

Michael Faure
Ton Hartlief (eds.)

Financial Compensation for Victims of Catastrophes
A Comparative Legal Approach

With Contributions by

Tola Amodu	Suzanne A. Bratis
Michel Cannarsa	Filippo A. Chiaves
Isabelle C. Durant	Michael Faure
Ton Hartlief	Dagmar Hinghofer-Szalkay
Michael Huber	Bernhard A. Koch
Fabien Lafay	Ulrich Magnus
Alberto Monti	Olivier Moréteau
Siv Nyquist	Erik Persson
Robert L. Rabin	Roger Van den Bergh

SpringerWienNewYork

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION	1
Part I. Problem Definition.....	1
Part II. Goal of this Book	2
Part III. Methodology	3
Part IV. Framework of the Project.....	4
Part V. Collaborators in this Project.....	5
Part VI. Structure of this Book	5
Part VII. Words of Thanks	6
COUNTRY REPORTS	7
Austria (<i>Dagmar Hinghofer-Szalkay and Bernhard A. Koch</i>)	7
Part I. Introduction.....	7
Part II. Information on Specific Compensation Systems	8
I. Tort.....	8
A. Fault Liability	8
B. Strict Liability	9
C. State Liability	10
D. Procedure.....	11
II. Social Security	11
III. The Austrian Fund for Catastrophes	12
A. Introduction	12
B. Financing of the Fund	12
C. Two Examples.....	13
1. Lower Austria	13
2. Salzburg	14
D. Summary	15
1. Procedure	15
2. Heads and Amount of Damages	15
3. Rules Preventing Cumulation	15
IV. Private Insurers	16
A. First-Party Insurance	16
B. Third-Party Insurance.....	17
C. Catastrophe Management.....	17
1. Catastrophe Management in General.....	17
2. Mass Collisions in Particular	17

Part III. Detailed Information on Specific Catastrophes	19
I. Natural Catastrophes.....	19
A. Galtür Avalanche 1999.....	19
B. Flood 2002	21
1. Action by the Federal Government.....	21
2. Details on Lower Austria.....	23
3. Details on Salzburg.....	24
4. Private Compensation.....	24
5. State Liability.....	27
II. Man-Made Catastrophes	28
A. Lassing Mine Collapse 1998.....	28
B. Bergisel Panic 1999.....	29
C. Kaprun Ski Train Fire 2000	31
Part IV. Conclusions.....	34
List of References	35
Belgium (<i>Isabelle C. Durant</i>).....	37
Part I. Introduction.....	37
Part II. Method.....	38
Part III. General Scope of the Compensation System	38
I. Patchwork of Regulations	38
II. First Overall Survey of the Various Rules.....	38
A. Tort Law.....	38
B. Insurance Law	39
1. Federal Legislation	41
2. Flemish Legislation	42
3. Brussels Legislation.....	44
4. Walloon Legislation.....	45
C. Social Security.....	45
D. Solidarity	46
Part IV. More Detailed Information	48
I. Social Security System	48
A. Workmen's Compensation Law.....	48
B. Health Insurance.....	51
II. Tort Law.....	53
A. Three Basic Requirements	53
1. Damaging Event	53
2. Damage	55
3. Causal Link.....	56
B. Compensation.....	56
1. General Rule: Compensation of the Entire Certain Loss	56
2. Heads of Damage.....	57
III. Natural Disasters.....	59
A. General Overview	59

	B. Summary of the Legal System Concerning Public Disasters	60
	C. Summary of the Legal System Concerning Natural Disasters	63
	D. Weaknesses of the Actual System and New Prospects	65
Part V.	Procedures	70
	I. Social Security System	70
	A. Charter of the Socially Insured	70
	B. The Workmen's Compensation Law	70
	II. Tort Law	71
	III. Insurance Law	71
	A. General Rule	71
	B. Fire Insurance – Property Insurance	72
	IV. Natural Disasters	72
Part VI.	Combination of the Various Systems	73
Part VII.	Financing	74
Part VIII.	Amounts of Damages	74
Part IX.	Empirics	75
Part X.	General Comments	77
	List of References	78
France (<i>Michel Cannarsa, Fabien Lafay, and Olivier Moréteau</i>)		81
Part I.	Introduction	81
Part II.	General Scope of the Compensation System	82
	I. Physical Injury	82
	II. Damage to Property	83
Part III.	More Detailed Information	84
	I. Social Security	84
	II. Insurance	85
	A. Insurance Cover of Natural Catastrophes	86
	B. Insurance Cover of Man-made Catastrophes	88
	III. Compensation Funds	89
	IV. Tort Law	91
	A. Private Law	91
	1. Liability Based on Fault	92
	2. Strict Liability	92
	B. Public Law	94
Part IV.	Procedure	95
	I. Insurance Schemes	95
	II. Compensation Funds	96
	III. Tort Law	98
	A. Interlocutory Proceedings	98
	B. Limitation Periods	99
Part V.	Financing	101
	I. Social Security Contributions and Insurance Premiums	101

II.	Reassurance and State Guarantee	101
III.	Funding the Compensation Funds	103
Part VI.	Heads and Amounts of Damages	104
I.	Under Tort Law.....	104
A.	Recoverable Losses.....	104
1.	Property Damage	105
2.	Pecuniary Losses (past, actual and future)	105
3.	Damnum Emergens	105
4.	Lucrum Cessans	105
5.	Non-Pecuniary Losses	106
B.	Lump Sums, Periodical Payments, Interim Payments.....	107
II.	Recoverable Losses under Specific Regimes	108
Part VII.	Rules Preventing Cumulative Benefits	109
I.	Social Security Benefits.....	110
II.	Insurance Companies Benefits.....	111
III.	Benefits Received from Compensation Funds.....	112
Part VIII.	Empirics	113
I.	The Tempests of December 1999	114
II.	The Sinking of the Tanker Erika.....	114
III.	The Toulouse AZF Explosion.....	115
IV.	The Rhone Flood of December 2003.....	116
Part IX.	Conclusion	116
	List of References	118
Germany (Ulrich Magnus)		119
Part I.	Introduction	119
Part II.	General Scope of the Compensation System	121
Part III.	Specific Regulations	123
I.	<i>Ad hoc</i> Legislation	123
II.	Tort Law.....	124
A.	Strict Liability	124
B.	Fault Liability.....	128
III.	Insurance Law	129
A.	Private Insurance Law	129
B.	Social Insurance Law	130
IV.	Further Possible Sources.....	131
A.	Liability for Acts of State Officials.....	131
B.	Further Possible State Liability	132
Part IV.	Procedural Questions	133
I.	Distribution of Means under the <i>Flutopferhilfesolidaritätsgesetz</i>	133
II.	Normal Tort Law Procedure	135
III.	Private Insurance Regulation Procedure.....	136
IV.	Social Insurance Regulation Procedure	137
Part V.	Cumulation of Claims?	137

Part VI. Financing.....	138
Part VII. Heads and Amounts of Damages.....	139
Part VIII. Empirics.....	140
Part IX. Reform Proposals; Criticism.....	141
I. Reform Proposals.....	141
II. Criticism.....	142
Part X. Concluding Remarks.....	143
List of References.....	143
Italy (Alberto Monti and Filippo Andrea Chiaves).....	145
Part I. Introduction.....	145
Part II. The General Framework of Disaster Law in Italy.....	147
Part III. Legislation, Rules and Regulations.....	147
I. The Law of Torts.....	148
II. Dangerous Activities.....	150
III. Nuisance.....	153
IV. Moral Damages.....	154
V. Specific Issues: Mass Infections.....	157
VI. Specific Issues: Smoking.....	158
VII. Class Actions?.....	159
VIII. Rules of Procedure.....	161
Part IV. Mass Torts and Environmental Protection Issues.....	163
I. Mass Torts.....	163
II. Environment Protection.....	164
A. The Environment Act (Law No. 349 of 1986).....	164
B. Other Statutory Provisions.....	166
C. Legal Qualification of Environmental Damage as Health Injuries.....	167
D. Nature of Liability. Standing to Sue.....	167
Part V. State Subsidizing. Special Laws and Extraordinary Government Contributions.....	169
Part VI. The European Union Solidarity Fund.....	171
Part VII. Private Insurance.....	172
I. Private Insurance and Environment Issues.....	173
II. Private Insurance and the Costs of Catastrophes.....	175
Part VIII. The Major Italian Disasters and Catastrophes.....	175
I. The Vajont Disaster (9 October 1963).....	176
II. The Asti Flood (4 September 1948).....	176
III. The Cermis Accidents (9 March 1976 and 3 February 1998).....	177
IV. The Seveso Dioxin Cloud (10 July 1976).....	178
V. The Stava – Val di Fiemme Disaster (19 July 1985).....	180
VI. Floods, Fires, Earthquakes, Droughts and Oil Spills.....	181
Part IX. Future Perspectives in the Italian Disaster Recovery System.....	182
I. Shared Views.....	182
II. The “Mixed” System: Foreign Models.....	184

III.	ISVAP's Proposals.....	185
IV.	Law Reform Bills Introducing Mandatory Insurance	
	Coverage for Disasters.....	186
	A. Reform Bill No. 1164/1993.....	186
	B. ANIA's Mapping Plan	187
	C. Reform Bill No. 235/1996.....	187
	D. Reform Bill No. 533/2001.....	189
	E. ANIA's 2003 Proposals and Government's Current Reform Plan	189
Part X.	Conclusions.....	191
	List of References	192
The Netherlands (<i>Michael Faure and Ton Hartlief</i>)		195
Part I.	Introduction.....	195
Part II.	General Scope of the Compensation.....	197
Part III.	More Specific Information.....	198
	I. Liability Law.....	198
	II. Social Security	201
	III. Insurance	202
	IV. WTS 1998.....	206
	V. Compensation Funds.....	208
Part IV.	Heads of Damage and Accumulation of Compensation	212
Part V.	Empirical Evidence	215
	I. Legionella in Bovenkarspel	216
	II. Flooding	218
	III. Enschede	218
	IV. Volendam.....	220
Part VI.	Criticisms and Reform	222
	I. Criticism.....	222
	II. Reform	223
	List of References	224
Sweden (<i>Siv Nyquist and Erik Persson</i>).....		227
Part I.	General Scope of the Compensation System	227
Part II.	Detailed Information	227
Part III.	Procedure to Obtain Compensation for Damage	230
	I. Personal Injuries.....	230
	A. Social Insurance Administration	230
	B. Costs for Medical and Dental Care and Medicines from the Social Insurance.....	231
	C. Loss of Income	231
	D. Support for the Disabled from the Social Insurance	232
	E. Other Social Insurance Benefits in Case of Death	232
	F. The Work Injuries Insurance Act	233
	G. Support According to the Social Services Act.....	233

	H. Compensation from Private Insurances for Personal Injuries.....	234
	I. Criminal Injuries Compensation	235
II.	Compensation for Property Damage	237
III.	Particular Compensation Mechanism for Catastrophes.....	237
	A. Insurances According to the Swedish Environmental Code.....	238
	1. Environmental Damage Insurance.....	238
	2. Environmental Clean-up Insurance	239
	B. Income Tax Act.....	240
	C. The Nuclear Liability Act	241
	D. Law on Extraordinary Occurrences in Peacetime in the Municipality and County Council.....	242
	E. The Reformed Rescue Service Act	242
	F. The Motor Traffic Damage Act	243
	G. Responsibilities for Dams at Hydroelectric Power Stations.....	243
Part IV.	Administrative Procedure and Appeals	244
	I. Elements of Proof	245
	II. Public Legal Aid and Private Legal Expenses Insurance.....	246
	A. Private Legal Expenses Insurance.....	246
	B. Public Legal Aid.....	246
Part V.	Coordination or Cumulation	248
Part VI.	Discussion	250
Part VII.	Heads and Amounts of Damages.....	250
	I. Third Party Insurance.....	252
Part VIII.	Empirics	253
	I. Discotheque Fire in Gothenburg.....	253
	II. The Ferry Estonia.....	255
	III. Chernobyl.....	256
	IV. EU Summit Meeting	256
	V. Agricultural Damage.....	256
Part IX.	Conclusions.....	258
	List of References	259
	United Kingdom (<i>Michael Huber and Tola Amodu</i>)	261
Part I.	Introduction.....	261
Part II.	Conceptual Concerns	263
	I. State, Insurance and Law	263
	II. Catastrophe, Hazard or Disaster?.....	264
Part III.	The General Scope of the Compensation Regime	266
Part IV.	The British Compensation Regime	267
	I. Social Security in the UK	267
	II. Social Security Benefits and Insurance.....	269

	A. Welfare or Social Security Entitlements for Industrial Injuries	269
	B. Compensating Man-made Catastrophes extra the Benefits System.....	271
	III. Compensating Natural Hazards	272
Part V.	Compensation Funds.....	276
	I. Flood	276
	II. Terrorism.....	276
Part VI.	Legal Procedures.....	278
	I. The Duty of Care	281
	II. The Liability of Public Bodies.....	283
	III. Access	284
	IV. Limitation of Actions.....	286
Part VII.	The Assessment of Damages in Tort Law	287
	I. The Recovery of Cumulative Benefits.....	288
Part VIII.	Procedures.....	289
	I. Insurance Schemes.....	289
	II. Fund Solutions	290
	III. Natural Hazards/Insurance.....	291
Part IX.	Financing.....	291
Part X.	New Developments	292
	I. Flood Insurance.....	292
	II. Terrorism after September 2001	295
	III. Compensation Culture	296
	IV. Public Inquiries and Negotiations.....	296
Part XI.	Concluding Remarks.....	300
	List of References	300
United States (Robert L. Rabin and Suzanne A. Bratis).....		303
Part I.	Introduction.....	303
	I. The Role of Tort: Responsible Party	303
	II. Natural Disasters.....	306
Part II.	Social Welfare Legislation in the U.S.:	
	General Disability Provisions	307
	I. The U.S. Social Security System: Background	307
	II. Disability Provisions: Eligibility Standards.....	307
	III. Benefit Levels, Treatment of Collateral Sources, and Funding	309
	IV. Administration	310
	V. Health Care Benefits	311
	VI. Concluding Observations.....	312
Part III.	Disaster Relief: The Role of the Federal Emergency Management Agency	312
	I. Introduction.....	312
	II. FEMA: Coordination with State and Local Entities	313
	A. The Role of Local Government.....	313

	B. The Role of State Government.....	314
III.	FEMA: Core Responsibilities	315
	A. Historical Overview	315
	B. Obtaining Federal Assistance.....	316
	C. The Federal Response	317
	1. Federal Personnel Available.....	317
	2. Types of Federal Assistance Provided for Individuals and Businesses	318
	3. Types of Federal Assistance Provided for Communities	319
IV.	Funding of FEMA and Coordination with Collateral Sources	319
V.	Concluding Observations.....	320
Part IV.	Insurance: The Intersecting Private/Public Sectors	323
	I. Introduction.....	323
	II. Types of Insurance Coverage Triggered by Disaster Events.....	324
	A. Nuclear Reactor Accidents: Price-Anderson Act.....	324
	B. Federal Terrorism Risk Insurance Act	325
	C. California Earthquake Authority	327
	D. National Flood Insurance Program	330
	III. Concluding Observations.....	332
Part V.	Three Case Studies of Compensation for Catastrophic Loss	334
	I. The September 11 Victim Compensation Fund.....	335
	A. The September 11 Victim Compensation Fund: Statutory Framework.....	335
	B. The September 11 Victim Compensation Fund: Regulatory Guidelines.....	338
	1. Collateral Source Offset	339
	2. Economic Loss.....	339
	3. Non-economic Loss	340
	4. Resolving Tensions: A Hybrid Model	340
	II. Compensating Hurricane Damage: Hurricane Andrew.....	342
	A. Role of Private Insurance	342
	1. Hurricane-related Losses Compensated by Insurance.....	342
	2. Uncompensated Losses.....	343
	B. Impacts on the Insurance Industry	344
	1. Residential Property and Casualty Joint Underwriting Association.....	345
	2. Florida Hurricane Catastrophe Fund	346
	C. Role of FEMA.....	347
	D. Concluding Observations	349

III.	Catastrophic Loss in Tort: The Case of Commercial Airline Crashes.....	350
	A. Applicable Tort Principles	350
	B. Background Social Welfare and Insurance Systems.....	351
	C. Empirical Analysis of the Compensation System.....	352
Part VI.	Critical Assessment of the System.....	353
	List of References	356

**COMPULSORY CATASTROPHE EXTENSION OF FIRST PARTY
PROPERTY INSURANCE FROM A COMPETITION POLICY**

	PERSPECTIVE (Roger Van den Bergh).....	361
Part I.	Introduction.....	361
Part II.	The Anti-Competitive Effects of a Compulsory Catastrophe Coverage Extension of First Party Property Insurance.....	364
	I. The French Law and the Italian Proposal	364
	II. Competition Law: The Prohibition of Cartel Agreements and Abuses of a Dominant Position	365
	III. The Restrictions of Competition Resulting from a Compulsory Extension of First Party Property Insurance	366
	IV. Compulsory Catastrophe Extension of First Party Property Insurance and the Group Exemption for the Insurance Industry	368
	V. The State Compulsion Defense.....	371
Part III.	Compulsory Catastrophe Extension of First Party Property Insurance Re-assessed: Efficiency Defense or Solidarity Exception?.....	374
	I. Coverage of Catastrophic Loss in a Competitive Insurance Market and the Problem of Adverse Selection	374
	II. The Need to Cope with Adverse Selection and the Conditions for an Exemption from the Cartel Prohibition.....	376
	A. The First Condition: Improvement of Production or Distribution, or Technical or Economic Progress.....	377
	B. Benefits to Consumers	380
	C. The Proportionality Requirement.....	381
	D. A Sufficient Degree of Remaining Competition.....	382
	III. The Solidarity Exception	383
Part IV.	Conclusions.....	385
	List of References	387

COMPARATIVE AND POLICY CONCLUSIONS (<i>Michael Faure</i>).....	389
Part I. Introduction.....	389
Part II. General Compensation System.....	390
I. Austria.....	391
II. Belgium.....	391
III. France.....	391
IV. Germany.....	394
V. Italy.....	394
VI. The Netherlands.....	395
VII. Sweden.....	395
VIII. United Kingdom.....	396
IX. United States.....	396
X. Summary.....	398
Part III. Social Security.....	399
Part IV. Tort.....	402
Part V. Insurance.....	406
I. General.....	406
II. Austria.....	407
III. France.....	407
IV. Belgium.....	408
V. Germany.....	409
VI. Italy.....	409
VII. The Netherlands.....	409
VIII. Sweden.....	411
IX. United Kingdom.....	411
X. United States.....	412
XI. Summary.....	413
Part VI. Compensation Funds.....	415
Part VII. Procedural Aspects.....	419
Part VIII. Financing.....	423
I. General.....	423
II. Financing of Funds.....	423
III. Financing of Insurance Solutions.....	424
IV. Public-Private Partnerships.....	425
V. Summary.....	426
Part IX. Damages.....	427
Part X. Cumulation.....	429
Part XI. Reforms and Criticisms.....	432
Part XII. Critical Economic Analysis.....	435
I. Liability and Liability Insurance.....	435
A. Importance.....	435
B. Tort Law as Deterrent.....	437
C. Compulsory Insurance.....	438
II. First Party Insurance.....	438
A. Market Failure?.....	438
B. Compulsory Insurance?.....	440

C. Outlook.....	442
III. Public Intervention.....	444
A. Government as (Re-)Insurer or Santa Claus?	444
B. Fund or Ad Hoc?.....	446
IV. Policy Conclusions.....	448
List of References	449
ANNEX: QUESTIONNAIRE	453
Part I. Introduction	453
Part II. Method	454
Part III. General Scope of the Compensation System	454
Part IV. More Detailed Information	454
Part V. Procedure	455
Part VI. Cumulation.....	456
Part VII. Financing.....	456
Part VIII. Heads and Amounts of Damages	456
Part IX. Empirics	457
Part X. Reforms/Criticism.....	457
INDEX	459
PUBLICATIONS	463