Federalism and the Accommodation of Diversity in Ethiopia

A Comparative Study

Assefa Fiseha
Contents

Preface v
Acronyms and Glossary xiii
Chronology of Major Events xvii
Map of FDRE Ethiopia xix

Introduction 1

Background 1
The Research Questions and outline of the Study 2
Scope and Method 5

Chapter 1 The Context of the Federal System in Ethiopia 11

Part One

1.1 Historic Ethiopia as a De Facto Federation 11
1.2 The Process of Centralization (1930-1991) 22
1.2.1 The Era of Written Constitutions 22
1.2.1.1 The 1931 Constitution 23
1.2.1.2 The 1955 Revised Constitution 25
1.2.2 The Ethio-Eritrean Federation (1952-1962) 27
1.2.3 The Revolution and the Coming to Power of the Military 34
1.2.3.1 The 1987 Constitution 39
1.3 The Transitional Period (1991-1994) 44

Part Two

1.4 The Challenges of Building a Multicultural State 52
1.4.1 The Instrumentalists 53
1.4.2 The Other Perspectives 60
1.5 Ethnicity, Nationalism and Multicultural States 79
1.5.1 Ethnicity 80
1.5.2 Nationalism 85
1.6 Conclusion 95

Chapter 2 Some Common Features among Federations 97

2.1 Introduction 97
2.2 Federalism and Federations 99
2.3 Some Common Features among Federations 102
2.3.1 Division of Power 102
2.3.1.1 The Notion of Co-ordinate Relationship 103
2.3.1.2 Limitations to the Co-ordinate Theory 107
# FEDERALISM AND THE ACCOMMODATION OF DIVERSITY IN ETHIOPIA

## Chapter 2

| 2.3.1.3 | Confederations, Federations and Decentralized forms of Governments | 111 |
| 2.3.2 | Written and Supreme Federal Constitution | 117 |
| 2.3.3 | Rigid Constitution | 121 |
| 2.3.4 | Umpiring the Federation | 123 |
| 2.3.5 | Origin of Federations and the Territorial Autonomy of the States | 124 |
| 2.4 | Extra-Constitutional Factors | 131 |
| 2.5 | Conclusion | 133 |

## Chapter 3

**Federations and Second Chambers**

| 3.1 | Rationale | 135 |
| 3.2 | Composition | 142 |
| 3.3 | Selection of Members | 145 |
| 3.4 | Powers | 148 |
| 3.5 | The Role of the HoF in Intergovernmental Relations | 153 |
| 3.6 | Conclusion | 159 |

## Chapter 4

**Forging Unity out of Diversity in Some Multicultural Federations**

| 4.1 | Introduction | 161 |
| 4.2 | Nigeria | 164 |
| 4.2.1 | Background | 164 |
| 4.2.2 | Description of the New Federation | 169 |
| 4.2.3 | Diversity | 170 |
| 4.2.4 | Ethnicity and the State Reorganization | 171 |
| 4.2.5 | Some Remarks | 175 |
| 4.3 | India | 178 |
| 4.3.1 | Background | 178 |
| 4.3.2 | The Federation | 180 |
| 4.3.3 | State Reorganization and the Ethno-Linguistic Demands | 187 |
| 4.3.4 | Language Policy | 191 |
| 4.4 | Switzerland | 192 |
| 4.4.1 | The Evolution of the Federal System | 192 |
| 4.4.2 | Diversity | 198 |
| 4.4.3 | Language | 201 |
| 4.4.4 | The Jura Case | 203 |
| 4.5 | Conclusion | 205 |

## Chapter 5

**Federalism and Accommodation of Diversity: The Ethiopian Experience**

| 5.1 | Introduction | 207 |
| 5.2 | Origin of the Federation | 211 |
| 5.3 | Federal Features | 213 |
CONTENTS

5.4 Some Distinct Features
   5.4.1 Unicameral Legislature 221
   5.4.2 Federal Supremacy, Secession and implications for the
       Unity-Diversity Rationale behind Federations 221
   5.4.3 The Explicit Recognition of Nations/Nationalities as Building
       Bricks of the Federation and its Implications 229

5.5 Limitations 245
   5.5.1 Failure to take into Account Historic Mobility and Inter-group
       Relations 245
   5.5.2 Boundary Disputes 249
   5.5.3 Issues of Legitimacy, Asymmetry and Resource Constraints 250
   5.5.4 The Threat of Local Tyranny 260
       5.5.4.1 The Crisis in Gambela 267
       5.5.4.2 Benishangul-Gumuz 270
       5.5.4.3 The Harar City State 275

5.6 Conclusion 280

Chapter 6 Division of Legislative Powers 283
   6.1 The Form and Scope of Distribution of Legislative Powers 283
   6.2 Exclusive Powers 286
   6.3 Shared Legislative Powers
       6.3.1 Framework powers 303
       6.3.2 Concurrent Powers 309
   6.4 Residual Powers 319
   6.5 Explaining the Paradox 330
   6.6 Conclusion 339

Chapter 7 Division of Executive Power and Intergovernmental
       Relations 341
   7.1 Dual versus Executive or Functional Federalism 342
       7.1.1 Dual Federalism 346
       7.1.2 Executive Federalism 348
   7.2 Intergovernmental Relations
       7.2.1 Co-operative Federalism 357
       7.2.2 The Evolution of the System of Co-operative Federalism 360
       7.2.3 Comparative Evaluation 368
   7.3 The System of Intergovernmental Relations in Ethiopia
       7.3.1 Delegation 370
       7.3.2 Co-operation through Executive Institutions 372
       7.3.3 Co-operation through Party Channels 377
       7.3.4 Co-operation through the Process of Policy-Making 380
   7.4 Conclusion 381