EUROPEAN MONOGRAPHS

Regulation of Subsidies and State Aids in WTO and EC Law

Conflicts in International Trade Law

Gustavo E. Luengo Hernández de Madrid
Table of Contents

Preface xix
Acknowledgements xxii
About the Author xxiii
Abbreviations xxv

Part I: Introduction 1

Chapter 1: Preliminary Remarks 3
   I. Subsidies in the International Context 3
      A. What is a Subsidy? 5
      B. Types of Subsidies 8
         1. Export Subsidies 8
         2. Domestic Subsidies 9
      C. Conclusion 9
   II. Scope of this Work: Subsidies in the WTO and the EC 10

Chapter 2: Economic Analysis of Subsidies 13
   I. Introduction 13
   II. Analysis of International Trade 15
      A. Theory of Comparative Advantage 15
      B. Theory of Proportion in Factors of Production 17
      C. Economies of Scale 18
      D. Imperfect Competition 19
      E. Conclusion 20
### Table of Contents

**III. Effects of Subsidies on International Trade**  
A. Effects of Export Subsidies  
B. Effects of Domestic Subsidies  
C. Conclusion  

**IV. Effects of the Adoption of Countervailing Duties**  

**V. Concluding Remarks**  

**Part II: The Regulation of Subsidies in the WTO**  

**Introduction to Part II**  

**Chapter 3: Evolution of the Regulation of Subsidies in International Trade: From the GATT to the WTO**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Subsidies in the Havana Charter</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Negotiations for the Creation of the ITO: Origins of the GATT</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Regulation of Subsidies in the HC</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Conclusions</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Subsidies in the GATT (1947–1979)</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The GATT of 1947</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. GATT Negotiations</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Obligations on Subsidies in the GATT</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Definition of ‘Subsidy’ in the GATT of 1947</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusion</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Reforms of 1955</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Export Subsidies</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Non-Primary Products</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Primary Products</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Revision Clause</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Conclusion</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Situation after the Reform of 1955</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Notification of Subsidies</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Export Subsidies for Primary Products</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Export Subsidies for Non-Primary Products</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Definition of Subsidy after the Reform of 1955</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Price Support Systems</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Subsidies Financed by a Non-Governmental Levy</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Multiple Exchange Rates</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Purpose of the Subsidy</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Other Cases</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusions</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of Contents

IV. The Subsidies Code from the Tokyo Round of 1979
   A. Negotiations During the Tokyo Round (1973–1979) 63
   B. The Tokyo Round Subsidies Code of 1979 65
      1. Track I—Countervailing Duties 66
      2. Track II—Obligations on Subsidies 68
   C. The Situation after the Reform of 1979 74
      1. The Definition of ‘Subsidy’ after the Tokyo Round of 1979 74
      2. Situation after the Tokyo Round 76
      3. Relevant Cases after the Reform of 1979 78
         a) Export Subsidies for Primary Products 79
         b) Export Subsidies for Non-Primary Products 81
         c) Countervailing Duties 82
   D. Conclusions 83

V. Negotiations in the Uruguay Round (1986–1994) 84
   A. The Negotiations on Subsidies in the Uruguay Round 84
      1. Definition of ‘Subsidy’ 85
         a) The Position of the US 86
         b) The Position of the EC 86
      2. The ‘Traffic Light Approach’ 87
      3. Other Important Issues: Trade Remedies, Sub-National Entities and Developing Countries 88
      4. Negotiations on Primary Products 88
   B. Proposals Made during the Negotiations 89
      1. The Cartland Draft 89
      2. The Dunkel Draft 90
      3. The De Zeeuw Draft 92
   C. Conclusions 92

VI. The Final Result: Agreements on Subsidies in the WTO 93

VII. Concluding Remarks 95

Chapter 4: The Regulation of Subsidies in the Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures 97

   I. Introduction 97
   II. Definition of ‘Subsidy’: Article 1 ASCM 102
      A. 1st Element: 1st Alternative—Financial Contribution 103
         1. Government or Other Public Body 103
         2. Territoriality of the Measure 106
         3. Exhaustive List of Cases Considered to be Financial Contributions 107
            a) Direct Transfer of Funds or Potential Transfers of Funds or Liabilities 108
            b) Foregoing of Government Revenue That Would Be Collected Otherwise 108
            c) Provision of Goods or Services 110
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a) Red Category: Prohibited Subsidies</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Article 4 of the ASCM)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Amber Category: Actionable Subsidies</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Article 7 of the ASCM)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Green Category: Non-Actionable Subsidies</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Article 9 of the ASCM)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Results of These Procedures: Withdrawal, Repayment or Removal of the Effects</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Conclusion</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. National Forum: Countervailing Duties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Substantive Requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Existence of a Specific Subsidy</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Material Injury to a Domestic Industry</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Causal Link</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Procedural Requirements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a) Initiation and Consultation</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b) Calculating the Amount of Countervailing Duties</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Duration and Termination of Countervailing Duties</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Possibilities for Judicial Review of the Countervailing Duties</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Conclusions</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Notification and Monitoring of Subsidies: The Role of the SCM Committee</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Exceptions for Developing Countries: Article 27 of the ASCM</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Prohibited Subsidies</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Actionable Subsidies</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Countervailing Duties</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Conclusions</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Concluding Remarks</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 5: The Regulation of Subsidies in the Agreement on Agriculture 207

I. Introduction 207

II. The Agreement on Agriculture 208

A. Commitments on Domestic Support 209

1. Amber Basket 210

2. Blue Basket 213

3. Green Basket 214

a) General Services 215

b) Food Security Industry 215

c) Domestic Food Aid 215

d) Direct Payments to Producers 215

4. Conclusion 216
B. Commitments on Export Subsidies 217
   1. Export Subsidies for Products Subject to Reduction Commitments 218
      a) List of Export Subsidies (Article 9.1. of the AoA) 219
         1. Direct Subsidies 219
         2. Export Sales under the Domestic Market Price 220
         3. Export Payments for Agricultural Products 221
         4. Subsidies to Reduce Costs of Marketing or Transporting Exports 224
         5. Upstream Subsidies 225
      b) Other Export Subsidies (Article 10.1 of the AoA) 225
      c) Conclusion 227
   2. Export Subsidies for Products Not Subject to Reduction Commitments 227
   3. Conclusion 230
C. Conclusions 230

III. The Application of the ASCM to Basic Agricultural Products: The Relationship Between the ASCM and the AoA 231
   A. Definition of 'Subsidy' in the AoA 231
   B. Specificity in the AoA 234
   C. Conclusions 235

IV. Trade Remedies: The Expiration of the Peace Clause 235
   A. The Peace Clause: Exceptions to Article 13 of the AoA 236
      1. Exceptions for Domestic Support 237
      2. Exceptions for Export Subsidies 238
      3. Expiration of the Peace Clause: Application of the ASCM 239
   B. Lack of Conformity of a Measure With the AoA: Withdrawal of the Subsidy (Article 4.7 of the ASCM) 240
   C. Conclusions 242

V. Concluding Remarks 242

Chapter 6: Subsidies in the WTO: The 'Foreign Sales Corporations' Case 245

I. Introduction 245
II. The DISC Case 249
   A. Group of Experts in DISC 251
   B. Group of Experts in the European Cases 252
   C. The Aftermath of These Cases 254
   D. Conclusions 255
III. The US–FSC Case 256
   A. The FSC–First Panel and AB Reports 257
      1. Measures in Relation to the FSCs 257

Table of Contents

2. **First Panel Report**  
   a) EC Arguments 261  
   b) US Arguments 262  
   c) Conclusions of the Panel 264  
3. **First AB Report** 268  
4. **Conclusions** 270

B. **The ETI–Second Panel and AB Reports** 271  
1. *Measures Introduced by the ETI* 272  
2. **Second Panel Report** 273  
3. **Second AB Report** 276  
4. **Conclusions** 277

C. **Developments of the FSC/ETI Case** 277

IV. **Conclusions from the FSC Case** 280

---

**Part III: EC Rules on State Aids** 283

**Introduction to Part III** 285

**Chapter 7: Evolution of the State Aid Rules in the EC** 287

I. **Introduction** 287  
II. **State Aids in the History of the EC** 291  
   A. **Rules on State Aids: From ECSC to EEC** 282  
   B. **Evolution of the Rules on State Aids After the EEC Treaty** 293  
   C. **Conclusions** 296  
III. **State Aids Nowadays: Statistics** 296  
IV. **Concluding Remarks** 303

**Chapter 8: The Notion of ‘State Aid’: Article 87.1 of the EC Treaty** 305  

I. **Introduction** 305  
II. **The Notion of ‘Aid in Any Form’** 307  
   A. **Examples of Advantages Granted by the State** 309  
      1. *Participation in the Capital of Enterprises* 309  
      2. *Loans* 310  
      3. *Government Guarantees* 311  
      5. *Acquisition of Products or Services by the State* 312  
      6. *Provision of Public Services by the State* 312  
      7. **Conclusions** 314  
   B. **Intention of the Government When Granting the Measure** 314  
   C. **Indirect Advantages** 315  
   D. **Form of the Aid** 315
Table of Contents

III. Granted by a Member State or through State Resources 315
   A. The Meaning of 'State' 316
   B. Notion of 'State Resources' 318
   C. Aids 'Granted by the Member States or through State Resources' 321
   D. Conclusions 327

IV. Distortion in Competition: Selectivity 327
   A. Distortion in Competition 328
   B. Selectivity of the Measure 330
   C. Conclusions 336

V. Effect on Trade between Member States 336

VI. Concluding Remarks 338

Chapter 9: State Aids Compatible with the Common Market 341

I. Introduction 341

II. State Aids per se Compatible with the Common Market 342
   A. Aids with Social Character 343
   B. Aids to Repair Damages Caused by Natural Disasters 344
   C. Aids to Certain Regions of the Federal Republic of Germany 344
   D. Conclusions 345

III. State Aids Which May be Compatible with the Common Market 346
   A. Aids to Improve the Development of Certain Regions Where the Standards of Living are Abnormally Low or Where There is a Serious Unemployment Situation 350
   B. Aids for Projects of Common European Interest or to Remedy a Serious Disturbance in the Economy of a Member State 353
   C. Aids to Promote the Development of Certain Activities or Regions: Sectoral, Horizontal and Regional Aids 355
      1. Regional Aids in Article 87.3(c) of the EC Treaty 356
      2. Sectoral Aids 359
         a) Transport 361
         b) Motor Vehicles 363
         c) Steel and Coal 364
      3. Horizontal Aids 365
         a) Aids for the Protection of the Environment 365
         b) Aids for R&D 366
         c) Aids for Employment and Training 368
         d) Aid for SMEs 370
         e) Aids for Rescuing and Restructuring Companies in Crisis 371
Part IV: Comparative Analysis of the Regulation of Subsidies in the WTO and the EC: Consequences

Introduction to Part IV

Chapter 12: Comparison of the WTO and EC Rules on Subsidies and State Aids

I. Introduction

II. Systemic Approach to Disciplining Subsidies
   A. Analysis of National Measures in the WTO
      1. Framework of the ASCM
      2. Framework of the AoA
   B. Analysis of Government Measures in the EC
   C. Notification and Control of Subsidies and State Aids
   D. Conclusions

III. Definition of 'Subsidy' versus Notion of 'State Aid'
   A. Origin of the Measure: Government versus State
   B. Benefit versus Aid
   C. Nature of the Resources Used
      1. FSC versus Sloman Neptun
      2. Canada—Aircraft and US—Export Restraints versus PreussenElektra
      3. Price Fixing Systems
   D. Conclusions

IV. Specificity versus Selectivity
   A. The Term 'Certain'
   B. Undertakings and Industries/Productions
   C. Measures Granted by Sub-National Entities
   D. Conclusions

V. Prohibitions and Exceptions in the WTO and the EC
   A. Red Category—Prohibited Subsidies and Aids Incompatible with the Common Market
      1. Export Subsidies
      2. Import Substitution/Domestic Content Subsidies
      3. Conclusion
   B. Green Category—Permitted Subsidies and Aids Compatible with the Common Market
      1. Aid for R&D
      2. Aid for Underdeveloped Regions
      3. Aid for the Adaptation of Existing Facilities to New Environmental Requirements
      4. Conclusion
   C. Amber Category—Actionable Subsidies and Aids Which May be Compatible with the Common Market
      1. The Adverse Effects Standard
Table of Contents

2. *The Compensatory Justification Standard*  
   *(Community Interest)* 472
3. *Comparison of Both Standards* 473
   D. Conclusions 474

VI. Remedies: Withdrawal of the Subsidy *versus* Recovery of the Aid 475
   A. Remedies at the Multilateral Level: Withdrawal of Prohibited Subsidies *versus* Recovery of Unlawful Aid 476
   B. Coercive Means of Enforcement 478
   C. Remedies at the National Level: The Role of Individuals 480
   D. Conclusions 481

VII. Reasons for the Differences between the WTO and the EC 482
   A. Scope and Systemic Approach 483
   B. Definitions of ‘Subsidy’ and ‘State Aid’ 484
   C. Prohibited and Permitted Government Measures 486
   D. Control and Remedies 487
   E. Conclusions 489

VIII. Concluding Remarks 490

Chapter 13: Conformity of the EC State Aid Rules With the WTO: Suggestions 493
   I. Introduction 493
   II. Conformity of State Aids With the WTO Rules on Subsidies: Conflicts 495
      A. Scope of the Regulation: Subsidy *versus* State Aid 495
      B. Objectives of the Regulation: Adverse Effects on Trade *versus* Community Objectives 496
      C. Conclusion: Lack of Conformity 499
   III. A Different Case: Conformity of Agricultural Subsidies in the EC with the AoA 499
      A. Domestic Support 500
      B. Export Subsidies 501
      C. Other Issues: Expiration of the Peace Clause 502
      D. The AoA in the EC Legal System 502
      E. Negotiations on Agriculture in the Doha Round 502
      F. Conclusions 503
   IV. Consequences of the Lack of Conformity 504
      A. Consequences for the EC and the Member State 505
         1. *Government Measure = Subsidy ≠ State Aid* 505
            a) Multilateral Level—WTO 506
               (i) *Distribution of Competences with Respect to the WTO Agreements* 506
               (ii) The Dispute Settlement System in Practice: Representation on Behalf of the EC 509
Table of Contents

(iii) Retaliatory Actions: The Requirement of Uniformity in the Action 511
(iv) Conclusions: Joint Responsibility of the EC and the Member State 512
(v) Consequences for the EC and the Member State Derived from the ASCM 513

2. Government Measure = Subsidy = Authorized State Aid 516
   a) Multilateral Level—WTO 516
   b) Community Level—EC 519
   c) Conclusions 520

B. Consequences for Individuals 520
   1. Government Measure = Subsidy = Authorized State Aid 521
   2. Government Measure = Subsidy ≠ State Aid 526
   3. Conclusion 527

C. Conclusions 527

V. Suggestions: Ways to Improve the Conformity of the EC Rules on State Aids with the WTO 528
   A. Modification of the Notion of ‘State Aid’ 529
   B. The Community Interest ‘Plus’ Standard 531
   C. Indirect Effect of the Provisions of the ASCM 532
   D. Conclusions 532

VI. Concluding Remarks 533

Chapter 14: Final Remarks 535

I. Introduction 535
II. Main Conclusions of This Work 536
III. Subsidies in an International Context: Reflections and Room for Improvement 548
IV. Conclusion: A Look into the Future 555

Table of Cases 559

I. GATT/WTO 559
   A. GATT 559
   B. WTO 560
II. EC 563
   A. ECJ 563
   B. CFI 567

Bibliography 569

Index 581