INDIGENOUS PEOPLES’ LAND RIGHTS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW
From Victims to Actors

Jérémie Gilbert
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ......................................................... vii
About the Author ........................................................ ix
List of Abbreviations ..................................................... xi

Introduction:
Territoriality: The Thread of Indigenous Cultures .................. xiii

PART I: INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AS VICTIMS:
THEORIES OF DISPOSSESSION ........................................... 1

Chapter 1: Means of Acquisition ....................................... 3
A. The Conquest of Indigenous Territories ............................ 3
   1. Justifications of Conquest: Commerce, Christianity and
      Civilization .......................................................... 4
      a. In the Name of the Pope: The Holy Conquest .......... 5
      b. The Naturalist Theory: A Conquest for “Civilization” 9
   2. Discriminatory Rules of Conquest .............................. 13
B. The Occupation of Indigenous Territories ........................ 20
   1. The Post-Westphalian Order: Dichotomy Between Nations
      and Indigenous Communities ................................. 22
   2. Occupation of “Vacant” Territories: Terra Nullius as a
      Legal Fiction ..................................................... 26
   3. Terra Nullius by Other Means: Contemporary
      Forms of Denial ................................................ 30
      a. The Positivist Requirement of “Effective Occupation” 32
      b. Impact of Uti Possidetis on Indigenous Territorial
         Ownership .................................................... 35
C. Conclusion .................................................................. 40

Chapter 2: Means of Extinguishment ................................... 41
A. The Extinguishment of Indigenous Territorial Sovereignty by
   Colonial Treaties ..................................................... 42
   1. A Process of Retrogression: From International Law to
      “Domestic Dependent Nations” ............................... 44
   2. The “Trail of Broken Treaties”: Contemporary Enforcement
      of Colonial Treaties ............................................. 51
B. Theories of Extinguishable Indigenous Land Rights ............. 55
   1. Discovery: A Theory of Extinguishable Right of Occupancy. 55
2. Contemporary Theories of Extinguishable Indigenous Title
   a. Content and Sources of Indigenous Title:
      The Burden of Proof
   i. Nature and Source of Indigenous Title
   ii. Proof of Indigenous Title: The Impossible Burden of Proof?
   b. Human Rights Approach on Extinguishment
      i. The Justification Test: Clear and Plain Legislative Intention
      ii. Extinguishment Versus Equality
      iii. Extinguishment Versus Participatory Rights
   C. Conclusion

PART II: INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AS SUBJECTS:
THEORIES OF PROTECTION AND REPARATION

Chapter 3: Land Rights as Proprietary Rights
A. Promises and Weaknesses of the Property Rights Discourse
   1. Property Rights: Sources and Content
      a. The Western Framing of Individual Property Rights
      b. Property as a Human Right
   2. Towards an Indigenous Peoples’ Right to Collective Land Ownership
      a. International Law: An Emergence of Collective Ownership
      i. Ownership Under ILO
      ii. The Emergence of Indigenous Peoples’ Collective Property Rights
      b. Recognition of Collective Ownership at the National Level: The “Social” Function of Land Rights
   3. Conclusions: Limits of Land Rights as a Proprietary Right
B. A Right to Use: Land Rights as a Cultural Right
   1. Land Rights as Subsistence Rights
      a. Land Rights as a Means to a Collective Existence: Ethnocide, Cultural Genocide or Crimes Against Humanity
      b. Right to Subsistence: Access to Livelihood
   2. Land Rights as a Way of Life
   3. The “Heritage” Approach
   C. Conclusion

Chapter 4: Remedies: Restitution and Special Measures
A. Reparations: Restitution and Compensation
   1. Restitution and Compensation
PART III INDIGENOUS PEOPLES AS ACTORS:
NEGOTIATING LAND RIGHTS ............................................. 195

Chapter 5: Self-Determination and Autonomy:
Emerging Standards on Territorial Negotiations ......................... 199
A. The Self-Determination and Land Rights Nexus ......................... 200
  1. Current Understandings of Self-Determination: States’
     Territorial Integrity and Indigenous Participation ................. 201
     a. The Caveat of Self-Determination: States’ Territorial
        Integrity .............................................................. 202
     b. Self-Determination as a Right to Participate in Land
        Management ......................................................... 209
        i. Self-Determination as a Right to Natural Resources ....... 209
        ii. Self-Determination as a “Participatory” Land Right ... 214
  2. Evolving Understandings of Self-Determination: Consent and
     Territorial Negotiations ............................................. 215
     a. A Right to “Freely Determine”: Self-Determination as a
        Norm for the Free, Prior and Informed Consent .............. 216
     b. Towards a Specific Form of “Indigenous
        Self-Determination”: A Right to Territorial Negotiations ... 220
B. Autonomy and Implications for Indigenous Peoples’ Land Rights .... 226
  1. Autonomy and Land Rights: Two Sides of the Same Coin ........... 226
  2. Indigenous Experiences with Institutional and Territorial
     Autonomy ................................................................... 231
     a. Institutional Autonomy: Legal Basis, Prospects
        and Limits .............................................................. 233
        i. The Saami Parliaments: Usufructuary Rights .......... 236
ii. The Panchayat System: Consultation and Land Alienation ........................................... 238
iii. Comments on Institutional Autonomy and Indigenous Peoples’ Land Rights .......................... 239
b. Territorial Autonomy: Sharing the Experience .............................................................. 240
   i. Imposed Forms of Autonomy: Northeast India and Greenland ........................................ 241
   ii. Negotiated Form of Autonomy: The Model of Nunavut .................................................. 244
3. Observations on Autonomy .......................................................................................... 246
C. Conclusion: Self-Determination and Autonomy as Rights to Negotiation ................................. 247

Chapter 6: Modern Treaties and Land Rights:
The Renewal of a Dialogue ................................................................. 251
A. Land for Peace: Peace Agreements and Indigenous Peoples’ Territorial Rights ......... 253
   1. Negotiations: Entrenching Human Rights in Peace Agreement ...................................... 255
      a. Land and Identity: The Recognition of Customary Laws and Collective Ownership in New Caledonia and Mexico ................................................................. 256
   2. Implementation: The Role of Human Rights Institutions ............................................... 263
      a. Follow-Up to Legislative Implementation .................................................................... 264
      b. Role of Power Sharing: Establishing Land Rights Institutions .................................. 268
B. Land Claim Settlement Agreements and Land Use Agreements ......................................... 272
      a. The Treaty Policy: An Overview .................................................................................. 273
      b. Limits of the Canadian Model: The Surrender Policy .................................................. 275
   2. Land Use Agreements: Towards Co-Management ........................................................... 281
      a. Protected Areas Agreements: The Example of South Africa ...................................... 282
      b. Australia: Indigenous Land Use Agreements ............................................................... 284
C. Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 288

Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 293

Table of Treaties and Instruments ................................................................................. 303
Table of Cases ..................................................................................................................... 305
Selected Bibliography ........................................................................................................ 311
Index ................................................................................................................................... 323