## Contents

*List of Abbreviations* xv
*Notes on Contributors* xvii
*Table of Cases* xix
*Table of Legislation* xli

1. **Comparing Supreme Courts**
   1. Introduction 1
   2. The Main Institutional Features of Supreme Courts 3
   3. The Way in which Supreme Courts Operate 7
   4. The ‘Culture’ of Common Law Jurisdictions 11
   5. An Outline of Subsequent Chapters 14

2. **‘Restrained Activism’ in the High Court of Australia**
   1. Introduction 19
   2. Institutional Features of the High Court 21
      - Federal Origins 21
      - Jurisdiction 21
      - Appointment and Removal of Judges 23
      - Caseload and Decision-making Practice 24
      - Judicial Review, Human Rights and Separation of Powers 26
   3. Debate about Judicial Activism in the High Court 27
      - The Competing Normative Claims of Dixon and Mason 27
         - Sir Owen Dixon’s Approach to the Judicial Function 27
         - Sir Anthony Mason’s Approach to the Judicial Function 29
      - The Current Debate: Kirby and Heydon 30
   4. The Mason Court 32
      - Overview of the Mason Court 32
      - Common Law Cases: *Mabo, Dietrich, and Wik* 34
         - *Mabo v Queensland (No 2)* and Native Title to Land 34
         - *Dietrich v The Queen* 38
         - *Wik* and Capital C Conservatives 41
      - Constitutional Cases: *ACTV* and *Leeth* 44
         - *ACTV v Commonwealth* and Freedom of Political Communication 46
         - *Leeth v Commonwealth* and Equality 50
   - Constitutional Conclusions 55
## Contents

5. The Gleeson Court  
   - A New Species of Legalism? 55  
   - International Law and the Gleeson Court 59  
     - International Law and its Place in Australian Law 60  
     - Justice Kirby: Bangalore, Al-Kateb, and Beyond 61  
   - International Law Conclusions 64

6. Conclusion: Lessons from Antipodean Activism 65  
   - Time, Place, and Personnel 66  
   - Fluidity and Frontiers 66  
   - Action and Reaction 67

3. Judicial Activism in the Supreme Court of Canada 69  
   1. Introduction 69  
   2. The Political Dimensions of the Judicial Activism Debate 72  
   3. The Jurisprudential Dimensions of the Judicial Activism Debate 76  
   4. Judicial Activism and Dialogue Between Courts and Legislatures 78  
   5. Criminal Justice 80  
   6. National Security 88  
   7. Gay Rights 91  
   8. Aboriginal and Treaty Rights 97  
   9. Political Policies 100  
     - Unwritten Constitutional Principles 100  
     - Electoral Policy 103  
   10. Social and Economic Policies 104  
     - Sunday Closing and Mandatory Retirement Laws 105  
     - Language and Educational Policy 106  
     - Commercial Advertising 108  
     - Labour Policy 110  
     - Social Welfare Policy 112  
     - Health Care Policy 114  
   11. Conclusion 117

4. The Supreme Court of India 121  
   1. Introduction 121  
   2. Historical Background and Powers of the Supreme Court 123  
     - Jurisdiction 123  
   3. Judicial Activism: The First Phase 125  
     - The Beginnings 125  
     - The Golak Nath decision 127  
     - The Fundamental Rights Case 130  
     - The First Phase: An Assessment 131
Contents

4. Judicial Activism: The Second Phase 133
   The 'Supersessions' 133
   The Emergency and the Habeas Corpus Case 134
   The Second Phase: An Assessment 137

5. Judicial Activism: The Third Phase 138
   Post-emergency Assertiveness 138
   Public Interest Litigation 141
   PIL: Criticisms of Principle 144
   PIL: Practical Criticisms 150
   Non-PIL Activism 152
   The Third Phase: An Assessment 159

6. General Conclusions 163

5. The Supreme Court of Ireland 169
   1. Introduction 169
   2. The Historical Background 170
      The Impact of the 1937 Constitution 171
   3. The Function and Role of the Supreme Court 173
      The Article 26 Process 174
      Precedent 176
   4. Lack of Substantiation of Rights 178
   5. Use of Comparative Materials 178
   6. International Human Rights Instruments 182
      The European Convention on Human Rights 183
   7. Equality 186
      Gender Equality 188
   8. Economic and Social Rights 190
   9. Religion 194
   10. The Family 198
      Deference to Family Autonomy 199
      The Non-marital Family 202
      Nullity of Marriage 203
   11. Abortion 205
   12. Fair Trial Rights 209
   13. The Law of Torts 210
   14. Concluding Observations 214

6. Judicial Activism in Israel 217
   1. Introduction 217
   2. The Sources for Judicial Activism in Israel 219
      Aharon Barak's Theory of Law 219
      The Israeli Political System 221
Judicial Activism and the Israeli Form of Separation of Powers 223
The Israeli Legal System as a Mixed Legal System 223
The Structure of Israeli Courts 224
The Composition of the Judiciary and Judicial Selection 226

3. Judicial Activism in the Realm of Public Law 231
   Historical and Institutional Background 231
   Judicial Activism in the Early Days of the State of Israel 233
   Judicial Activism in Form—Access to the High Court of Justice 234
     Jurisdiction and Competence of the Court 235
     Judicial Review of Legislation 235
     The Jurisdiction of the High Court of Justice over the Occupied Territories 238
   The Discretionary Powers of the Court 240
     Standing 240
     Justiciability 242
     Judicial Review of the Knesset and the Attorney General 243
   The Substantive Public Law Applied by the Supreme Court 246
     A Judge-made Bill of Rights—Freedom of Expression and Derivative Liberties 247
     Judicial Activism in Matters of Security and Defence 250
     The New Constitutional Jurisprudence 258
     Reasonableness as the Primary Administrative Law Doctrine 260

4. Judicial Activism in the Realm of Private Law 261
   The Supreme Court Unchains Itself from English Common Law Precedents 262
   The Broad Interpretation of the New Civil Legislation 263
   The Development of Unjust Enrichment Law by the Court 266
   Judicial Activism in Other Areas of Private Law 267

5. Concluding Remarks 268

7. Judicial Activism and New Zealand’s Appellate Courts 273
   1. Introduction 273
   2. The New Zealand Constitutional Context 274
   3. Arguments For and Against Judicial Creativity in New Zealand 276
   4. The Retreat of the Privy Council 277
   5. The Fledgling Local Supreme Court 279
   6. Assessments of Judicial Activism in New Zealand 284
   7. Acceptable Judicial Creativity and Unacceptable Judicial Activism 301
   8. The Values Implicit in Plugging Constitutional and Legislative Gaps 302
11. Judges and Supra-National Norms 311
12. Rulings of Other Common Law Supreme Courts 314
13. The Altering of Previous Rulings 314
14. Judicial Developments Where Parliament has Spoken Inadequately 316
15. Opportunities to Develop the Law Declined by the Courts 317
16. Conclusion 322

8. Judicial Activism of a Special Type: South Africa's Top Courts Since 1994 323
   1. Constitutional Governance: The Context 324
      Court Structure and Judicial Attitudes 1910–1994 326
      Judicial Activism of a Special Type 328
   2. Implementing Civil and Political Rights 331
   3. Implementing Social and Economic Rights 341
   4. Redefining the Limits of Judicial Authority 345
   5. Developing Process and Remedies 351
   6. Realigning the Common Law by Importing Constitutional Values 353
      The Law of Delict: Defamation 353
      The Law of Delict: Wrongfulness 355
      The Law of Delict: Strict Liability 357
      Contract Law 358
      Criminal Law 359
   7. Drawing Lessons 360

   1. The Distinguishing Features of the House of Lords 363
   2. The Orthodoxy Regarding Judicial Activism in the United Kingdom 366
   3. Modelling Judicial Activism 369
   4. Constitutional and Administrative Law 371
   5. Human Rights and Equality Law 379
      Human Rights Law 379
      Equality Law 385
   6. International Law 387
   7. Negligence and Related Claims 390
   8. Homicide Law 404
   9. Other Decisions and Concluding Remarks 411
10. The United States of America

   1. ‘Judicial Activism’ and the Baseline Problem  
   2. The Avoidance Canon  
   3. Interpreting Statutes that Delegate Interpretive Authority  
   4. Conclusion  

Index