Terrorism and Anti-Terror Legislation: The Terrorised Legislator?
A Comparison of Counter-Terror Legislation and Its Implications on Human Rights in the Legal Systems of the United Kingdom, Spain, Germany and France

Anna Oehmichen
# Table of Contents

Preface v  
Acknowledgements vii  
List of abbreviations xi  
Table of contents xvii

## Introduction

1. Terrorism and the law 4  
   1.1 The notion of ‘terrorism’ 5  
   1.2 Scope and limitations of the examined law: anti-terror legislation and human rights 7  
      1.2.1 The ECHR 8  
      1.2.2 Domestic human rights protection 10  
   1.3 The paradox of terrorism, counter-terrorism and human rights 21  
2. Purpose and aim 23  
3. Methodology 26  
   3.1 The historical approach – justification and methods 27  
      3.1.1 Methods 28  
      3.1.2 Scope of the historical overview 28  
      3.1.3 Relevance of the research 30  
   3.2 The comparative criminal law approach 30  
      3.2.1 Some preliminary remarks on comparative research 30  
      3.2.2 Relevance of the comparative research 31  
      3.2.3 The object of comparison: national anti-terror legislation 33
Table of Contents

3.2.4 Applied test for compatibility with human rights: national and European case-law, academic writings 34
3.2.5 Justification for selecting the UK, Spain, France, and Germany 35
3.2.6 Limitations in comparative law 38
4 Summary: Research questions and structure of the study 41

PART I
CONCEPTUALISATION OF TERRORISM FROM A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

CHAPTER 1
EXAMPLES OF TERRORISM BEFORE 1793 49
1.1 Antiquity – terrorist behaviour in the Bible? 49
1.2 The roman age 50
1.3 Zealots (A. D. 66-70) 51
1.4 Assassins (A. D. 1090-1256) 51
1.5 Indian Thugs 53
1.6 Gunpowder Plot (1605) 53
1.7 Summary 54

CHAPTER 2
TERRORIST MOVEMENTS AFTER THE FRENCH REVOLUTION 55
2.1 Robespierre’s reign of terror (1793-4) 55
2.2 Terrorism and anarchism in the second half of the nineteenth century 57
2.3 Early nationalist and anti-colonial groups 61
2.3.1 Ireland 61
2.3.2 Serbia 63
2.3.3 India 64
2.4 Liberation movements after World War II 65
2.4.1 Palestine / Israel 66
2.4.2 Cyprus 69
2.4.3 South Africa 70
2.5 The beginning of contemporary terrorism: ideological left-wing terrorism 71
CHAPTER 3
TERRORISM COMMITTED OR SUPPORTED BY THE STATE

3.1 State terrorism in the twentieth century
   3.1.1 Russia's (soviet) terror regimes
   3.1.2 Fascist movements
   3.1.3 Chile and Argentina
   3.1.4 Systematic terror under Mao Tse Tung

3.2 Vigilante terrorism: death squads in Central America and Colombia
   3.2.1 El Salvador
   3.2.2 Guatemalan mass killings
   3.2.3 The Contras in Nicaragua
   3.2.4 Colombia: Drug cartels and death squads
   3.2.5 Death squads elsewhere

3.3 Wartime terrorism

3.4 Summary

CHAPTER 4
TERRORIST MOVEMENTS WITH DIRECT IMPACT ON LEGISLATION OF
THE UK, SPAIN, GERMANY AND FRANCE

4.1 United Kingdom

4.2 Spain

4.3 Germany

4.4 France

4.5 The 'new global threat': international Islamic terrorism
   (1980s until present)

4.6 Summary

Excursus: Other religions as motivators for contemporary terrorism
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 5
CONCLUSIONS OF PART 1 125
5.1 Conceptualisation of terrorism – a definition? 125
5.2 Lessons learnt or why we should not reduce human rights when fighting terrorism 128

PART 2
A NATIONAL AND HISTORICAL COMPARISON OF ANTI-TERROR LEGISLATION

CHAPTER 6
ANTI-TERROR LEGISLATION IN THE UK 135
6.1 Introduction 135
6.2 Relevant legal sources 136
6.3 Anti-terror legislation prior to September 11th 137
6.3.1 Early special laws 137
6.3.2 Beginning of the ‘Troubles’ 138
6.3.3 Special legislation in Northern Ireland 138
6.3.4 Wider powers of arrest, extended detention, and derogations under the ECHR 142
6.3.5 Internment and in-depth interrogations 146
6.3.6 Direct rule 147
6.3.7 PTA’s and exclusion orders 148
6.3.8 Proscribed organisations 150
6.3.9 Supergrasses 151
6.3.10 ‘Shoot to kill’ policy and the right to life 152
6.3.11 Inferences from the silence of the accused 154
6.3.12 Repeal of the (Northern Ireland) Emergency Provisions Act 1978 following ECtHR rulings 156
6.3.13 Developments in the 1990s 158
6.4 Post September 11th anti-terror legislation 166
6.4.1 Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001 166
6.4.2 Admissibility of evidence obtained by torture 167
6.4.3 Criminal Justice Act 2003 168
6.4.4 Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005 170
6.4.5 Serious Organised Crime and Police Act 2005 172
6.4.6 Terrorism Act 2006 172
6.4.7 Racial and Religious Hatred Act 2006 174
6.4.8 Justice and Security (Northern Ireland) Act 2007 175
6.5 Current developments 175
6.6 Summary 177
  6.6.1 Main developments 177
  6.6.2 General observations 181

CHAPTER 7

ANTI-TERROR LEGISLATION IN SPAIN 183

7.1 Introduction 183
7.2 Relevant legal sources 185
7.3 Anti-terror legislation prior to September 11th 188
  7.3.1 Early anti-terror laws: Era Franco 188
  7.3.2 Transition to democracy 192
  7.3.3 Spanish Constitution of 1978 and first years of
       democracy 194
  7.3.4 Legislative activity in 1980 and 1981 197
  7.3.5 The 1980s 199
  7.3.6 The 1990s 209
7.4 Post September 11th anti-terror legislation 216
  7.4.1 Prohibition of political parties 216
  7.4.2 Implementation of EU and international law 217
  7.4.3 Abbreviated proceedings 218
  7.4.4 Legislative activism in 2003 219
  7.4.5 Improvement of detention on remand (prisión
       provisional) 223
  7.4.6 Torture allegations in Strasbourg 226
  7.4.7 11th March ('11-M') attacks on Madrid trains 227
Table of Contents

7.5 Current developments 229
7.6 Summary 230
   7.6.1 Main developments 230
   7.6.2 General observations 233

CHAPTER 8
ANTI-TERROR LEGISLATION IN GERMANY 237
8.1 Introduction 237
8.2 Relevant legal sources 238
8.3 Anti-terror legislation prior to September 11th 240
   8.3.1 Significant Acts adopted against the RAF 240
   8.3.2 The 1980s: Privacy constraints and leniency 253
   8.3.3 Fin de siècle of privacy? Combat of organised
        crime and terrorism combined 258
8.4 Post September 11th anti-terror legislation 265
   8.4.1 Security Package I 266
   8.4.2 Security Package II 267
   8.4.3 More grid search and 'forefront investigations'
          under police law 271
   8.4.4 More (mobile) telecommunication interception 273
   8.4.5 Implementation of European law 273
   8.4.6 Air Security Act 276
   8.4.7 Anti-Terror Database and Completion of the Act
          for the Combat of Terrorism 277
   8.4.8 Rulings of the German Federal Court of Justice
          concerning the Hamburg Cell 278
8.5 Current developments 280
8.6 Summary 284
   8.6.1 Main developments 284
   8.6.2 General observations 288
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 9

**Anti-Terror Legislation in France**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Relevant legal sources</td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Anti-terror legislation prior to September 11th</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1</td>
<td>Early anti-terror laws</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2</td>
<td>Terrorism combat in the 1980s</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.3</td>
<td>Developments in the 1990s</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.4</td>
<td>Football World Cup and reinforcement of the presumption of innocence</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Post September 11th anti-terror legislation</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.1</td>
<td>Law no. 2001-1062 of 15 November 2001 on Daily Security</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.2</td>
<td>Laws adopted in 2002</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3</td>
<td>Law no. 2003-239 of 18 March 2003 on Internal Security</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.4</td>
<td>Law no. 2004-204 of 9 March 2004 to Adapt Justice to the Evolutions of Criminality</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.5</td>
<td>London Bombings of 2005 and urban riots in Paris' banlieus</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.6</td>
<td>Solitary confinement decrees</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.7</td>
<td>Criticism from Strasbourg for extensive detention and violations of the fair trial principle</td>
<td>326</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Current developments</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.1</td>
<td>Main developments</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.6.2</td>
<td>General observations</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

PART 3
COMPARISON AND ANALYSIS

CHAPTER 10
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN A TERRORIST ATTACK AND SUBSEQUENT LEGISLATION

CHAPTER 11
CHARACTERISTICS OF ANTI-TERROR LAWS

11.1 General characteristics
   11.1.1 Human rights implications
   11.1.2 Other characteristics

11.2 Specificities of the different countries
   11.2.1 United Kingdom
   11.2.2 Spain
   11.2.3 Germany
   11.2.4 France

CHAPTER 12
GENERAL HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF ANTI-TERROR LEGISLATION

12.1 Common and diverging developments in the examined countries

12.2 Assessment of the impact of September 11th

CHAPTER 13
HUMAN RIGHTS PROTECTION AND COUNTER-TERRORISM

13.1 Comparison of domestic human rights protection
   13.1.1 Some general comparative observations
   13.1.2 Comparison of the cases decided with respect to counter-terrorism legislation

13.2 Impact of the ECHR and of Strasbourg’s case law
   13.2.1 The ECHR and the ECtHR’s case law in the respective national legal systems
13.2.2 Comparison of ECtHR/EComHR cases in relation to counter-terrorism 374
13.2.3 Violations of the ECHR in relation to terrorist cases per Article 377

CHAPTER 14
SUMMARY 381

CONCLUSION 383

1 Summary 383
2 A Final Assessment and Outlook 384

EPILLOGUE
THREE ESSENTIAL PROBLEMS 389

1 Torture and the ‘ticking bomb scenario’ 389
2 Criminalisation of preparatory acts: How far can we go? 390
3 What to do with potential or convicted terrorists (e.g. sleepers)? 391

Summary 393
Bibliography 407
Curriculum Vitae 439