WOMEN, LAW AND SOCIAL CHANGE

Core Readings and Current Issues

FIFTH EDITION

edited by

T. Brettel Dawson

Department of Law
Carleton University

CANADIAN LEGAL STUDIES SERIES

Captus Press
# Table of Contents

## Preface ........................................... xi

## Dedication ....................................... xii

## Introduction .................................... xiii

## Artefacts ........................................ xvii

(a) The Legal Lady  
*McKenzie Porter* ........................................ xvii

(b) Pregnant Tribunals  
*Bronwyn Naylor* ........................................ xxi

(c) *R. v. Chase* ........................................ xxiii

## I WOMEN AND LAW

### Connections and Disconnections

1 Silences ........................................... 3

(a) *U.S. v. Susan B. Anthony* (1873) .................. 3

(b) Seneca Fall Declaration ............................. 4

(c) Ain't I a Woman?  
*Sojourner Truth* ........................................ 6

(d) A Jury of Her Peers  
*Susan Glaspell* ......................................... 6

(e) Susan Glaspell's Trifles and A Jury of Her Peers:  
Woman Abuse in a Literary and Legal Context  
*Marina Angel* ........................................... 15

(f) "History Will Judge"  
*Constance Backhouse* .................................. 24

(g) Context in Equality  
*Sarah Lugtig* .......................................... 27
2 Opening Space .................................................. 31

(a) African-American Women's Quilting: A Framework for Conceptualizing
and Teaching African-American Women's History
_Elsa Barkley Brown_ ........................................ 31

(b) Teaching Law as If Women Really Mattered, or,
What about the Washrooms?
_Christine Boyle_ ........................................... 34

(c) Feminist Pedagogy: Critique and Commitment
_T. Brettel Dawson_ ...................................... 38

(d) The Gender Wars: 'Where the Boys Are'
_Bruce Feldthusen_ ........................................ 46

(e) Peekiskwetan
_Rhonda Johnson, Winona Stevenson, and Donna Greschner_ .......... 51

3 Framing ......................................................... 57

A. Law

(a) Blind Justice
_Ngaire Naffine_ ........................................... 57

(b) Law: A Primer
_T. Brettel Dawson_ ...................................... 65

(c) Judging in the Twenty-First Century
_The Right Honourable Justice E W (Ted) Thomas_ ................. 72

(d) Jurisprudence for Judges: Why Legal Theory Matters for
Social Context Education
_Richard F. Devlin_ ........................................ 74

(e) The “I” in the “It”: Reflections on a Feminist Approach to
Constitutional Theory
_Colleen Sheppard_ ........................................ 83

B. Women

(f) Feminist Legal Studies: A Primer
_T. Brettel Dawson_ ........................................ 86

(g) It's Time for Change. Demands to the Federal Government to End
Poverty and Violence Against Women .......................... 91

(h) Post-Modern Race and Gender Essentialism
or a Post-Mortem of Scholarship
_Radha Jhappan_ ............................................ 93

(i) Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State: An Agenda for Theory
_Catharine MacKinnon_ ................................... 112

(j) Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State:
Toward Feminist Jurisprudence
_Catharine MacKinnon_ ................................... 115

(k) Themes, Concerns and Strategies in Feminist Legal Studies:
A Summary and Reflection
_T. Brettel Dawson_ ........................................ 117
II WOMEN AND LAW
Challenging Exclusion

4 Are Women Persons? .................................................. 123
(a) Law and the Legal Person
   T. Brettel Dawson .................................................. 123
(b) Reference re Meaning of Word "Persons" in s. 24 of the B.N.A. Act. 126
(c) Edwards v. A.G. for Canada .................................... 130
(d) Bradwell v. The State of Illinois ............................... 136
(e) In Re Mabel P. French ........................................... 138
(f) 'Persons,' Pronouns, and Policy Choices: Judicial Reasoning in French and Langstaff
   Mary Jane Mossman ............................................. 143
(g) Bradwell Revisited
   Martha Minow ..................................................... 148
(h) Clara Brett Martin Revisited
   T. Brettel Dawson ................................................ 150
(i) A Collage of Firsts
   T. Brettel Dawson ................................................ 153

Talking Points
(i) Re Connelly Estate ............................................. 155
(ii) On Being the Object of Property
    Patricia Williams .............................................. 158
(iii) Sandra Lovelace v. Canada ................................. 167

5 The Language of Statutes .......................................... 170
(a) Alice through the Statutes
    Marguerite Ritchie ........................................... 170
(b) Are Statutes Written for Men Only?
    Elmer Driedger .................................................. 174
(c) The Language of Oppression — Alice Talks Back
    Marguerite Ritchie ........................................... 177
(d) Locating Inequality — The Evolving Discourse on Sexist Language
    Sandra Petersson .............................................. 181

Talking Points
(i) Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, s. 28 ...................... 189
(ii) An Act to amend the National Anthem Act to include all Canadians 189
(iii) National Anthem Act, Second Reading Debate ..................... 190

6 Myths and Stereotypes (De)valueing Women .......................... 194
(a) Women’s Experience of Judicial Process
    T. Brettel Dawson ............................................. 194
Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study One: “Not on Her Way to Nunnery”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study Two: “What Any Wife Would Do”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study Three: “Blonde Freckled Twins”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**III WOMEN AND LAW**

**Probing Omission, Revisiting Concepts**

7 Reasonableness 269

(a)  | Criminal Code 269 |
(b)  | R. v. Whynot (Stafford) 270 |
(c)  | R. v. Lavallee 272 |
Table of Contents

(d) Negligence Law: The “Reasonable Person” Standard as an Example of Male Naming and the Implicit Male Norm
Leslie Bender ................................................................. 280
(e) Laying Down the Master’s Tools: A Feminist Revision of Torts
Lucinda Finley ................................................................. 282
(f) On Silences, Screams and Scholarship:
An Introduction to Feminist Legal Theory
Kathleen Lahey ................................................................. 284
(g) Battered Women and Mandatory Minimum Sentences:
Law and Policy
Elizabeth Sheehy ................................................................. 286

8 Relevance and Perception .................................................. 292
(a) Sexual Assault Law and Past Sexual Conduct of the Primary Witness:
The Construction of Relevance
T. Brettel Dawson ................................................................. 292
(b) R. v. Seaboyer; R. v. Gayme ................................................... 298
(c) Culture as a Defense: Aboriginal Offenders
Sherene Razack ................................................................. 315
(d) To “understand equality, and make it part of our thinking”:
Towards Fairness and Equity in Sexual Assault Law
T. Brettel Dawson ................................................................. 318

9 Reproduction ................................................................. 323
(a) R. v. Morgentaler ................................................................. 323
(b) R. v. Sullivan and Lemay
[Factum of the Women’s Legal Education and Action Fund (LEAF)] ................................. 327
(c) R. v. Sullivan ................................................................. 330
(d) Correspondence to LEAF, 1990 re Sullivan and Lemay
T. Brettel Dawson ................................................................. 333

10 Real Property ................................................................. 336
(a) Home/Land
Mary Ellen Turpel ................................................................. 336
(b) Matrimonial Real Property
Native Women’s Association of Canada ........................................ 344
(c) Consultation Report on Matrimonial Real Property
Wendy Grant-John ................................................................. 346

Further Resources: The Floating Chapter ................................... 351
I. The FemLaw Virtual Casebook: <www.lawsite.ca>
II. Starting Point References
III. Online Collections Addressing Women’s Legal Issues
IV. Online Publications and Scholarly Journals
V. Related Websites

vii
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Legal Provisions and Policy Commitments</td>
<td>Primer on Legal Protections of Human Rights in Canada</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms — Selected Provisions</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selected International Conventions (Human Rights of Women)</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender-based Analysis</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Stances</td>
<td>Will Women Judges Really Make a Difference?</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Making a Difference: The Pursuit of a Compassionate Justice</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Building a Bridge to Equality: A Duty for Lawyers</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Judicial Method</td>
<td>Punjab v. Singh</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Impartiality, Equality and the Judicial Role</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Fiction of Judicial Impartiality</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Judicial Education on Context</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Nature of Judgment</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Strategies</td>
<td>Strategizing in Equality</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Test Case Litigation: The Canadian Experience</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Cold Game of Equality Staring</td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Resistance and Responsiveness of Law</td>
<td>Bliss v. Canada (A.G.)</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brooks v. Canada Safeway Ltd</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Feminism and the Law: Challenges and Choices</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

(d) The Promise of Brooks v. Canada Safeway Ltd:
Those Who Bear Children Should Not Be Disadvantaged
Lorna Turnbull .......................................................... 442

Talking Points
(i) Interpretive Approach: Choice of Path
The Honourable Madam Justice Lynn Smith and Geoffrey Loomer (Law Clerk) .... 444
(ii) Critical Comparisons: The Supreme Court Of Canada Dooms Section 15
Daphne Gilbert and Diana Majury ........................................ 449
(iii) Note: Women’s Court of Canada ........................................ 454

13 Gender Neutrality and Gender Specificity in Law ............... 455

(a) Out of the Icy Water: Regina v. Douglas X
Donna F. Johnson .................................................................. 455
(b) The Criteria of Reasonable Doubt in Assessing
the Witnesses’ Credibility
The Honourable Justice Sophie Bourque .................................. 459
(c) Note: Credibility Assessment and Reasons for Judgment in
Sexual Assault Trials
T. Brettel Dawson .................................................................. 462
(d) R. v. Hull ......................................................................... 464
(e) R. v. Jaura ........................................................................ 465
(f) R. v. J.J.R.D ...................................................................... 469

Talking Point
(i) R. v. Ponomarev .......................................................... 473

14 Enabling and Constraining Social Change ......................... 475

(a) UN Communication No 902/1999: Joslin v. New Zealand [Quilter]
United Nations Human Rights Committee ................................ 475
(b) Halpern v. Canada (A.G.) ................................................ 480
(c) Case Study on Same-Sex Marriage
T. Brettel Dawson .................................................................. 491
(d) Reference re Same-Sex Marriage ........................................ 498
(e) Ceremony of Civil Marriage: Jennifer Rowan and Juliet Joslin ......... 499

15 Dialogue and Contestation ................................................. 506

(a) ‘Whack’ Sex Assault Complainant at Preliminary Inquiry
Cristin Schmitz ...................................................................... 506
(b) Case Study on Sexual Assault Law Reform, 1980–2000:
A Chronology
T. Brettel Dawson .................................................................. 509
(c) Sex Equality and Sexual Assault: In the Aftermath of Seaboyer
Elizabeth J. Shilton and Anne S. Derrick .................................. 512
(d) An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (sexual assault) .................. 516
Table of Contents

(e) Discriminatory Uses of Personal Records in Sexual Violence Cases
Karen Busby ................................................................. 519
(f) Bill C-46, An Act to Amend the Criminal Code
   (production of records in sexual offence proceedings) ................. 528
(g) R. v. Mills (Alta. Q.B.) ............................................. 532
(h) R. v. Mills (S.C.C.) .................................................. 538
(i) R. v. Darrach .......................................................... 543

Talking Point
(i) No Stigma for Rape Victims in Islam
   Council on American-Islamic Relations Canada ....................... 548

V WOMEN IN LAW
Bridging Life and Law

16 Forming the Future ................................................... 551
(a) The Real World of Technologies
   Ursula Franklin ......................................................... 551
(b) The First Women Lawyers
   Mary Jane Mossman .................................................. 551
(c) Through My Eyes: Lessons on Life in Law School
   Marilyn Poitras ....................................................... 556
(d) 2005 Call to the Bar Convocation Remarks
   Elizabeth Sheehy ..................................................... 558
(e) 2002 Call to the Bar Convocation Remarks
   The Honourable Claire L'Heureux-Dubé ............................. 560
(f) The Mentor
   Susan Lightstone ..................................................... 562
(g) Three Guineas
   Virginia Woolf ....................................................... 564