The United Nations Security Council in the Post-Cold War Era
Applying the Principle of Legality

by

Kenneth Manusama
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preface</th>
<th>ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table of Cases</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 1 - The Security Council and the Principle of Legality

1.1 Introduction: The Security Council in the Post-Cold War era 1
1.2 The Security Council, rule of law and the principle of legality 3
   1.2.1 Perceptions of Security Council illegitimacy 4
   1.2.2 Security Council (il)legitimacy & the principle of legality 6
   1.2.3 Issues for analysis and chapter outline 10
1.3 An executive organ bound by law 12
   1.3.1 Applying the rule of law & the principle of legality 12
   1.3.2 Higher Norms: International law and UN Purposes and Principles 21
   1.3.3 *Intra vires* Security Council action 31
1.4 The nature of the Security Council and its decisions 40
1.5 Conclusion: A Security Council *legibus alligatus* 44

### Chapter 2 - Security Council jurisdiction

2.1 Preliminaries: Council jurisdiction versus domestic jurisdiction 47
   2.1.1 Criteria for Security Council jurisdiction 48
   2.1.2 Security Council jurisdiction and Article 2(7) 51
   2.1.3 Pré-1990 Security Council practice 56
2.2 The Iraq-Kuwait crisis 62
   2.2.1 Invading Kuwait 63
Contents

2.2.2 Resolution 687 (1991): The ‘mother of all resolutions’ and disarmament 67
2.2.3 The Kurds of Northern Iraq 72

2.3 The Yugoslav conflicts 75
2.3.1 Civil war 76
2.3.2 Bosnia and Herzegovina 78
2.3.3 Kosovo 83

2.4 The coup d’êtat in Haiti 86
2.5 Self-determination in East Timor 91

2.6 The Security Council and international terrorism 97
2.6.1 Preliminaries: Terrorism, international law and the Security Council 98
2.6.2 The Lockerbie incident: Resolutions 731 and 748 (1992) 104
2.6.3 Refusal to Exradite: Egypt v. Sudan 107
2.6.4 Qualifying international terrorism before and after 9/11 109

2.7 Conclusion: The breadth of Security Council jurisdiction 111

Chapter 3 – The Security Council and enforcement measures short of armed force

3.1 Preliminaries 119
3.1.1 Authority & objectives 120
3.1.2 Applicable law 122
3.1.3 Pré-1990 Security Council practice 128

3.2 The Iraq sanction-regime 130
3.2.1 Security Council demands 130
3.2.2 On sanctions, humanitarian exemptions and humanitarian assistance 138
3.2.3 Observations 149

3.3 Sierra Leone and ‘conflict diamonds’ 152
3.3.1 Security Council demands 153
3.3.2 Targeted sanctions: Arms embargoes and travel bans 154
3.3.3 Targeted sanctions: Combating the illicit diamond trade 156
3.3.4 Observations 159

3.4 Ad hoc international criminal tribunals 159
3.4.1 An appropriate means? 161
3.4.2 Security Council authority 163
3.4.3 Applicable law: Legislation or enforcement? 166

3.5 Combating international terrorism 168
3.5.1 Preliminaries: Terrorism, international law and the Security Council 168
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2 The Lockerbie incident: Resolutions 731 and 748 (1992)</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3 Refusal to extradite: Egypt v. Sudan</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4 Beyond extradition: The Taliban and Al Qaeda</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.5 General measures to combat terrorism: Resolutions 1373 (2001) and 1540 (2004)</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Conclusion: The Security Council and enforcement measures short of armed force</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 4 – The Security Council and the collective use of force**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Preliminaries: The law on the use of force and collective security</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1 The general prohibition of Article 2(4): Elements and interpretation</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2 Exception to the rule: Collective security and the use of force</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3 Pré-1990 Security Council practice</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 The Iraq-Kuwait crisis and collective security</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The naval blockade of resolution 665 (1990)</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Resolution 678 (1990): Enforcement action, self-defence or both? Part I</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Resolutions 1441 (2002) and Operation Iraqi Freedom</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Observations</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Crisis in the former Yugoslavia</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Resolution 770 (1992): Humanitarian assistance</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Resolutions 787 (1992) and 820 (1993): Naval blockade</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Resolutions 781 (1992) and 816 (1993): No-fly zone</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Resolutions 836 and 844 (1993): Air power</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Observations</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 The forceful restoration of democracy in Haiti</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Resolution 875 (1993): Naval blockade</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Resolution 940 (1994): UN authorised ‘humanitarian’ intervention</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3 Observations</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Conclusion: The Security Council and the collective use of force: Authority without accountability?</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Chapter 5 – The Security Council and the unilateral use of force**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 The unilateral use of force in self-defence</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 Pré-1990 Security Council practice</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.1.2 The Iraq-Kuwait crisis and collective self-defence 247
5.1.2.1 Resolutions 661 to 665 (1990) 247
5.1.2.2 Resolution 678 (1990): Enforcement action, self-defence or both? Part II 251
5.1.2.3 Observations 252
5.1.3 The arms embargo against Bosnia and Herzegovina and its right to self-defence 254
5.1.3.1 Genocide and self-defence 255
5.1.3.2 International response 257
5.1.3.3 Observations 259
5.1.4 Observations on the Security Council and self-defence 260
5.2 Humanitarian intervention 262
5.2.1 Pré-1990 Security Council practice 265
5.2.2 Humanitarian relief in Northern Iraq 267
5.2.3 NATO intervention in Kosovo 270
5.2.4 ECOWAS intervention in Sierra Leone 276
5.2.5 Observations on the Security Council and humanitarian intervention 279
5.3 The unilateral use of force in response to international terrorism 281
5.3.1 Pré-1990 Security Council practice 281
5.3.2 In response to state-sponsored assassination – Iraq 1993 284
5.3.3 Operation Infinite Reach: Afghanistan & Sudan 1998 288
5.3.4 Operation Enduring Freedom: Afghanistan 2001 291
5.3.5 Observations on the Security Council and unilateral responses to terrorism 296
5.4 Conclusions: The Security Council and the unilateral use of force 298

Chapter 6 – Conclusion

6.1 The principle of legality in the law of the Security Council 302
6.2 Legality in Security Council practice 305
6.3 Security Council legality versus Security Council legitimacy 313
6.4 The Security Council and its reform in the 21st century 317

Bibliography 321

Index 339