Taxation of Capital Gains under the OECD Model Convention

with special regard to immovable property

Stefano Simontacchi
# Table of Contents

**Preface**  
xiv

**Introduction**  
 xv

**Chapter I**  
The Capital Gains Article in the Model Conventions Drafted Under the Auspices of the League of Nations  
1

1. International Double Taxation after World War I  
2. 1923 Report  
   2.1 Economic Consequences of International Double Taxation  
   2.2 Basis of Taxation and the Elements of Economic Allegiance  
   2.3 Economic Allegiance and Classification of Wealth for Tax Purposes  
   2.4 General Methods of Avoiding Double Taxation  
3. 1925 Report  
4. 1927 Draft  
5. 1928 Drafts  
   5.1 1928 Report  
   5.2 1928 Drafts No. Ia and Ic  
      5.2.1 Article 2 – Income from Immovable Property  
      5.2.2 Article 3 – Income from Bonds, Loans and Deposits and Article 4 – Income from Shares  
      5.2.3 Article 5 – Business Income  

vii
5.2.4 Article 9 – Annuities
5.2.5 Article 10 – Personal Taxes
5.2.6 Article 12 – Property Taxes
5.3 1928 Draft No. Ib

6. Non-Inclusion of Capital Gains in the 1927 and 1928 Drafts

7. Work of the Fiscal Committee 1929–1939
7.1 1929 Report and 1930 Report
7.2 1931 Plurilateral Drafts
7.3 1933 Draft and 1935 Draft
7.4 1936–1939 Reports

8. 1940 Drafts
8.1 Work of the Fiscal Committee in 1940
8.2 Carroll’s 1940 Draft
8.2.1 Carroll’s 1940 Study
8.2.2 Article VIII – Gains Derived from the Sale of Immovable Property
8.2.3 Article XII – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Capital Assets Other than Immovable Property
8.3 1940 Hague Draft
8.3.1 1940 Hague Report
8.3.2 Article 12 – Capital Gains
8.3.3 Article 12(1) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Real Property
8.3.4 Article 12(2) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Business Property
8.3.5 Article 12(3) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Other Capital Assets
8.4 1940 Mexico Draft
8.4.1 1940 Mexico Report
8.4.2 Article 12 – Capital Gains
8.4.3 First Step in the Revision of the 1928 Drafts

9. 1943 Mexico Draft
9.1 Work Accomplished Between First and Second Regional Tax Conferences
9.2 1943 Mexico Report
9.3 Article XII – Capital Gains
9.3.1 Limited Scope
9.3.2 Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Real Property

10. 1946 London Draft
10.1 Reconsideration of 1943 Mexico Draft
10.2 1946 London Report
10.3 Article XII – Capital Gains
# Table of Contents

10.3.1 Scope 117  
10.3.2 Article XII(1) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Real Property 118  
10.3.3 Article XII(2) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Business Assets 118  
10.3.4 Article XII(3) – Gains Derived from the Sale or Exchange of Other Capital Assets 119

## Chapter II

### Definition of Capital Gains in Article 13 of the OECD Model 121

1. **Definition of Capital Gains in Domestic Systems** 121
   1.1 Conceptual Problems in Defining Capital Gains for Tax Purposes 121
   1.2 Historical Development of Capital Gains Taxation 123
   1.3 Lack of an International Common Definition of Capital Gains 126
   1.4 No Generally Accepted Approach to Capital Gains Taxation 127
   1.5 Capital Gains Taxation: Main Issues 128
     1.5.1 Criteria for Type of Tax Regime 129
     1.5.2 Definition of Capital Asset 131
     1.5.3 Realization Requirement 131
     1.5.4 Definition of Alienation 132
     1.5.5 Bunching 133
     1.5.6 Calculation 133
     1.5.7 Anti-Abuse 134

2. **Nature Of Capital Gains Under the OECD Model** 137

3. **Gains Covered by Article 13** 142
   3.1 The Term ‘Capital Gains’ 142
     3.1.1 Use of the Term in Article 13 142
     3.1.2 Relevance of Headings of Treaty Articles 143
     3.1.3 Use of the Term in the OECD Commentary 145
     3.1.4 Terms Affecting the Scope of the Article 146
   3.2 Definition of Property 147
   3.3 Definition of Gains 150
   3.4 History of Gains Covered by Article 13 151
   3.5 Other Model Conventions and Treaties 160
   3.6 Preliminary Comments 164
   3.7 Article 7 and Article 13: Interaction 169
     3.7.1 Scope of Article 7 169
     3.7.2 Article 7 and Article 13: Attribution of Taxation Rights 170
   3.8 Final Remarks 173

4. **Definition of Alienation** 175
   4.1 Independent Treaty Meaning vs. Domestic Law Definition 175
Table of Contents

4.1.1 History of Terms Used in the Model Conventions for the Event Giving Rise to Capital Gains 176
4.1.2 OECD Commentary Position 182
4.2 Appreciation in Value of Property 185
  4.2.1 Taxation of Unrealized Gains 185
  4.2.2 Applicability of Article 22 187
  4.2.3 Consistency of Article 7–Article 21 Treaty Regime with Article 13 Regime 188
  4.2.4 Remarks 191
4.3 Change in the Use of a Capital Asset 191
4.4 Final Remarks 195

Chapter III
Gains Derived from the Alienation of Immovable Property (Article 13(1)) 197

1. OECD Model and Other Model Conventions 197
   1.1 OECD Model 197
   1.2 Other Model Conventions 198
2. Purpose of Article 13(1) 201
3. Geographical Scope of Article 13(1) 202
   3.1 Bilateral Reach 202
4. Cases outside the Bilateral Reach of Article 13(1) 206
   4.1 Applicability of Article 13(5) 206
      4.1.1 Scope 206
      4.1.2 Two Relevant Factors 207
      4.1.3 OECD Commentary Position 209
      4.1.4 Historical Analysis 212
      4.1.5 Remarks 213
   4.2 Alternatives to Article 13(5) 215
      4.2.1 Article 7 and Article 21 215
      4.2.2 Scope and Purpose of Article 7 219
      4.2.3 Scope and Purpose of Article 21 220
      4.2.4 Interaction of the Two Articles 223
      4.2.5 Applicability of Article 21 to Capital Gains 226
      4.2.6 Remarks 227
5. Article 13(1) and Article 13(2): Interaction 227
   5.1 Situs Rule vs. Permanent Establishment Rule 227
   5.2 Immovable Property in Permanent Establishment State 229
      5.2.1 Capital Gains 229
      5.2.2 Income from Immovable Property 230
      5.2.3 Taxation of Capital 231
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Immovable Property in Residence State</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Capital Gains</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Income from Immovable Property</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3 Taxation of Capital</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Immovable Property in a Third State</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1 Capital Gains</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.2 Income from Immovable Property</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.3 Taxation of Capital</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Cases: Summary</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Situs Rule in the OECD Model</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Definition of Derived</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1 Domestic Law Definition vs. Autonomous Definition</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2 History</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.1 ‘Derived’ in the League Model Conventions</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2 Alternative Terms in the League Model Conventions</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Use of ‘Derived’ in Article 13</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1 OECD Model</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2 From 1946 London Draft to 1977 OECD Model</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Use of ‘Derived’ in the Other OECD Model Articles</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 Article 6</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 Article 10(5)</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3 Article 15</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4 Article 16</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.5 Article 17</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.6 Article 23</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.7 French Version</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.8 Remarks</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 Alternatives to ‘Derived’ in the OECD Model</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1 Income or Gains from Something</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2 Profits of Something Carried on by a Person</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.3 Income of a Person</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.4 Income Paid</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.5 Income Received</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.6 Income Beneficially Owned by a Person</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.7 Income Arising in a State</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.8 Income Accrued to a Person</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 Final Remarks</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Definition of Immovable Property in Article 13(1)</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Cross Reference to Article 6</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1 Scope of Article 6(2)</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2 History</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.3 ‘As Defined in Paragraph 2 of Article 6’ vs. ‘Referred to in Article 6’</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Article 6(2): Definition of Immovable Property</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1 History</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2 Structure</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3 Article 6(2) and Article 3(2)</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.4 Definition of Law</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.5 Definition of Situated</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.6 Definition of Terms in Positive and Negative List</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.7 Consistency for Purposes of Applying Article 13(1)</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.8 Consistency for Purposes of Applying Article 13(5)</td>
<td>304</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter IV
Gains Derived from the Alienation of Shares in Immovable Property Companies (Article 13(4)) 307

1. OECD Model AND Other Model Conventions 307
   1.1 OECD Model 307
   1.2 Other Model Conventions 307

2. Indirect Alienation of Immovable Property and Tax Treaties 313
   2.1 Domestic Sourcing Provisions 313
   2.2 Domestic Sourcing Provisions and Tax Treaties: Interaction 315

3. Inclusion of Article 13(4) in OECD Model 318
   3.1 Purpose and Nature of Article 13(4) 318
   3.2 Article 13(4) and the Improper Use of Tax Treaties 320

4. Geographical Scope of Article 13(4) 324
   4.1 Bilateral Reach 324
   4.2 Cases within the Bilateral Reach of Article 13(4) 325
      4.2.1 Immovable Property Company Resident in the Situs State 325
      4.2.2 Immovable Property Company Resident in the Residence State 326
      4.2.3 Immovable Property Company Resident in a Third State 327
   4.3 Cases Outside the Bilateral Reach of Article 13(4) 328
      4.3.1 Relevant Immovable Property in the Residence State 328
      4.3.2 Relevant Immovable Property in a Third State 329

5. Article 13(4) and Article 13(2): Interaction 330
   5.1 Shares of an Immovable Property Company Forming Part of the Business Property of a Permanent Establishment 330
   5.2 Immovable Property in the Permanent Establishment State 331
   5.3 Immovable Property in the Residence State 333
   5.4 Immovable Property in a Third State 335
   5.5 Inconsistency 338
   5.6 Possible Solutions 340

6. Scope: Gains Derived From Alienation of Shares 341
   6.1 Definition of Shares 341
      6.1.1 Exclusion of Interests in Other Entities 343
      6.1.2 Exclusion of Other Interests in Joint-Stock Companies 345
# Table of Contents

6.2 Alienation of Shares
   6.2.1 Non-Substantial Shareholdings 348
   6.2.2 Listed Shares 348
   6.2.3 Corporate Reorganizations 350
   6.2.4 Shares Held by Pension Funds 352

7. Definition of Immovable Property Company
   7.1 Value Test 353
   7.2 Definition of Immovable Property 354
      7.2.1 Applicability of Article 6 Definition 354
      7.2.2 Immovable Property in which a Business is Carried on 357
   7.3 Sources from which the Shares Derive Their Value 359
      7.3.1 Relevant Property 359
      7.3.2 Definition of Value 363
   7.4 When the Value Test Must Be Met 365
   7.5 Direct or Indirect Derivation of Value 367
   7.6 Indirect Derivation of Value: Multi-Tier Chains of Companies 373
   7.7 Compatibility of the Value Test with the Purpose of the Provision
      7.7.1 Application Requirements 376
      7.7.2 Attribution of Taxation Rights 377
      7.7.3 Proposed Solution 380

8. Obtaining Information and Collecting Taxes 381

9. Double Exemption 384

10. Effects of Introduction of Article 13(4) on the Attribution of Taxation Rights
   10.1 Indirect Ownership Structure and Related Attribution of Taxation Rights 385
   10.2 Attribution of Taxation Rights Before the Introduction of Article 13(4) 385
   10.3 Attribution of Taxation Rights after the Introduction of Article 13(4) 386
   10.4 Points for Further Discussion 389

   11.1 Substantial Interest Provisions 390
   11.2 Interaction when Contained in the Same Treaty 392
   11.3 Interaction when Contained in Different Treaties Applicable to the Same Alienation Of Shares 392

Bibliography 395