Studies in Employment and Social Policy

Between Soft and Hard Law

The Impact of International Social Security Standards on National Social Security Law

Edited by Frans Pennings
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface xi

List of Abbreviations xiii

## 1 International Social Security Standards: An Overview

*Frans Pennings and Bernd Schulte*

1.1 The Objectives of International Standards Established by the ILO 1

1.2 Other Means of Action by the ILO 5

1.3 The Stages in Development of Social Security Standards 5

1.4 Standards Concerning Migrant Workers 11

1.5 Characteristics of ILO Standards 12

1.6 Methods of Protection under the Conventions 13

1.7 Supervision instruments 15

1.7.1 General 15

1.7.2 Reporting Duties 16

1.7.3 The Committee of Experts 18

1.7.4 Complaints Procedures 19

1.7.5 The International Court of Justice 20

1.8 A Comparison of ILO Standards with those of Other International Organisations 21

1.8.1 The Council of Europe 21

1.8.2 The European Union 24

1.9 Conclusions 26

## 2 Overview of Up-To-Date ILO Social Security Conventions

*Ursula Kulke*

2.1 Introduction 27

2.2 Flexibility Clauses 27

2.2.1 Ratification 27

2.2.2 Coverage 28

2.2.3 Temporary Exceptions for Developing Countries 28

2.2.4 Methods of Calculating Benefits 28

2.3 Principles Common to the Various Branches of Social Security 29

2.3.1 General Responsibility of the State 29

2.3.2 Participation of Insured Persons 30
## Contents

2.3.3 Financing of Benefits 30  
2.3.4 Adjustment of Pensions 30  
2.3.5 Right of Appeal 31  
2.3.6 Suspension of Benefit 31  
2.4 Legal Requirements of the Conventions at a Glance 32  

### 3 Some Current Points of Discussion Concerning Social Security Conventions  
*Frans Pennings and Bernd Schulte*

- 3.1 Introduction 43  
- 3.2 The Lack of a Definition of Social Security 43  
- 3.3 Some Branches Seem to Have Become Outdated 45  
- 3.4 The Lack of Coverage of Modern Risks 46  
- 3.5 The Reference of Standards to the Male Breadwinner 46  
- 3.6 The Criticism on the Categories of Persons that are Protected by the Conventions 47  
- 3.7 The Alleged Conservative Influence of the Conventions 48  
- 3.8 The Topic of the Subsequent Chapters 49  

### 4 The Impact of Social Security Conventions: The United Kingdom  
*Simon Roberts*

- 4.1 Introduction 53  
  - 4.1.1 The UK Social Security System 53  
  - 4.1.2 The UK and the ILO 54  
- 4.2 Sickness Benefits 55  
  - 4.2.1 Healthcare (Sickness Benefits in Kind) 56  
  - 4.2.2 Income Replacement Benefits in the Case of Sickness 57  
- 4.3 Maternity Benefits 58  
- 4.4 Incapacity for Work Benefits 60  
- 4.5 Industrial Accidents Benefits 60  
- 4.6 Survivors’ Benefits 62  
- 4.7 Old Age Benefits 62  
- 4.8 Unemployment Benefits 63  
- 4.9 Family Benefits 67  
- 4.10 Conclusions 67  

### 5 The Impact of Social Security Conventions: Spain  
*Cristina Sánchez-Rodas Navarro and Andrés Rodríguez Benot*

- 5.1 Introduction 69  
  - 5.1.1 The Direct Effect of International Treaties on Spanish Law 69  
  - 5.1.2 The Spanish attitude towards ILO and Council of Europe Conventions 71
5.1.3 The Attitude of the Courts Towards and Social Security Conventions 72
5.1.4 The ILO Conventions and Spanish Social Security Law 73
5.2 An Overview of the Spanish Social Security System 74
5.2.1 Personal Scope 74
5.2.2 Material Scope 74
5.2.3 Financing of Social Security Benefits 75
5.2.4 Medical Care 76
5.2.5 Sickness Benefits 77
5.2.6 Maternity Benefits 77
5.2.7 Unemployment Benefits 78
5.2.8 Old-Age Benefits 79
5.2.8.1 Contributory Old-Age Pensions 79
5.2.8.2 Non-Contributory Old-Age Pensions 80
5.2.8.3 Public Assistance Old-Age Pensions for Returned Migrants or those who Live Abroad 80
5.2.9 Employment Injury Benefits 80
5.2.10 Family Benefits 81
5.2.11 Invalidity Benefits 82
5.2.11.1 Contributory Invalidity Benefit 82
5.2.11.2 Non-Contributory Invalidity Benefit 83
5.2.12 Survivors’ Benefits 83
5.3 Conclusions 84

6 The Impact of Social Security Conventions: The Netherlands 85
Frans Pennings

6.1 Introduction 85
6.2 The Attitude towards ILO Conventions until the 1960s 86
6.3 The Conventions Ratified by the Netherlands 87
6.4 The Conventions Not Ratified by the Netherlands 88
6.5 The First Frictions between ILO Conventions and Dutch Laws 89
6.6 The Attempts of the Government to Denounce Conventions 91
6.7 The Policy Rules for Denouncing Conventions 92
6.8 The Impact of Conventions on Court Decisions 92
6.9 Sickness and Maternity Benefits 93
6.9.1 Sickness Benefits in Kind 94
6.9.2 Sickness Benefits in Cash (Income Replacing Benefits) 95
6.9.3 Maternity Benefits 97
6.10 Incapacity for Work Benefits 99
6.10.2 The Wholly and Permanently Disabled 100
6.10.3 The Partially Disabled (Between 35 and 80 Per cent) 101
6.10.4 The Partially Disabled (Less than 35 Per Cent) 103
6.10.5 The Proposal for an Extra Guarantee Scheme for Occupational Risks 103
8.1.2 The Basic Social Security Schemes 140
  8.1.2.1 The General Scheme 140
  8.1.2.2 The Agricultural Scheme 142
  8.1.2.3 Special Social Security Schemes 143
8.1.3 Unemployment Benefit Schemes 144
8.1.4 The Compulsory Supplementary Schemes 146
8.1.5 Complementary Collective Labour Agreement Schemes 147
8.1.6 Optional Schemes 148
8.2 The Impact of ILO Social Security Conventions on the French Legal System 149
  8.2.1 The State of Ratification of ILO Conventions 149
    8.2.1.1 Social Security Conventions Ratified by France 149
    8.2.1.2 The Legal Force of Ratified ILO Conventions 150
    8.2.1.3 ILO Conventions Not Ratified by France 150
    8.2.1.4 Analysis of the Reasons for Non-Ratification of Conventions 151
8.3 The impact of ILO Social Security Conventions on French Social Security 152
8.4 Two Examples of the Priority of EU Law over ILO Conventions in French Law 152
  8.4.1 Night Work in Industry and Equality of Treatment between Women and Men 152
  8.4.2 Equal Pay for Men and Women 153
8.5 Examples of the Reluctance of French Courts to Apply International Conventions in the Area of Social Security 153
  8.5.1 Introduction 153
  8.5.2 The Uncertainty Concerning the Direct Effect of ILO Social Security Conventions 155
8.6 Equality of Treatment on Grounds of Nationality: Convention 118 156
  8.6.1 Equal Treatment in Respect of Non-Contributory Benefits 156
  8.6.2 The Social Security Status of Illegal Immigrants 157
  8.6.3 How Does The Principle of Territoriality Combine with ILO Social Security Conventions? 159
8.7 Conclusions 162

9 Conclusions 165
  Frans Pennings

  9.1 Introduction 165
  9.2 The Role of the Conventions in General 166
    9.2.1 General 166
    9.2.2 The Attitude towards Adopting Conventions 166
    9.2.3 The Role of (Academic) Lawyers 167
  9.3 The Conventions and the National Legislators 168
    9.3.1 The Role of the Conventions in the Process of Making New Legislation 168
    9.3.2 The Role of the Conventions after they have been Adopted 168