Immigration Detention and Human Rights

Rethinking Territorial Sovereignty

By

Galina Cornelisse
Contents

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ xi
Abbreviations .................................................................................................................. xiii

Chapter 1 Introduction: Immigration Detention in Contemporary Europe ............................. 1

1.1 Immigration Detention and Modern Constitutionalism ............................................ 1
1.2 Detention as a Tool of Immigration Control in Europe:
   An Overview .................................................................................................................. 7
   1.2.1 Detention upon Arrival .................................................................................. 8
   1.2.2 The Use of Detention within the Asylum System ......................................... 11
   1.2.3 Detention and Removal ................................................................................ 15
1.3 Immigration Detention: Current Research and Outline of this Book .......................... 22

Part I Theory

Chapter 2 Sovereignty, People and Territory ................................................................. 33

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................ 33
2.2 A Claim to Ultimate Political Power ..................................................................... 34
   2.2.1 The Development of the Modern Notion of Sovereignty ............................. 35
   2.2.2 The People as the Source of Legitimate Power .......................................... 41
2.3 A Territorial Solution to the Problem of Universality versus Particularity .......... 44
   2.3.1 Territorialisation: Changing Identities and Allegiances ......................... 46
   2.3.2 The Discovery of the Nation: Inconsistent Universalism? ...................... 49
   2.3.3 National Identity as the Basis for Territorial Sovereignty ........................ 55
2.4 On Sovereignty's Content and Form, and the (Il)Legitimacy of Violence .............. 59
Chapter 3 Limiting Sovereign Power

3.1 Introduction

3.2 Constitutionalism as the Theory and Practice of the Limits on Political Power
   3.2.1 Formal Limits on Government and Rules of Institutional Design
   3.2.2 Individual Rights as Material Limits to Political Power
   3.2.3 A Brief Note on Constitutionalism's Limits

3.3 Citizenship, Individual Rights, and Territory
   3.3.1 Citizenship: An Apparent Paradox?
   3.3.2 National Citizenship as a Condition for Access to Universal Rights
   3.3.3 Citizenship's Structuring Role in a Global Territorial Structure

3.4 International Law and Violence
   3.4.1 The Sovereign State as the True and Only Subject of International Law
   3.4.2 Types of Violence Regulated by Classical International Law
   3.4.3 International Human Rights Law

3.5 Human Rights: Closing the Gap between Us and Them/Inside and Outside?
   3.5.1 'Us' and 'Them' within the Contemporary State: Post-national Citizenship
   3.5.2 Human Rights and Sovereignty's Territorial Claims

3.6 Conclusions: A Particularistic Universalism?

Part II Doctrine and Practice

Chapter 4 Freedom of Movement I: The Right to Leave as a Human Right

4.1 Introduction

4.2 Development of the Right to Emigrate

4.3 General Legal Framework of the Right to Leave

4.4 The Right to Leave in the Context of Immigration Control
4.5 On the Right to Leave and the Visibility of the Content of Sovereignty

Chapter 5 Freedom of Movement II: Decisions on Entry as a Sovereign Prerogative?

5.1 Introduction
5.2 Development of a Sovereign Right to Exclude
5.3 The Right to Enter and Remain in International Law
   5.3.1 General Limitations on the Sovereign Right to Exclude
   5.3.2 Refugee Law and the Prohibition of Non-refoulement
   5.3.3 Family Life and Limits on Immigration Control
5.4 Immigration into and within the EU: The Obduracy of the National Border?
   5.4.1 Freedom of Movement within an Area without Internal Borders
   5.4.2 The External Border: The Common Immigration and Asylum Policy
5.5 Free Movement: Territoriality Shapes the Relation between State Power and Rights
   5.5.1 Territoriality and Limitations on the State's Exclusionary Powers
   5.5.2 Territoriality and the Asymmetry of International Movement

Chapter 6 Reaffirming Sovereignty and Reproducing Territoriality: Deportation and Detention

6.1 Introduction
6.2 Deportation as Administrative Practice
6.3 Immigration Detention, State Power, and Territoriality
6.4 Maintaining the Territorial Order

Chapter 7 International Human Rights Law on Immigration Detention

7.1 Introduction
7.2 The Human Right to Personal Liberty: A Prohibition on Arbitrary Detention
7.2.1 The Prohibition on Arbitrariness in Article 9 ICCPR .................................................................................................................. 251
7.2.2 Article 9 ICCPR and Procedural Guarantees for Immigration Detainees ............................................................................. 256
7.2.3 Conditions of Immigration Detention: An Indication of Arbitrariness? .................................................................................. 259
7.3 Human Rights and the Detention of Refugees and Asylum Seekers ............................................................................................ 261
7.4 Regional Discourse: The Council of Europe and Immigration Detention ..................................................................................... 265
7.5 Emerging EC Law on the Detention of Immigrants and Asylum Seekers .................................................................................... 268
7.6 The Right to Personal Liberty vs. Territorial Sovereignty ............................................................................................................. 272

Chapter 8 The ECtHR: Detention as a ‘Necessary Adjunct’ to an ‘Undeniable Sovereign Right’? ............................................................... 277

8.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................................................................................... 277
8.2 Immigration Detention and the Right to Personal Liberty in the ECHR .......................................................................................... 278
8.2.1 The Immigration Context: Deprivations or Restrictions upon Liberty? ..................................................................................... 280
8.2.2 ‘Lawful’ Detention in ‘Accordance with a Procedure Prescribed by Law’ .................................................................................. 282
8.3 Procedural Safeguards against Arbitrary Detention .......................................................................................................................... 285
8.3.1 The Right to be Informed of the Reasons for Detention ............................................................................................................. 286
8.3.2 Habeas Corpus or the Right to Challenge the Lawfulness of Detention ...................................................................................... 287
8.3.3 Compensation for Unlawful Deprivations of Liberty ...................................................................................................................... 290
8.4 The Notion of Arbitrariness in the Strasbourg Case Law on Immigration Detention ............................................................................. 290
8.4.1 Chahal and Saadi: Unnecessary and Disproportionate, but Lawful Detention ............................................................................ 291
8.4.2 Immigration Detention and the ECtHR: Proportionality ‘Lite’? ................................................................................................. 296
8.5 How to Reconcile the Human Right to Liberty with the Public Interest? .......................................................................................... 300
8.5.1 The Proportionality Principle as a General Principle in the ECHR .................................................. 301
8.5.2 Detention of Persons who are Mentally Ill, Alcoholics and Vagrants ............................................. 305
8.6 Immigration Detention as the Blind Spot of the ECtHR? ................................................................. 308

Part III Conclusions

Chapter 9 Destabilising Territorial Sovereignty through Human Rights Litigation in Immigration Detention Cases ........................................ 315

9.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 315
9.2 Territorial Sovereignty as an Institution: The Shaping of Norms and Practices .................................. 316
  9.2.1 Nationalism as Social Practice and the Reification of Territorial Sovereignty ................................ 317
  9.2.2 The Territorial Limitations of Modern Constitutionalism .......................................................... 320
  9.2.3 Constitutionalism's Limits Exemplified: The Legal Regulation of Human Movement .................. 322
9.3 Territorial Sovereignty as an Institution with Ontological Significance and Immigration Detention as the Litmus Test for the Modern Territorial Order ......................................................... 326
9.4 Destabilising Territorial Sovereignty through Human Rights Law ...................................................... 332
  9.4.1 The Restrained but Radical Potential of Human Rights ............................................................. 332
  9.4.2 Human Rights as Destabilisation Rights: Towards Territoriality 'Lite'? ...................................... 335
9.5 Conclusions ........................................................................................................................................ 341

Bibliography ......................................................................................................................................... 345
Table of Cases ..................................................................................................................................... 369
Index ..................................................................................................................................................... 379