

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

A Substantive Environmental Right

An Examination of the Legal Obligations of
Decision-Makers towards the Environment

Stephen J. Turner



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Table of Contents

Foreword	xiii
Preface	xv
Acknowledgements	xvii
Abbreviations	xxi
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
Chapter 2	
The Current Status of the Development of Environmental Rights at National and International Levels	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 International Environmental Law	6
2.2.1 The Status of the Development of Substantive Environmental Rights within International Environmental Law	7
2.2.2 Sovereignty	10
2.2.3 The Development of Procedural Environmental Rights	11
2.3 Human Rights Law	15
2.3.1 Different Classifications of Human Rights	16
2.3.2 Substantive Environmental Rights as Part of International and Regional Human Rights Law	17
2.3.3 Other Human Rights that can Provide Protection of the Environment	19

2.3.4	Existing 'Non-environmental' Human Rights that can be of use in the Protection of the Environment	19
2.3.5	The Status of the Development of the Right to a 'Clean' or 'Healthy' Environment	26
2.4	Constitutional Rights	27
2.5	Work of the United Nations	38
2.6	The International Court of Justice	41
2.7	Conclusions	42

Chapter 3

The Debate Relating to the Potential Development of a Substantive Environmental Right and the Proposed Design of Such a Right 45

3.1	Introduction	45
3.2	The Case against the Development of a Substantive Environmental Right	45
3.2.1	Lack of Certainty Relating to the Legal Development	48
3.2.2	Anthropocentricity and Differing Theories of Environmental Rights	49
3.2.3	Competing Issues and Decision-Making	51
3.2.4	Redundancy	53
3.2.5	Effectiveness in Operation	53
3.2.6	Cultural Issues	54
3.2.7	The Time it takes to develop a Right	55
3.2.8	The Scope of Human Rights under International Law	55
3.3	The Case for the Development of a Substantive Environmental Right	56
3.3.1	Background	56
3.3.2	Scientific Reasons	58
3.3.3	Institutional Recognition for the Link between the Environment and Man's Welfare	61
3.3.4	Realization of Intergenerational Equity	63
3.3.5	The Realization of the Potential of Procedural Rights	64
3.3.6	Issues Relating to 'Sustainable Development'	64
3.3.7	Providing a Balance to a State's Sovereignty over Natural Resources	65
3.3.8	The Need for Positive Duties for All Decision-Makers to Protect the Environment	66
3.3.9	The Development of International Law in Relation to Environmental Harm Caused by Non-state Actors	70
3.3.10	The Protection of Indigenous and Vulnerable Communities	71
3.4	The Design of a Substantive Environmental Right	72
3.4.1	The Proposed Right has the Status of a Human Right	73

3.4.2	The Proposed Right is not solely Anthropocentric	74
3.4.3	The Proposed Right Includes a Mechanism to Deal with its Relationship with other Human Rights	75
3.4.4	The Proposed Right Applies to both State and Non-state Actors	75
3.4.5	The Proposed Right Operates by Creating Clear Legal Duties and Obligations	76
3.4.6	The Proposed Right Provides an Equitable Mechanism for the Internalization of Compensation for Environmental Degradation	76
3.4.7	The Proposed Right Provides a Straightforward Process for Dealing with Decision-Making that Affects the Environment	77
3.4.8	Why the 'Human Right to a <i>Good</i> Environment'	78
3.5	Conclusion	78
Chapter 4		
A Substantive Environmental Right and the State Actor		81
4.1	Introduction	81
4.2	Provisions of State Constitutions that Relate to the Environment	82
4.2.1	The Constitutional Provisions Relating to the Environment of South Africa, Spain, India and Peru	82
4.2.2	Key Features of Constitutional Environmental Rights	86
4.3	The Effect of Vague and Conflicting Constitutional Provisions on Legislative and Policy Decision-Making that Can Affect the Environment	87
4.3.1	The Constitutional Provisions	88
4.3.2	Environmental Laws	89
4.3.3	Law Creating Institutional Frameworks for Decision-Making	91
4.3.4	Laws Relating to the Hydrocarbon Industry	93
4.3.5	Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs)	96
4.3.5.1	EIA Law	96
4.3.5.2	The Stage at which the EIA occurs	97
4.3.5.3	The Lack of Independence of the EIA	98
4.3.5.4	Public Participation within the EIA process	98
4.3.6	Public Participation in Decision-Making	100
4.4	Case Study: The Camisea Project: The Practical Problems for the Environment that can be Associated with Weak Environmental Provisions within Constitutions	101

4.4.1	Exploration Phase	101
4.4.2	Construction of the Well-Heads, Pipeline and Associated Facilities	102
4.4.3	Fractionation Plant	104
4.4.4	Ongoing Operations	104
4.4.5	The Effect of the Constitutional Provisions on the Camisea Project	105
4.5	Conclusion	106
Chapter 5		
Companies and Multinational Enterprises		109
5.1	Introduction	109
5.2	The Power of Modern Companies and MNEs	110
5.3	The Legal Responsibilities of Companies and MNEs	113
5.3.1	The Primary Responsibility of a Company or an MNE	114
5.3.2	The Duties of Directors	115
5.4	The Law at an International Level Relating to Companies and Multinational Enterprises	118
5.4.1	Liability	122
5.5	Attempts by the International Community to Respond to the Existing Legal Framework and Business Environment in which Companies and MNEs Operate	127
5.5.1	Corporate Governance	127
5.5.2	The Stakeholder Theory of Responsibilities	128
5.5.3	Corporate Social Responsibility	129
5.5.4	Codes of Conduct (and Guidelines)	132
5.5.5	Corporate Accountability	138
5.5.6	World Summit on Sustainable Development	139
5.5.7	Changes to the Duties of Directors	140
5.6	The Overall Deficit in the Law and Responses from the Academic Community	141
5.7	Conclusion	144
5.7.1	If a State Fails through its Laws or Lack of Enforcement to Properly Protect the Environment, are There Measures that should be taken on an International Level to Ensure that Companies Operate to Certain Minimum Environmental Standards?	145
5.7.2	If it is Primarily the Duty of the State to Regulate Companies, would there be any Purpose for Imposing upon Companies a Human Rights Responsibility that they Should Protect the Environment?	146

Chapter 6		
Multilateral Development Banks		149
6.1	Introduction	149
6.2	What Capacity do MDBs have to Harm the Environment?	150
6.3	Legal Responsibilities under Constitutional Charters or Agreements	152
6.4	Legal Responsibilities under Operational Policies and Procedures	154
6.4.1	Environmental Impact Assessments	155
6.4.2	Public Participation	160
6.4.3	Specific Sectoral Policies	161
6.4.4	Indigenous Peoples	162
6.5	The Legal Character of Operational Policies and Procedures	164
6.5.1	The Role of Operational Policies and Procedures as Instruments within MDBs	164
6.5.2	The Legal Consequences of the Conditions Included within Bank Loans	166
6.5.3	The Legal Consequences of the Various Independent Accountability Mechanisms	167
6.6	International Environmental Law	173
6.7	International Human Rights Law	175
6.8	The Potential of a Rights-Based Approach to Reform	180
6.9	Conclusion	182
Chapter 7		
The World Trade Organization		185
7.1	Introduction	185
7.2	The WTO in Context	186
7.2.1	The Effects that Trade and Trade Liberalization Can Have on the Environment	187
7.3	Legal Obligations towards the Environment	190
7.3.1	The Legal Obligations of the WTO towards the Environment under its own Constitution	191
7.3.2	Is there an Obligation on the WTO to Apply International Law other than that Contained in its own Agreements?	193
7.3.3	The Legal Obligations towards the Environment that Member States have as a Result of Membership of the WTO	196
7.3.4	The Development of Jurisprudence and the Extent to which Environmental Concerns are Incorporated into the Decision-Making of the Dispute Settlement Body	198

7.3.5	Issues Arising from the Existing Legal Framework	206
7.4	The Potential Application of a Substantive Environmental Right to the WTO System	207
7.5	Conclusion	213
Chapter 8		
Conclusion		215
Appendix		
Draft Accord between States for the Development and Realization of a Substantive Environmental Right		221
Bibliography		223
Table of International Instruments		259
Table of International Cases		267
Table of National Laws		271
Table of National Cases		273
Index		277