4.3 The concept of risk analysis 22

1.4.4 Assessment of risks and uncertainty 30

1.5 Conclusions 34

2. **The SPS Agreements within the WTO System** 35

2.1 Introduction 35

2.2 Overview of the disciplines of the SPS Agreement 38

2.2.1 Rules of treaty interpretation in the WTO jurisprudence 38

2.2.2 Substantive obligations of the SPS Agreement 40

2.2.3 Risk communication (transparency) and procedural obligations 42

2.2.4 Developing countries and the SPS Agreement 43

2.2.5 SPS Committee 44

2.2.6 Dispute settlement 47

(a) Burden of proof 49

(b) Standard of review 50

2.3 Applicability of the SPS Agreement 52

2.4 The relationship between the SPS Agreement, the TBT Agreement, and GATT 1994 63
2.4.1 The SPS and TBT Agreements 63
(a) Purpose of a measure 64
(b) Multi-purpose measures 66

2.4.2 The SPS Agreement and GATT 1994 68

2.5 Conclusions 71

3. Harmonization Disciplines of the SPS Agreement 75

3.1 Introduction 75

3.2 The concept of harmonization 76

3.3 Relevant international organizations 79
3.3.1 Codex Alimentarius Commission 82
3.3.2 World Organization for Animal Health 84
3.3.3 International Plant Protection Convention 85
3.3.4 International standard-setting bodies in practice 86

3.4 Standards, guidelines, and recommendations 88

3.5 Substantive obligations 90
3.5.1 Measures conforming to international standards 92
3.5.2 Measures based on international standards 96
3.5.3 Measures deviating from international standards 100
3.5.4 Measures that are less demanding than international standards 102

3.6 Conclusions 104


4.1 Introduction 107

4.2 Scientific principles and sufficient scientific evidence (Article 2.2) 108
4.2.1 Relationship between Articles 2.2 and 5.1 111

4.3 Scientific justification (Article 3.3) 112

4.4 Risk assessment (Article 5.1–5.3) 113
4.4.1 The substantive content of risk assessment 115
(a) What constitutes risk assessment under the SPS Agreement? 115
(b) Likelihood v Potential—Two different concepts? 116
(c) Minimum magnitude of risk 119
(d) As appropriate to the circumstances 120
(e) Specificity of risk assessment 122
(f) Risk assessment techniques of international organizations 124
(g) Science and other elements relevant for risk assessment 126
(h) Good veterinary practice 129
(i) Economic factors in risk assessment 130

4.4.2 Implementation of risk assessment results 133
(a) Objective relationship between the risk assessment and the SPS measure 134
(b) Minority scientific opinions 136
6.4.3 Implementation of SPS decisions 243
   (a) Necessity (Article 2.2) 244
   (b) Scientific disciplines and risk management
       (Articles 2.2 and 5.1) 246
   (c) Non-discrimination (Article 2.3) 246
   (d) Least-trade-restrictive alternative (Article 5.6) 248
   (e) Regionalization (Article 6) 251
   (f) Equivalence (Article 4) 262

6.4.4 Monitoring and review 268

6.5 Conclusions 269

7. Concluding Remarks 271
   7.1 SPS Agreement—An appropriate tool for management
       of SPS disputes? 271
   7.2 Recommendations 274
   7.3 Consistency of the SPS jurisprudence 277
   7.4 Interpreting the uninterpreted 279
   7.5 A final word 282

Bibliography 283
Index 297