ACCOUNTABILITY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS BY INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS

Jan Wouters
Eva Brems
Stefaan Smis
Pierre Schmitt
(eds.)
# CONTENTS

*Summary of Contents* ................................................................. v
*Abbreviations* ..................................................................... xxi

Accountability for Human Rights Violations by International Organisations:
Introductory Remarks

Jan WOUTERS, Eva BREMS, Stefaan SMIS and Pierre SCHMITT ............. 1

I. Background ................................................................. 1
II. Aim of the Book .......................................................... 1
III. Contentious Legal Issues .................................................. 5
    A. Are International Organisations Bound by International
       Human Rights Norms? ......................................................... 5
    B. Accountability of Member States of International
       Organisations ................................................................. 10
    C. Obstacles to Accountability of International Organisations .... 11
    D. The Need to Create Mechanisms To Ensure Accountability .... 13
IV. Structure of the Book ....................................................... 15
    A. General Concepts .......................................................... 15
    B. Peace and Humanitarian Operations .................................. 16
    C. International Civil Administration ..................................... 16
    D. Economic Governance .................................................... 17
    E. Staff of International Organisations ................................. 18

PART I. GENERAL CONCEPTS

Accountability of International Organisations: An Evolving Legal Concept?

Ige F. DEKKER .................................................................. 21

I. Introduction ................................................................. 21
II. Concepts of Accountability ............................................... 23
    A. Approaches to Accountability ........................................... 23
    B. The ILA Concept of Accountability ................................... 25
    C. Critical Assessment ....................................................... 28
III. An institutional Concept of Accountability .......................... 31
    A. An Institutional Approach ............................................... 31
B. Accountability as a Legal Institution ........................................... 32
C. Accountability and the Institutional Character of International Organisations ........................................... 34

IV. Concluding Observation ......................................................... 36

International Organisations as Independent Actors: Sweet Memory or Functionally Necessary?
Niels M. Blokker ................................................................. 37

I. Introduction ........................................................................... 37
II. Attribution of Powers ............................................................. 39
III. International Legal Personality ............................................... 43
IV. The Theory and Practice of the Independence of International Secretariats ........................................... 46
V. Concluding Remarks ............................................................. 49

Human Rights and the Rise of International Organisations:
The Logic of Sliding Scales in the Law of International Responsibility
Olivier De Schutter ................................................................. 51

I. The Human Rights Obligations of International Organisations ...... 55
   A. The international Organisation 'Succeeding' to the Human Rights Obligations of Its Member States .......... 57
   B. Human Rights as Part of General Public International Law ...... 68
II. The Problem of Accountability – One: State Responsibility ........ 73
   A. The Establishment of the International Organisation and the Initial Transfer of Powers ......................... 77
   B. The Decision-Making Process Within the Organisation ......... 86
   C. The Implementation of Decisions Adopted by International Organisations ........................................... 94
   D. The Logic of Sliding Scales in Examining Questions of State Responsibility ........................................... 102
III. The Problem of Accountability – Two: The Responsibility of International Organisations .................. 104
   A. Self-Regulation ............................................................... 104
   B. Accession to International Human Rights Treaties .......... 110
   C. The Role of National Courts .............................................. 119
   D. The Logic of Sliding Scales Expanded ................................ 123
IV. Conclusion ........................................................................... 125
Binding International Organisations to Member State Treaties
or Responsibility of Member States for Their Own Actions in the
Framework of International Organisations

Frederik NAERT .......................................................... 129

Introduction .............................................................. 129

I. Are International Organisations Bound by Treaties Concluded
   by Their Member States? .............................................. 130
   A. General Considerations ........................................ 130
   B. The EU, GATT and Customs Agreements .................. 136
   C. The EU and the ECHR ........................................... 138
   D. The EU and Other Member State Treaties, Including
      the UN Charter .................................................. 139
   E. Other International Organisations ........................... 154

II. Some Reflections on Responsibility of Member States for Their
    Own Actions in the Framework of International Organisations .... 155
   A. Responsibility for the Actions of an International
      Organisation Resulting from Its Establishment ............ 156
   B. Responsibility of a Member State for Its Own Subsequent
      Conduct in the Framework of an International Organisation .... 162

Conclusion .............................................................. 168

The 'Italian job': How to Make International Organisations Compliant
with Human Rights and Accountable for Their Violation by Targeting
Member States

Matteo TONDINI ......................................................... 169

I. Introduction .......................................................... 169

II. A Few Remarks on Legal Personality and Accountability
    of International Organisations .................................. 172
   A. The Attribution of Legal Personality to International
      Organisations and Their Accountability to Third Parties .... 172
   B. The Establishment of Internal Claim Settlement Mechanisms .... 174
   C. 'Accountability' and 'Responsibility' .......................... 176
   D. The ILC Draft Articles ......................................... 177

III. Possible Responsibility of UN Member States in Peace Operations .... 180
   A. Possible Responsibility of Contributing States for
      Violations Committed by UN Military Forces ............... 180
   B. Possible Responsibility of Member States for Violations
      Committed by UN Police Forces and Civilian Officers ........ 185
   C. Possible Human Violations Committed by UN Territorial
      Administrations: The UNMIK Case ............................. 188
IV. Some Brief Remarks on International Organisations as Subjects Bound to Human Rights Law and Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Treaties .............................................. 191
   A. The Mandatory Nature of Human Rights Law for International Organisations .............................................. 191
   B. The Extraterritorial Application of Human Rights Conventions ................................................................. 193
V. The “Job”: Bringing States to Courts .............................................. 195
   A. Finding the Right Forum .............................................................. 195
   B. International Courts ................................................................. 198
VI. The “Italian Job” in the Most Recent Case Law (Be Assured – Your Sins Will Find You Out!) .............................................. 201
   A. The Behrami & Saramati Cases .............................................. 202
   B. The Al-Jedda Case ................................................................. 206
   C. Other Relevant Cases ............................................................... 208
VII. Concluding Remarks ............................................................... 211

PART II. PEACE AND HUMANITARIAN OPERATIONS

Human Rights Accountability of International Organisations in the Lead of International Peace Missions
Ulf HÄUSLER .............................................................. 215

I. Preliminary Remarks and Introduction .............................................. 215
II. The Institutionalisation of Transitional Authority – A Brief Typology of Peace Missions .............................................. 218
III. The Effects of Actions of Peacekeeping Operations on Human Rights .............................................. 222
   A. Exercise of Transitional Authority vis-à-vis Ex- and Would-Be-Belligerents or Governance Institutions in Receiving States .............................................. 223
   B. Exercise of Transitional Authority Directly Affecting the General Public .............................................. 226
   C. Conclusion ................................................................. 229
IV. Attribution of Conduct of Peacekeeping Operations to International Organisations .............................................. 229
   A. To Whom to Attribute I: Peace Missions or Lead Organisations? .............................................. 230
   B. To Whom to Attribute II: Lead Organisations or Contributing States? .............................................. 232
   C. Further Attribution Criteria .............................................................. 251
   D. Conclusion ................................................................. 253
## V. Defining the Limits of Transitional Authority of Peacekeeping Operations

A. The Emerging Customary International Law of Peace Missions ........................................ 255

B. General Principles of International Humanitarian and Human Rights Law .......................... 257

C. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 259

## VI. Balancing Public and Private Interests in the Framework of International Peacekeeping

A. Self-Defence .............................................................................................................. 259

B. Military Necessity and Operational Necessity ......................................................... 261

C. Claims .................................................................................................................... 264

D. Judicial Review of Operational Detention? .............................................................. 266

## VII. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 268

---

Accountability of the United Nations: The Case of Srebrenica

Peter R. BAEHR ................................................................. 269

I. Introduction ............................................................................................................... 269

II. What Happened at Srebrenica .............................................................................. 270

III. The Role of Dutchbat .......................................................................................... 274

IV. The Role of the 'International Community' ......................................................... 278

V. Accountability ........................................................................................................ 280

VI. Conclusion ............................................................................................................ 285

---

On the Social Life of International Organisations: Framing Accountability in Refugee Resettlement

Kristin Bergtora SANDVIK ..................................................... 287

I. Introduction ............................................................................................................... 287

II. The Problem ........................................................................................................... 288

III. Framing Legal Humanitarianism ........................................................................ 290

IV. Contextualising Accountability .......................................................................... 292

V. Resettlement as Humanitarian Practice ............................................................... 296

VI. Surviving Torture Credibly ................................................................................. 298

VII. Doing and Living Accountability Standards ..................................................... 302

VIII. Concluding Observations .................................................................................. 306

---