Predictability and Flexibility in the Law of Maritime Delimitation

Yoshifumi Tanaka
# Contents

_Acknowledgements_ v  
_Preface_ vii  
_Table of Cases_ xxi  
_Table of Treaties and National Legislation_ xxiii  
_List of Abbreviations_ xxxvii  
_List of Illustrations_ xxxviii  

Chapter I: Preliminary Considerations 1  
  
_Section I  Nature of the Problem_ 1  
  1. Importance of Maritime Delimitation in International Law of the Sea 1  
  2. Development of the Studies on Maritime Delimitation 3  
  3. Analytical Framework 4  
  
_Section II  Concept of Maritime Delimitation_ 7  
  1. Legal Nature of Maritime Delimitation 7  
      A. Definition 7  
      B. Arguments on the Distinction between Delimitation and Apportionment 11  
      C. Arguments on the Distinction between Declaratory and Constitutive Delimitation 12  
  2. Typology of Maritime Delimitations 14  
      A. Typology in the 1958 Geneva Conventions 14  
      B. Typology in the 1982 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 14  
      C. Issues of the Single Maritime Boundary 15  
  
Part One: The Evolution of Law of Maritime Delimitation: Opposition of Two Basic Approaches 17  
  
Chapter II: Law of Maritime Delimitation Prior to the 1958 Geneva Conventions: Emergence of Two Approaches 19  
  
_Section I  Five Principal Systems of Maritime Delimitation_ 19  
  1. Median-Line System 19
A. State Practice and Opinions of Writers 19
B. Emergence of Two Prototypes 22
2. The System of a Line Perpendicular to the General Direction of the Coast 24
   A. The Grisbadarna Case (Norway/Sweden, 1909) 24
   B. Evaluation 25
3. Prolongation of the Land Boundary 27
4. Thalweg System 28
   A. State Practice and the Case Law 28
   B. Evaluation 31
5. Common-Zone System 31
Section II Discussion at the Hague Conference for the Codification of International Law in 1930 32
  1. Delimitation of Territorial Sea between States with Adjacent Coasts 32
  2. Delimitation of the Territorial Sea between States with Opposite Coasts 33
Section III Summary 34

Section I The 1958 Geneva Conventions 37
  1. Rules Regarding Delimitation of Territorial Sea and the Continental Shelf 37
     A. Basic Structure of the Rules 37
     B. Comments on the Triple Rule 40
  2. Rules on the Delimitation of Contiguous Zones and Internal Waters 43
Section II The 1982 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 44
  1. Analysis of Articles 74(1) and 83(1) 44
  2. Problems with Articles 74(1) and 83(1) 47

Chapter IV: Opposition of Two Approaches in the Case Law I: Continental Shelf Delimitation 51
Section I The North Sea Continental Shelf Cases (1969, Federal Republic of Germany/Denmark, the Netherlands) 51
  1. Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf Delimitation (1): Article 6 of the Convention on the Continental Shelf 52
     A. The Fundamental Aspects of Article 6 52
     B. The Positive Law Aspects of Article 6 53
  2. Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf Delimitation (2): Equitable Principles 57
A. Legal Basis of Equitable Principles 57  
B. Substance of Equitable Principles 58

**Section II** The *Anglo-French Continental Shelf* Case  
(France/United Kingdom, 1977) 61

1. Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf Delimitation 61  
   A. Preliminary Considerations on Reservations 61  
   B. Relation between Article 6 and Customary Law 62  
2. Application of the Law Identified 64  
   A. Establishment of the Continental Shelf Boundary 64  
   B. Comparison between the 1969 and 1977 Decisions 66

**Section III** The *Tunisia/Libya* Case (1982) 67

1. Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf Delimitation 67  
   A. Relation between Equitable Principles and Natural Prolongation 67  
   B. Approach to Equitable Principles 69  
2. Application of the Law Identified 71  
   A. Establishment of an Illustrative Continental Shelf Boundary 71  
   B. Problem of the Illustrative Boundary 72

**Section IV** The *Libya/Malta* Case (1985) 74

1. Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf Delimitation 75  
   A. The Court's Approach to Equitable Principles 75  
   B. Contents of Equitable Principles 76  
2. Application of the Law Identified 77  
   A. Establishment of the Illustrative Continental Shelf Boundary 77  
   B. Evaluation 79

**Chapter V: Opposition of Two Approaches in the Case Law II:**  
Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 81

**Section I** The *Gulf of Maine* Case (United States/Canada, 1984) 81

1. Law Applicable to the Single Maritime Boundary 82  
   A. Three Levels of Structure in the Chamber's Reasoning and Its Problems 82  
   B. The Chamber's Approach to the Law Applicable to Single Maritime Boundary 85  
2. Application of the Law Identified 86  
   A. Operational Stage 86  
   B. Verification Stage 88

**Section II** The *Guinea/Guinea-Bissau* Case (1985) 88

1. Law Applicable to the Single Maritime Boundary 89  
2. Application of the Law Identified 90
Section III  The St Pierre and Miquelon Case (France/Canada, 1992) 91
   1.  Law Applicable to the Single Maritime Boundary 91
   2.  Application of the Law Identified 92
      A.  Operational Stage 92
      B.  Verification Stage 94

Section IV  The Greenland/Jan Mayen Case (Denmark/Norway, 1993) 94
   1.  The Law Applicable to the Maritime Delimitation 95
      A.  Law Applicable to the Continental Shelf 95
      B.  Law Applicable to the FZ 97
      C.  The Court’s Approach to Equitable Principles 98
   2.  Application of the Law Identified 99
      A.  Consideration of the Special/Relevant Circumstances 99
      B.  Problems with the Coincident Maritime Boundary Established 100

Section V  The Eritrea/Yemen Case: the Second Stage (1999) 101
   1.  Law Applicable to the Single Maritime Boundary 103
   2.  Application of the Law Identified 104

Section VI  The Qatar/Bahrain Case (Merits, 2001) 107
   1.  Law Applicable to Maritime Delimitation 108
      A.  Law Applicable to Territorial Sea Delimitation 108
      B.  Law Applicable to a Single Maritime Boundary 109
   2.  Application of the Law Identified 110
      A.  Territorial Sea Delimitation 110
      B.  Single Maritime Boundary 112

Section VII  The Cameroon/Nigeria Case (Merits 2002) 113
   1.  Law Applicable to Maritime Delimitation 114
   2.  Application of the Law Identified 117
      A.  Identification of Relevant Coasts and Base Points 117
      B.  Considerations on Relevant Circumstances 118

Section VIII  Two Approaches to Equitable Principles in the Case Law 119
   1.  General Considerations 119
   2.  Analysis of Courts Approaches Based on the Configuration of the Coast 121
   3.  Advantages and Disadvantages of the Two Approaches 123
      A.  The Result-Oriented Equity Approach 123
      B.  The Corrective-Equity Approach 125

Part Two: Comparative Analysis between the Case Law and State Practice 127
Chapter VI: Predictability in the Law of Maritime Delimitation: 
The Applicability of the Equidistance Method at the First Stage of 
Delimitation 129

Section I Method of Analysis 129
  1. Importance of Comparative Analysis between 
     the Case Law and State Practice 129
  2. Concept of Predictability 130

Section II Analysis of State Practice 132
  1. The Equidistance Method in State Practice 133
     A. Method of Analysis 133
     B. The Results 134
  2. Evaluation 136
     A. Extensive and Virtually Uniform State Practice 136
     B. Existence of Opinio Juris 137

Section III Analysis of the Case Law 138
  1. Link between Legal Title and Method of Delimitation 138
     A. Concept of Legal Title in Maritime Delimitation 138
     B. Relation between Legal Title and Delimitation 
        Method in the Case Law 141
  2. Evaluation 147

Section IV Discussion 148

Chapter VII: Flexibility in the Law of Maritime Delimitation I: 
Geographical Factors 151

Section I The Concept of Flexibility 151

Section II Configuration of the Coast 152
  1. Opposite or Adjacent Coasts 152
     A. Analysis of the Case Law 152
     B. Analysis of State Practice 154
  2. Concave or Convex Coasts 154
     A. Analysis of the Case Law 154
     B. Analysis of State Practice 157
  3. General Direction of the Coast 158
     A. Analysis of the Case Law 158
     B. Analysis of State Practice 160
  4. Discussion 160

Section III Proportionality 161
  1. Analysis of the Case Law 161
     A. Proportionality in the Context of Continental Shelf 
        Delimitations 161
     B. Proportionality in the Context of Single/Coincident 
        Maritime Boundaries 169
Contents

C. Summary 177

2. Analysis of State Practice 179
   A. Agreements Regarding Continental Shelf Boundaries 179
   B. Agreements Regarding Single Maritime Boundaries 181

3. Discussion 182

Section IV Presence of Islands 183
1. General Considerations 183
   A. Entitlement of Islands 184
   B. Typology of Islands 185

2. Analysis of the Case Law 186
   A. Islands in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 186
   B. Islands in the Context of the Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 196

3. Analysis of State Practice 207
   A. Offshore Islands 209
   B. Islands 'on the Wrong Side' 213
   C. Detached Islands (Islands as the Sole Unit of Entitlement) 214
   D. Island States 216

4. Discussion 217

Section V Baselines 219
1. Analysis of the Case Law 219
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 219
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 222

2. Analysis of State Practice 225
   A. Straight Baselines Which Did Not Influence the Maritime Delimitation 225
   B. Straight Baselines Which Did Influence the Maritime Delimitation 227

3. Discussion 230

Section VI Geological and Geomorphological Factors 231
1. Analysis of the Case Law 231
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 231
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 233

2. Analysis of State Practice 234
   A. Agreements regarding Continental Shelf Delimitations 234
   B. Agreements regarding Single Maritime Boundaries 237
### Contents

3. Discussion 240

**Section VII** The Presence of Third States 241
1. Analysis of the Case Law 241
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 241
   B. Arguments in the Judgments on Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 245

2. Analysis of State Practice 253
   A. Establishment of a Tri-Junction Point 254
   B. Agreements Which Provide for Future Delimitation with Third States 254

3. Discussion 255

**Section VIII** Position of Land Boundary 257
1. Analysis of the Case Law 257
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations: The *Tunisia/Libya* Case 257
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single Maritime Boundaries: The *Gulf of Maine* and *Guinea/Guinea-Bissau* Cases 258

2. Analysis of State Practice 260
   A. Starting Point of Maritime Boundaries 260
   B. Prolongation of a Land Boundary 261

3. Discussion 262

**Section IX** Presence of Ice 262
1. Analysis of the Case Law: The *Greenland/Jan Mayen* Case 262
2. Analysis of State Practice 263

---

Chapter VIII: Flexibility in the Law of Maritime Delimitation II: Non-Geographical Factors 265

**Section I** Economic Factors 265
1. Analysis of the Case Law 266
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 266
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 269

2. Analysis of State Practice 276
   A. Agreements Regarding Delimitations of Continental Shelf 276
   B. Agreements Regarding Single Maritime Boundaries 277
   C. Two Flexible Solutions in State Practice 279

3. Discussion 287

**Section II** Conduct of the Parties 288
1. Analysis of the Case Law 288
# Contents

A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations: The *Tunisia/Libya* Case 289

B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 291

2. Analysis of State Practice 297
   A. Agreements Regarding Continental Shelf Delimitations 297
   B. Agreements Regarding Single Maritime Boundaries 298

3. Discussion 298

Section III Historic Rights 299

1. Analysis of the Case Law 299
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations: The *Tunisia/Libya* Case 299
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 302

2. Analysis of State Practice 305

3. Discussion 306

Section IV Security Interests 306

1. Analysis of the Case Law 306
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 306
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single/Coincident Maritime Boundaries 309

2. Analysis of State Practice 311

3. Discussion 313

Section V Navigation 314

1. Analysis of the Case Law 314
   A. Arguments in the Context of Continental Shelf Delimitations 314
   B. Arguments in the Context of Single Maritime Boundaries 315

2. Analysis of State Practice 316
   A. Agreements Regarding Continental Shelf Delimitations 316
   B. Agreements Regarding Single Maritime Boundaries 317

3. Discussion 318

Section VI Environmental Factors 319

1. Analysis of the Case Law: The *Gulf of Maine* Case 319

2. Analysis of State Practice 320

3. Discussion 322

Section VII Traditional Livelihood 322

1. Analysis of the Case Law 322

2. Analysis of State Practice 322