HUMAN RIGHTS: JUDICIAL PROTECTION IN THE UNITED KINGDOM

SIR JACK BEATSON FBA
A Justice of the High Court,
formerlY Rouse Ball Professor of English Law,
University of Cambridge

STEPHEN GROSZ
Solicitor, Bindmans LLP

TOM HICKMAN
Barrister, Blackstone Chambers

RABINDER SINGH Q.C.
Barrister, Matrix Chambers

with

STEPHANIE PALMER
Fellow, Girton College, Cambridge and Barrister, Blackstone Chambers

LONDON
SWEET & MAXWELL
2008
CONTENTS

Foreword vii
Preface ix
Table of Cases xix
Table of Cases before the European Court of Human Rights lxxxi
Table of Cases before the European Court of Justice xcix
Table of Cases before the European Commission of Human Rights ciii
Table of Cases before the European Court of First Instance cv
Table of Statutes cvii
Table of Statutory Instruments cxxi
Table of International Treaties and Conventions cxxiii
Table of European Community Treaties cxxvii

Chapter 1: Introduction: The Place of Human Rights in the Laws of the United Kingdom 1

1. Overview: the Ways in which Human Rights are Protected in Domestic Law 2
2. Protection of Human Rights in the Common Law 3
3. Common Law Constitutional and Fundamental Rights 6
   (a) Jurisprudential basis for common law constitutional and fundamental rights 6
   (b) What common law rights do we have? 13
4. Customary International Law as a Source of the Common Law 18
5. Limitations of the Common Law 20
6. The Status of the European Convention in Domestic Law Prior to the HRA 21
7. Objectives behind the Human Rights Act 25
8. The Definition and Scope of “Convention Rights” in the HRA 29
   (a) The omitted Articles 30
9. Convention Rights not part of Substantive Domestic Law under HRA 34
10. Relationship between Convention Rights and Rights in the HRA 38
11. Section 2 of the HRA: Taking Account of Strasbourg Jurisprudence 40
12. Precedent and Taking Account of Strasbourg Case Law 45
13. Understanding the Strasbourg Jurisprudence 47
14. Use of Foreign Case Law 50
15. Limitations, Derogations and Reservations 51
16. Addition of New Convention Rights 56
17. The “British Model” of a Bill of Rights 56
   (a) Joint Committee on Human Rights 60
   (b) Commission for Equality and Human Rights 60
18. Devolution Legislation 63
19. Other Statutes 63
20. Indirect Domestic Incorporation of ECHR rights via European Community/European Union Law 67
CONTENTS

(a) The Development of Fundamental Rights 68
(b) The Relationship between the EU's Fundamental Rights Protection and Convention Rights 69
(c) Community Protection Against Infringements by Member States 71
(d) Divergence in the Decisions of the Strasbourg and Luxembourg Courts 75
(e) The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU 77
21. The Future 80

Chapter 2: The Convention Principles and the Approach of the Strasbourg Court 83

1. Introduction 83
   (a) Overview 83
   (b) General structure of analysis by the Strasbourg Court 84
2. Convention Values 87
   (a) Human dignity and autonomy 89
   (b) Democracy 97
   (c) The rule of law 103
   (d) Equality 107
3. The Courts' Approach to Interpretation of the Convention 117
   (a) The Courts' general approach to interpretation 117
   (b) The ordinary meaning of the Convention 118
   (c) The context of terms used in the Convention 119
   (d) Interpretation based on the object and purpose of the Convention 121
   (e) Margin of appreciation 143
4. The Structure of Analysis by the Strasbourg Court 152
   (a) Lawfulness 152
   (b) Legitimate Aim 162
   (c) Justification for the Interference 163

Chapter 3: General Principles in Domestic Law 183

1. Interference with a Protected Right 184
2. Legality 187
   (a) Lawful in domestic law 188
   (b) Clear, precise and foreseeable 188
   (c) Not arbitrary 191
3. Proportionality 195
   (a) When proportionality will now be applied 195
   (b) Proportionality under the HRA and the devolution statutes 195
   (c) Proportionality when assessing breach of a fundamental common law right 196
   (d) Other contexts in which proportionality applies 198
   (e) Proportionality is an international juridical concept 199
   (f) The de Freitas test of proportionality 201
CONTENTS

(g) Proportionality in EC Law 216
(h) Relationship between EC proportionality and Convention proportionality 221
(i) Proportionality: specifics 222
(j) Rational connection 228
(k) Least intrusive means and fair balance 229
(l) The relevance of the decision-making process and contemporaneous reasons 230
(m) Merits review 238
(n) Blanket and bright line rules 239
(o) Proportionality and procedural safeguards 243
(p) Evidential issues 244
(q) Evidence and judicial review proceedings 251

4. Other Convention Standards 254
   (a) Measures taken in the public interest 254
   (b) Strict necessity 255

5. Equality 261

6. Weight and Latitude 267
   (a) Introduction 267
   (b) Overview of the proper approach 272
   (c) Unqualified rights 273
   (d) Qualified rights 275
   (e) Reasons for affording weight to the assessment of the primary decision-maker 276
   (f) Discretionary area of judgment 297

7. National Security 300
   (a) Historical position 300
   (b) National security after the HRA 305

Chapter 4: Scope of Protection of the HRA 311

Introduction

1. Personal Scope 312
   (a) Who May Bring Proceedings: The “Victim” Requirement 312
   (b) Public Authorities Under the HRA 337
   (c) Private Individuals and Bodies: The Horizontal Effect of the HRA 371

2. Freedom of Expression and Freedom of Religion 405
   (a) Freedom of Expression: section 12, HRA 406
   (b) Religious Bodies and Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion 414

3. The Extra-territorial Application of the HRA 418
   (a) Jurisdiction Under the Convention 418
   (b) Application of the HRA to Acts of UK Public Authorities Outside the United Kingdom 428

4. Substantive Restrictions on Convention Rights 434
   (a) Restrictions on Convention Rights Through the UN Charter 434
   (b) Justiciability 436
5. The Temporal Scope of the HRA 444
   (a) Introduction 444
   (b) Section 22(4) HRA 444
   (c) Appeals in Criminal Proceedings 445
   (d) Civil Proceedings 451
   (e) The “Reasonable Time” Requirement 454

Chapter 5: Impact of the HRA on Legislation 457

1. Introduction 458
   (a) Models for giving effect to the Convention rights 458
   (b) The interpretative obligation and the power to make declarations of incompatibility 459
2. The Scope of Section 3 460
   (a) Material scope 460
   (b) Personal scope--applicable to all organisations and persons 461
   (c) Temporal scope 461
3. Consistency with Parliamentary Sovereignty 462
   (a) The doctrine of implied repeal 464
4. Provisions Implementing EC Obligations 468
5. Ministerial Statements of Compatibility 468
6. The Joint Committee on Human Rights 472
7. Overview of the Approach to Statutes under the HRA 472
8. Stage 1(a): Determining Meaning by the Ordinary Principles of Interpretation and Disregarding section 3 474
   (a) “Ordinary” and “secondary” meanings 474
   (b) Legislative history 475
   (c) Common law presumptions 476
   (d) The principle of legality 477
9. Stage 1(b): Determining the scope of Convention rights 479
10. Stage 1(c): Determining whether there is an apparent incompatibility between the provision and a Convention right 481
11. Stage 2: Section 3’s Obligation: to “read and give effect to” legislation in a way which is compatible with the Convention rights “so far as it is possible to do so” 486
   (a) Overview of the role section 3 requires courts, tribunals and others to exercise 486
   (b) Guidance from the legislative history of the HRA 488
   (c) Reconsidering the interpretation of a statutory provision 490
   (d) The operation of section 3: types of incompatibility 491
   (e) Guidance on interpretation from cases concerned with European Community law 494
   (f) Guidance on interpretation from cases concerned with Commonwealth human rights instruments 498
   (g) “Reading down”, “reading broadly”, and “reading in” 499
   (h) The limits 504
   (i) The effect of a statement of compatibility under section 19 on what is “possible” under section 3 508
CONTENTS

(j) The effect of applying section 3 508
(k) Conclusion: the overall approach 509

12. Declarations of Incompatibility 510
(a) Introduction 510
(b) Which courts 511
(c) Which proceedings 512
(d) Which legislation 512
(e) A power not a duty 513
(f) The effect of a declaration 516
(g) The exercise of remedial power in HRA section 10 518
(h) Procedural issues 518

Chapter 6: Decision Making by Public Officials: Impact of Human Rights Principles 535

1. The Application of the HRA to Actions and Decisions of Public Authorities 536
(a) Applicability to both decisions and conduct 536
(b) Overlap in the effect of section 3 and section 6 of the HRA 537
(c) Defence under section 6(2) of the HRA 539
(d) Action taken under statutes that strike a fair balance 548

2. Judicial Review after the Human Rights Act 551
(a) Fundamental difference from traditional form of judicial review 551
(b) Proportionality: the forbidden process approach 559
(c) The Convention rights and relevant considerations doctrine 560
(d) Convention rights and error of law 567
(e) Policies, practices and individual consideration 568
(f) Legitimate expectations 571
(g) Article 6 and decisions of public officials which determine civil rights and obligations 577
(h) Impartiality 592
(i) When Article 6 will require full merits review by a court 595
(j) Article 6 and decisions of public officials that determine a criminal charge 597
(k) Tort law 600
(l) Negligence 602

Chapter 7: Remedies 617

1. Domestic Remedies in the Convention System 618
(a) The obligation to secure Convention rights and provide effective remedies 618
(b) The Strasbourg remedy is subsidiary to domestic remedies 620

2. Remedies under the Human Rights Act: an Overview 622
CONTENTS

(a) The interpretation of legislation: compatible interpretation and declarations of incompatibility 622
(b) Sections 7 and 8 of the HRA 624

3. The Importance of the Convention’s Remedial Provisions 631
   (a) Article 13: The right to an effective remedy 631
   (b) Article 41: “reparation” and “just satisfaction” 636
   (c) The approach of the Strasbourg Court 641

4. Judicial Remedies under Section 8 of the HRA 659
   (a) General approach 659
   (b) The practice of domestic courts under the HRA 661
   (c) Damages 669
   (d) Procedure for bringing HRA claims 697

5. Non-judicial “Remedies”: Remedial Orders under Section 10 of the HRA 709
   (a) Conditions precedent to the exercise of the remedial power 710
   (b) Ambit of the remedial power 712
   (c) Procedure for making a remedial order 714

Chapter 8: Scotland, Northern Ireland and Wales 717

1. Introduction 717
   (a) Overview 717
   (b) Jurisdiction in respect of devolution issues 719

2. Scotland 725
   (a) Human rights in Scotland 725
   (b) Scottish devolution 728
   (c) The HRA in Scotland 731
   (d) Protection of Convention rights in the devolution arrangements 732
   (e) Legal proceedings 747

3. Northern Ireland 761
   (a) Human rights in Northern Ireland 761
   (b) Devolution in Northern Ireland 771
   (c) The HRA in Northern Ireland 777
   (d) Protection of the Convention rights in the devolution arrangements 782
   (e) Legal proceedings 791

4. Wales 798
   (a) Introduction 798
   (b) Welsh devolution 798
   (c) Protection of Convention rights in the devolution arrangements 803
   (d) Legal proceedings 807

Appendices 815

Appendix 1: Human Rights Act 1998 815
Appendix 2: Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 839
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix 3: Rights Brought Home: The Human Rights Bill</th>
<th>851</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Index** 881