# Contents

**Acknowledgements**  
vi

**Introduction**  
1

| Transnational Influences In An Andean Valley | 1 |
| Mining and Community Conflicts | 3 |
| What Is Transnational Law? | 4 |
| The Organisation Of This Book | 8 |

1 **Understanding Regulation and Legitimation: The Challenges for Transnational Law**  
11

| Understanding Regulation: The Interaction of Two Kinds of Law | 11 |
| Constituting Legal Authority through Legitimation | 13 |
| Three Sources of Perceptions of Legitimacy | 16 |
| Legitimation Strategies and the Psychology of Rule Makers | 17 |
| Legitimation and Power: Organised and Disorganised Audiences | 19 |
| Categorising Concepts of 'Right Process' | 20 |
| Challenges for Democratic Governance: Drawing Boundaries in a Transnational World | 23 |

2 **The Selective Absence of the State: Delegating Responsibility for Mining and Community Conflicts**  
27

| The Social Mediation of Mining Development | 28 |
| Historical Background to the Predicament | 29 |
| The Rise of Local Claims for the Social Mediation of Mining Investment | 37 |
| Ideological Shifts, Transnational Linkages | 37 |
| The Evolution of Mining and Community Conflicts in Peru | 38 |
| The Predicament of the State | 43 |
| Peru's Response to the Predicament: a Strategy of Selective Absence | 45 |
### Contents

The Sale of Land Required for Mine Development 45
Implications from the State Perspective 47
Environmental Assessment 48
The Evaluation of Social Impacts 49
Public Participation in EIA Decision-making 51
Limitations on State Administrative and Regulatory Capacity 54
Implications from the State Perspective 55

Conclusion: State Absences and the Promotion of Local and Transnational Legal Ordering 58

3 Transnational Law-making in a Global Policy Arena: Addressing Mining and Community Conflicts 61

**Introduction** 61

Transnational Law-Making and Corporate Accountability in Globalising Industries 62
Developing a Taxonomy of these Transnational Legal Regimes 62

Globalisation Backlash and the Rise of Certification Institutions 64
Activist Threats and Legal Responses 68
Explaining Variation in Certification Institutions 70
Regulation and Legitimacy in Certification 71
The Global Stakes Involved in Certification: the Globalisation of Legal Models 73

Transnational Law-making and Mining and Community Conflicts 74
Certification and the Mining Industry 75
Industry Perspectives: Globalising Opportunities and Threats 75
A Snapshot of the Global Mining Industry: Capacity for Self-organisation to Defend a Reputational Commons 77
Broader Industry Initiatives: the Australian Minerals Code 82
The Global Mining Initiative and the ICMM Sustainable Development Framework 83
Conclusions Regarding Mining Industry Certification Efforts 86

Transnational Law-making at the World Bank 87
The World Bank as a Site of Global Norm Production 87
How Leverage was Developed to Move the Bank 88
Development of the Safeguard Policy Regime: 1980s to mid-1990s 89
The Spread of the Safeguard Policy Regime to Private Sector Projects: mid-1990s to the Present 92
Why has Law-making Occurred at the Bank? 94
A Note on the Globalisation of the World Bank’s Regulatory Model 97
Conclusions Regarding the Development of Transnational Legal Regimes for Addressing Mining and Community Conflicts 99
## 4 The World Bank Safeguard Policy Regime: A Globalising Regulatory Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the Social Responsibility of Large Project Developers? The World Bank Group’s Answer</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the World Bank Safeguard Policy Regime</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How the Regime is Organised</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous Peoples Policies</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Divergence within the World Bank Group</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involuntary Resettlement</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Formal Provisions of WBG IR Policy</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The IR Policy Regime’s Decision-making Architecture</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision-making Structures and Legitimation Strategies in the WBG Safeguard Policy Regime</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Participation in Decision-making: Contrasting Liberal Legal Approaches with Safeguard Policy Regime Approaches</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Autonomy and the Marginalisation of Project-affected Groups in Decision-making (or Navigating between Due Process and Privity of Contract)</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using ‘Participation’ to Structure Public Involvement in Decision-making</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert Involvement in IR Policy Decision-making: the Role of the Social Specialist</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Emergence of a New Form of Professional Knowledge</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Specialists and Mining Enterprises</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Specialists and the World Bank Group</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing Summary</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 5 Communities and Corporations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Approaching the Concepts of Corporation and Community</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning Community</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community, Identity and Authority in the Peruvian Andes</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are Andean Populations Solidaristic? Essentialised Visions of Andean Society</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Historical Origins of Solidarities and Divisions in the Rural Andes</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications of Andean Identity Politics for the Construction of Community Solidarity</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are Andean Populations Defined by Subsistence Livelihoods?</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are Andean Populations Isolated?</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do Andean Peoples in Peru Call Themselves Indigenous?</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Contents

A Hypothesis Regarding the Goals and Behaviour of Community Actors 149

Problematising the Corporation: Understanding Transnational Mining Projects 150

How do we Think about Companies? 150

Do Companies only Care about Money? Modelling Regulatory Conversations within the Firm 152

Do Mining Enterprises make Rational Decisions about Community Relations? 154

Does the Mining Project either Think with One Brain or Speak with One Voice? 157

Who is Working for the Project at Any Given Time? 157

Are Community Relations Issues Effectively Integrated into Project Planning Processes? 158

Are Attitudes within the Mining Industry towards Community Relations Uniform? 159

Incentives, Co-ordination, Control and Community Relations Policy 161

Hypotheses Regarding Motivations and Challenges within Mining Enterprises 161

Concluding Remarks 162

6 Case Study: Antamina in San Marcos 163

Introduction 163

Part I: Introductions to the Actors 165

A Snapshot of the District of San Marcos 165

Geography, Demography and Politics 165

Agricultural and Pastoral Production Systems 168

Law Governing Ownership, Use and Exchange of Highland Pastures in San Marcos 170

A Snapshot of the Compañía Minera Antamina 178

Part II: The Processes of Land Acquisition and Resettlement 186

The Development of Local Legal Ordering 186

The Acquisition of Land by CMA 188

Analysing The Negotiations: Looking at the Construction of an Informal Legal Order 201

Resettlement: the Local Legal Order Unravels 208

Community and Corporate Perspectives on the Local Legal Order 216

Part III: Re-Engagement under the Auspices of the WBG Involuntary Resettlement Policy Regime 221

From Stalemate to Re-engagement 221
Assessing the World Bank Safeguard Policy

Introduction

Objectives of the Chapter

The Safeguard Policy Regime Decision-making Model

Circumstances Affecting the Interpretive Power of Social Specialists

How to Identify Social Specialist Influence in the Case Study?

Three Rationalities of Decision-making

Roles Assigned to the Rationalities by the IR Policy Regime

An Additional Factor: Co-operation Versus Defection

Limitations of the Approach and a Hypothesis

IR Policy Regulatory Decisions Made in the Case Study

Analyzing the Regulatory Decisions Made

A Brief Recapitulation of WBG IR Policy’s Eligibility, Entitlement, and Participatory Requirements

First Phase: Resettlement Planning

Second Phase: Land Acquisition

Third Phase: Accelerated Resettlement Plan (ARP)

Fourth Phase: MIGA Compliance Audit

Assessing the Relative Influence of the Decision-making Rationalities

The First Three Phases: Resettlement Planning, Land Acquisition and the ARP

A Note on Competing Professional Rationalities: the Influence of Lawyers

Explaining the Weakness of Social Specialist Rationality in the First Three Phases

What about Peer Review? Looking for a Strong Epistemic Community of Social Specialists

Conclusions Regarding Social Specialist Influence

The Quality of Social Specialist Decision-making in the IR Policy Model

Regulatory Effectiveness

Legitimation

Moving Forward: Bridging ‘Social Acceptability’ and ‘Social Acceptance’
# Contents

8 Transnational Law and Democratic Governance 287

Posing the Question: Antecedents to an Inquiry into Democratic Legitimacy 287

The Dynamics of a Global Policy Arena 290
  Modelling Flows of Legal Authority: the Privatisation and Transnationalisation of National Law 290
  Modelling Industry Certification 291

Interlegality 292
  Interlegality and Access to Information 292
  Interlegality and Discretionary Power within the Corporation 294

Legitimacy and Transnational Ordering 295
  Publicness versus Privacy in the Transnational Sphere 296
  Technical versus Political Legitimation Strategies in Transnational Arenas 299
  Appropriate Decision-making Processes for the IR Policy Regime 301

Legitimacy, Political Identity and Transnational Law 302

Bibliography 307

Index 331