The Voice of a Child in Family Law Disputes

PATRICK PARKINSON
JUDY CASHMORE

Faculty of Law, University of Sydney, Australia
Contents

Preface v

1 The Debate About Children's Voices 1
   1.1 The Protective Approach to Children 2
   1.2 Views on the Capacities of Children 3
   1.3 Children as Participants 4
       1.3.1 Understanding children as social actors 7
       1.3.2 Understanding children as citizens 9
   1.4 The Pitfalls of Listening to Children 13
       1.4.1 Children may be placed in the middle of their parents' conflicts 14
       1.4.2 The risk of undue influence 15
       1.4.3 Children may be given the decision-making authority that the parents need to exercise 15
       1.4.4 Children's voices may provide an excuse for adults to avoid hard decisions 16
       1.4.5 The risk that children's voices will be used to facilitate irresponsible adult decisions 17
   1.5 Different Levels and Forms of Participation 19
   1.6 The Purpose of this Book 21

2 The Research 23
   2.1 The Importance of Multiple Perspectives 24
       2.1.1 The importance of children's and parents' views 27
       2.1.2 The importance of professionals' views: judges, lawyers and welfare professionals 28
   2.2 Research Method 29
       2.2.1 The participants and the interviews 30
   2.3 Practical and Ethical Issues in Research with Children 33
       2.3.1 Consent for children's participation 34
       2.3.2 Confidentiality and privacy of children's responses 36
       2.3.3 Format of interviews with children 37

3 The Different Ways of Hearing the Voice of the Child 39
   3.1 Legislative Principles for Participation 41
   3.2 Child-inclusive Mediation 43
   3.3 Family Reports 47
   3.4 Child Representatives 49
3.5 Children as Parties to Proceedings 53
3.6 Judicial Interviewing 55
3.7 Evidence from Children 59
3.8 The Filtering of Children's Voices 60

4 Children's and Parents' Views of Children's Participation 62
4.1 Preconditions for Children's Participation 63
4.2 Children's Views 64
  4.2.1 Children's reasons for wanting to have a say 67
  4.2.2 Children's reasons for not wanting to have a say 68
  4.2.3 Children's actual and perceived involvement 70
  4.2.4 How much say did children want? 73
  4.2.5 Having a say and the fairness of the arrangements 75
4.3 Parents' Views 77
  4.3.1 Should children have a say? 77
  4.3.2 Age, maturity and parental influence 80
  4.3.3 Parents' views on the benefits of children having a say 85
4.4 Children's and Parents' Views Compared 87
  4.4.1 Similarities and differences in children's and parents' views 87
  4.4.2 Differences between those who had experienced contested proceedings and those who had not 88
4.5 Voice and Choice in Children's Participation 89

5 Professional Views of Children's Participation 91
5.1 The Importance of Professional Perspectives 91
5.2 Family Lawyers 92
  5.2.1 Age, maturity and parental influence 93
  5.2.2 Workability and children's happiness 97
  5.2.3 Protection from participation 100
  5.2.4 Children as decision-makers 103
  5.2.5 Children's participation as about choices between adult positions 104
  5.2.6 Changing the system 105
5.3 Mediators and Counsellors 106
  5.3.1 Enlightenment 107
  5.3.2 Empowerment 108
  5.3.3 The involvement of children in mediation 108
  5.3.4 Workability 109
  5.3.5 Therapeutic benefits 110
  5.3.6 Concerns about pressure and manipulation 110
  5.3.7 Age, maturity and self-determination 112
  5.3.8 The risks of involving children in the litigation process 114
5.4 Judges
   5.4.1 Children's voices in the context of all the evidence 116
   5.4.2 Evaluating children's wishes 118
5.5 Lawyers v Welfare Professionals on Children's Participation 119
5.6 Participation, Decision-making and Parental Influence 120

6 Children's Involvement in The Litigation Process 123
   6.1 The Voice of the Child in Family Reports 123
      6.1.1 Entering the child's world 124
      6.1.2 Assessing the child's views 125
      6.1.3 Family reports and children's secrets 128
      6.1.4 Following up on outcomes 131
   6.2 The Role of Child Representatives 132
      6.2.1 Meeting with the child 133
      6.2.2 Ascertaining the views of the child 134
      6.2.3 Representing the child 136
      6.2.4 Respecting confidentiality 137
      6.2.5 Advising the child 138
   6.3 Counsellors, Lawyers and the Interpretation of Children's Voices 139
   6.4 Parents' Views 141
      6.4.1 What did parents think of the family report process? 141
      6.4.2 What did parents think of the children's lawyers? 145
   6.5 Children's Views 148
      6.5.1 What did children think of the family report process? 149
      6.5.2 What did children think of their legal representative? 152
   6.6 Filtering, Confidentiality and Feedback Mechanisms 154

7 Judicial Conversations With Children 158
   7.1 The Views of the Children 158
      7.1.1 Who would be the best person to talk with? 159
      7.1.2 Specific questions on talking with judges in chambers 160
      7.1.3 Children's reasons for wanting to talk with the judge 160
      7.1.4 Children's reasons for not wanting to talk with the judge 163
   7.2 Parents' Views 164
      7.2.1 Parents' reasons for favouring judges talking with children 165
      7.2.2 Parents' reasons for not favouring judges talking with children 167
      7.2.3 The preferred process 168
   7.3 Professionals in the Family Law System 169
      7.3.1 Areas of agreement 170
      7.3.2 Objections to judicial conversations with children 171