Sports and Inequality

Michael J. Cozzillio
Professor of Law
Widener University School of Law

Robert L. Hayman, Jr.
Professor of Law and
H. Albert Young Fellow in Constitutional Law
Widener University School of Law

Carolina Academic Press
Durham, North Carolina
Contents

Preface xiii
Acknowledgments xvii

Chapter One. Sports, Law and Culture 3

I. Introduction: Law, Culture, and the Study of Sports 3
   Prologue: Save Me, Joe Louis 3
   A. An Overview: Sports, Law, and Culture 4
   B. Law, Culture, and the Study of Sports 7
   C. Sports as Metaphor 8
   D. Sports, Law, and Culture: The Case of Ethnic Logos 9

II. Sports, Law and Culture 10
    Stewart Macaulay, Popular Legal Culture: An Introduction 10
    Austin Sarat, On the Margin: Humanities and Law 12
    Austin Sarat & Jonathan Simon, Beyond Legal Realism: Cultural Analysis,
       Cultural Studies, and the Situation of Legal Scholarship 14
    Naomi Mezey, Law as Culture 17
    Daniel C. McDonald, S.J., Symposium: Reflections from a Fan:
       Searching for More Common Ground in Sociology and Law 21
    Rodney K. Smith, When Ignorance Is Not Bliss: In Search of Racial and
       Gender Equity in Intercollegiate Athletics 23

III. Sports as Metaphor 30
    William T. Pizzi, Soccer, Football, and Trial Systems 30
    Robert L. Hayman, Jr., The First Object of Government: Creation Myths 36

IV. Sporting Metaphors 40
    George P. Fletcher, Comparative Law as a Subversive Discipline 40
    Elizabeth G. Thornburg, Metaphors Matter: How Images of Battle, Sports,
       and Sex Shape the Adversary System 42

V. Sports Symbols 49
    Cathryn L. Claussen, Ethnic Team Names and Logos —
       Is There a Legal Solution? 49
    Suzan Shown Harjo et al. v. Pro-Football, Inc. 55
    Justin Blankenship, The Cancellation of Redskins as a
       Disparaging Trademark: Is Federal Trademark Law an
       Appropriate Solution for Words That Offend? 63
CHAPTER TWO.  RACE AND AMERICAN SPORTS 69

I. A Brief History of Race in America 69
A. Beyond Black and White 70
B. Behind “Race” 70

II. The Three Myths of Race 72
A. The Myth and Reality of American Racism 72
   Scott v. Sandford 75
B. The Myth and Reality of the Struggle for Equality 80
   1. Emancipation and Reconstruction 80
   2. Redemption and Jim Crow 84
      The Civil Rights Cases 86
      Plessy v. Ferguson 92
   3. A Second Reconstruction 96
      Shelley v. Kraemer 97
      Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, Kansas 99
C. The Myth and Reality of Race Today 104
   1. Legal Equality Today 105
      a. Equal Protection: Strict Scrutiny for Racial Classifications 105
      b. Equal Protection: Proving Discrimination 106
      c. Equal Protection: Public and Private, De Jure and De Facto 107
      d. Federal Civil Rights Legislation 107
   2. “Real” Equality Today 109
      a. Educational Equality 109
      b. Economic Equality 110
      c. “Social” Equality 110

Conclusion 111

CHAPTER THREE.  RACE AND PROFESSIONAL SPORTS 113

I. Segregation: The Negro Leagues 113
  Neil Lanctot, “A General Understanding”—Organized Baseball and Black Professional Baseball, 1900–1930 113

II. Desegregation: Civil Rights and Economics 130
  James R. Devine, The Past as Moral Guide to the Present: The Parallel Between Martin Luther King, Jr.’s Elements of a Nonviolent Civil Rights Campaign and Jackie Robinson’s Entry onto the Brooklyn Dodgers 130
  Alfred Dennis Mathewson, Major League Baseball’s Monopoly Power and the Negro Leagues 143
  Ben Lombardo, The Harlem Globetrotters and the Perpetuation of the Black Stereotype 152

III. Desegregation, Integration, Inequality 156
  J. Gordon Hylton, American Civil Rights Laws and the Legacy of Jackie Robinson 156
  Paul Finkelman, Baseball and the Rule of Law Revisited 158
  Kenneth L. Shropshire, Where Have You Gone, Jackie Robinson?: Integration in America in the 21st Century 161
Dr. Harry Edwards, *The End of the “Golden Age” of Black Sports Participation?* 165

**IV. Contemporary Inequality: Professional Athletes**


Peter Bodo, *The Hard Road to Tennis Glory* 183

Scott Stossel, *The Golfing of America* 188

Mike Towle, *I Remember Arthur Ashe* 197

Edward Hotaling, *The Great Black Jockeys* 207

**V. Contemporary Inequality: Sports Management**

Richard E. Lapchick, *The Color Bar Gets Raised in Baseball* 218

Kenneth L. Shropshire, *Sports Agents, Role Models and Race-Consciousness* 224

Kenneth L. Shropshire, *Diversity, Racism, and Professional Sports Franchise Ownership: Change Must Come from Within* 235

Timothy Davis, *Racism in Athletics: Subtle Yet Persistent* 245


Scholz v. RDV Sports 265


I. Race and Collegiate Athletics

Rodney K. Smith, *When Ignorance is not Bliss: In Search of Racial and Gender Equity in Intercollegiate Athletics* 273

Timothy Davis, *The myth of the Superspade: The Persistence of Racism in College Athletics* 276

Professor Leroy D. Clark, *New Directions for the Civil Rights Movement: College Athletics as a Civil Rights Issue* 287

Timothy Davis, *African-American Student-Athletes: Marginalizing the NCAA Regulatory Structure?* 293

II. “Race” and Aptitude


John Hoberman, *Darwin’s Athletes: How Sport Has Damaged Black America and Preserved the Myth of Race* 315

Robert L. Hayman, Jr., *The Smart Culture: Society, Intelligence, and Law* 318

Cureton v. National Collegiate Athletic Association 335

**CHAPTER FIVE. GENDER AND AMERICAN SPORTS** 347

I. Introduction 347

II. A Brief Legal History of Gender in America

A. The Separate Spheres 348

Wendy W. Williams, *The Equality Crisis: Some Reflections on Culture, Courts and Feminism* 348

Bradwell v. State of Illinois 356

Muller v. Oregon 358
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adkins v. Children’s Hospital</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Equal Protection</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael M. v. Superior Court of Sonoma County</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mississippi University for Women v. Hogan</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. The Contemporary Legal Status of Gender in America</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Equal Protection</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States v. Virginia</td>
<td>372</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Civil Rights Legislation</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Feminist Legal Theories</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Understanding Equality</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Understanding Gender Differences</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Understanding Gender</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Essentialism and Anti-Essentialism</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Conclusion</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER SIX. GENDER AND AMATEUR ATHLETICS</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction: Title IX and Gender Equality</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohen v. Brown University (Cohen I)</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah Brake, <em>The Struggle for Sex Equality in Sport and the Theory Behind Title IX</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Proportionality</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pederson v. Louisiana State University</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kimberly A. Yuracko, <em>One for You and One for Me: Is Title IX’s Sex-Based Proportionality Requirement for College Varsity Athletic Positions Defensible?</em></td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patrick N. Findlay, <em>The Case for Requiring a Proportionality Test to Assess Compliance with Title IX in High School Athletics</em></td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Compliance by Contraction</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohen v. Brown University (Cohen I)</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cohen v. Brown University (Cohen II)</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donald E. Shelton, <em>Equally Bad Is Not Good: Allowing Title IX “Compliance” by the Elimination of Men’s Collegiate Sports</em></td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neal v. Board of Trustees of the California State Universities</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miami University Wrestling Club v. Miami University</td>
<td>466</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The Contact Sports Exception</td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzanne Sangree, <em>Title IX and the Contact Sports Exemption: Gender Stereotypes in a Civil Rights Statute</em></td>
<td>471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mercer v. Duke University</td>
<td>484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodney K. Smith, <em>Solving the Title IX Conundrum with Women’s Football</em></td>
<td>490</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Title IX at the Intersection of Gender and Race</td>
<td>496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tonya M. Evans, <em>In the Title IX Race Toward Gender Equity, the Black Female Athlete Is Left to Finish Last: The Lack of Access for the “Invisible Woman”</em></td>
<td>496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joan Williams, <em>Implementing Antiesentialism: How Gender Wars Turn Into Race and Class Conflict</em></td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Dennis Mathewson, <em>Essay: Black Women, Gender Equity and The Function at the Junction</em></td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VI. The Future
Ellen J. Staurowsky, Title IX and College Sport: The Long Painful Path to Compliance and Reform 518
Brian L. Porto, Completing The Revolution: Title IX as Catalyst for an Alternative Model of College Sports 531

CHAPTER SEVEN. GENDER AND PROFESSIONAL SPORTS 555
I. Women's Professional Sports 555
Jill Jeffrey, Professional Sports Opportunities for American Female Athletes 555
James Deacon, Leagues of their Own 559
Dan Atkins, with Michael Cozzillio and Bob Hayman, The Gender Hierarchy in Tennis 570

II. Women Athletes, Professional Sports, and the Law 573
Syda Kosofsky, Toward Gender Equality in Professional Sports 573
Garret v. New York State Athletic Commission 592
Barbara Gregorich, Women at Play 596
Matthew J. McPhillips, Comment: “Girls of Summer”: A Comprehensive Analysis of the Past, Present, and Future of Women in Baseball and a Roadmap to Litigating a Successful Gender Discrimination Case 598

III. Women Coaches 602
Stanley v. University of Southern California (Stanley I) 602
Lisa A. Bireline Sarver, Coaching Contracts Take on The Equal Pay Act: Can (and Should) Female Coaches Tie the Score? 608
Stanley v. University Of Southern California (Stanley II) 624
Barbara Osborne & Marilyn V. Yarbrough, Pay Equity for Coaches and Athletic Administrators: An Element of Title IX? 631

IV. Women Officials 641
Gai Ingham Berlage, Women in Baseball: The Forgotten History 641
Postema v. National League of Professional Baseball Clubs 648
Ortiz-Del Valle v. National Basketball Association 662

V. Women Reporters 667
Ludke v. Kuhn 667
Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. National Broadcasting Co. 674

CHAPTER EIGHT. PRIVATE CLUBS 681
I. Exclusivity and Exclusion 681
John Garrity, Willing To Go It Alone: Women are Often Forced to Pay a Painful Price for Demanding Equality at their Country Clubs 681
Marcia Chambers, The Unplayable Lie 685

II. Private Clubs, Public Accommodations, and Anti-Discrimination 705
Sally Frank, The Key to Unlocking the Clubhouse Door: The Application of Antidiscrimination Laws to Quasi-Private Clubs 705
Nancy Kamp, Gender Discrimination at Private Golf Clubs 729
CHAPTER NINE. SPORTS AND SEXUAL VIOLENCE 751

I. The Problem 751
Todd W. Crosset, Jeffrey R. Benedict & Mark A. McDonald, *Male Student-Athletes Reported for Sexual Assault: A Survey of Campus Police Departments and Judicial Affairs Officers* 757

II. Remedies 771
A. The Need for Remedies 771
Timothy Davis & Tonya Parker, *Student-athlete Sexual Violence Against Women: Defining the Limits of Institutional Responsibility* 771
B. Institutional Remedies: NCAA and Professional League Sanctions 776
*Note, Out of Bounds: Professional Sports Leagues and Domestic Violence* 776
*United States v. Morrison* 782
Shirley A. Wiegand, *Sports Heroes, Sexual Assault and the Unnamed Victim* 800

III. Abuse and Harassment 809
Joan Ryan, *Little Girls in Pretty Boxes* 809
Rhonda Reaves, *There’s No Crying in Baseball”: Sports and the Legal Construction of Gender* 817

CHAPTER TEN. SPORTS AND SEXUAL ORIENTATION 833

I. Introduction: Sexual Orientation and Anti-Discrimination Law 833
*Boutilier v. Immigration and Naturalization Service* 833
*Romer v. Evans* 837
*Weaver v. Nebo School District* 845
*Lawrence v. Texas* 851

II. Sports, Gender, and Sexual Orientation 862
Susan K. Cahn, *Coming on Strong: Gender and Sexuality in Twentieth Century Women’s Sport* 862
Pat Griffin, *Strong Women, Deep Closets: Lesbians and Homophobia in Sport* 870
Victoria A. Brownworth, *The Competitive Closet* 882
Mariah Burton Nelson, *Paid to Play a Game* 891

III. Sports, Sexual Orientation, and Law 896
*Montgomery v. Independent School District No. 709* 910

IV. Coming Out 916
Dan Woog, *Time-out: The Author’s Story* 916
CHAPTER ELEVEN. SPORTS AND DISABILITY

Introduction: Disability and American Sports 929
I. A Brief History of Disability in America 929
   A. A Brief Intellectual History of Disability 930
   B. An Illustration: The History of “Mental Retardation” 931
   C. Disability Labels 932
      Doris Zames Fleischer & Frieda Zames, The Disability Rights Movement: From Charity to Confrontation 934
II. The Legal Response to Disability 939
   A. Segregation and Worse: Eugenics and the Law 939
      Buck v. Bell 940
      Skinner v. Oklahoma 945
   B. Integration and Equal Protection 947
      City of Cleburne v. Cleburne Living Center 948
   C. Legislation: Integration and Accommodation 955
      Doris Zames Fleischer & Frieda Zames, The Disability Rights Movement: From Charity to Confrontation 955
      Joseph R. Shapiro, No Pity: Forging a New Civil Rights Movement 958
      Marta Russell, Beyond Ramps: Disability at the End of the Social Contract 963
      Board of Trustees of the University of Alabama v. Garrett 975
III. Sports and Disability 983
   Michael A. Paciorek & Jeffrey A. Jones, Disability Sport and Recreation Resources 983
   Joseph R. Shapiro, No Pity: Forging a New Civil Rights Movement 993
IV. Law, Sports, and Disability 996
   Laura F. Rothstein, Don’t Roll in My Parade: The Impact of Sports and Entertainment Cases on Public Awareness and Understanding of the Americans with Disabilities Act 996
      PGA Tour, Inc., v. Casey Martin 1002
      Cruz v. Pennsylvania Interscholastic Athletic Association, Inc., Defendant 1021
      Anderson v. Little League Baseball, Inc. 1031
      Shultz v. Hemet Youth Pony League, Inc. 1034

APPENDIX. FEDERAL ANTI-DISCRIMINATION LAWS 1039
I. United States Constitution 1039
   Thirteenth Amendment (1865) 1039
   Fourteenth Amendment (1868) 1039
II. Equal Pay Act of 1963 1039
III. Civil Rights Act of 1964 1040
   Title II 1040
   Title VI 1041
   Title VII 1041
IV. Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972 1044
V. Rehabilitation Act of 1973 1046
VI. Americans with Disabilities Act 1047
   Title I: Employment 1048
   Title II: Public Services 1051
Title III: Public Accommodations and Services Operated by Private Entities (Refs & Annos) 1052
Title IV: Miscellaneous Provisions 1056
VII. Employment Non-Discrimination Act (Proposed) 1056

INDEX 1065