## Contents

**Foreword**  
vi

**Preface**  
ix

**Table of Cases**  
xx

**Table of Legislation, Treaties, and Conventions**  
xxi

**List of Contributors**  
xxiii

1. **Problems on Pitcairn**  

    *Dawn Oliver*

    A Thought Experiment  
    The Government and Governance of the Island  
    ‘Operation Unique’: Investigation of Alleged Offences  
    Trials and Convictions  
    The Next Chapters


    *Dawn Oliver*

    *Steven Raymond Christian and Others v The Queen* in the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council  
    The Colonial Status of Pitcairn  
    The Machinery of Justice Points  
    Legality and the Rule of Law  
    Reflections  
    And Afterwards ...

3. **Pitcairn’s Tortured Past: A Legal History**  

    *Andrew Lewis*

    The Settlement: 1790–1814  
    A savage society  
    A biblical monarchy  
    Recognition: 1814–56  
    Intervention: 1856–98
Settled Government: 1898–Present 56
Conclusion 61

Gordon Woodman

The History of the Sources of Law in Pitcairn 66
The law originally in force in Pitcairn 67
Legal development after the original settlement 72
The Abuse of Process Issue 82
A Concluding Comment 89

5. The Pitcairn Prosecutions: An Assessment of Their Historical Context by Reference to the Provisions of Public International Law 93
Dino Kritsiotis and A. W. B. Simpson

Jurisdiction: A Brief Conceptual Analysis 96
On Territorial Acquisition 106
Sovereign Title and Sovereign Obligations 119
Concluding Reflections 127

6. ‘A Million Mutinies Now’: Why Claims of Cultural Uniqueness Cannot be Used to Justify Violations of Basic Human Rights 131
Colm O’Cinneide

Narrating Pitcairn 134
The alleged failure to respect the uniqueness of Pitcairn 136
The incoherence of the cultural narrative and the reality of the sexual abuse that occurred on Pitcairn 138
The distorting influence of the emphasis on Pitcairn’s isolation 141
‘Cultural’ Arguments in Relation to Pitcairn 143
Minority group rights claims 146
‘Cultural defence’ claims 150
‘Cultural relativism’ claims 151
The Dangers of Exaggerated Respect for ‘Culture’ 154
Conclusion 155
### Contents

#### 7. Rights and Duties on Pitcairn Island

*George Letsas*

- Cultural Relativism, Universality, and Blameworthiness 159
- Legal Positivism and Natural Law 169
- Legality and Community 176
- Conclusion 182

#### 8. Legality, Reciprocity, and the Criminal Law on Pitcairn

*Stephen Guest*

- Crown Jurisdiction in Pitcairn: Community and Legal Theory 186
- *Mala in se* 197
  - The importance of promulgation 199
  - Promulgation and *ignorantia* 201
  - Two values of promulgation and legal positivism 204
- Return to Pitcairn 207
  - Fairness 210
- The Limits of Criminal Law 214
  - Rights of victims 216
  - The value of certainty in the criminal law 218
- Summary and Conclusion 219

#### Afterword

*Marilyn Strathern, DBE, FBA*

- How are Islands Made? 221
- Speculations 222
- Comparisons 226
- End 228

#### Appendix I

*Steven Raymond Christian and Others v The Queen* [2006] UKPC 47 231

#### Appendix II

- Official Correspondence
  - (a) Paul Treadwell, Honorary Legal Adviser to the Governor of Pitcairn Island, Kerikeri, New Zealand, to CD Shute, First Secretary, British High Commission, Wellington, New Zealand, 5 January 1997 260
(b) Paul Treadwell, Honorary Legal Adviser to the Acting Governor of New Zealand, to Mrs K Wolstenholme, Acting Governor of Pitcairn, Wellington, New Zealand, 29 April 2000 262
(c) Martin Williams, Governor of Pitcairn, London, to Mrs K Wolstenholme, Deputy Governor, British High Commission, Wellington, New Zealand, 2 May 2000 264
(d) Clare Short, Secretary of State for International Development, London, to The Rt Hon Robin Cook, Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs, London 265

Appendix III
Outline: Pitcairn Island Chronology 267

References 271
Index 285