COMPANY CHARGES

Spectrum and Beyond

Edited by
JOSHUA GETZLER
JENNIFER PAYNE

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
CONTENTS

List of Contributors xxiii
Table of Cases xxv
Table of Legislation xxxi

1. Fictions and Floating Charges: Some Reflections on the House of Lords’ Decision in Spectrum 1
   A. Introduction 1
   B. How Did We Get Here? 1
   C. Where Are We Now? 4
      1. The ‘known knowns’ 4
      2. The ‘known unknowns’ 5
      3. The ‘unknown knowns’ 6
   D. Where Do We Go from Here? 9
      1. Commercial substance 9
      2. A prediction 9
      3. Bad for the economy 9
      4. Conclusion: fiction and reality 10

2. The Case for the Abolition of the Floating Charge 11
   A. Introduction 11
   B. The Present Priority Status of the Floating Charge 12
   C. Do We Still Need the Floating Charge? 14
   D. The Company Law Review 16
   E. The Law Commission’s Consultation Papers 16
   F. Responses to the Proposals on the Abolition of the Floating Charge 18
   G. The Law Commission’s Final Report 19
   H. Is the Floating Charge So Wonderful? 21
   I. The Modernization of English Personal Property Security Law 22
3. Floating Charges: The Use and Abuse of Doctrinal Analysis 25
   A. The *Spectrum* Decision 25
   B. The Use of Doctrinal Analysis: Characterization and its Consequences 27
      1. Characterization: fixed charges and chargee control 28
      2. Charges over book debts 30
      3. Charges over other revenue-generating assets 33
      4. Fixed charges for the future 36
      5. Consequences: theory and practice 37
      6. Summary 45
   C. The ‘Abuse’ of Doctrinal Analysis: Insolvency Consequences 45
   D. Conclusion 48

4. The Characterization of Fixed and Floating Charges 51
   A. Introduction 51
   B. The Nature of Floating Charges 55
   C. The Process of Characterization 64
      1. Nomenclature 68
      2. Related contracts 69
      3. Post-contractual conduct 69
   D. Justifications for the Process of Characterization 73
      1. Pre-insolvency 74
         (a) Rights as between the parties *inter se* 74
         (b) Rights vis-à-vis third parties 76
      2. Post-insolvency 77
         (a) Registration 77
         (b) Claims in priority to the charge holder 78
         (c) The ability of administrators to dispose of assets 81
         (d) Section 245 of the Insolvency Act 1986 85
      3. Summary 87
   E. Possible Alternative Statutory Triggers 87
      1. United States 88
      2. Canada 90
         (a) Tax 90
         (b) Unpaid wages 93
      3. New Zealand 95
      4. Some thoughts on alternative statutory triggers 100
   F. Conclusion 101
5. *Spectrum*—An End to the Conflict or the Signal for a New Campaign?  

A. The Impact on Traditional Charge Structures  
1. Introduction  
2. Practical significance of re-characterization risk  
3. How far does the *Spectrum* decision extend?  
4. The equivalence of debts and their proceeds  
5. The ‘concurrence of the chargee’ distinction  
6. Why the *Spectrum* analysis does not apply to other asset classes  
   (a) Land  
   (b) Shares  
   (c) Intellectual property rights  
   (d) Goods and other chattels  
   (e) Receivables  
7. When fixed charges over assets other than debts become floating charges  
8. The dangers of a bundled approach to charging clause drafting  
9. Payment waterfalls and previously agreed release arrangements  
   (a) General  
   (b) Non-circulating assets  
   (c) Circulating assets  

B. *Spectrum* and Securitizations and Other Structured Financings  
1. Introduction  
2. Typical securitization structure  
   (a) The SPV  
   (b) Bond issue  
   (c) Funding parties  
   (d) Security  
   (e) Servicer  
   (f) SPV’s charged account  
   (g) Priority of payments  
3. Distinguishing between a securitization SPV and a trading company  
   (a) Freedom to carry on business  
   (b) An SPV is not a trading company  
   (c) Trade creditors  
4. Applying the *Brumark* and *Spectrum* tests to an SPV  
   (a) *Brumark*  
   (b) *Spectrum*  
   (c) ‘Control’ should be assessed in the round  
5. A discussion of policy in this area  
6. Using joint agency  
7. Conclusions and the future
# Contents

6. A Review of *Brumark* and *Spectrum* in an International Setting 135
   
   A. Introduction 135
   B. Background to *Brumark* 136
   C. The Role of Security 141
   D. International Survey 142
   E. Sectors of Secured Credit 144
   F. The *Brumark* Thesis 146
   G. The Effect of *Brumark* 146
   H. Conclusions 149

7. Security after the Enterprise Act 153
   
   A. Introduction 153
   B. Reform 153
   C. Rescue 155
   D. Precipitate Behaviour by Lender 157
   E. Making the Office Holder More Accountable 159
   F. Increasing Transparency 162
   G. Improving Collectivity 162
   H. Improving the Congruence with International Insolvency Regimes 163
   I. Have the Reformers’ Goals Been Achieved? 164
   J. How Can the Enterprise Act Be Evaded after *Spectrum*? 165
   K. Conclusion 167
   
   Appendix 169

8. The Debenture Holder’s Liability in Unjust Enrichment after *Spectrum* 173
   
   A. Unjust Enrichment Claims against the Chargees 173
      
      1. Mistake of law 174
         
         (a) Floating charge assets as the debenture holder’s property 175
         (b) No loss to the company 179
         (c) Preferential creditors having an alternative remedy against the debenture holder 180
      2. Receipt-based liability 180
      3. *Re Diplock* 183
   
   B. Defences to Unjust Enrichment Claims 184
C. Conclusion

9. Should We Redistribute in Insolvency?
A. Introduction
B. Redistribution and the History of the Floating Charge
1. How does English corporate insolvency law redistribute?
2. The early history of the floating charge
3. Legislative rebalancing
4. Secured creditors respond
5. The legislature strikes back
6. How will the market respond?
C. The Impact of Redistribution on Corporate Finance
1. How is secured credit used?
   (a) Asset-based lending: 'focal' monitoring and/or enforcement
   (b) Relationship lending: general monitoring and/or enforcement
2. Is secured credit harmful?
3. Is the floating charge different from other types of security interest?
   (a) Circulating assets: asset-based lending
   (b) Circulating assets: relationship lending
4. Asset-based versus relationship lending?
D. The Impact of Redistribution on Recipients
1. Employees
2. The Crown
3. Liquidation expenses
4. Unsecured creditors generally
E. Conclusions

10. The Role of Security over Future and Circulating Capital:
    Evidence from the British Economy circa 1850–1920
A. Freedom of Contract and the Supply of Debenture Finance
B. Why Secured Lending?
C. Did Scarcity of Share Capital Require Debenture Lending to
    Companies?
   1. The beginnings of corporate capital
   2. Corporate capital after 1862
   3. Prominence of circulating capital
   4. Liquidity preferences of banks
   5. Summary
D. Was American Prohibition Efficient?
Contents

11. The Economics of English Insolvency: Some Recent Developments 253
   A. Introduction 253
   B. Criticism of the English Insolvency System 255
      1. Is there evidence of 'lazy banking'? 258
      2. Are there coordination failures and excessive liquidations? 259
      3. Are UK corporate bankruptcy procedures fair? 260
   C. Enterprise Act 2002 261
   D. The Spectrum Decision 263
   E. Conclusion 265

12. The Law Commission's Proposals for the Reform of Corporate Security Interests 267
   A. Introduction 267
      1. Terminology 268
      2. The legal environment 269
      3. External developments 269
      4. Modernization 270
      5. Scope 271
   B. The Continued Existence of the Floating Charge 272
      1. Role of the floating charge 272
      2. Continuing need for floating charges 273
   C. The Relationship of Security to Insolvency Law 275
      1. Floating charges in insolvency legislation 275
      2. Late floating charges 276
      3. Unsecured and preference creditors 277
      4. Circular priority 277
   D. The Purchase Money Security Interest 279
      1. Purpose of purchase money security interests 279
      2. Title retention 279
   E. General Assignments of Accounts Receivable 281
      1. General assignments: an exceptional case 281
      2. Survival of the rule in Dearle v Hall? 281
      3. Clauses prohibiting assignments 282
   F. The Dating of Priority and the Effect of Registration 283
      1. Dating priority from registration 283
      2. Tacking and future advances 283
      3. The disappearance of 'attachment' 284
      4. Effect of registration 284
      5. Constructive notice 285
### Contents

6. The registrar's conclusive certificate 286  
7. Notice filing and further information 286  

G. The Rights of Outright Purchasers of the Collateral 286  
1. Outright buyers and unregistered charges 287  
2. Outright buyers and registered charges 288  

H. Conclusions 289  

---

**Index** 291