Cultural Law

INTERNATIONAL, COMPARATIVE, AND INDIGENOUS

James A. R. Nafziger
Thomas B. Stoel Professor of Law
Willamette University

Robert Kirkwood Paterson
Professor of Law
University of British Columbia

Alison Dundes Renteln
Professor of Political Science and Anthropology
University of Southern California
Contents

PREFACE ............................................................................................................ page xxiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ....................................................................................... xxvii

1. CULTURAL LAW: AN INTRODUCTION ....................................................... 1
   A. The Cultural Dimension of the Legal Process ............................................. 1
      1. Dispute Resolution amid Cultural Diversity ........................................... 1
          Yahoo!, Inc. v. La Ligue Contre Le Racisme et L'Antisemitisme ............... 1
          Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 7
          Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 11
   2. Legal Discourse ............................................................................................ 12
      a. International Business Transactions ....................................................... 12
          DANIEL C.K. CHOW & THOMAS J. SCHOENBAUM, INTERNATIONAL
          BUSINESS TRANSACTIONS: PROBLEMS, CASES, AND MATERIALS
          11–13 (2005) ............................................................................................... 12
          Richard W. Downing, Comment, The Continuing Power of Cultural
          Tradition and Socialist Ideology: Cross-Cultural Negotiations
          RESOL. 105, 125–29 .............................................................................. 14
          Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 17
      b. Diplomacy .................................................................................................. 18
          RAYMOND COHEN, NEGOTIATING ACROSS CULTURES:
          INTERNATIONAL COMMUNICATION IN AN INTERDEPENDENT
          WORLD 215–18, 222–26 (1997) ............................................................... 19
          Notes and Questions .................................................................................. 23
   3. Cultural Identity Paradigms ......................................................................... 24
      Jacinta O'Hagan, Conflict, Convergence, or Coexistence? The
      Relevance of Culture in Reframing World Order, in REFRAMING THE
      INTERNATIONAL: LAW, CULTURE, POLITICS 187–88, 198–210
      Notes ............................................................................................................. 35
B. Cultural-Legal Interaction

1. Legal Protection of Cultural Values

   Lyng v. Northwest Indian Cemetery Protective Association
   Church of the Lukumi Babalu Aye, Inc. and Ernesto Pichardo v. City of Hialeah
   Notes and Questions

2. Cultural Relativism and Universalism in the Legal Process

   JACQUELINE NOLAN-HALEY, HAROLD ABRAMSON & PAT K. CHEW,
   INTERNATIONAL CONFLICT RESOLUTION: CONSENSUAL ADR
   PROCESSES 78–82 (2005)
   Notes

3. The Cultural Defense
   Notes and Questions

4. Separate Legal Systems
   Note

5. Globalization of Mass Culture

   Siva Vaidhyanathan, Open Source as Culture – Culture as Open Source, in OPEN SOURCE ANNUAL 346 (2007)

C. Cultural Law

1. A Working Definition

2. Culture-Related Terminology

3. Culture as a Human Right
   a. Applicable Law
   b. Claims
      (i) Food
      Cavel International, Inc. v. Madigan
      Notes and Questions
      (ii) The Environment
      Memorandum on Distribution of Eagle Feathers for Native American Religious Purposes, WEEKLY COMP. PRES. DOC. 30 (17) (Apr. 29, 1994), at 935–37
      (iii) Disabilities
      Questions
      (iv) Family Life and Marriage
      City of Westminster Social & Community Services Department v. IC
      Aleem v. Aleem
      Notes and Questions

4. Coda: Examples of Cultural Law from the World of Music
   a. Law Embodies Culture and Formalizes Its Norms
b. Law Promotes, Protects, Conditions, and Limits Cultural Attributes and Expressions 89


c. Law Harmonizes Cross-Cultural Differences, Establishes International Standards, and Confirms Cultural Rights 94


Notes and Questions 96

d. Culture Reinforces Legal Rules 96

e. Culture Conditions and Constrains the Adoption, Interpretation, and Vitality of Legal Rules 96


f. Cultural Expressions and Symbols Promote Legal Relationships 97


Notes 98

2. Culture and the Law: The Basics 100

A. Culture 100

1. The Issues 100


2. Relativism and Incommensurability 123

Peter Winch, *Understanding a Primitive Society*, 1 Am. Phil. Q. 1, 307, 315 (1964) 124

3. Anthropological Definitions and Concepts 125

a. Early Definitions 125

Bronislaw Malinowski, *Culture, in Encyclopaedia of the Social Sciences* 621, 645 (Edwin R.A. Seligman ed., 1937) 125

b. Later Definitions: The Influence of Relativism 126

c. Postmodern Theory and Cultural Studies 127

d. The Contemporary Defense of the Concept of Culture 129


Notes and Questions 131
### Table of Contents

#### 4. Enculturation: How Culture Affects Perception and Behavior


#### B. Law

1. Jurisprudential Foundations
   a. Natural Law and Legal Positivism
      - *Streletz, Kessler and Krenz v. Germany; K.-H. W. v. Germany*
      - Notes and Questions
   b. Other Schools of Jurisprudence
      - Note

2. International Law
   a. Introduction
   b. Sources

3. Comparative Law
   a. Introduction
   b. The Common Law Tradition
   c. The Civil Law Tradition
   d. Beyond the Common Law and Civil Law Traditions
   e. The Judicial Use of Foreign Law
      - *Roper v. Simmons*
      - David G. Savage, *Scalia to Congress: Butt Out of Court’s Use of Foreign Law, L.A. Times, May 19, 2006, at 1*
      - Notes and Questions
   f. Customary Law
      - *Max Gluckman, The Judicial Process among the Barotse of Northern Rhodesia 134–41 (1955)*
      - Notes and Questions

4. Indigenous Law
   - Notes
   - *Case of the Saramaka People v. Suriname*
   - Notes and Questions
### 5. Legal Pluralism

*Werner Menski, Comparative Law in a Global Perspective: The Legal Systems of Asia and Africa* 173–74, 183–84 (2d ed. 2006) 200

*Question* 202


### 3. Cultural Heritage Law: Introduction

#### A. The Definitional Framework


*Note* 208

#### B. Individual and Nongovernmental Organization Actors

1. Private Dealers, Auction Houses, and Collectors

   *Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus v. Goldberg* 209

   *Notes and Questions* 215

2. Museums and Art Galleries

3. Anthropologists and Archaeologists

4. Indigenous and Minority Ethnic Groups

5. Artists

6. Historic Preservationists, Archivists, and Art Historians

7. Criminals and Criminal Organizations
   a. Forgers, Fakers, and Defrauders


      *Note* 226

   b. Thieves

      *Note* 227

      *Bumper Development Corp. v. Commissioner of Police for the Metropolis* 227

      *Mullick v. Mullick* 236

      *Notes and Questions* 237

   c. Grave Robbers and Other Illegal Excavators

   d. Smugglers (Illegal Export and Import)

      *William H. Honan, Rare Pre-Columbian Relics, at Any Cost, N.Y. Times, July 31, 1995, at 1* 242

      *Notes* 247

   e. War Criminals

#### C. The International Legal Framework: A Summary

*Note* 251
4. CULTURAL MATERIAL: PROTECTION AND COOPERATION .......................... 252

A. Protection ............................... 252

1. Threats to Cultural Resources ............................... 252
   a. Archaeological ............................... 252


Notes and Questions 257

b. Artistic ............................... 258

Carter v. Helmsley-Spear, Inc. 258
Notes and Question 267

Note 268

c. Architectural ............................... 269

Notes and Questions 270

d. Archival ............................... 271

Jutta Reed-Scott, Preserving Research Collections 4–6 (1999) 271

Notes and Questions 272

2. General Protections of the Cultural Heritage ............................... 273

a. United States Law ............................... 273

(i) Federal Law ............................... 274

United States v. Gerber 274

(ii) State Law ............................... 281

Whitacre v. Indiana 281

b. Canadian Law ............................... 284

Notes and Questions 287

c. Swiss Law ............................... 287

d. International Law ............................... 288


(iii) The Convention for the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972) 290

Notes and Questions 290


Notes and Questions 293
3. Protection of the Cultural Patrimony and Export Controls 297
   a. Cultural Patrimony 297
   b. Export Controls 299
      (i) International Law 299
      (ii) Regional Law 300
      (iii) Practical Problems of Implementation 300
         Notes and Questions 301
   Problem 302
   (iv) The Canadian Model 302
      Cultural Property Export and Import Act 302
   (v) The Enforcement of Export Controls 305
      (a) The Common Law of England and the United States 305
         Attorney-General of New Zealand v. Ortiz 306
         Notes 310
      (b) Enforcement under the 1970 UNESCO Convention 312
         Notes and Questions 315
4. Protection of Underwater Cultural Heritage 316
   R.M.S. Titanic v. Haver 319
   Notes and Questions 338
   Problems 344
5. Protection of Cultural Heritage in Preparation for, during, and after Armed Conflict 345
   The Stela of Matara 345
   a. The Hague Conventions of 1899 and 1907 347
   b. The Geneva Convention IV of 1949 and Protocol I to the Convention 348
   c. The 1954 Hague Convention 349
      Protocol I for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict 351
   d. Customary Humanitarian Law 351
   e. The International War Crimes Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, the International Criminal Court, and Crises in Afghanistan and Iraq 352
      Notes 353
B. Cooperation 357
   1. Amicable Settlements and Partnerships 358
      a. Indigenous Peoples and Museums 359
         (i) Canada 359
         (ii) New Zealand 361
         (iii) United States 362
b. Holocaust-Related Claimants and Possessors

M.J. BAZYLER, HOLOCAUST JUSTICE: THE BATTLE FOR
WASHINGTON CONFERENCE ON HOLOCAUST-ERA ASSETS,
PRINCIPLES WITH RESPECT TO NAZI-CONFISCATED ART (1998)
Martha Lufkin, The Increasing Role of the Market in Settling Claims,
ART NEWSPAPER, December 2008, at 8
Vineberg v. Bissonnette
Notes and Questions

2. International Agreements

Agreement between the United States and Italy
Notes and Questions

5. CULTURAL MATERIAL: RECTIFICATION, CRIMINAL JUSTICE,
AND DISPUTE RESOLUTION

A. Rectification

1. International Return and Restitution
   a. Introduction
      Note
   b. The Adversarial Model (Internationalism versus Nationalism) and the
      Common Heritage Alternative
      Shareen Blair Brysac, The Parthenon Marbles Custody Case,
      John Henry Merryman, Thinking about the Elgin Marbles, 83
      MICH. L. REV. 1881 (1985)
   Notes and Questions
   c. The UNESCO Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing
      the Illicit Import, Export, and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural
      Property (1970)
      Étienne Clement, The Aims of the 1970 UNESCO Convention on the
      Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and
      Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property and Action Being Taken
      by UNESCO to Assist in its Implementation, in ANTIOQUIES TRADE
      OR BETRAYED: LEGAL, ETHICAL AND CONSERVATION ISSUES 38
      (K.W. Tubb ed., 1995)
   Notes and Questions
   d. The UNIDROIT Convention on Stolen or Illegally Exported Cultural
      Objects
      Notes and Questions
      Problems
   e. UNESCO, UN, and ICOM Resolutions
      Note and Questions
   f. Codes of Ethics
      Ellen Herscher, Tarnished Reputations, ARCHAEOLOGY, Sept.–Oct.
      1998, at 66, 68, 75
ARCHAEOLOGICAL INSTITUTE OF AMERICA, CODE OF ETHICS (1997) 419
Sharon Flescher, AAMD Revises Guidelines for Acquisition of Antiquities – Again, 10 IFAR J., no. 1, at 4 (2008) 419
Notes and Questions 424

2. Indigenous Heritage 425
   a. Introduction 425
      Notes and Questions 426
   b. United States Law 427
      (i) Federal Law: The Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA) 427
         (a) Summary of Provisions 427
         (b) Origins 429
         (c) Legal Foundations 431
         (d) Benefits 432
         FERGUS M. BORDEWICH, KILLING THE WHITE MAN’S INDIAN 172–74 (1996) 434
         Tessie Naranjo, Thoughts on Two Worldviews, Fed. Archaeology, Fall–Winter 1995, at 8 436
         Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, 25 U.S. § 3001 et seq. 437
         Notes and Questions 439
         Bonnichsen v. United States 443
         Notes and Questions 454
      (ii) State Law 456
         State Commissioner of Transportation v. Medicine Bird Black Bear White Eagle 460
      c. Other Approaches: South Africa, Australia, New Zealand, and Canada 464
         WORLD ARCHAEOLOGICAL CONGRESS, THE VERMILLION ACCORD ON HUMAN REMAINS (1989) 472
         Notes and Questions 473

B. Criminal Justice 473
   United States v. Ligon 473
   Questions 477
   United States v. McClain 483
   One Lucite Ball Containing Lunar Material 490
   United States v. Schultz 500
   Notes and Questions 509
C. Dispute Resolution 514

1. Litigation: The Core Issues 514
   a. Standing 515
      "Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus and the Republic of Cyprus v. Goldberg" 515
   b. Jurisdiction 516
      "H.R.H. Maharanee Seethadevi Gaekwar of Baroda v. Wildenstein" 516
   c. Choice of Law 519
      (i) Alternative Approaches 519
         "Winkworth v. Christie Manson and Woods Ltd." 519
         "Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus and the Republic of Cyprus v. Goldberg" 525
         "Notes and Questions" 535
      (ii) The Lex Rei Extra Commercium in the Civil Law 536
         "Notes and Questions" 542
   d. Statutes of Limitation 543
      (i) The Demand and Refusal Rule 548
         "Guggenheim v. Lubell" 548
         "Notes and Questions" 553
      (ii) The Discovery Rule and the Doctrine of Fraudulent Concealment 553
         "Autocephalous Greek-Orthodox Church of Cyprus and the Republic of Cyprus v. Goldberg" 554
         "Note" 557
         "Erisoty v. Rizik" 557
         "Notes" 563
      (iii) Characterization: Procedural or Substantive? 564
         "Orkin v. Taylor" 565
         "Notes" 569
   e. The Doctrine of Laches 570
      "Sanchez v. Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania" 570
   f. The Doctrine of Repose 572
      "Questions" 573
      "Problem" 573
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>g. Foreign Sovereign Immunity</td>
<td>573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Republic of Austria v. Altmann</em></td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Malewicz v. City of Amsterdam</em></td>
<td>585</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>h. Remedies</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Hoelzer v. City of Stamford</em></td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Alternative Dispute Resolution</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Background</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Advantages of Collaboration</td>
<td>604</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quentin Byrne-Sutton, <em>Resolution Methods for Art-Related Disputes</em>,</td>
<td>605</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 <em>J. Cultural Prop.</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The Principles for Cooperation in the Mutual Protection and Transfer</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td>611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. <strong>Intangible Cultural Heritage</strong></td>
<td>614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>614</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Traditional Knowledge</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel J. Gervais, *Spiritual but Not Intellectual? The Protection of</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sacred Intangible Traditional Knowledge*, <em>Cardozo J. Int’l &amp; Comp. Law</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christoph Antons, *Traditional Knowledge and Intellectual Property</td>
<td>616</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights in Australia and Southeast Asia*, in *New Frontiers of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intellectual Property Law*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. International Regimes</td>
<td>618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Convention on Biological Diversity</td>
<td>618</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham Dutfield, <em>Intellectual Property Rights, Trade and Diversity</em></td>
<td>619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The WTO Agreement on TRIPs</td>
<td>620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olufunmilayo B. Arewa, *TRIPs and Traditional Knowledge: Local</td>
<td>620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communities, Local Knowledge, and Global Intellectual Property</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note and Question</td>
<td>627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural</td>
<td>628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Limits of Intellectual Property Laws</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Problems Resulting from the Failure to Protect Indigenous Cultural</td>
<td>629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Indigenous Cultural Heritage and IPRs</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Copyright</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
b. Moral Rights 632

c. Patent Law 632

4. Appropriateness of IPR Protection 632

a. Contract, Privacy, Trade Secret, and Trademark Law 635

(i) Contract Law 635

(ii) Privacy and Trade Secret 637

(iii) Trademark 637

b. Cultural Heritage Rights in Domestic Law 638

Notes and Questions 639

E. Sui Generis Protection 640

F. Comparative Approaches to Protection 642

1. United States: Nonregistrable Subject Matter under the Lanham Trademark Act 642

Harjo v. Pro-Football, Inc. 642

Notes 649

2. New Zealand: The Regulation of Offensive Marks under the Trade Marks Act 2002 650

3. Canada: The Recognition of Aboriginal Custom in Constitutional Law 651

Delgamuukw v. British Columbia 651

4. Australia: Constraints on Appropriation of Aboriginal Culture 657

Mipurrurr u. Indofurn Pty. Ltd. 658

Notes and Questions 666


5. Taiwan: Act for the Protection of the Traditional Intellectual Creations of Indigenous Peoples 668

Notes and Questions 671

7. MUSEUMS ................................................................. 674

A. Introduction 674

Notes and Questions 675

B. The Museum Culture through History 676

1. General Observations 676


Notes 683

2. The Ritual of the Secular 683


Notes 685
Contents

3. The Culture of Collecting

   SUSAN SONTAG, THE VOLCANO LOVER 25, 144, 201 (1992) 687

   HERMIONE WATERFIELD & J.C.H. KING, PROVENANCE: TWELVE
   COLLECTORS OF ETHNOGRAPHIC ART IN ENGLAND 1760–1990, 111
   et seq. (2007) 688

   Elizabeth A. Sackler, The Ethics of Collecting, 7 Int’l J. Cultural

   Notes and Questions 695

4. The Global Museum

   James Cuno, View from the Universal Museum, in IMPERIALISM,
   ART AND RESTITUTION 18–21 (John Henry Merryman ed., 2006) 696

   International Council of Museums, Declaration on the Importance

   HECTOR FELICIANO, THE LOST MUSEUM: THE NAZI CONSPIRACY
   TO STEAL THE WORLD’S GREATEST WORKS OF ART 16, 21 (1997) 698

   JONATHAN PETROPOULOS, ART AS POLITICS IN THE THIRD REICH

   Notes and Questions 699

5. Biculturalism and Museums

   a. Introduction 700

   b. New Zealand Museums 700

   c. Canadian Museums 701

   Notes and Questions 703

C. Museum Organization and Governance

1. Introduction

   In Re Pinion 704

   Notes 705

   In Re Barnes Foundation 708

2. The Fiduciary Duties of Museum Managers 710

   a. Deaccessioning: Selling the Family Silver 713

      Patricia Ainslie, The Deaccessioning Strategy at Glenbow, 1992–97,
      15 MUSEUM MGMT. & CURATORSHIP 21 (1996) 715

      Attorney General v. Trustees of the British Museum

      Notes and Questions 723

   b. Conservation of Cultural Material and the Duty of Care 726

      Sarah E. Botha, Art Conservation: Problems Encountered in an

      MARIE C. MALARO, A LEGAL PRIMER ON MANAGING MUSEUM

      Catherine Sease, Codes of Ethics for Conservation, 7 Int’l J.
      CULTURAL PROP. 98, at 106–08 (1998) 729

      MIKIA MALLORY, PRESERVING WHAT IS VALUED: MUSEUMS,
      CONSERVATION AND FIRST NATIONS 119–20, 125–26, 135–37, 139
      (2002) 731

      Notes and Questions 734
3. Ethical Constraints

Rosenberg v. Seattle Art Museum

Notes and Questions

8. SPORTS

A. Characteristics

David Parlett, The Arts of Contest, in ASIAN GAMES: THE ART OF
CONTEST 23–24, 27 (Asia Society 2004)

Jerry L. Anderson, Comparative Perspectives on Property Rights: The

Timothy R. Pauketat, America’s First Pastime, ARCHAEOLOGY,

Notes and Questions

René Lefort & Jean Harvey, What’s in a Game? UNESCO COURIER,
Apr. 1999, at 19

James H. Frey & D. Stanley Eitzen, Sport and Society, 17 ANN. REV.
SOC. 503, 508–10 (1991)

Barbara Ehrenreich, Where the Wild Things Are: A Defense of
Cheeseheads, the Chop, and Ecstatic Religion in the Stands,
CIVILIZATION, June–July 2000, at 84, 86

Notes

James H. Frey & D. Stanley Eitzen, Sport and Society, 17 ANN. REV.
SOC. 503, 511–12 (1991)

Stephen Weatherill, Sport as Culture in EC Law, in CULTURE AND
EUROPEAN UNION LAW 113, 145 (Rachael Craufurd Smith ed.,
2004)

Notes and Questions

B. Legal Framework

1. An Overview

2. National Litigation

a. Doping

Reynolds v. International Amateur Athletic Federation
Walton-Floyd v. U.S. Olympic Committee
Notes and Questions
Problem

b. Discrimination

Kuketz v. Petronelli
Notes and Questions

3. The Process of International Sports Law

Notes and Questions

4. European (EC) Law

Union Royale Belge des Societes de Football Association v. Bosman
Meca-Medina & Majcen v. Comm’n
Notes and Questions
4. Custodial
5. Mediative
6. Summary

D. Governmental Establishment of Religion


Notes and Questions 864


Notes and Questions 871

E. Freedom of Religion 872

1. National Laws

*Gonzalez v. O Centro Espírita Beneficente União do Vegetal* 872

Notes and Questions 880


Notes and Questions 882

2. International Law


Notes and Questions 887
3. Regional Law


Sahin v. Turkey 889

Notes and Questions 902

4. Comparative Law

Cooper v. Eugene School District No. 4J 904

Notes and Questions 908

F. Concluding Observations

Martin E. Marty, The One and the Many: America's Struggle for the Common Good 90–91 (1997) 909

Note and Questions 910

Brian Cox & Daniel Philpott, Faith-Based Diplomacy: An Ancient Idea Newly Emergent, 1 Brandywine Rev. Faith & Int'l Aff., Fall 2003, at 31, 34 910


John Updike, The Future of Faith, New Yorker, Nov. 29, 1999, at 87, 91 913

10. Language and Linguistic Expression

A. The Relationship between Language and Cultural Identity


Notes and Questions 918

B. Responses of the State to Multilingualism

Dario Castiglione, The Challenges of Multilingualism, in The Language Question in Europe and Diverse Societies: Political, Legal, and Social Perspectives 5–11 (Dario Castiglione & Chris Longman eds., 2007) 919


Notes and Questions 938
C. Linguistic Human Rights


Case Relating to Certain Aspects of the Laws on the Use of Languages in Education in Belgium 941
Notes and Questions 943


D. Dying Languages 951


Notes and Questions 955

E. Affirmative Measures to Implement Linguistic Rights 955

Notes and Questions 956

F. Restrictions of Linguistic Rights 958


Notes and Questions 962

G. Accent Discrimination and Linguistic Profiling 963

1. Accent Discrimination 963

Gerrit B. Smith, Note, I Want to Speak like Native Speaker: The Case for Lowering the Plaintiff’s Proof in Title VII Accent Discrimination Cases, 66 Ohio St. L.J. 231 (2005) 963

Notes and Questions 971

2. Linguistic Profiling 972

Clifford v. Commonwealth 972

Notes and Questions 978

INDEX ................................. 981