REDRESSING MISCARRIAGES OF JUSTICE

Practice and Procedure in National and International Criminal Law Cases

GEERT-JAN ALEXANDER KNOOPS
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**Preface** ........................................... xi

**About the Author** .................................. xiii

**List of Abbreviations** ............................... xv

**Chapter 1: The Need for Effective Retrial Procedures in International Criminal Cases** .......................................................... 1

A. Wrongful Convictions and Their Inter-Relationship with the Nature of the Criminal Justice System .......................... 1

B. Effective Retrial or Review Procedures: Protection of the Integrity of Criminal Trials .................................................. 3

**Chapter 2: Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice Within International Criminal Law: An Erga Omnes Obligation** .......... 5

A. Introduction: The Applicability of the Doctrine of State Responsibilities Erga Omnes ........................................ 5

B. The Genesis of the Erga Omnes Doctrine: The U.S. Innocence Protection Act ......................................................... 9

C. State Responsibilities Vis-à-Vis The Protection Against Miscarriage of Justice: The ILC Articles on State Responsibility ............. 12

**Chapter 3: Causes and Pre-Disposing Factors of Miscarriages of Justice: A Legal Overview** ................................................... 17

A. Clear and Present Dangers .................................. 17

**Chapter 4: Miscarriages of Justice Originating from Disclosure Deficiencies in Criminal Cases** .......................................................... 23

A. Disclosure Failures as Ground for Retrials: Common Law Standards and Examples ......................................................... 23

1. Disclosure Requirements Set Forth by the U.S. Supreme Court .......................................................... 23

2. Basic Disclosure Conditions Under U.K. Law ......................................................... 24

B. The Extent of Disclosure Obligations in Criminal Cases: 

   *R. v. Ward* ............................................. 27

C. Judicial Relationship Between Disclosure of Evidence and Miscarriages of Justice .......................... 30
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6: Miscarriages of Justice Originating from Unsafe Identification Evidence in Criminal Cases</th>
<th>59</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. The Fallibility of “Human Perception and Recollection:” Identification Standards of International Tribunals</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Retrial Standards Within Common Law</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Retrial Standards Based on Identification Evidence in International Criminal Cases</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Prevention of Unsafe Convictions Due to Identification Evidence in International Criminal Cases</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Conclusions</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7: Retrial Standards and Procedures in International Criminal Cases</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Judicial Review Based on “New” Evidence</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Approach of the U.S. Supreme Court</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Toward a New Perception of Miscarriages of Justice: The Birmingham Six Precedents</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Inception of a Specialized Investigative Body for Review Cases</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i. The CCRC’s Procedures</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii. Stage 1: Initial Assessment</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii. Stage 2: Substantive Review</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv. Stage 3: Appointment of an Investigating Officer</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The CCRC Review System</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Approach of the Dutch Supreme Court</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Retrial Standards Before the International Criminal Tribunals</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. ICTY-ICTR Criteria</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. ICTY-ICTR Case Law on Review Proceedings</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. ICTR’s Extensive View on the “New Fact” Criterion</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The Revision System Under the ICC Statute</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Determination and Standard of “New Evidence” in Criminal Cases: Toward a Uniform Model</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Judicial Review Based on “New” Defenses or Arguments</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 8: Forensic Sciences to Protect Against and Remedy Miscarriages of Justice

A. Introduction: The Evolution of Forensic Genetics in Criminal Cases

B. The Advent of Forensic Genetics in the Context of Reopening International Criminal Cases
   1. Increasing DNA Exonerations
   2. Technical Evolution of Forensic Genetics
   3. Practical Problems and Complications of Assessing the Evidentiary Weight of DNA Evidence
   4. Future Forensic Genetics Developments and Miscarriages of Justice

C. Forensic Evidence Standards to Prevent Miscarriages of Justice in Criminal Trials
   1. Introduction
   2. Forensic Science Errors in the Diagnosis of Guilt or Innocence in Criminal Cases
      a. The Reality of Contemporary Forensic Science Errors
      b. 11 Factors
      c. Forensic Science Errors: The Brandon Mayfield Case

D. Scientific Error: A Potential Retrial Argument

E. Forensic Standards and Principles to Be Applied by National and International Criminal Courts: The Approach of the U.S. Supreme Court

F. The Right to Hear and Challenge Defense Expert Witnesses Under the ECHR

G. Toward a Legal Standard to Review Forensic or Expert Witness Evidence in Criminal Cases

Chapter 9: Expert Evidence Requirements and Standards Within International Criminal Cases: Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice

A. Introduction

B. General Principles Pertaining to Adducing Expert Witness Evidence
   1. Purpose of and Requirements as to Expert Witness Qualifications
      a. Common Law Approach
      b. The Approach of International Criminal Tribunals
   2. Practical Guidelines as to Qualifying and Examining Expert Witnesses
3. The "Ultimate Issue" Rule Within the Practice of International Criminal Tribunals ........................................ 135
C. Conclusion: The Ultimate Issue as an Instrument in the Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice .................. 145


Chapter 11: Procedural Mechanisms Sui Generis Against Miscarriages of Justice .................................................. 149
A. Balancing the Prevention of Wrongful Conviction: Judicial Economy and Equality of Arms Within International and Internationalized Criminal Trials ........... 149
1. Introduction: Converging Objectives Before International Criminal Tribunals ................................................. 149
2. Ensuring Equality of Arms on the International Plane: Defense Scope and Limitations ...................................... 150
3. Concurrence of Equality of Arms and Judicial Economy in the Law Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals ................................................................. 152
   a. The Practice of the International Criminal Tribunals: A Shift to Controlling the Effectiveness of the Proceedings ................................................................. 152
   b. Challenging Judicial Economy and Prioritizing Equality of Arms: The Oric Case ............................................. 156
   c. Equality of Arms as a Human Rights Protection Against Judicial Economy Before International Criminal Tribunals ................................................................. 159
4. Equality of Arms Vis-à-Vis Investigation and Documentary Evidence ................................................................. 164
   b. Equality of Arms and Access to Documents of Governmental or International Organizations .......................... 170
5. Pitfalls and Dangers of Judicial Economy Within International Trials ................................................................. 171
Redressing Miscarriages of Justice

Chapter 12: Recommendations and Future Guidelines as to the Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice

A. Toward a Uniform System of Judicial Supervision of Miscarriages of Justice
   1. Disclosure as Principal Procedural Remedy
   2. Future Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice: Enhancing Judicial Supervision of Prosecutorial Conduct
   3. Proper and Timely Engagement of Expert Witnesses
   4. Minimizing the Inherent Risks in Forensic Evidence: Proactive Tasks for Defense Lawyers
   5. Statutory Obligation as to Recording Police Interviews
   6. Improvement in Police Training and Awareness
   7. Refining the Laws on Review of International Criminal Cases: A Uniform Provision

B. Concluding Recommendation: The Protection Against Miscarriages of Justice as an Erga Omnes Obligation

Table of Authorities

Table of Cases

Index