STATE LAW AS ISLAMIC LAW
IN MODERN EGYPT

The Incorporation of the *Shari‘a*
into Egyptian Constitutional Law

BY

CLARK B. LOMBARDI

BRILL
LEIDEN · BOSTON
2006
CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ................................................................. ix
Transliteration ................................................................. xi
Introduction ........................................................................ 1

PART I
CLASSICAL ISLAMIC LEGAL THEORY AND THE RISE
OF COMPETING MODERNIST LEGAL THEORIES

Chapter One: The Formation of the Classical Sunnī Legal
Tradition ........................................................................ 11
I. The concept of the shari'a ........................................... 12
II. The development of institutions that shaped
interpretation of the shari'a: the madhhab ..................... 13
III. The development of competing "orthodox"
interpretations of the shari'a .......................................... 17
IV. Imposing one interpretation of the shari'a in an
"Islamic" state .................................................................. 18

Chapter Two: Developing Fiqh: Classical Sunnī Methods of
Interpreting the Shari'a ..................................................... 20
I. Classical Sunnī assumptions about authority and
epistemology ................................................................... 20
II. Using ijtiḥād to interpret the shari'a ......................... 21
III. Using taqlīd to interpret the shari'a ......................... 41
IV. Recapitulation: Classical methods of interpreting the
shari'a ........................................................................... 45

Chapter Three: When Was a Ruler's Law Legitimate?:
The Classical Theory of Siyāsa Shariyya .......................... 47
I. The theory of siyāsa shariyya ....................................... 49
II. Siyāsa shariyya in the Ottoman empire ...................... 54
Chapter Four: Political, Social, and Intellectual Developments in Nineteenth-Century Egypt
   I. Social and political developments in nineteenth-century Egypt ........................................ 60
   II. The secularization of Egyptian state law ................................................................. 69
   III. The emergence of Islamic modernism in Egypt ...................................................... 73

Chapter Five: Modernist Egyptian Legal Theories and Modernist Approaches to Drafting Islamic Legislation
   I. “Neo-traditional” theories of Islamic law ............................................................... 80
   II. Modernist theories calling for Muslims to interpret the *shari‘a* and develop state law through utilitarian *neo-ijtihād* ................................................................. 83
   III. Modernist theories calling for Muslims to interpret the *shari‘a* and develop state law through comparative *neo-taqlīd* .............................................................. 92
   IV. Conclusion: Competing methods of Islamic legal interpretation and of drafting Islamic codes ................................................................. 99

Chapter Six: Political Islamism in Twentieth-Century Egypt and the Competing Modernist Theories of Islamic Law
   I. Islamist factions during Egypt’s Liberal Period, 1922–1952 ........................................ 101
   II. Islamist factions under Naṣir, 1952–1970 ................................................................. 110
   III. The fractured state of Islamism at the dawn of the Article 2 era .................................. 116
   IV. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 118

PART II

ARTICLE 2 OF THE EGYPTIAN CONSTITUTION

Chapter Seven: Article 2 and the Attempt at Executive-Sponsored Islamization, 1970–1985
   I. The adoption of Article 2 in 1971 ................................................................................ 123
   II. The spread of Islamism after the adoption of Article 2 .................................................. 126
   III. Sādāt’s Islamization policy and the amendment of Article 2 in 1980 ...................... 129
IV. The political branches’ retreat from their policy of top-down Islamization, 1980–1985 ........................................ 135
V. Article 2 litigation and the evolving judicial role in shaping Islamization ................................................................. 139

Chapter Eight: The Interpreters of Article 2: The Egyptian Courts and the SCC ................................................................. 141
I. The structure of the Egyptian court system and the role of the SCC ........................................................................ 143
II. Constitutional review in the Egyptian legal system .......... 143
III. Institutional and ideological concerns of the SCC ....... 147
IV. Conclusion ...................................................................................................................................................... 158

Chapter Nine: Debates About the SCC’s Jurisdiction over Article 2 Cases ............................................................................. 159
I. Why might Article 2 cases be non-justiciable? ............... 159
II. The SCC’s 1985 Article 2 opinions .............................. 163
III. The ramifications of the doctrine of Article 2’s non-retroactivity ........................................................................... 172

Chapter Ten: The SCC’s Substantive Article 2 Jurisprudence: An Overview ......................................................................... 174
I. The earliest substantive Article 2 opinions .................... 175
II. Later Article 2 opinions: articulating a theory of Islamic law and legal interpretation .................................................... 178
III. Conclusion ...................................................................................................................................................... 199

Chapter Eleven: The SCC’s Article 2 Jurisprudence as Applied: Case Studies ..................................................................... 201
I. Five Article 2 cases .......................................................... 202
II. Non-Article 2 cases that required the Court to consider the principles of the shari‘a ...................................................... 253
III. Conclusion: The SCC’s application of its theory of Islamic legal interpretation ......................................................... 256

Chapter Twelve: The Reception of the SCC’s Article 2 Jurisprudence ............................................................................ 259
I. Ambiguity in the SCC’s theory of Islamic law and Islamic legal interpretation ........................................................... 259
II. The reaction of the Egyptian judiciary to the SCC’s Article 2 jurisprudence ............................................. 262
III. Academic reactions to the SCC’s Article 2 jurisprudence ............................................................................. 264
IV. Conclusion: The reception of the SCC’s Article 2 jurisprudence ................................................................. 268

Conclusion ......................................................................................................................................................... 270

Bibliography ...................................................................................................................................................... 275

Index of Names .............................................................................................................................................. 291
Index of Subjects ........................................................................................................................................... 293