Comparative Income Taxation: A Structural Analysis

Second Edition

Principal Authors

Hugh J. Ault, Boston College Law School
Brian J. Arnold, Goodmans LLP, Toronto

Contributing Authors

Guy Gest, University of Paris II
Peter Harris, University of Cambridge
Peter Melz, Stockholm University
Minoru Nakazato, University of Tokyo
Yasutaka Nishikori, Nishimura & Partners, Tokyo
James Repetti, Boston College Law School
Wolfgang Schöhn, Max Planck Institute, Munich
John Tiley, University of Cambridge
Richard J. Vann, University of Sydney
Kees van Raad, University of Leiden
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgment</th>
<th>xvii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>ixx</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>xxi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PART ONE: GENERAL DESCRIPTION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Australia</strong></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. History of the income tax</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Constitutional issues</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tax rates</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Composition of fiscal system</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Basic structure of the income tax</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Tax legislation</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1. Legislative process</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Statutory Style</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Statutory interpretation</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Courts Dealing with Tax Matters</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1. Appeal processes</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2. Judicial expertise</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Tax administration</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. General principles</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1. Relation of tax and financial accounting</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2. Respect for legal form</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3. Tax avoidance and anti-avoidance legislation</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Sources of tax law</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Canada</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Constitutional Issues</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Tax Rates</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Composition of the Fiscal System</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Basic Structure of the Income Tax</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Tax Legislation</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1. Tax legislative process</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2. Statutory style</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3. Statutory interpretation</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.1.1. Principles of the Tax Base (Global or schedular approach, accrual or consumption-based approach, ‘dualism’ of income) 58
6.1.2. Private Expenses 59
6.1.3. Non-resident taxpayers 60
6.2. Corporate income tax 60
   6.2.1. Taxable entities 60
   6.2.2. Tax Base 60
   6.2.3. Tax system 61
6.3. Trade tax 62
7. Tax Legislation 63
   7.1. Legislative Process 63
   7.2. Statutory style 63
   7.3. Statutory interpretation 63
8. Courts dealing with tax matters 64
   8.1. Structure of the courts 64
   8.2. Judicial Style 65
9. Tax Administration 65
   9.1. General 66
   9.2. Assessment and Audit 66
   9.3. Tax compliance 67
   9.4. Administrative Style 68
10. General Principles 69
    10.1. Relationship between tax and financial accounting 69
    10.2. Respect for legal form 69
    10.3. Anti-avoidance doctrines and rules 70
11. Sources of Tax Law 70

Japan 73
1. History 73
2. Constitutional Issues 75
3. Tax Rate 76
4. Composition of the Fiscal System 77
5. Basic Structure of the Income Tax 78
   5.1. On Individuals 78
   5.2. On Corporations 79
6. Tax Legislation 80
   6.1. Legislative Process for Income Tax Measures 80
   6.2. Statutory Style 80
   6.3. Statutory Interpretation 81
7. Courts Dealing with Tax Matters 82
   7.1. Structure of the Courts 82
   7.2. Judicial Style 82
8. Tax Administration 83
9. General principles 85
   9.1. Relation between Tax and Financial Accounting 85
   9.2. Respect for Legal (Civil Law) Form 86
   9.3. Anti-Avoidance Doctrines or Legislation 86
10. Sources of Tax Law 86
### The Netherlands

1. History of the Netherlands income tax system  
2. Constitutional issues  
   2.1. In general  
   2.2. Impact of human rights conventions and EC Treaty fundamental freedom provisions  
3. Income Tax Rates  
4. Composition of the Fiscal System  
5. Basic Structure of the Income Tax  
   5.1. Individuals  
   5.2. Corporations  
6. Tax Legislation  
   6.1. Tax legislative process  
   6.2. Statutory style  
   6.3. Statutory interpretation  
7. Courts dealing with tax matters  
8. Tax administration  
   8.1. In general  
   8.2. Taxpayer bill of rights; ombudsman  
   8.3. Release of Government information to taxpayers  
   8.4. Advance rulings  
   8.5. Assessment, administrative appeal and appeal to courts  
9. General Principles  
   9.1. Relationship between tax and financial accounting  
   9.2. Respect under tax law for the civil (private) law form of contracts  
   9.3. Anti-avoidance doctrines and rules  
10. Sources of Tax Law

### Sweden

1. History  
2. Constitutional Issues  
3. Tax Rates  
4. Composition of the Fiscal System  
   4.1. Types of taxes  
5. Basic Structure of the Tax System  
   5.1. Individuals  
      5.1.1. Earned income  
      5.1.2. Income from capital  
   5.2. Corporations  
6. Tax Legislation  
   6.1. Legislative process  
   6.2. Statutory style  
   6.3. Statutory interpretation  
7. Courts dealing with tax matters  
8. Tax Administration  
9. General principles  
   9.1. Relation of tax and financial accounting  
   9.2. Respect for legal form  
10. Sources of Tax Law
Subpart B. Partnership Taxation 335
1. Qualification for pass-through taxation 336
2. Basic structure of pass-through taxation 337
3. Liabilities, tax cost and losses 339
4. Transactions between partner and partnership 341
5. Disposition of a partnership interest 342
6. Liquidation of the partnership 343

PART FOUR. INTERNATIONAL TAXATION 345

Subpart A. Residence Taxation 347
1. Bases for the assertion of personal taxing jurisdiction 347
  1.1. Individuals 347
  1.2. Corporations 349
2. Change of status 351
  2.1. Change of status of individuals 351
  2.2. Change of status of corporations 353
  2.3. Dual residence 355
3. Mechanisms for relief of double taxation 357
  3.1. Issues in the structure of a foreign tax credit system 360
    3.1.1. Creditable taxes 360
    3.1.2. Limitations on the credit 362
    3.1.3. Allocation of expenses to foreign-source income 365
    3.1.4. Treatment of losses in the credit computation 367
    3.1.5. Carryover of excess credits or limitation 368
    3.1.6. Indirect credit for foreign taxes paid by foreign subsidiaries 369
      3.1.6.1. Share ownership requirements 369
      3.1.6.2. Tier limitations 370
      3.1.6.3. Computation of the indirect credit 370
    3.1.7. Interaction between indirect credit and limitation system 371
  3.2. Issues in the structure of an exemption for foreign income 372
    3.2.1. Structure of the exemption 372
    3.2.2. Classes of exempt income 372
    3.2.3. Allocation of deductions to tax-exempt income 375
    3.2.4. Treatment of foreign losses 376
4. Limitations on exemption or deferral of income of foreign corporations 377
  4.1. Limitations on exemption for shareholders in foreign corporations with significant domestic share ownership 378
  4.2. Limitations on deferral for shareholders of foreign corporations with significant domestic share ownership 380
  4.3. Special provisions dealing with domestic portfolio investment in foreign investment companies 386
5. Outbound transfers to foreign branches or subsidiaries 389

Subpart B. Source Taxation 395
1. Issues in the structure of net basis taxation of business income 395
  1.1. Threshold of activity 395
  1.2. Attribution of business income for net basis taxation 397
1.3. Determination of deductions in the net basis taxation of business income 401
1.4. Taxation of employment income 403
1.5. Other situations involving net basis taxation 405
2. Issues in the structure of gross basis taxation 406
3. Branch profits tax 410
4. Limitations on base-eroding payments to non-residents 411
5. Restrictions on source-based taxation of non-residents within the European Union 414

**Subpart C. Additional International Topics** 419
1. Special international avoidance rules 419
2. Selected intercompany pricing issues 420
3. Corporate-shareholder taxation in the international context 425
   3.1. General 425
   3.2. International aspects of capital gains 427
4. Selected treaty issues 428
   4.1. Relation between domestic law and treaties; treaty override 428
   4.2. Approach to treaty interpretation 430
   4.3. Anti-treaty shopping policy 432
   4.4. Non-discrimination 434
   4.5. ‘Model’ tax treaties 435
   4.6. Tax sparing by treaty 437

**PART FIVE. SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY** 439

**Part One: General Description** 440
Australia 440
Canada 440
France 440
Germany 441
Japan 441
The Netherlands 441
Sweden 442
The United Kingdom 442
The United States of America 442

**Part Two: Basic Income Taxation** 443
Subpart A: Inclusions in the tax base 443
1. Employee Fringe Benefits 443
2. Imputed Income 443
3. Gifts 444
4. Prizes and awards 444
5. Scholarships and grants 444
6. Cancellation of indebtedness 444
7. Gambling 445
8. Illegal income 445
10. Subsidies 445
11. Realization and recognition of gain 446
12. Capital gains and losses 446
Subpart B: Deductions
1. Mixed business and personal expenses
2. 'Hobby losses' and the criteria for determining business versus personal activities
3. Capital costs and recovery methods
4. Educational costs
5. Deduction of personal costs
6. Limitations on deductions and losses

Subpart C: Accounting
1. General
2. Advanced/Deferred Payment
3. Accounting for original issue discount and complex financial instruments

Subpart D: Attribution of Income
1. Definition of taxable unit
2. Alimony and child support
3. Limitations on assignment of income

Part Three: Taxation of Business Organizations
Subpart A: Corporate-Shareholder Taxation
1. Overview of corporate tax systems
2. Defining entities subject to tax
3. Issues in corporate formation
4. Issues involving capital structure
5. Taxation of corporate distributions
6. Liquidations
7. Corporate reorganizations and restructuring
8. Transfer and limitations on transfer of corporate tax attributes
9. Consolidated corporate taxation
10. Special tax regimes for closely held corporations

Subpart B: Partnership Taxation

Part Four: International Taxation
General Descriptive Material by Country
Subpart A: Residence Taxation
1. Bases for the assertion of personal taxing jurisdiction
2. Change of status
3. Mechanisms for relief of double taxation
4. Limitations on exemption or deferral of income of foreign corporations
5. Outbound transfers to foreign branches or subsidiaries

Subpart B: Source Taxation
1. Issues in the structure of net basis taxation of business income
2. Issues in the structure of gross basis taxation
3. Branch profits tax
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subpart C: Additional International Topics</th>
<th>468</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Special international avoidance rules</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Selected intercompany pricing issues</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Selected treaty issues</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index**

473