The Definition of Subsidy and State Aid

WTO and EC Law in Comparative Perspective

LUCA RUBINI
Lecturer in Law and Deputy-Director of the Institute of European Law
Birmingham Law School

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
I INTRODUCTION AND FOUNDATIONS

Overview

1. Introduction

I. The definition of WTO subsidy and EC State aid: the topic and its importance

II. Comparing WTO law and EC law

A. Why compare?

B. Can WTO subsidy law and EC State aid law be compared?

C. ‘Context matters’: a case-study on legal interpretation

   Legal interpretation in the WTO

   Legal interpretation in the EC

   Brief parallel between WTO and EC law

D. A matter of importance: ‘inconsistencies’ between WTO subsidy law and EC State aid law at the definition level

III. Defining the definition

IV. The definition of subsidy and the interaction between scope and justification

A. Scope and justification, equality and distributive justice

B. Scope or justification: does it really matter?

IV. Book outline

2. Foundations: the purpose of subsidy control

Prelude: market, trade and competition

I. The objectives of the WTO and the EC

A. An analysis of the WTO

B. A parallel with the EC

C. Conclusions: constitution, community and shared interests

   The concept of community: implications for subsidy control
II. The goals of subsidy and State aid control in the WTO and EC 37
   A. First perspective: subsidies and market access 38
      The heart of the GATT bargain: the protection of market access 38
      State aids and the EC internal market 40
      Back to the GATT: striking the bargain's right balance 40
   B. Second perspective: subsidies, competition and market failures 41
      Introducing complexity: competition assessment, welfare analysis and political judgement 42
      Two case-studies on welfare standards 44
         Case-study 1: export and domestic subsidies 44
         Case-study 2: subsidies and consumer welfare 47
      Giving substance to subsidies' distortion: a competition-oriented approach 49
      Addressing market failures: subsidies and political judgements 52
      Technical issues 53
      Normative issues 54
   C. Conclusions: goals of subsidy control in the WTO and EC 56
      The goals of subsidy control in the GATT/WTO 56
      The goals of State aid control in the EC 59
      Coda: State aid and subsidy rules as competition regulation 62
      Conclusion: a matter of practical importance 67

III. The operation of subsidy control in the WTO and EC: overview and critique 68
   A. Summary of WTO and EC rules 68
      The WTO subsidy regime 68
      From GATT to WTO 68
      One subsidy, three categories 70
      The EC State aid regime 74
   B. Critical analysis 80
      Drafting tests and provisions 80
      Type of control and remedies 81
      Supranational and/or unilateral 81
      Transparency and control 82
      Remedies 85

II FORMS OF GOVERNMENTAL ACTION

Overview 90

3. Introduction: governmental intervention in the economy and subsidies 91
   I. Distinguishing financial assistance and regulation 91
      A. Forms of financial assistance 92
      B. Forms of regulation 93
## II. Conceptualizing the distinction between financial assistance and regulation

A. The complexity of the action 94  
B. The complexity of the financial dimension 96  
C. The significance of prerogatives 97

## III. Techniques to define the legal relevance of the governmental action 97

## IV. Legal treatment of regulatory measures 99

## V. Forms of governmental action and objectives 100

A. Self-defence and permitted remedies in rule-oriented systems: the case of retaliatory subsidies 100  
B. The place of objectives in subsidy legal analysis 102

---

### 4. The forms of governmental action covered by WTO subsidy rules 105

#### I. Formulations of the definition of subsidy and rules of imputability 105

A. GATT era 105  
B. WTO era 107

**SCM Agreement** 108

- Article 1.1(a)(1) of the SCM: the financial contribution requirement 108  
- Interpretation and function of the financial contribution 108  
- The fourth subparagraph of Article 1.1(a)(1) of the SCM: rules of imputability and ‘guarding’ mechanisms 111  
- Subparagraph (iv) between restrictiveness and expansiveness 111  
- The quest for a balance: the development of the law 112  
- The quest for a balance: analysis of the law 113  
- Interlude on the other form of indirect action (payments to funding mechanism) 115  
- Two provisos consolidating the function of the financial contribution 116

Conclusions 122

**Article 1.1(a)(2) of the SCM: any income or price support—an additional concept in search of an expansive reading** 123

**Agreement on Agriculture (AG)** 125

- Introduction: AG and SCM Agreement, definitions and relationships 125  
- The forms of governmental action under the AG 126  
- The rule of imputability in Article 9.1(c) of the AG 128  
- Abstract rules of imputability: the definitions of ‘government agency’ and ‘public body’ 130
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two concluding parallels  132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparing Article 9.1(c) of the AG and Article 1.1(a)(iv) of the SCM  132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comparing abstract and concrete rules of imputability  134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Origin of the resources  135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Premise on definitions: costs between economics and accounting  135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. GATT era  136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. WTO era  138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCM Agreement  139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The financial contribution: uncertain compromise or creeping victory?  139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article 1.1(a)(2) of the SCM: forms of income or price support  141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarifying the ambiguity of the financial contribution: Canada—Aircraft  141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exercise of interpretation: the financial contribution and the ‘cost to government’  143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textual and contextual interpretation  143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation ‘in the light of the object and purpose’ of the treaty  145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness, preparatory works, restrictive interpretation  146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion  148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The forms of governmental action covered by EC State aid rules  149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Formulation of the definition of State aid  149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Broad language between potentially wide coverage and prevailing interpretation  149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Boundaries  152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Rules of imputability under Article 87(1) EC  152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. No precise rule of imputability  153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. A brief review of the case-law  154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Stardust Marine test  155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. The Pearl case: the double role of the concept of control in a boundary-case  157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Analysis of the rule of imputability under Article 87(1) EC  158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Stardust’s rationalization: towards a flexible and case-by-case rule  158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond Stardust: imputability and regulatory measures  159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Origin of resources  160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The case-law on the ‘State resources’  160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The first period: fluctuations  161</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

The second period: towards stability?  162
The third period: perplexities  165
B. Analysis of the 'State resources' requirement  170
  Extensive interpretation  170
  Restrictive interpretation  172
  Method of financing and legal certainty  173
C. Conclusions  178

6. Forms of governmental action: internal and external perspectives  181
   I. Critical and comparative analysis, internal and external perspectives  181
   II. The regulation of subsidies and of State aids: the 'internal perspective'  181
      A. Recapitulation of the state of the law in the two legal systems  181
         WTO law  182
         EC law  183
      B. Critical and comparative assessment  183
   III. The other rules: the 'external perspective'  188
      A. Sketching the terms of the problem: rules and system  188
      B. Rules interplay and system coherency  189
      C. An application: subsidies in EC and WTO law  190
         Alternative application, exclusion of subsidy rules  190
         Cumulative application, subsidy and other rules  192
         State aid compatibility and other rules  194
         Applicability of different rules: implications  194
         Conclusions  198

III THE ADVANTAGE ANALYSIS

Overview  200

7. The advantage analysis: an introduction  203
   I. Comparison and benchmarks  203
      A. Benchmarks: an insight from economics  204
      B. Economic and non-economic activity, market and normative benchmarks  205
   II. How the analysis works  205
      A. Norm and exception: the derogation test  205
      B. Defining the norm, determining the exception: variations on the theme  207
   III. The context of the advantage analysis: market and public role redefinition  208
      A. Two characters in search of identity: the market and the government  208
B. Economic and non-economic activities:
   a conceptual clarification 210
   Public and private goods 210
   Publicly provided private goods 211
   Two lessons for the advantage analysis 213
C. Public interest between scope and justification 214

8. Economic activity and the advantage analysis 217
   I. The market: a complex paradigm 217
      A. The adoption of the principle 217
         From reticence to consolidation 217
         First comments 219
      B. Market benchmarks: complex decisions, difficult reviews 220
         The complexity of business decisions 220
         Normative latitude: ‘standards’ vs ‘rules’ 220
         The review of business decisions 222
         Market benchmarks: examples of complexity 222
         (a) Diversity of investment objectives 222
         (b) Restructuring of companies in difficulties and investment of large sums 224
         (c) Ambivalence of market indicators 225
   II. The interaction between public intervention in the economy and market 226
      A. Case-study 1: influence of the public intervention in the economy on market analysis 227
         Regulation: Canada—Dairy (Article 21(5) I) 227
         Economic and other policies: US—Lead and Bismuth II and US—Countervailing Measures on Certain EC Products 228
         Commercial presence: US—Softwood Lumber IV 229
         Comments on the case-study 232
      B. Case-study 2: market logic expansion and redefinition of the public intervention in the economy 233
         The La Poste saga: natural monopoly, network infrastructure and public services 234
         Comments on La Poste 236
         (a) The incomparable and the ineffable: the singularity of natural monopolies and the protean nature of public services 236
         (b) ‘Normal market conditions’ and ‘objective and verifiable elements’ 238
         (c) Access to infrastructures and market benchmarks 239
         Infrastructure and market under State aid rules 240
         (a) The traditional approach 240
         (b) Market logic expansion and multi-layered analysis 241
Contents

The regulation of infrastructure under WTO subsidy rules 243
(a) The exclusion of ‘general infrastructure’ 244
(b) Towards a new approach 245
C. Concluding remarks on the case-studies: the interplay between two forces 245

III. The step forward: from difficulty to criticism 246
A. First criticism: the fallacy of the market paradigm 246
   The criticism and its refutation 246
   A flexible solution 249
   Final gloss: advantage analysis and distortion 251
B. Second criticism: the inconsistency of the market paradigm with the public interest 252
   WTO law 253
      The definition of subsidy in the Tokyo Round Subsidies Code and public policy objectives:
      US—Lead and Bismuth I 253
      The benefit requirement in the SCM and public policy objectives 255
   EC law 255
      Conclusions: distinction between market and public interest 259

IV. A word of conclusion: the redemption of the market paradigm 259

9. Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the WTO 261
I. Tax measures 261
   A. A methodological premise: the advantage analysis between ‘financial contribution’ and ‘benefit’ 261
      The fabric and the position of the advantage analysis 262
   B. Case study: the US—FSC dispute 263
      Introduction 264
      The ‘but for’ test between simplicity and inadequacy 265
      The Panel: the choice of simplicity 265
      The Appellate Body: the recognition of inadequacy 267
      Preliminary conclusions: the ‘but for’ test is insufficient 268
      More sophistication: derogation test and comparative test 269
      Panel (Article 21.5 DSU): a derogation test in disguise? 269
      Appellate Body (Article 21.5 DSU): the ‘new’ comparative test 271
      Comparative and derogation test between norm and exception 272
   C. Some implications of the case-study 274
      The share of sovereignty in tax matters: foreign economic processes and local taxation 274
      The taxation of foreign economic processes 274
Contents

Territorial and worldwide taxation: economic and legal considerations 274
Border tax adjustments: a confirmation 277
Local taxation 279
The analogy between international and local taxation under subsidy rules 279
Derogation test and objectives: the core of the 'scope/justification' interplay 279
The role of 'objectives' in subsidy rules and 'aims' in Article III of the GATT 281

II. Regulatory measures 283
III. Public goods 283
IV. 'Derogation' and 'discrimination': a parallel with Article III of the GATT 285

10. Non-economic activity and the advantage analysis in the EC 287
I. Tax measures 287
   A. The derogation test in taxation 287
   B. A conceptual gloss: advantage analysis, derogation test and specificity 289
   C. The operation of the derogation test and the critical role of objectives 290
      What is a general (tax) rule? 291
      What is a derogation (or discrimination)? 295
      The divergence between the objectives of the measure and the general rule 295
      The distinction between objectives 296
      'Navigating between the poles': the risk of conflating scope and justification 297
      An assessment of the case-law 298
         (a) Correct reasoning and correct outcome 299
         (b) Unclear reasoning but correct outcome 300
         (c) Incorrect reasoning and incorrect outcome 302
   D. Some applications 302
      Technical rules 302
         Gil Insurance 303
         The issue of negative aid 304
      Local taxation 306
      Environmental taxes 307

II. Regulatory measures 309
   A. Employment deregulation 310
   B. The regulation of debt 311

III. Public goods 314
11. Concluding remarks: objectives and the advantage analysis 317

I. Concluding remarks: subsidies between market and objectives 317
   A. The expansion of market logic: ineluctable process? 317
   B. Derogating? Norm and exception, and the objectives search 318
   C. The attraction of the objectives: scope or justification? 319

II. Exploring the scope-justification interplay: case-study on the financing of public services 319
   A. Public services: their mission, their problem, their relationship with State aid/subsidy rules 320
   B. The financing of public services under EC State aid rules: the Altmark decision 321
      The stakes and the clash 321
      The Ferring and Altmark decisions 321
      The interplay between scope and justification: separation or conflation? 325
   C. The financing of public services under WTO subsidy rules: the GATS 328
      Public services in an international context: between increasing concerns, diversity and official recognition 328
      The current State of the law (and the prospects for the future) 329

IV BENEFICIARIES

Overview 334

12. The identification of the beneficiaries 335
   I. Introduction 335
   II. Two case-studies 336
      A. 'Input' or 'upstream' subsidies 337
         The US—Pork dispute 338
         The US—Softwood Lumber III and IV disputes 341
         Input 'State aids' and conclusions 343
      B. Sale of companies or assets 344
         The pass-through of the benefit: the position of the buyer between the use of presumptions and the market 344
         Presumption of pass-through of the advantage: against automatism 345
         Presumption of exhaustion of the advantage: the market and the government intervention 346
The distinctions between the company and its owners and between share, business and asset deals 350
WTO law 350
EC law 353

The case of circumvention of the repayment 354
EC law 354
WTO law 356

13. The idea and analysis of specificity 359
I. Introduction 359
II. The justification of the idea of specificity 359
A. Economic rationales 360
B. Non-economic rationales 364
C. A truly political economy justification 365
III. The application of the specificity test 366
A. The specificity analysis and its test 366
B. The specificity test between limitation, flexibility, certainty and expansiveness 368
The definition of ‘certain’ (how many is ‘certain’?) 368
The examples of export and regional aid 369
Specificity, objective requirements and discretionality 371
De facto specificity 372
Difficulty of distinguishing between specific and generic measures 373
How to distinguish then? 374

IV. Conclusions 376

V. DISTORTION OF COMPETITION 380

14. The distortion of competition 381
I. Subsidies from market access to distortion of competition 381
A. How can subsidies distort competition? 381
The impact of subsidies on competition 382
Assessment of the impact 385
Two case-studies on subsidies and locational competition 387
Case-study 1: Compensation of regional location costs 388
Case-study 2: Mobile investment and location decisions 389
II. Critical interpretation of the standards: from trade to competition 392
   A. EC law: ‘distortion of competition’ and ‘effect on trade’, revisiting two requirements 392
      Distortion of competition 393
      The traditional interpretation and its critique 393
      Effect on trade 398
      Effect on trade: a jurisdictional and substantive requirement between free movement and State aid 398
   B. WTO law: a bundle of standards, but what rationales? 401
      Prohibited subsidies 401
      Actionable 404
      Injury 406
      Nullification or impairment of benefits 410
      Serious prejudice 412

III. Conclusions 416

Conclusions 419

Bibliography 425
Index 443