Copyright Exceptions: The Digital Impact

Robert Burrell
Allison Coleman
Contents

Preface xi
List of abbreviations xiii
Table of cases xvii
Table of statutes xxiii

Introduction 1
The exceptions in focus 1
The functions of the exceptions 4
The plan of this work and our argument in outline 6
A note on language 10

Part I Where we are

1 Copyright and freedom of expression 15
   Recognising the problem 16
   The idea/expression dichotomy and judicial reaction 20
   Recognising the conflict 24
   Resolving the conflict 35
   Conclusion 41

2 Fair dealing for the purposes of criticism, review and news reporting and related exceptions 42
   Fair dealing for the purposes of criticism, review and the reporting of current events: introduction 43
   Does the exception apply to the work in question? 44
   Is the use for an approved purpose? 48
   Is the use fair? 57
   Attribution of the work 60
   Summary 61
   Miscellaneous provisions relating to the communication of information 62
   Miscellaneous provisions relating to the creation of derivative works 64
   Other obstacles faced by users 67
   Conclusion 78
## Contents

### Part I  How we got here

#### 6 Markets and metaphors
- Exceptions, licences and market failure 168
- Copyright as a form of property 180
- Copyright law and notions of balance 187
- Conclusion 191

#### 7 Copyright in supranational fora
- The logic of harmonisation 194
- The Commission's understanding of copyright I: market failure, the copyright balance and property rights 197
- The Commission's understanding of copyright II: harmonisation and the copyright families 201

### Part II  Exceptions applying to education, research and private study

#### 4 Exceptions applying to education, research and private study
- Fair dealing for the purposes of research or private study 115
- The education exceptions: overview 120
- Things done for the purposes of instruction or examination 120
- Anthologies for educational use 124
- Performing, playing and showing works in educational establishments 124
- Lending of copies by educational establishments 126
- The licensing provisions 126
- Case study: copyright licensing in higher education 130
- Conclusion 135

### Part III  The library and archive provisions and related exceptions

#### 5 The library and archive provisions and related exceptions
- Overview of the existing exceptions 137
- Defining libraries, archives, museums and galleries and the role of such institutions 138
- Divisions within the 1988 Act 142
- Wider coverage under the directive 143
- The existing library exceptions 145
- Miscellaneous exceptions 160
- Conclusion 162

## Contents

### 3 The public interest defence

- The public interest defence in its early form 81
- The recent authorities 91
- Can the same result be achieved by other means? 94
- The objections of principle to a public interest defence 102
- Is a public interest defence legitimate? 103
- Is a public interest defence appropriate? 108
- Is a public interest defence necessary? 109
- Is a public interest defence workable? 111
- Conclusion 111

### 4 Exceptions applying to education, research and private study

- Fair dealing for the purposes of research or private study 115
- The education exceptions: overview 120
- Things done for the purposes of instruction or examination 120
- Anthologies for educational use 124
- Performing, playing and showing works in educational establishments 124
- Lending of copies by educational establishments 126
- The licensing provisions 126
- Case study: copyright licensing in higher education 130
- Conclusion 135

### 5 The library and archive provisions and related exceptions

- Overview of the existing exceptions 137
- Defining libraries, archives, museums and galleries and the role of such institutions 138
- Divisions within the 1988 Act 142
- Wider coverage under the directive 143
- The existing library exceptions 145
- Miscellaneous exceptions 160
- Conclusion 162
Contents

Opportunities for participation 208
The Information Society Directive and the importance of official inertia 213
Summation 215
The international forum 215
Conclusion 219

8 Copyright in the domestic arena 220
Understandings of copyright 221
The DTI's mandate 226
Draftsmanship and the inevitable accident 230
Implementing directives: the method of transposition 235
European legislation and the erosion of parliamentary control 236
The role of the judiciary 238
Conclusion 245

Part III Where we go from here

9 The fair use panacea 249
The evolution of the fair use defence and its abolition by the judiciary 253
Protecting parodies 264
The fair use defence: current practice and future developments 267
Conclusion 274

10 A model for reform 276
A flexible system 276
A workable system 277
A law of users' rights 279
The importance of public participation 280
Working with the Directive: criticism, review and news reporting 282
Supplementing the Directive: the public interest defence 287
Working with the Directive: private study and research, education, libraries and archives 288
Summation 297
The three-step test 298
Other types of users' rights 299
Making harmonisation a reality 303
Changing attitudes 304
Contractual exclusion and technological measures of protection 306
Conclusion 310

Appendices


Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, s. 296ZE and Schedule 5A 352
Contents


United States Copyright Act 1976, 17 USC, s. 107 375

Bibliography 376

Index 412