Tort Law and Economics

Edited by

Michael Faure

Professor of Comparative and International Environmental Law, University of Maastricht and Professor of Comparative Private Law and Economics, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands

ENCYCLOPEDIA OF LAW AND ECONOMICS, SECOND EDITION

Edward Elgar
Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA
# Contents

- List of contributors  xvii
- List of abbreviations  xviii
- General introduction  xxi

## PART I  EFFICIENT LIABILITY RULES

1  **Strict liability versus negligence**  
   *Hans-Bernd Schäfer and Frank Müller-Langer*

1.1  Introduction  3
1.2  Unilateral accidents  5
   - 1.2.1  Rule of no liability  6
   - 1.2.2  Negligence  6
   - 1.2.3  Relaxing assumptions  7
   - 1.2.4  Strict liability  10
   - 1.2.5  Relaxing assumptions for strict liability  10
   - 1.2.6  Liability and uncertain legal standards of due care  13
1.3  Bilateral accidents  15
   - 1.3.1  The ‘cheapest cost avoider’  16
   - 1.3.2  Rule of no liability  17
   - 1.3.3  Negligence  17
      - Simple negligence  17
      - Negligence with the defence of contributory negligence  18
      - Comparative negligence rule  18
   - 1.3.4  Strict liability  19
      - Simple strict liability  19
      - Strict division of losses  19
      - Strict liability with the defence of contributory negligence  20
      - Strict liability with the defence of relative negligence  20
   - 1.3.5  Relaxing assumptions  20
1.4  Litigation costs  24
1.5  The decentralisation effect of strict liability and negligence  24
1.6  The information-generating consequence of negligence  27
Tort law and economics

1.6.1 Negligence generates public information on safety technology 27
1.6.2 Information generated by the negligence rule alleviates principal-agent problems 28
1.7 Strict liability versus negligence if the injurer's wealth is lower than the damage 29
1.8 Liability and contracts 30
1.9 Negligence under the disguise of strict liability, liability for design defects 31
1.10 Multiple tortfeasors 32
1.11 Risk aversion, liability law and insurance 33
1.12 Relaxing behavioural assumptions of rational choice 35
1.13 Comparing strict liability and negligence 36
Bibliography 39

2 Contributory and comparative negligence in the law and economics literature 46
Mireia Artigot i Golobardes and Fernando Gómez Pomar
2.1 Introduction 46
2.2 The world of negligence 47
2.3 Contributory and comparative negligence: concepts and evolution 48
2.3.1 Contributory negligence: origin, development and later trend towards comparative negligence 48
2.3.2 Comparative negligence: pure and modified forms 52
2.4 Incentives to take care 53
2.4.1 Initial literature: contributory negligence and the least-cost avoider 53
2.4.2 Haddock and Curran and Shavell: the equivalence between contributory and comparative negligence 58
2.4.3 Relaxing some of the initial assumptions and moving away from first-best analysis 59
2.4.3.1 Evidentiary uncertainty and court error 59
2.4.3.2 Stochastic due care and the losses of injurers and victims 66
2.4.3.3 Heterogeneous agents 67
2.4.3.4 Asymmetric information and liability rules as mechanisms to reveal information 70
2.4.3.5 Convergence to equilibrium 72
2.5 Other grounds for criticism of comparative negligence 73
   Ability to apportion negligence 73
   Risk coverage 73
   The role of jurors 74
   The costly mechanism of adjusting the defendant’s liability share both with respect to the plaintiff and with respect to the other defendants 74
2.6 Empirical studies on the performance of contributory and comparative negligence rules, and on pure comparative versus modified comparative negligence 74
2.7 Conclusions 77
Bibliography 77

PART II CAUSATION AND MULTIPLE TORTFEASORS

3 Causation and foreseeability 83
   Omri Ben-Shahar 83
   3.1 Introduction 83
   3.2 Causation in early economic analysis of law 84
   3.3 Prospective causation 85
   3.4 Causation and socially optimal care 86
   3.5 Causation under strict liability 87
      3.5.1 The effect of the scope of liability on the level of care 87
      3.5.2 The effect of the scope of liability on the level of activity 88
   3.6 Causation under the negligence rule 89
      3.6.1 The determination of the optimal standard of care 89
      3.6.2 The effect of the scope of liability on the actual level of care 89
      3.6.3 The scope of liability in an imperfectly operating negligence system 89
   3.7 Uncertainty over causation 91
   3.8 The case for threshold probability rules 92
   3.9 The case for the proportional liability rule 93
   3.10 Risk-based liability and safety regulation 96
   3.11 Causal apportionment among joint tortfeasors 97
   3.12 Foreseeability in tort law 100
   3.13 Foreseeability in contract law 102
   3.14 Causation and litigation costs 104
Bibliography 105
## 4 Joint and several liability

*Lewis A. Kornhauser and Richard L. Revesz*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Introduction</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Legal regimes</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Settlements</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Several only liability</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Joint and several liability with two defendants</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.1 Independent probabilities</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.2 Perfectly correlated probabilities</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2.3 The effects of limited solvency</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Joint and several liability with $n &gt; 2$ defendants</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Deterrence: opening remarks</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Full solvency</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1.1 Negligence</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1.2 Strict liability</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Limited, exogenously determined solvency</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Endogenous solvency</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Fairness: several remarks</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 Size of the plaintiff's recovery</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 Division of the plaintiff's recovery</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8 The effects of settlements</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9 Division of the burden of insolvency</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10 Insurance under joint and several liability</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.11 Conclusions</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 5 Vicarious and corporate civil liability

*Reinier H. Kraakman*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Introduction</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 The standard case for vicarious liability</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Factors militating against strict vicarious liability</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 The interaction between principal and agent liability</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Negligence and composite vicarious liability regimes</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Reaching beyond the principal: alternative liability targets</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Corporate civil liability versus criminal liability</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## PART III  DAMAGES

### 6  Tort Damages

*Louis T. Visscher*

6.1 Introduction 153  
6.2 Full compensation of harm? 156  
6.3 Pecuniary and nonpecuniary losses 158  
6.4 Assessment of losses 159  
6.5 Damages for fatal accidents 160  
6.5.1 Introduction 160  
6.5.2 Optimal amount that injurers should pay 160  
6.5.3 Optimal amount that the surviving relatives should receive 162  
6.6 Compensation for nonpecuniary losses? 163  
6.7 Uncompensated losses 165  
6.8 Punitive damages 166  
6.9 Pure economic loss 168  
6.10 Harm to the victim or gain to the injurer? 170  
6.11 Future losses 171  
6.12 Role of defendants’ wealth 172  
6.13 Mitigation of losses 173  
6.14 Judicial moderation, limitation of damages and insolvency 174  
6.15 Loss of a chance 176  
6.16 Multiple tortfeasors 178  
6.17 Secondary accident cost reduction 180  
6.18 Empirical research 181  
6.19 Conclusion 182  

Bibliography 184

### 7  Pure economic loss

*Jef De Mot*

7.1 Introduction 201  
7.2 A taxonomy of pure economic loss cases 202  
7.3 The insufficiency of explanations not based on efficiency 203  
7.4 Private versus social loss 204  
7.5 Private loss, social loss and market structure 206  
7.6 Strict liability versus negligence 207  
7.6.1 Unilateral precaution accidents 207  
7.6.2 Bilateral and trilateral precaution accidents 208  
7.7 Intentional versus negligent torts 209
7.8 Economic analysis of the various types of cases 209
  7.8.1 Ricochet loss cases 209
  7.8.2 Transferred loss cases 209
  7.8.3 Closure of public service and infrastructures cases 210
  7.8.4 Flawed professional advice cases 210

7.9 Conclusion 211
Bibliography 211

8 Non pecuniary losses 215
Siewert D. Lindenbergh and Peter P.M. van Kippersluis

8.1 Introduction 215
8.2 Tort law and economics 216
8.3 Why should non pecuniary losses be compensated? 217
  8.3.1 Why compensation? 217
  8.3.2 Prevention 218
  8.3.3 Efficient distribution and insurance 220
8.4 Valuation of non pecuniary loss 223
8.5 Risks of high awards 224
8.6 Conclusions 225
Bibliography 226

9 Punitive damages 228
A. Mitchell Polinsky and Steven Shavell

9.1 Introduction 228
9.2 Optimal damages when injurers are found liable for sure: the basic theory of deterrence 229
9.3 Optimal damages when injurers might escape liability 231
9.4 Optimal damages when harm is underestimated 232
9.5 Optimal damages when injurers' gains are socially illicit 233
9.6 Optimal damages when parties can bargain and transact in the marketplace 234
9.7 Optimal damages and punishment 235
9.8 Optimal damages in the light of both objectives 237
9.9 Extensions of the analysis 238
Bibliography 242

PART IV SPECIFIC CASES

10 Environmental liability 247
Michael Faure

10.1 Introduction 247
11.7 Product warranties 295
11.8 Insurance costs and warranty liability 297
11.9 The regulatory problem 298
11.10 The choice between negligence and strict liability 300
11.11 Empirical studies of the effect of seller liability on product safety 301
11.12 The impact of tort liability on innovation and productivity 304
11.13 Products liability and the market for liability insurance 306
11.14 Introduction to the main doctrines of products liability 308
11.15 The requirement of defect 309
11.16 Construction or manufacturing defects 310
11.17 Design defects 311
11.18 Warning defects 313
11.19 Extended seller liability 315
11.20 Defenses based on consumer conduct 316
11.21 The enforceability of contractual waivers of seller liability 316
11.22 Bystander injuries 317
11.23 Compensatory damages 318
11.24 Punitive damages 319
11.25 The evolution of products liability, and the evolution of economics 320

Bibliography 321

12 Medical malpractice 341
Steve Boccara
12.1 Introduction 341
12.2 The development of medical malpractice liability 342
12.3 The economic analysis of medical malpractice liability 343
12.3.1 The nature of the doctor–patient relationship 343
12.3.2 Incentive and compensation 344
12.3.3 Medical malpractice and the law and economics approach 346
12.3.4 Tort law, regulation and insurance 347
12.4 The main topics of medical malpractice 349
12.4.1 Negligence versus strict liability 349
12.4.2 Standard of care 351
12.4.3 Is the tort system relevant? 351
12.4.4 Defensive medicine 354
12.5 The medical malpractice crisis 356
12.5.1 The context 356
12.5.2 Malpractice insurance and the underwriting cycle 359

12.6 Some proposals to end the medical malpractice crisis 360
   12.6.1 Tort reforms 360
   12.6.2 Shifting toward a no-fault system 362

12.7 Conclusions 364

Bibliography 365

PART V ALTERNATIVE COMPENSATION SYSTEMS

13 Tort law and liability insurance 377
   Gerhard Wagner

13.1 Introduction 377

13.2 The economic rationale of insurance 377
   13.2.1 The demand for insurance 377
      13.2.1.1 Risk aversion 377
      13.2.1.2 Consequences for the deterrence function of tort law 379
      13.2.1.3 Insuring liability for fault 380
      13.2.1.4 Non-pecuniary losses 381
   13.2.2 The supply of insurance 382
      13.2.2.1 Pooling: the law of large numbers 382
      13.2.2.2 Subdivision of risk 383

13.3 Compensation of victims as a purpose of liability insurance? 384

13.4 Economic problems of liability insurance 386
   13.4.1 Asymmetric information and imperfect insurance 386
   13.4.2 Adverse selection 388
   13.4.3 Moral hazard 389
      13.4.3.1 Effect: destruction of incentives generated by tort law 389
      13.4.3.2 Source: informational asymmetry 390
      13.4.3.3 Remedy: partial insurance 391
      13.4.3.4 Activity levels 392

13.5 Economic virtues of liability insurance 393
   13.5.1 Unlimited liability on paper, limited liability in reality 393
   13.5.2 The pervasiveness of limited liability 394
   13.5.3 Limited liability and the incentive to take care 394
   13.5.4 Limited liability and the incentive to insure 395
   13.5.5 Limited liability and activity levels 397
   13.5.6 Compulsory insurance 397
xv  *Tort law and economics*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.5.7 Alternative means</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6 The limits of insurance: insurability</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.1 Uninsurability as an argument in political discourse</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.2 Elements of insurability</td>
<td>399</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.6.3 Insurability as a flexible concept</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.7 The impact of liability insurance on tort law</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>14 No-fault compensation systems</strong></td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Karine Fiore</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.1 Introduction</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2 No-fault systems: the priority given to the protection of victims</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.1 Definition of no-fault systems</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2 The theoretical rationale of no-fault systems</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2.1 Higher compensation</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2.2 Lower transaction costs</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.2.3 Lower insurance premiums</td>
<td>410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.3 Disadvantages of no-fault systems</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.4 Examples and empirical evaluations</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.4.1 Automobile insurance</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2.4.2 A universal no-fault system: the case of New Zealand</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3 No-fault versus strict liability systems</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3.1 Definition of the strict liability system</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3.2 The advantages of strict liability</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4 The efficiency of compensation systems: the necessary conditions</td>
<td>418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4.1 Unlimited liability/compensation amounts</td>
<td>418</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4.2 Safety regulation</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4.3 Compulsory insurance</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.5 Examples of compensation systems (based on strict liability)</td>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.5.1 Compensation for nuclear accidents</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.5.2 Compensation for marine oil pollution accidents</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.6 Conclusions</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART VI OTHER PERSPECTIVES ON TORT LAW

15 Harmonizing tort law: a comparative tort law and economics analysis
   Willem H. van Boom
   15.1 Introduction
   15.2 Tort law as domestic preference
   15.3 Domestic preferences and the market for tort law systems
   15.4 Differences in European tort law systems and the harmonization of tort law
      15.4.1 General
      15.4.2 Economic analysis in the harmonization debate
      15.4.3 Tort law an obstacle for the mobility of persons and goods?
      15.4.4 Regulatory competition versus culture
      15.4.5 Cross-border externalities argument
      15.4.6 Race to the bottom argument
      15.4.7 Reduction of (transaction) cost

Bibliography

PART VII EMPIRICS

16 Empirics of tort
   Ben C.J. van Velthoven
   16.1 Introduction
   16.2 Prerequisites for empirical analysis
      16.2.1 Variation
      16.2.2 Data
      16.2.3 Methods
   16.3 The tort litigation system
      16.3.1 Base rate
      16.3.2 Claiming rate
      16.3.3 Disposition of claims
      16.3.4 Punitive damages
      16.3.5 Administrative costs
   16.4 Effects of tort reform on litigation and insurance
   16.5 Safety effects
      16.5.1 Automobile accidents
         No-fault
         Other changes in liability rules


Other safety measures 477

16.5.2 Industrial accidents 479
From negligence to workers’ compensation 480
Trends in workers’ compensation 480

16.5.3 Product liability 482
Empirical findings 483
Asbestos 484

16.5.4 Medical malpractice 485
Defensive medicine 486

16.6 Cost-benefit analysis 488

Bibliography 490

Index 499