Sustainable Development in World Trade Law

Edited by

Markus W. Gehring

and

Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger

Centre for International Sustainable Development Law, Montreal, Canada
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>xxvii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOREWORD</td>
<td>xxxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Georges Abi-Saab</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger and Dr. Markus W. Gehring</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Concept of Sustainable Development, and its Meaning in</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. World Trade Law as an Instrument for Sustainable Development?</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Negotiating Sustainable Development in the WTO?</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sustainable Development in Recent WTO Disputes?</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Recent Developments in Trade Law for Sustainable Development</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Sustainable Development in World Trade Law: The Book</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PART I: FOUNDATIONS</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. TRADE AND ENVIRONMENT IN THE CONTEXT OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Matthew Stilwell</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface by James Cameron</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A. The WTO, Environment and Sustainable Development 34
B. Material Linkages – Economic, Social and Environmental 36
C. Legal and Policy Issues – the Importance of Coherence and Balance 39
   1. Market access 43
   2. Process and production methods 44
   3. Labelling 47
   4. Scientific Uncertainty and Precaution 49
   5. Biosafety 52
   6. Agriculture 55
   7. Subsidies 57
   8. Services 58
   9. Intellectual property 61
  10. Multilateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs) 64
  11. Institutional Issues 66
      a. The Role of Integrated Assessments 66
      b. Information Exchange and Observer Status 68
      c. Compliance, Enforcement and Dispute Settlement 68
D. Conclusion 70

3. TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT LAW 73
   Henning Jessen
   Preface by Ricardo Meléndez-Ortiz 73
A. International Law and Development Issues 81
   1. The General Concept of Development and its Manifestations in International Law 82
   2. The Concept of Sustainable Development and its Connection to “Good Governance” 84
B. Linkages between Trade, Human Development and Human Rights 86
   1. The Importance of Strengthening the Rule of Law on the Domestic Level 88
   2. Trade, Poverty Reduction and Human Rights 89
C. Linkages between Trade and Development Law 92
   1. The WTO’s General Contribution to Development 93
   2. The Development Contribution of the Doha Development Agenda 96
D. Conclusions – Achieving Demarginalisation and Coherence in Global Trade 98
4. A PERSPECTIVE ON TRADE AND LABOUR RIGHTS

Prof. Christopher McCrudden and Dr. Anne Davies

Preface by Dr. Kamal Hossain

A. Introduction

B. How Far is there a Conflict between Trade Liberalisation and Labour Rights?
   1. Empirical Issues
   2. Theoretical Issues
   3. Legal Issues

C. Where there is a Conflict, How Should We Respond?
   1. Unilateral Model
   2. NGO Model
   3. Regional Model
   4. Multilateral Model

D. Alternatives to the Current Approaches
   1. Involuntary Multilateralism
   2. Voluntary Multilateralism

E. Conclusions

5. INTEGRATING SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION IN WORLD TRADE LAW

Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger

Preface by Prof. Nico J. Schrijver

A. Sustainable Development in International Law

B. EU v. Chile in the ITLOS / Chile v. the EU in the WTO

C. Distinct Communities for Trade, Environment and Social Development

D. Explaining Intersections of Rules and Regimes

E. Implications of Intersections between Regimes

F. Addressing the Intersections of Trade, Environment and Social Regimes

G. Sustainable Development in World Trade Law
H. Adjudicating Sustainable Development Conflicts in World Trade Law

1. United States – Measure Affecting Government Procurement, Request for Consultation by the European Communities

2. The European Communities – Measures concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) Case

3. The European Communities — Measures Affecting Asbestos and Products Containing Asbestos Case

4. United States — Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products

5. European Communities — Conditions for the Granting of Tariff Preferences to Developing Countries

I. Intersections between Trade and Other Sustainable Development Law Regimes

1. Intersections between Trade Rules on SPS, and Biosafety Law

2. Intersections between Trade Rules on Public Procurement and Social, Economic and Cultural Rights

3. Intersections between Trade Rules on Subsidies and Climate Change Measures

J. Future International Trade Negotiations and Sustainable Development

K. Sustainable Developments in New Regional and Bi-lateral Trade Treaties

L. Conclusions

PART II: SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENTS IN WORLD TRADE LAW

6. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT THROUGH PROCESS IN WORLD TRADE LAW

Dr. Markus W. Gehring and Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger

Preface by Hon. Sergio Marchi

A. Introduction

B. From Specific Project Environmental Assessment to Broader Sustainability Assessment of Policies

1. Environmental Impact Assessment

2. Extension of EIAs to Include Social Criteria
## Contents

3. Strategic Assessment: From Projects to Policies, Plans and Programmes 199
4. Sustainability or Integrated Impact Assessments 204

C. National Assessments of Trade Agreements 205
   1. Canada 206
   2. USA 208
   3. European Union 209

D. Multilateral Assessment 212

E. Conclusions 213

7. HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT ASSESSMENTS OF TRADE-RELATED POLICIES 217

*Simon Walker*

Preface by Hon. Ibrahim Salama 217

A. Introduction 221
   1. How Can Trade Affect Human Rights (and Vice Versa)? 222
   2. What is a Human Rights Impact Assessment? 225
   3. What is the Added Value of a Human Rights Impact Assessment? 228

B. Information and Tools for Human Rights Impact Assessments 229
   1. Mapping 229
   2. Human Rights Indicators 232
   3. Assessment Methodologies 234

C. A Process for Undertaking Human Rights Impact Assessments 238
   1. Choosing the Assessment Team 238
   2. Setting the Framework 238
   3. Screening 241
   4. Scenario-building 243
   5. Assessment 244
   6. Preventive, Remedial and Fulfilment Measures 247

D. Conclusions 249

8. DOES THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT UNDERSTANDING PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT? 257

*Tenu Avafia*

Preface by Prof. Vaughan Lowe 257

A. The Evolution of the Principle of Sustainable Development in WTO Law 260
B. Dispute Settlement under GATT 1947 and Sustainable Development 261

C. The WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding and its Impact on Sustainable Development 262
1. Differences between GATT and WTO Dispute Settlement 262

D. A History of Key WTO Panel and Appellate Body Reports: The DSU Approach to Sustainable Development 264
1. US – Gasoline 264
2. US – Shrimp 266
3. EC – Tariff Preferences 268

E. The Future of Sustainable Development in the WTO’s Dispute Settlement system 269

F. Conclusion 271

9. THE TRIPS AGREEMENT AT A CROSSROADS: INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE DOHA ROUND 273
Maria Julia Oliva and Sisule F. Musungu

Preface by Pia Rodriguez 273

A. Introduction 275

B. The State of Play in Intellectual Property Negotiations in the WTO: Recent Developments and Trends 278
1. Relationship between the TRIPS Agreement and the CBD 279
2. Implementation of Paragraph 11 of the 30 August Decision 281
3. Non-violation and Situation Complaints 283
4. Geographical Indications 285
5. Special and Differential Treatment 286
6. Transfer of Technology under Article 66.2 of the TRIPS Agreement 287
7. Transition Periods for LDCs under Article 66.1 of TRIPS 287

C. Intellectual Property and Sustainable Development Towards Hong Kong: Issues and Challenges 288
1. Introducing Disclosure of Origin Requirements in the TRIPS Agreement 288
2. Resolving the Implementation of Paragraph 11 of the 30 August Decision 291
3. Declaring the Inapplicability of Non-violation and Situation Complaints to the TRIPS Agreement 292
4. Preserving the Link between Geographical Indications and Implementation Issues 293
5. Maintaining the Momentum on other Intellectual Property and Development Issues and Concerns 294

D. Final Remarks 295

10. INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS AND TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE 297
   W. Bradnee Chambers, Dr. Alphonse Kambu and Christine Frison

Preface by Shawn Atleo (Chief Ainchu) 297
A. Introduction 299
B. The Debate: Effectiveness of the International Intellectual Property Regime 301
C. Steps Toward Protecting Traditional Knowledge 304
1. The IT-PGRFA 304
   a. Legal History 304
   b. Why a New Agreement on Plant Genetic Resources? 309
   c. General Provisions of the Agreements 310
   d. Benefit Sharing Arrangements 310
   e. Technology Transfer 312
   f. Intellectual Property Rights 314
   g. Material Transfer Agreements 315
   h. Prior Informed Consent 315
2. The Convention on Biological Diversity 316
3. The World Intellectual Property Organisation 317
4. The WTO TRIPS Agreement 319
5. The Interlinkages of the IT-PGRFA with the CBD, WIPO and the TRIPS 319

D. Conclusion 324

11. TRADE, AGRICULTURE AND SUSTAINABILITY IN LAND USE 327
    Prof. Dr. Stefan Oeter

Preface by Dr. Jacques Diouf 327
A. Sustainable Development and its Implications 332
B. Agriculture within the WTO and the Doha Round Negotiations 334
1. How have ICSID tribunals approached the investment issue? 393

C. Comparing Approaches to the Investment Issue 407
D. Conclusions 409

14. IS EUROPEAN LAW BECOMING MORE SUSTAINABLE? 411
Mario Prost

Preface by Prof. Armand de Mestral 411

A. Introduction: The European Union in a Crisis of Ideal 415

B. The Constitutional Basis for Sustainability 419
1. The Early Communities 419
2. The Evolving Community 420
   a. The Single European Act (1986) 420
   c. The Treaty of Amsterdam (1997) 423
   d. The Treaty of Nice (2001) 425

C. The Widening of EC Law to Non-Commercial Matters 428
1. Positive Harmonisation 428
   a. Development of European Environmental Law 428
   b. EC Law and Human Rights 431
   c. A European Social Policy? 433
2. Negative Harmonisation 435
   a. Article 30 and Mandatory Requirements 435
   b. Limitations and Safeguards against Misuse or Abuse 436

D. The Implementation of Sustainable Development Legal Principles 440
1. Precaution 441
2. Public Participation in Decision-Making 448

E. Concluding Remarks 455
15. NEGOTIATING SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN THE FREE TRADE AREA OF THE AMERICAS 461

*Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger*

Preface by Prof. Carlos Murillo 461

A. The Policy Context of the FTAA Negotiations 468
   1. Regional Americas Summits process 468
   2. Sustainable development as policy direction for the FTAA negotiations 470

B. A More Sustainable FTAA? 471
   1. Reconciliation through Interpretive Provisions 472
      a. Preamble 472
      b. Interpretive guidance when treaties overlap or conflict 473
      c. Exceptions 481
   2. Reconciliation through “Integrated” Substantive Provisions 482
      a. Sustainability impact assessments of trade agreements 482
      b. Developing ‘mutually supportive’ agendas in areas of potential overlap 485
   3. Reconciliation through ‘value-added’ parallel instruments 490
   4. Reconciliation through procedural innovations 491
      a. Innovations in the FTAA negotiations procedures 492
      b. Procedural Innovations in the FTAA Draft Text 493

C. General Conclusions 493

16. THE AUSTRALIA–US FREE TRADE AGREEMENT: A SUSTAINABILITY CASE STUDY OF A POST-CANCÚN FTA 495

*Michael Kerr*

Preface by Nicholas Sinclair-Brown 495

A. Economic Outcomes 501

B. Sustainable Development (Environmental and Social) Outcomes 504
   1. Process 504
      a. Environmental Review 504
      b. Negotiating Objectives on Environment and Labour Standards 506
      c. Parliamentary Scrutiny of Trade Agreements 508
   2. The Investment Chapter – The Impact on Environmental Laws and Other Social Policy Measures 510
   3. The Services Chapter – The Impact on Environmental Laws and Other Social Policy Measures 513
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>xvii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4. Labour and Environment Chapters</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Chapter 18 – Labour</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Chapter 19 – Environment</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme and Higher Drug Prices</td>
<td>518</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Conclusion</td>
<td>520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT, TRADE &amp; SOCIAL EXCLUSION IN ASIA</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr. Kishan Khoday</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface by Prof. Gary Sampson</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. ASEAN-plus: Towards the World’s Largest Free Trade Area</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Finding Coherence between Regional Trade and Domestic Policies</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. An enabling environment of peace, poverty reduction and good governance</td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The challenge in areas of extreme poverty</td>
<td>527</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Inclusive governance for poverty reduction</td>
<td>528</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Natural resources as a driving force towards greater policy coherence</td>
<td>529</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Means of Implementation: The Case of Indonesia</td>
<td>531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Partnership as Governance Reform</td>
<td>532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The drivers of conflict in the new economy</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The failures of market liberalisation</td>
<td>533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Increasing income gaps and distributive inequities</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Collective values</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Social exclusion and systematic disadvantage</td>
<td>534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Complex change and strategic policy setting</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Negotiated rule making: social compacts for the new economy</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The policy-making context</td>
<td>536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Summary</td>
<td>538</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Policy Coherence through Local Autonomy Regimes</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. At the crossroads of globalisation and decentralisation</td>
<td>540</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Integrated policy responses</td>
<td>542</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Conclusion</td>
<td>545</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### PART III: FUTURE DIRECTIONS

#### 18. INTERNATIONAL PUBLIC HEALTH AND TRADE LAW

*Dr. Maya Prabhu and Kathryn Garforth*

Preface by Prof. Margaret Somerville

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. An Overview of the TRIPS Agreement Pre-Doha</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Linking Intellectual Property to Trade</td>
<td>555</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Relevant TRIPS Provisions</td>
<td>556</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. TRIPS in Practice</td>
<td>558</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Case Study: South Africa</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Debates in Doha</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Post Doha</td>
<td>563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Recent Negotiations</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. A Sustainable Development Law Contribution to Analysis of the Tensions</td>
<td>566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Integration and Interrelationship</td>
<td>567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Equity and the Eradication of Poverty</td>
<td>568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Principle of Common but Differentiated Responsibility</td>
<td>569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Public Participation and Access to Information</td>
<td>570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Looking Forward</td>
<td>571</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 19. INVESTMENT TRIBUNALS AND THE COMMERCIAL ARBITRATION MODEL: MIXED PROCEDURES AND CREEPING INSTITUTIONALISATION

*Prof. Fabien Gelinas*

Preface by Prof. Ko-Yung Tung

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Mixed Procedures and Instrument Choice</td>
<td>578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. <em>Ad Hoc</em> Tribunals and Precedent</td>
<td>580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Creeping Institutionalisation, Public Debate and Legitimacy</td>
<td>585</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
20. PRECAUTION IN MULTILATERAL ENVIRONMENTAL AGREEMENTS AND ITS IMPACT ON THE WORLD TRADING SYSTEM 593

Prof. Hélène Trudeau and Céline Nègre

Preface by Prof. Robert Howse 593

A. Crossed Influences between the Precautionary Principle and Trade Interests in Multilateral Environmental Agreements 598

1. Trade Interests as a Resistance to Precaution 598

2. Precaution and GMOs: the Prevalence of Fear of Risk over Trade Interests 604

B. The Challenge Ahead for International Tribunals: Resolving Conflicts between Competing Versions of Precaution 611

1. The Danube Dam Case and the Hormones Case 612

2. GMOs and Risks to the Environment: a Definite Need for Precaution 619

C. Conclusion 628

21. CONCLUSIONS 631

Dr. Markus W. Gehring, Marie-Claire Cordonier Segger and Martin Endicott

Table of Treaties 643

Table of Cases 651

Table of Declarations 655

Recommended Resources 659

Acknowledgements 693

About the CISDL 695

Index 697