Asylum Law and Practice

Second edition

Mark Symes, BA (Oxon)
of Lincoln's Inn, Barrister

Peter Jorro, LLB
of Lincoln's Inn, Barrister

Special contributor – Chapter 13
Adrian Berry MA, MLitt
of the Inner Temple, Barrister

Foreword by
The Rt Hon The Lord Brown of Eaton-under-Heywood

Bloomsbury Professional
CONTENTS

Foreword v
Preface vii
Table of Statutes xxiii
Table of Statutory Instruments xxix
Table of EU Legislation xxxv
Table of International Treaties and Conventions xxxvii
Table of Cases xli

Chapter 1  History of the Refugee Convention, Sources of Refugee Law and Principles of Interpretation 1
  1 The Status of the Convention in English Law 2
  2 Sources of Refugee Law 6
    (a) The Qualification Directive 6
    (b) The Travaux Préparatoires 9
    (c) The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees 10
    (d) The UNHCR Handbook 12
    (e) Human rights instruments 15
    (f) Decisions from Foreign Courts 16
    (g) Academic Authority 18
  3 Construction of the Convention 18

Chapter 2  Well-founded Fear 31
  1 The Standard of Proof 31
  2 General Approach to the Assessment of Historical Facts 38
    (a) The Spirit of the Enquiry 39
    (b) The UNHCR Handbook 41
  3 Fairness and the Fact-Finding Process 42
  4 Confidentiality 43
  5 Features of the Asylum Seeker’s Account 44
    (a) Discrepancies 44
    (b) Fear of the Authorities 52
    (c) Interviews 53
    (d) Legal Representation at Interview 55
    (e) Witnesses of Trauma; Victims of Sexual Abuse 56
    (f) Vagueness; Political and Religious Knowledge 59
    (g) Dishonesty 59
    (h) Exaggeration 62
    (i) Plausibility 62
    (j) Plausibility and the Reasonable Man 66
    (k) Extraneous Considerations 67
  6 Relevant Factors Taken into Account by the Secretary of State 68
    (a) Failure to Claim Asylum in a Third Country 71
    (b) Failure to Claim Asylum at the Border 73
    (c) Delay in Claiming Asylum 74
Contents

(d) Intention to Return to the Country of Origin 76
(e) Corroboration 76
(f) Demeanour 79
(g) Language Analysis 80
(h) Evaluating Sexuality 81

7 Subjective Fear 82

8 Objective Risk 83
   (a) The Reality of Risk 87
   (b) Conjecture and Inference 87
   (c) Objective Risk: Timing of the Enquiry 89

9 Objective Risk: Factors in the Assessment 91
   (a) Focus on the Country of Origin 91
   (b) Sources of Information; the Fate of Returnees; Diplomatic
       Assurances 91
   (c) Prominence of the Individual 94
   (d) The Experiences of the Claimant’s Family 97
   (e) Generic Risk 97

10 Judgments on Foreign Countries 99

11 The Relevance of Past Events 100

12 The Relevance of Past Persecution 100

13 Change of Circumstances in the Country of Origin 104

14 Risk Based on Future Conduct 107

15 The Country of Origin – Departure and Return 109
   (a) Delay in Leaving the Country 109
   (b) Departure from the Country of Origin 110
   (c) Return to the Country of Origin 111
   (d) Risks arising from mode of return 112

16 Assessing Risks from Post-Departure Events 115
   (a) Fears Arising from Enquiries by the Status Determination
       Authorities 115
   (b) Fears Arising from Claiming Asylum 116

Chapter 3 Persecution 119

1 Persecution and human rights 121
   Analysing Human Rights Abuses: Domestic and
   International Perspectives 132

2 Persecution, State Protection, and Non-State Actors 133

3 Systematic Ill-treatment 135

4 Persistence and Persecution 136

5 Severity of Persecution 137

6 General Approach to Persecution 138

7 Forms of Persecution 139

8 Physical Harm 140
   Threats of Harm 142

9 The Subjective Nature of Persecution 143

10 Singling Out for Persecution 144

11 Persecution of Family Members 145

12 Atrocious Past Persecution 147
Contents

13 Persecution, Socio-Economic Rights and Discrimination 148
   (a) Denial of Employment as Persecution 151
   (b) Denial of Education as Persecution 153
14 Persecution and Armed Conflict 154
15 Prosecution and Persecution 159
   (a) The Criminalisation of the Exercise of Human Rights 164
   (b) Sexuality and Persecution 168
   (c) The Overcoming of Conscience as Persecution 173
   (d) Military Service Cases 174
   (e) Political Offences 189
   (f) Prosecution by States not Recognised by the International Community 193
   (g) Laws in Desuetude 194
   (h) Illegal Departure from the Country of Origin 195
   (i) Violation of Laws regarding Population Control 196
16 Inability to Return to the Country of Origin; Deprivation of Nationality 198

Chapter 4 The Convention Reasons and Causation 203
1 Race 204
2 Nationality 207
3 Religion 207
4 Political Opinion 213
   (a) Attributed Political Opinion 220
   (b) Future Activities 223
5 Membership of a Particular Social Group 225
   (a) Women as a Particular Social Group 240
   (b) Gay Asylum Seekers as a Particular Social Group 242
   (c) Family as Particular Social Group 243
   (d) Shared Employment and Particular Social Group 246
   (e) Victims of Criminals, Guerrillas and Forced Conscription as Members of a Particular Social Group 246
   (f) Population Control and Particular Social Group 248
6 Causation 252
   (a) ‘For Reasons Of’ 252
   (c) Discrimination and Causation 255
   (d) Intention and Causation 256
   (e) Mixed Motives and Causation 259
   (f) Inferences and Causation 262

Chapter 5 Protection Against Non-State Actors and Internal Relocation 265
1 Non-state Actors 265
   (a) Inability and Unwillingness; The History of ‘Sufficiency of Protection’ 267
   (b) Horvath and the Protection Test 269
   (c) Applying the Protection Test 272
   (d) Species of Non-State Actor 275
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(e) Article 1(f)(a): War Crimes</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(f) Article 1(f)(a): Crimes against Humanity</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(g) Serious Non-Political Crimes</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(h) Acts Contrary to the Purposes and Principles of the United Nations</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) Terrorism and Exclusion</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(j) Complicity</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(k) Command Responsibility</td>
<td>426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(l) Membership of Organisations</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(m) Defences to Exclusion: Coercion and Following Orders</td>
<td>430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(n) Defences to Exclusion: Lack of Capacity, Duress and Self-Defence</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(o) Family Members and Children</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 9** The Protection Owed to Refugees 435

1 The Prohibition on Refoulement: Article 33 435
   - (a) Limitations on the Prohibition on Refoulement 441
   - (b) Particularly Serious Crimes 444
   - (c) National Security Cases 448

2 Third Country Cases: The Situation in Principle 450
   - The Impact of Status Determination Abroad 458

3 Refugees Lawfully in the Country of Application: Article 32 460

4 Penalties for Illegal Entry: Article 31 462
   - (a) ‘Without Delay’ 463
   - (b) ‘Present Themselves without Delay’ 464
   - (c) ‘Good Cause’ 464
   - (d) ‘Penalty’ 465
   - (e) Future Application of Article 31 465

5 Protection and the Declaratory Nature of Refugee Status 465

**Chapter 10** Common European Asylum System and Subsidiary or Humanitarian Protection 467

1 The European Union Asylum Framework – the CEAS 468
   - (a) Pre-Tampere Resolutions and Positions 472
   - (b) The Dublin Convention 1990 475
   - (d) The ‘Dublin II Regulation’ 2003 481
   - (f) ‘The Refugee Qualification Directive’ 492
   - (g) Council Directive on Asylum Procedures 507

2 Subsidiary or Humanitarian Protection in the UK 517
   - (a) Qualification for Humanitarian Protection 517
   - (b) Exclusion from Humanitarian Protection 524
   - (c) Beneficiaries of Humanitarian Protection 526
   - (d) Cessation and Revocation of Humanitarian Protection 528
Chapter 11  Asylum and the Human Rights Convention 533

1 The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, 1950 533
   (a) The Nature of the Protected Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 536
   (b) Implementation 539
   (c) The European Court of Human Rights 540

   (b) Very Limited Retrospective Effect of the HRA 1998 552

3 The Human Rights Act 1998 and Immigration Control 553
   (a) Applicability of the HRA 1998 in Immigration Cases 553
   (b) The Immigration and Asylum Chamber of the Tribunal and the Human Rights Act 1998 554
   (c) Asylum Support Adjudicators (now judges of the First-tier Tribunal) and the Human Rights Act 1998 556
   (d) The Standard of Review on Appeal in Human Rights Cases 558
   (e) Bail Decisions and Human Rights 562
   (f) Appeals on Human Rights Grounds before the Special Immigration Appeals Commission 562
   (g) The Effect of the HRA 1998 on Judicial Review Claims 563
   (h) The Effect of the HRA 1998 on Appeals to the Court of Appeal 567

4 The Convention Rights Generally in the Context of Immigration Cases 568
   The Extent to which Convention Rights are Relevant in Terms of Deportation or Removal 570

5 Article 3 of the Human Rights Convention and its Applicability in Immigration Cases 576
   (a) Applicability of Article 3 in Immigration Cases 577
   (b) The Absolute Nature of the Right under Article 3 579
   (c) The Threshold or Level of Severity of Mistreatment Necessary to Amount to a Violation of Article 3 582
   (d) Burden and Standard of Proof and Assessment of Facts in Article 3 Immigration Cases 598
   (e) Sufficiency of Protection in Article 3 Immigration Cases 604
   (f) Internal Protection, Relocation and Article 3 612
   (g) Article 3 in Health Cases 613
   (h) Beneficiaries of Article 3 Protection 621

6 Other Incorporated Human Rights Relevant to Asylum Cases 623
   (a) Article 2 and Thirteenth Protocol, Article 1 624
   (b) Article 4 625
(c) Articles 5 and 6
(d) Article 7
(e) Article 8
(f) Articles 9, 10 and 11
(g) Article 12 and Protocol 1, Article 2
(h) Article 14

Chapter 12  Claiming Asylum in the United Kingdom

| Contents |
|----------|-----|
| 1 Claims for Asylum within the Context of Immigration Law | 639 |
| (a) Port Applications | 645 |
| (b) In-country Variation-Based Applications | 647 |
| (c) Deportation | 649 |
| (d) Administrative Removal | 656 |
| 2 Consideration of Asylum Claims | 660 |
| (a) The Procedure | 660 |
| (b) Spouses, Children and Dependents | 663 |
| (c) Child Applicants | 664 |
| (d) Victims of Trafficking | 666 |
| (e) Criteria for Assessing Asylum Claims in the UK | 667 |
| 3 Withdrawal of Asylum Claims and Voluntary Departure | 674 |
| 4 Decisions on Asylum Claims and their Consequences | 677 |
| (a) Grant of Asylum as a Refugee | 677 |
| (b) The Gateway Protection Programme | 680 |
| (c) Refugees and Family Reunion | 681 |
| (d) Exceptional Leave, Humanitarian Protection and Discretionary Leave | 686 |
| (e) Humanitarian Protection | 686 |
| (f) Discretionary Leave | 688 |
| (g) Appeal Rights for Persons Granted Humanitarian Protection or Discretionary Leave | 691 |
| (h) Outright Refusal of Asylum Claim | 692 |
| (i) Refusals in Variation Cases | 693 |
| (j) Notification of Refusals, Removal Directions and Rights of Appeal | 694 |
| 5 Certifications of Asylum Claims by the Secretary of State on their Refusal | 696 |
| (a) Clearly Unfounded Certifications | 696 |
| (b) Certifications on the Basis of Exclusion from the Benefits of the Refugee Convention | 704 |
| (c) Certifications on National Security Grounds | 707 |
| 6 Fresh Claims for Asylum Following Earlier Refusal | 708 |
| (a) The Judgment in Onibiyo | 708 |
| (b) Immigration Rules, Paragraph 353 | 711 |
| 7 Renewal of Refugee Status and Humanitarian Protection | 715 |
| 8 Transfer of Refugee Status | 718 |
| (a) European Agreement on the Transfer of Responsibility for Refugees 1980 | 718 |
| (b) Home Office Practice on Transfer of Refugee Status | 718 |
Contents

9 Ending Refugee Status and Humanitarian Protection and Revocation of Indefinite Leave 721

Chapter 13 Treatment of Asylum Seekers 725
1 Fingerprinting and Application Registration Cards (ARCs) 725
2 Induction Centres 726
3 Liability of Asylum Seekers to Detention 727
4 Detention pending consideration of asylum claims 736
5 The Detention and Control of Suspected Terrorists 739
6 Temporary Admission, Bail and Habeas Corpus 741
7 Employment for Asylum Seekers 748
8 Welfare Support for Asylum Seekers 749
9 The Scheme for Asylum Support 750
10 Failed Asylum Seekers 757
11 Persons released on bail 758
12 Accommodation Centres 759
13 Eligibility for Asylum Support 761
14 Unaccompanied asylum seeking children 764
15 Asylum Seekers entitled to Social Security Benefits 766
16 Refusal of support – Late Claim for Asylum 768
17 Application for Support: False or Incomplete Information 771
18 Ending of Eligibility for Support 772
19 Appeals against Refusals of Support 773
20 Social Security Benefits and Tax Credits for Refugees 774

Chapter 14 Third Country Cases 777
1 Introduction 777
2 The UK Domestic Approach up to 2004 777
   (a) Initial Development of the Approach to Third Country Removals Prior to 1996 777
   (b) Third Country Cases under the Asylum and Immigration Act 1996 and the Immigration and Asylum Act 1999 780
3 The UK Approach since 2004 791
   (a) Third Country Cases under the Asylum and Immigration (Treatment of Claimants, etc) Act 2004 and the Immigration Rules 791
   (b) Practical Application and the Effect of the Dublin II Regulation 798
   (c) Exercise of Discretion in Whether to Remove to a Third Country 802
   (d) Human Rights and Third Country Removals 808
4 Judicial Supervision in Third Country Cases 813
   (a) Appeals 813
   (b) Judicial Review 819

Chapter 15 Statutory Rights of Appeal 825
1 The Development of the Right of Appeal in Asylum Cases 825
   (a) Appeal Rights prior to the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 825
Contents

2 Rights of Appeal in Asylum Cases under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 (NIAA 2002) to the First-tier Tribunal, Immigration and Asylum Chamber

(a) Appeals against Immigration Decisions Relating to Exclusion or Imminent Removal from the United Kingdom 830
(b) Grounds of Appeal 833
(c) Appeals on Refugee Asylum Grounds under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002, ss 83 and 83A 836
(d) Limitations on Appeal Rights to the Tribunal: National Security 838
(e) Suspensive and Non-suspensive Appeal Rights: Clearly Unfounded Claims and Third Country Cases 840
(f) The One-Stop Procedure and Limitations on Subsequent Appeal Rights 842
(g) Appeals Pending and Lapsing 845
(h) The Statutory Duty of the First-tier Tribunal in Appeals under the Nationality, Immigration and Asylum Act 2002 847
(i) Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals in Asylum Cases to the First-tier Tribunal 850

3 Appeals to the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases 851

(a) Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases 852
(b) Statutory Powers and Duties of the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases 854
(c) Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals in Asylum Cases to the Upper Tribunal 856

4 Appeals to the Special Immigration Appeals Commission in Asylum Cases 857

5 Onward Statutory Appeals in Asylum Cases to the Appellate Court 862

(a) Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Relevant Appellate Court from the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases 862
(b) Statutory Powers and Duties of the Relevant Appellate Court on an Appeal from the Upper Tribunal in Asylum Cases 867
(c) Transitional Provisions in Respect of Appeals to the Appellate Court in Asylum Cases 867
(d) Statutory Rights of Appeal to the Appropriate Appellate Court from the SIAC in Asylum Cases 868

6 Judicial Review in Asylum Cases where Suspensive Statutory Right of Appeal is denied 868
Chapter 16 Procedure before the First-tier Tribunal; Evidence before the Immigration and Asylum Chambers

1 Procedure
   (a) Introduction
   (b) Pre Hearing Issues
   (c) Conduct of the Appeal and Directions
   (d) Appeals – Withdrawal, Abandonment, Determinations without Hearings and in the Absence of a Party
   (e) Representation
   (f) General Procedure
   (g) Determinations
   (h) Fast Track

2 Evidence
   (a) General Principles
   (b) Forms of Evidence
   (c) Expert Evidence

Chapter 17 Challenging the First-tier Tribunal and Procedures in the Upper Tribunal

1 Appeals and Review of First Instance Decisions: Practice and Procedure for Challenges via the First-tier Tribunal
   (a) Introduction
   (b) Decisions which may be Challenged by Appeal or Review
   (c) Jurisdiction upon Review and Appeal
   (d) The Tribunal’s Own Duty to identify Errors of Law
   (e) Permission to Appeal to the Upper Tribunal via the First-tier Tribunal – Time and Procedure
   (f) Service
   (g) The Respondent’s Duties of Service
   (h) Content and Treatment of the Application
   (i) Tribunal’s Duty regarding Review
   (j) Review of Determination for Administrative Error and Slips
   (k) Consequences of Procedural Irregularities
   (l) Transitional Cases: Time Limit for Making Applications
   (m) Transitional Cases: Procedure
   (n) Fast Track Cases

2 Appeals and Review of First Instance Decisions: Practice and Procedure for Challenges in the Upper Tribunal
   (a) Application for Permission to Appeal to the Upper Tribunal: Direct Applications
   (b) Considerations regarding Permission to Appeal
   (c) Late Applications to the Upper Tribunal
   (d) Grant or Refusal of Permission to Appeal
   (e) Response to the Notice of Appeal
   (f) Reply
Contents

3 Proceedings in the Upper Tribunal
   (a) Upper Tribunal: Character
   (b) General Powers of the Upper Tribunal
   (c) Objectives of Upper Tribunal; Duties of Parties; Case Management
   (d) Variation of Grounds
   (e) Remittal to the First-tier Tribunal
   (f) Remittal back to the Original Immigration Judge
   (g) Re-Making of Decisions in the Upper Tribunal
   (h) Fresh Evidence
   (i) Approach to Original Determination
   (j) Transfer of Proceedings
   (k) Transitional Cases
   (l) Events Leading to Deemed Abandonment
   (m) Service of Decisions
   (n) Irregularities in the Upper Tribunal
   (o) UNHCR in the Upper Tribunal; Representation Generally
   (p) Time in the Upper Tribunal
   (q) Fast Track Cases

4 The Role of the Senior Immigration Judiciary
   (a) The Tribunal and Consistency
   (b) Precedent and ‘Starring’
   (c) Reporting of Tribunal Determinations
   (d) The Role of the Tribunal in giving Country Guidance

5 Errors of Law
   (a) Common Errors of Law
   (b) Error of Law and Fresh Evidence
   (c) Erroneous Exercise of Jurisdiction by Tribunal
   (d) The ‘Three Month Rule’: Delay in the Credibility Assessment
   (e) Determinations
   (f) Findings of Fact
   (g) Flawed Findings of Fact
   (h) Reasons
   (i) Reasons and Credibility
   (j) Submissions and Authorities
   (k) Drafting Grounds of Appeal, including Challenges to conduct of the Hearing

6 Challenging the Upper Tribunal
   (a) Application for Permission to Appeal to Court of Appeal: Procedure
   (b) Application for permission to appeal against its own decision to the Upper Tribunal: Powers
   (c) Time Limit for Court of Appeal Application
   (d) Time Limit for Making Applications to Court of Appeal: Transitional Cases
Contents

(e) Challenges to the Upper Tribunal made to the Court of Appeal Directly 1114
(f) Asylum Appeals in the Court of Appeal 1116

Index 1119