FORMS OF RESPONSIBILITY IN INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

International Criminal Law Practitioner Library Series

Volume I

GIDEON BOAS

JAMES L. BISCHOFF

NATALIE L. REID

The views expressed in this book are those of the authors alone and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia or the United Nations in general.
Contents

Foreword

Table of authorities

1 Introduction
  1.1 Forms of responsibility in international criminal law 1
  1.2 Scope of this book and terminology used 4

2 Joint criminal enterprise
  2.1 Origins and development of Joint Criminal Enterprise in the jurisprudence of the ad hoc Tribunals 10
  2.2 Limited application of JCE in the ICTR 28
  2.3 Elements of Joint Criminal Enterprise 33
    2.3.1 Physical elements 34
      2.3.1.1 The JCE consisted of a plurality of persons: first physical element 35
      2.3.1.2 Common plan, design, or purpose: second physical element 37
      2.3.1.3 The accused participated in the JCE: third physical element 44
    2.3.2 Mental elements 51
      2.3.2.1 Mental elements of the first category of JCE 51
        2.3.2.1.1 Voluntary participation 51
        2.3.2.1.2 Shared intent 52
      2.3.2.2 Mental elements of the second category of JCE 57
        2.3.2.2.1 Personal knowledge 57
        2.3.2.2.2 Intent to further criminal purpose 59
        2.3.2.2.3 Shared intent for specific-intent crimes 67
      2.3.2.3 Mental elements of the third category of JCE 68
Contents

2.3.2.3.1 Intent to participate and further criminal purpose 68
2.3.2.3.2 Accused's anticipation of natural and foreseeable commission of charged crime 70

2.4 The Brdanin Trial Judgement: reining in the expansion of JCE? 84
2.4.1 The Brdanin Trial Judgement 85
2.4.2 Warning signs before the Brdanin Trial Judgement 89
2.4.3 Precedent considered in the Brdanin Trial Judgement 93
2.4.4 Post-Brdanin jurisprudence 96
2.4.5 Assessing the impact of Brdanin 103

2.5 Indirect co-perpetration: a new form of common-purpose liability? 104
2.5.1 The Stakić Trial Judgement 105
2.5.2 The prosecutor's response to the Brdanin and Stakić Trial Judgements 109
2.5.3 The March 2006 Milutinović decision 112
2.5.4 The Stakić Appeal Judgement 114
2.5.5 The Gacumbitsi Appeal Judgement 116
2.5.6 Assessing the impact of Milutinović, Stakić and Gacumbitsi 121

2.6 Joint Criminal Enterprise and its analogues in the International Criminal Court and internationalised tribunals 124
2.6.1 The International Criminal Court 124
2.6.2 The Internationalised Tribunals 128
2.6.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 128
2.6.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 133
2.6.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 136
2.6.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT), formerly known as the Iraqi Special Tribunal (IST) 137

2.7 Conclusion 140

3 Superior responsibility 142
3.1 Origins and development of the superior responsibility doctrine 145
3.1.1 The roots of the superior responsibility doctrine 145
3.1.2 Developments subsequent to the Second World War 148
### 3.1.3 Historical evolution of the elements of superior responsibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-section</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.1</td>
<td>Historical evolution of the subordinate-superior relationship element</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.1.1</td>
<td>Post-Second World War cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.1.2</td>
<td>Additional protocols</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.1.3</td>
<td>Statutes of the <em>ad hoc</em> Tribunals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2</td>
<td>Historical evolution of the mental element</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2.1</td>
<td>Post-Second World War cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2.2</td>
<td>Additional protocols</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2.3</td>
<td>The Kahan Report (Israeli Commission of Inquiry)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2.4</td>
<td>The Statutes of the <em>ad hoc</em> Tribunals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.2.5</td>
<td>ICC Statute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.3</td>
<td>Historical evolution of the 'necessary and reasonable measures' element</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.3.1</td>
<td>Post-Second World War cases: 'necessary and reasonable measures'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.3.2</td>
<td>Post-Second World War cases: duty to prevent as a separate duty?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1.3.3.3</td>
<td>Additional protocols</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.2 Elements of superior responsibility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-section</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>Elements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.1</td>
<td>A superior-subordinate relationship existed between the accused and the person for whose criminal conduct he is alleged to be responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2</td>
<td>The accused knew or had reason to know that the criminal conduct in question was about to be, was being, or had been realised by one or more subordinates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2.1</td>
<td>Actual knowledge: first alternative mental element</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2.2</td>
<td>Constructive knowledge: second alternative mental element</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.3</td>
<td>The accused failed to take the necessary and reasonable measures to prevent or punish the subordinate criminal conduct in question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.3.1</td>
<td>Common sub-element for the failure to prevent and the failure to punish</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2.1.3.2 First form of superior responsibility: the failure to prevent 227
3.2.1.3.3 Second form of superior responsibility: the failure to punish 229
3.3 The scope of the subordinate criminal conduct that may give rise to superior responsibility 237
3.4 Superior responsibility in the International Criminal Court and internationalised tribunals 252
3.4.1 The International Criminal Court 252
3.4.1.1 A bifurcated standard 253
3.4.1.2 Mental element: a higher standard for civilian superiors 258
3.4.1.3 Causation 260
3.4.1.4 Past crimes and independent obligations 262
3.4.2 The internationalised tribunals 264
3.4.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 264
3.4.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 268
3.4.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 271
3.4.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) 272
3.5 Conclusion 274
4 Complicity and aiding and abetting 278
4.1 The modes of participation in genocide: inchoate crimes or forms of responsibility? 280
4.2 The relationship between ‘aiding and abetting genocide’ and ‘complicity in genocide’ 291
4.3 Elements of aiding and abetting 303
4.3.1 Physical elements 304
4.3.1.1 Practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support: first physical element 305
4.3.1.1.1 The accused lent practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support to the physical perpetrator in committing a crime 305
4.3.1.1.2 The accused may aid and abet by mere presence at the scene of the crime 307
4.3.1.1.3 Does a form of responsibility known as ‘aiding and abetting by omission’ exist in international criminal law? 310
4.3.1.1.4 The accused may aid and abet in the planning, preparation, or execution of a crime, and before, during, or after the crime of the physical perpetrator 315
4.3.1.1.5 The accused need not be physically present when the physical perpetrator commits the crime 316
4.3.1.2 Substantial effect: second physical element 317
  4.3.1.2.1 The practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support had a substantial effect on the commission of the crime by the physical perpetrator 317
4.3.2 Mental elements 319
  4.3.2.1 Intentional action 319
    4.3.2.1.1 The accused acted intentionally with knowledge or awareness that his act would lend assistance, encouragement, or moral support to the physical perpetrator 319
  4.3.2.2 Awareness of crime 321
    4.3.2.2.1 The accused was aware of the essential elements of the physical perpetrator’s crime, including the perpetrator’s mental state 321
  4.3.2.3 The requisite intent of the accused aider and abettor for specific-intent crimes 324
4.4 Elements of complicity in genocide 327
  4.4.1 Practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support: first physical element 328
    4.4.1.1 The accused lent practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support to the physical perpetrator in committing a crime 328
4.4.2 Substantial effect: second physical element
4.4.2.1 The practical assistance, encouragement, or moral support had a substantial effect on the commission of the crime by the physical perpetrator

4.4.3 Mental elements: intentional action and awareness of crime
4.4.3.1 The accused acted intentionally, and was aware of the essential elements of the crime of genocide, including the perpetrator's mental state

4.5 Complicity and aiding and abetting in the International Criminal Court and internationalised tribunals
4.5.1 The International Criminal Court
4.5.2 The internationalised tribunals
4.5.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL)
4.5.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC)
4.5.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC)
4.5.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT)

4.6 Conclusion

5 Planning, instigating and ordering
5.1 Evolution of the elements of planning, instigating and ordering in the jurisprudence of the ad hoc tribunals
5.2 Elements of planning
5.2.1 Design of conduct with intent or awareness of substantial likelihood
5.2.2 Substantial contribution
5.3 Elements of instigating
5.3.1 Prompting of conduct with intent or awareness of substantial likelihood
5.3.2 Substantial contribution
5.4 Elements of ordering
5.4.1 Instruction to engage in conduct with intent or awareness of substantial likelihood
5.4.2 Authority of accused
5.4.3 Direct and substantial contribution
5.5 Planning, instigating and ordering in the International Criminal Court and internationalised criminal tribunals
5.5.1 The International Criminal Court
Contents

5.5.2 The internationalised tribunals 373
  5.5.2.1 Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) 373
  5.5.2.2 East Timor: Special Panels for Serious Crimes (SPSC) 376
  5.5.2.3 The Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia (ECCC) 377
  5.5.2.4 Supreme Iraqi Criminal Tribunal (SICT) 378

5.6 Conclusion 379

6 Concurrent convictions and sentencing 381
  6.1 Choosing among forms of responsibility 382
    6.1.1 Concurrent convictions pursuant to more than one Article 7/6(1) form of responsibility 388
    6.1.2 Concurrent convictions pursuant to Article 7/6(1) and Article 7/6(3) 393
  6.2 Forms of responsibility and sentencing 406

7 Conclusion 415
  7.1 Innovations in the law on forms of responsibility in the ad hoc Tribunals 416
  7.2 The ad hoc Tribunals’ emphasis on ‘commission’ liability 419
  7.3 Limitations on trial chamber discretion in choosing forms of responsibility 423
  7.4 The future development of the law on forms of responsibility 424

Annex: Elements of forms of responsibility in international criminal law 426

Index 430