The Notion of Income from Capital

EATLP Congress, Cologne 12-14 June 2003

Editors:
Peter Essers and Arie Rijkers

General reporters:  Prof. Peter Essers and Prof. Arie Rijkers, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

Contributors:  Prof. Henk van Arendonk, University of Rotterdam, The Netherlands
Prof. Laura Castaldi, University of Siena, Italy
Prof. Judith Freedman, University of Oxford, United Kingdom
Prof. Wolfgang Gassner (University of Business Administration Vienna, Austria)
Prof. Daniel Gutmann, University Paris-1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, France
Dr. Kevin Holmes, University of Budapest, Hungary
Prof. Peter Kavelaars, University of Rotterdam, The Netherlands
Prof. Joachim Lang, University of Cologne, Germany
Prof. Leif Mutén, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden
Prof. Manfred Rose, University of Heidelberg, Germany
Dr. Ian Roxan, London School of Economics, United Kingdom
Prof. Claudio Sacchetto, University of Turin, Italy
Prof. Alain Steichen, University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg
Prof. Bertil Wiman, Stockholm School of Economics, Sweden
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About the authors</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>xxiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Peter Essers and Arie Rijkers*

## PART A

### GENERAL ASPECTS OF AN INCOME TAXATION ON INCOME FROM CAPITAL

**Chapter I:** The influence of tax principles on the taxation of income from capital 3

*Joachim Lang*

1. Introduction 3

2. The framework of tax principles in the constitutional and the European law 4
   2.1. Tax equity and equality 4
   2.2. Certainty 4
   2.3. Right to property 5
   2.4. Rights of the family 7
   2.5. The four freedoms of the EC Treaty 7

3. Specific tax principles to determine the income 8
   3.1. Ability to pay 8
   3.2. Individual taxation 13
   3.3. Real income versus inflationary gains and fictitious income 14
   3.4. Net income 15
   3.5. Non-disposal income 16
   3.6. Efficiency of taxation: fiscal neutrality and simplicity 17
   3.7. Periodicity 17
# Table of Contents

4. **Theories and methods to determine the income**
   4.1. The historical debate: net accretion theory versus source theory 18
   4.2. The present debate: accrual method versus cash flow method 21

5. **Notion of income towards a cash flow income tax?**
   5.1. The phenomenon of a hybrid income taxation 24
   5.2. Schedular or global income taxation? 26
   5.3. Two essentials of the income from capital 28
      5.3.1. Taxation of pension schemes 28
      5.3.2. Treatment of capital gains and losses 29

6. **Conclusions** 30

---

**Chapter IA: The influence of tax principles on the taxation of income from capital – a response**

*Wolfgang Gassner*

1. **Introduction** 33

2. **Economic theory and the notion of income** 34
   2.1. Notion of income as a multidisciplinary issue 34
   2.2. Economic theory and legal definition of income 34

3. **Foundation concept of income and tax legislation** 36
   3.1. Schanz-Haig-Simons model as “superior to other models” 36
   3.2. Global income tax as a “matter of fairness” 36
   3.3. Creation of “generally accepted income definition” by scholars 38
   3.4. Income tax base with a “non political character” 39

4. **Tax principles and their influence on the notion of income** 40
   4.1. The high esteem for the ability-to-pay principle 40
   4.2. The “features” of the ability-to-pay principle 42
      4.2.1. “Lifetime notion of income” 42
      4.2.2. “Real and realistic income” 42
### Table of contents

3. The economic notion of lifetime income as a guideline for the notion of taxable income 62  
   3.1. The citizen's lifetime income from an economic standpoint 62  
   3.2. The notion of taxable income corresponding to the notion of lifetime income 63  
       3.2.1. The segregation of income elements that have already been burdened and that will be taxed at some time in the future 63  
       3.2.2. The segregation of transfer incomes 66  

4. Evaluation of alternative systems of taxing lifetime income 68  
   4.1. Decision neutrality 68  
   4.2. Administrative efficiency 70  
   4.3. Taxation versus tax burdening 70  

5. The simplest method of taxing lifetime income 72  

6. Summary 75  

7. References 76  

### Chapter III: Relationship between personal income tax on income from capital and other taxes on income from capital (corporate income tax, wealth tax, inheritance and gift tax and real-estate tax) 77  

**Claudio Sacchetto and Laura Castaldi**  

1. The combination of personal income tax and wealth tax 77  
   1.1. Does the combination of personal income tax on capital proceeds and a wealth tax cause double taxation? 77  
   1.2. The trend of developing fiscal systems in which income taxes and wealth taxes coexist 79  
   1.3. The degree of acceptability of a tax system developing a periodical ordinary direct tax on income/capital proceeds and other taxes on capital/wealth 80
2. Income taxes; taxing the proceeds of the use of capital in the light of income tax: the principles 83

3. Taxation of income from capital 86
   3.1. The income tax on the proceeds coming from capital gains and the examples of possible double objective tax 86
   3.2. Should capital gains be considered as capital income (i.e. revenues from the use of capital)? 88
   3.3. Possible cases of double income tax coming from the incorporation of profits/interests in the compensations of share assignments 89

4. Taxation of dividends, capital gains and profits of participations 90
   4.1. The problem of the tax treatment of the proceeds causally referring to participation in associations, when the latter are already subject to income tax 90
   4.2. The possibility that the tax treatment of the proceeds coming from (and for the effect of) participating relations must be separated according to the lucrative and non-lucrative causal of the connotation of the participation bond 91
   4.3. The possibility that the actual problem of subject double imposition of group incomes refers solely to the incomes coming from participations, in reference to associations in which the participation connotes causally for the pursuit of the single members’ lucrative aims 92
   4.4. Possible justifications of double income tax on company revenues 92
   4.5. Solutions to eliminate/decrease double tax on company revenues 94
### Table of contents

**Chapter IIA: Relationship between personal income tax on income from capital and other taxes on income from capital (corporate income tax, wealth tax, inheritance and gift tax and real-estate tax)**
- a response  
  
  Daniel Gutmann  
  
  Chapter IV: Fixed amount taxation with respect to income from capital in personal income taxation  
  
  Henk van Arendonk  
  
  1. Introduction  
  2. Theoretical framework  
  3. The practice of fixed amount schemes  
    3.1. Notional rental value for owner-occupiers  
    3.2. Bare ownership/usufruct situations  
    3.3. Income foreign investment companies  
    3.4. Fixed amount return for saving and investing  
  4. Kinds of fixed amount schemes  
  5. Fixed amount schemes and the theoretical framework  
  6. Some important issues  
  
  **PART B**  
  THE NOTION OF INCOME FROM CAPITAL: THE TAXABLE BASE  
  
  **Chapter I: Accrual versus realization**  
  
  Peter Kavelaars  
  
  1. Introduction  
  2. (Annual) valuation
3. Liquidity: how to pay tax? 130

4. Losses 134

5. Migration 135

6. Treaty aspects 137

7. Inflation 140

8. Some special situations 140
   8.1. Death 140
   8.2. Gifts 141
   8.3. Divorce 141
   8.4. Mergers and splits 142

9. Closing considerations 143

Chapter II: Deferral possibilities 147

Kevin Holmes

1. Introduction 147

2. Meaning of deferral 148

3. Tax policy and deferral 151

4. Deferral mechanisms in selected jurisdictions of the new Europe 157
   4.1. Deferral of recognition of dividend income 158
   4.2. Deferral of recognition of interest income 159
   4.3. Deferral of recognition of rental income 160
   4.4. Deferral of recognition of royalty income 163
   4.5. Deferral of recognition of capital gain 164
   4.6. Participation exemptions 170
   4.7. Corporate reconstructions 172
   4.8. Change of residential status 173
   4.9. Capital losses 174
   4.10. Intra-family arrangements 175
Table of contents

5. Anti-avoidance provisions 178
6. Conclusion 179

Chapter II: Deferral possibilities – a response 183

Alain Steichen

1. Concept of deferral of taxation 183
2. Normative assumptions 184
3. Two types of tax deferrals 185
4. Tax deferrals have a cost to the tax revenue 186
5. Are tax deferral provisions unjust? 187
6. Trade off between justice and efficiency 187
7. Conclusions 188

Chapter III: Treatment of capital gains and losses 191

Judith Freedman

1. Introduction: concepts of capital gains and income 191
2. Approaches to taxation of capital gains and losses 195
   2.1. Three models 195
   2.2. Distinguishing capital gains from other income gains 196
   2.3. Special treatment of capital gains 197
3. Rationale for special treatment of capital gains 198
   3.1. Qualitative differences 198
   3.2. Ability to pay and equity 200
      3.2.1. Realization versus accruals basis 200
      3.2.2. Moving away from realization – marking to market and following the commercial accounts 202

xii
### Chapter IIIA: Treatment of capital gains and losses – a response

*Leif Muten*

### Chapter IV: Influence of inflation

*Ian Roxan*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Effects of inflation on tax revenues</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Fiscal drag</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Collection effect</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Effects of inflation on the tax base</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Inflation adjustment mechanisms in use</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Partial adjustment</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1. Capital gains</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1.1. An illustration: the United Kingdom</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.1.2. Other approaches in Europe</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.2. Interest</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1.3. Business profits</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Global adjustment</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Adjustment of tax rate and allowance thresholds</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Desirability of adjusting income from capital for inflation</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Equity considerations</td>
<td>238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Efficiency considerations</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of contents

5.3. Administration costs 239

6. Desirability of particular inflation adjustment methods 240
   6.1. Indexation 240
   6.2. Indexation for specific assets 240
   6.3. Indexation and the realization basis 241
   6.4. Business profits 242
   6.5. Tax bases that exclude inflationary returns 243

7. Conclusions 244

8. References 248

Chapter V: Imputed income (including deductible costs) 249

Ian Roxan

1. Imputed income 249
   1.1. Problem of imputed services from assets 249
   1.2. Imputed income from housing 250
      1.2.1. Prevalence 250
      1.2.2. Grounds for taxing imputed rent 250
      1.2.3. Measuring the returns on housing: relevance of ex ante and ex post returns 251
      1.2.4. Taxation of imputed rent in Europe 253
      1.2.5. Taxation of capital gains on private housing 254
      1.2.6. Conclusion 254
   1.3. Imputed income on other assets 255

2. Deemed income 255
   2.1. The use of deemed values – two cases 255
   2.2. Deemed values reflecting true values 256
      2.2.1. Non-arm’s length transfers 256
      2.2.2. Deemed transactions 257
      2.2.3. Measure of deemed value 258
   2.3. Deemed values used to implement policy objectives 259
      2.3.1. Deemed values in relieving provisions 259
      2.3.2. Restrictive deemed values 259
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>References</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter VI: Emigration taxes</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bertil Wiman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>National law</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Tax treaty perspective</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>EC law perspective</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Concluding remarks</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART C</strong></td>
<td><strong>GENERAL REPORT</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Essers and Arie Rijkers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>General aspects of an income taxation on income from capital</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.</td>
<td>The influence of tax principles on the taxation of income from capital</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1.</td>
<td>Income tax as a model</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2.</td>
<td>Concept of income a multidisciplinary issue?</td>
<td>283</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3.</td>
<td>Comprehensive income tax</td>
<td>284</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4.</td>
<td>The ability-to-pay principle</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.5.</td>
<td>Robbery?</td>
<td>291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.6.</td>
<td>Science versus politics</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.</td>
<td>Economic aspects of taxation of income from capital</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1.</td>
<td>A lifetime notion of income</td>
<td>294</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2.</td>
<td>Economic versus legal approach</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.3. Relationship between personal income tax on income from capital and other taxes on income from capital 296
   2.3.1. Combination of wealth tax and personal income tax 296
   2.3.2. Combination of capital gains tax and gift and inheritance taxes 299
   2.3.3. Combination of personal income tax on dividends and capital gains tax on shares and a corporate income tax 300

2.4. Fixed amount taxation with respect to income from capital in personal income taxation 302
   2.4.1. Between justice and practicability 302
   2.4.2. Solutions 303
   2.4.3. Degressive effective tax rate 304
   2.4.4. Discussion themes 305
      2.4.4.1. Fictitious 305
      2.4.4.2. Unconstitutional? 308
      2.4.4.3. Harmonization and tax policy 309

3. The notion of income from capital: the taxable base 311
   3.1. Accrual versus realization 311
      3.1.1. Is realization an inherent part of the notion of income (from capital)? 311
      3.1.2. Valuation, liquidity and lock-in 312
      3.1.3. International aspects 315
      3.1.4. Discussion 315
   3.2. Deferral possibilities 317
      3.2.1. The range of deferral 317
      3.2.2. Deferral and tax avoidance 318
      3.2.3. Deferral and tax policy 319
      3.2.4. Lock-in effect 321
      3.2.5. Legal comparison 322
   3.3. Treatment of capital gains and losses 322
      3.3.1. Normal or special income? 322
      3.3.2. Capital losses 324
   3.4. Influence of inflation 325
      3.4.1. Equity, efficiency and costs 325
      3.4.2. Compensation measures and types of return 325
      3.4.3. All or nothing 326
      3.4.4. Feasible systems 326
         3.4.4.1. Global adjustment 326
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.2. Dutch system of presumptive return</td>
<td>327</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4.3. A fund for deduction</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.5. Conclusion</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5. Imputed income</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1. Owner occupied housing</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2. Deemed values and transactions</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3. Deemed values for policy and anti-avoidance reasons</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6. Exit taxes</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1. Conflict with the ability-to-pay principle?</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2. Treaty override?</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3. EC aspects</td>
<td>333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. General conclusions</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>