Access to Environmental Justice

A Comparative Study

Edited by

Andrew Harding

MARTINUS
NIJHOFF
PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2007
CONTENTS

The Contributors xv

Chapter 1
Access to Environmental Justice: Some Introductory Perspectives 1
Andrew Harding 1

I. ORIGINS 1
II. SOAS/A2EJ: AN OUTLINE 3
III. SOAS/A2EJ: THE FINDINGS 7
IV. THE CONTRIBUTIONS TO THIS BOOK 11
(a) Ghana (Accra) 11
(b) India (Bangalore) 11
(c) Indonesia 12
(d) Malaysia (Kuala Lumpur) 13
(e) Nepal 14
(f) Pakistan (Karachi) 15
(g) People's Republic of China 16
(h) South West Pacific 16
(i) Thailand 17
(j) United Kingdom 18
(k) United States 18
V. FINALLY ... 19

Chapter 2
Access to Environmental Justice in Ghana (Accra) 21
James S. Read 21

I. INTRODUCTION: GENERAL BACKGROUND 21
(a) Accra: the growth of the city and its people 23
(b) Accra: its economy in the national context 24
(c) Environmental law in Ghana in historical perspective 25
(d) Accra: an environmental crisis 26
II. CONTEXT: GENERAL ‘PARTICIPATION ENDOWMENTS’ 27
   (a) Policy framework for citizen participation 27
   (b) The constitutional foundation for participation 27

III. STRUCTURES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL DECISION-MAKING 30
   (a) National agencies and procedures 30
      (i) Ministry for Environment, Science and Technology 30
      (ii) National Development Planning 30
      (iii) Environmental Protection Agency 31
      (iv) Environmental Impact Assessment 32
      (v) Planning law 34
      (vi) Other legislation 35
      (vii) Judicial remedies 36
      (viii) Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice 38
   (b) Local agencies 39
      (i) Local government: structure and powers 39
      (ii) Local government in Accra 40
      (iii) Traditional authorities, local customary laws and indigenous culture 41
      (iv) Strengthening community management 43

IV. THE ROLE OF NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANISATIONS 44
   (a) CENCOSAD 44
   (b) La Mansaamo Kpee 45
   (c) Association of Vegetable Growers 45
   (d) Accra Sustainable Programme 46

V. GATEWAYS TO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION: RIGHTS, DECISION-MAKING AND PROCESS 47
   (a) Water 47
   (b) Air 49
   (c) Land 50
      (i) Land tenure in Ghana 51
      (ii) Access to land in Accra 52
      (iii) Access to land: self-help as a gateway to law reform 54
   (d) Waste disposal 55

VI. CONCLUSION 57

Chapter 3
Access to Environmental Justice in India’s Garden City (Bangalore) 59
Amanda Perry-Kessaris

I. AN ANATOMY ... OF PUBLIC RESPONSIBILITY 60
   (a) Municipal Corporation 60
   (b) Development Authority 60
   (c) Industrial Areas Development Board 61
(ii) Litigation against the police or the Public Prosecutor’s Office

III. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION
(a) Legal framework
(b) Getting started
(c) Getting an agreement
(d) Implementing the agreement
(e) Conclusion

IV. ACCESS TO LITIGATION AND MEDIATION AND FACTORS
SHAPING THEIR EFFECTIVENESS
(a) Economic conditions
(b) Liberalisation
(c) Decentralisation and democratisation
(d) State control
(e) The role of NGOs
(f) The image of the judiciary

V. CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 5
Access to Environmental Justice in Malaysia (Kuala Lumpur)
Andrew Harding and Azmi Sharom

I. INTRODUCTION

II. ENVIRONMENTAL LAW IN HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

III. STRUCTURE OF ENVIRONMENTAL DECISION-MAKING
(a) Local Government
(b) Planning and Development Control

IV. THE JUDICIARY
(a) Archaic rules of locus standi (standing)
(b) Procedural barriers
(c) Lack of development of planning law
(d) Tort actions
   (i) Causation
   (ii) Limitation
   (iii) Expert evidence
   (iv) Costs and representation

V. HUMAN RIGHTS

VI. WATER POLLUTION

VII. AIR POLLUTION

VIII. SQUATTER COMMUNITIES
(a) Land rights
(b) Case study: Kampung Merbau Berdarah

IX. LICENSING
Chapter 6
Access to Environmental Justice in a Politically Unstable Environment: A Case Study of Nepal
Surya Subedi

I. INTRODUCTION

II. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT
   (a) An EIA for All Major Development Projects
   (b) EIAG 1993
   (c) Environment Protection Act 1997
   (d) Environmental Protection Regulations 1997

III. ACCESS TO JUSTICE
   (a) Constitutional remedies
   (b) Remedies under the Environmental Protection Act 1997
   (c) The Civil Code
   (d) The case law
   (e) Individual right of access to environmental information

IV. CONCLUSION

Chapter 7
Access to Environmental Justice: Karachi's Urban Poor and the Law
Martin Lau

I. INTRODUCTION: KARACHI AND ITS URBAN POOR
   (a) The setting
   (b) Master plans
   (c) The informal housing market
   (d) Case study: Rehmanabad
   (e) Regularisation

II. THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK
   (a) Constitutional rights
   (b) Environmental laws
   (c) Environmental laws and the urban poor
   (d) Environmental litigation
   (e) Access to justice

III. CONCLUSION
Chapter 8
Towards a Greener China? Accessing Environmental Justice in the People's Republic of China

Michael Palmer

I. INTRODUCTION

II. THE LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK FOR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

III. INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

IV. SEEKING ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
(a) Avoidance and force
(b) Negotiation and mediation
(c) Umpiring – administrative penalties
(d) Umpiring – going to court
(e) Umpiring – criminal justice

V. CONCLUSIONS

References

Chapter 9
Access to Environmental Justice in the South West Pacific

Nicola Pain

I. INTRODUCTION

II. THE SOUTH WEST PACIFIC
(a) Regional environmental organisations
(b) Environmental rights and customary ownership

III. ACCESS TO JUSTICE: PROCEDURAL ASPECTS OF PARTICIPATION
(a) Constitutional provisions
(b) Procedural rights in national legal systems
(c) NGO participation at the national level

IV. PUBLIC INTEREST ENVIRONMENTAL LITIGATION
(a) The nature of environmental court action at the national and local levels
(b) Hurdles to public interest litigation
(c) Environmental litigation in developing countries

V. CASE STUDY: MINING IN PAPUA NEW GUINEA
(a) The Constitution
(b) Large-scale mining activity and environmental protection
   (i) Panguna
   (ii) Ok Tedi
(c) Access to legal representation
Chapter 10

Access to Environmental Justice and Public Participation in Thailand

Thawilwadee Bureekul

I. INTRODUCTION

II. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

IV. CASE STUDY: HIN KRUD POWER PLANT

V. MAJOR FACTORS AFFECTING PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Appendix: Chronology of the Hin Krud Project
Chapter 11
Access to Environmental Justice in United Kingdom Law
Jean-Jacques Paradissis and Michael Purdue

Access to Environmental Justice: A Comparative Study

I. ACCESS TO ENVIRONMENTAL INFORMATION
(a) Public registers of environmental information
(b) EC Directives 90/313 and 2003/4 and the Environmental Information Regulations 2004
(c) Freedom of Information Act 2000

II. LEGAL RIGHTS OF PUBLIC TO PARTICIPATION IN ENVIRONMENTAL DECISION-MAKING
(a) Public participation in environmental impact assessment
(b) General rights of public participation in environmental decision-making
(c) Public participation in policy and plan-making
(d) Strategic environmental assessment
(e) Public participation in the preparation of legislation

III. ACCESS TO THE COURTS
(a) Who can apply to the courts
(b) The costs of legal proceedings
(c) The substantive law and the need for an environmental court or tribunal

IV. CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 12
Access to Environmental Justice in the United States: Embracing Environmental and Social Concerns to Achieve Environmental Justice
J. Mijin Cha

I. THE BEGINNINGS OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
II. LOOKING TO STATUTES AND THE COURT FOR RELIEF
III. STANDING REQUIREMENTS IN BRIEF
(a) Article III Standing Requirements
(b) Prudential Standing Requirements
(c) Administrative Agency Action

IV. EXECUTIVE ORDER 12898

V. FEDERAL SUBSTANTIVE ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS
(a) Clean Air Act
(b) Clean Water Act
(c) Citizen Suit Provisions
(d) National Environmental Protection Act
(e) Title VI, Civil Rights Act of 1964
(f) 42 USC 1983
   (i) South Camden Citizens in Action v New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection 340
   (ii) District Court’s Initial Decision 340
   (iii) The Introduction of Alexander v Sandoval 344
   (iv) District Court’s Decision after Sandoval 345

VI. THE CENTRE ON RACE, POVERTY AND THE ENVIRONMENT 349
   (a) The Kivalina Relocation Planning Committee Case 349
   (b) The Residents of Blythe, California’s Title VI Claim 351

VII. CONCLUSIONS 354

A Note on Environmental Law-Enforcement Duties 355
Andrew Harding

Index 363