Indigenous Heritage and Intellectual Property

Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore

Editor:

S. von Lewinski

Contributors:

Anja von Hahn
Michael Hassemer
Roland Knaak
Annette Kur
Matthias Leistner
Silke von Lewinski
Agnès Lucas-Schloetter
P.-Tobias Stoll

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Abbreviations xi

## Notes on Contributors xvi

### Part I. Introduction

*Silke von Lewinski*

### Part II. Indigenous Peoples, Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources in International Law

*Peter-Tobias Stoll and Anja von Hahn*

#### Section 1. Indigenous Peoples in International Law

5

#### Section 2. Indigenous Peoples: Definition Issues

8

1. The Term “Indigenous”: An Approximation

8

2. The Recognition of Indigenous Peoples as “Peoples”

12

#### Section 3. Some Essential Characteristics of Indigenous Cultures

14

1. Collective Rights

14

2. Indigenous Peoples and Their Land

15

3. Indigenous Heritage: Indigenous and Traditional Resources

15

#### Section 4. Relevant Human Rights Norms in the Context of Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources

17

1. General Human Rights Norms Relevant to the Protection of Indigenous Knowledge and Indigenous Resources

17

2. Other Relevant Standards in the Context of Indigenous Resources and Traditional Knowledge

19

2. Specific Human Rights Instruments for the Protection of Indigenous Peoples

20

1. ILO Convention No. 169

21

2. Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

22

3. The Proposed American Declaration

24

#### Section 5. Indigenous Peoples in International Environmental Law

25

1. *The Convention on Biological Diversity*

26

2. “Indigenous and Local Communities”

26
# Table of Contents

2. The General Concept 27  
   (a) Dependence of Indigenous and Local Communities on Biological Resources 27  
   (b) The Concept of Benefit-Sharing 27  
3. Art. 8(j) of the CBD as the Key Operative Provision 28  
   (a) Art. 8(j) in Context: *in situ* Conservation of Biological Diversity as a State Obligation and the National Law Limitation 28  
   (b) Subject and Contents 28  

Section 6. Ongoing Discussions: Recent Developments in  
International Fora Regarding Indigenous Resources and Traditional Knowledge 29  
I. The World Intellectual Property Organization 30  
II. Traditional Knowledge in the Context of the WTO 31  
III. The Convention on Biological Diversity 32  
IV. The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations: The International Undertaking on Plant Genetic Resources and the Concept of Farmers’ Rights 33  
   1. “Farmers’ Rights” and Indigenous Peoples 35  
   2. The Concept of Farmers’ Rights 35  
   3. Farmers’ Rights, Traditional Knowledge and Intellectual Property 36  
V. The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development 37  
VI. The World Health Organization 37  

Section 7. Recent Developments at the Regional and National Levels with Regard to the Protection of Indigenous Resources and Traditional Knowledge 38  

Section 8. Statements, Declarations, Charters, Resolutions and Recommendations by Indigenous Peoples 40  

Section 9. Conclusion  
Bibliography 44  

Part III. Analysis of Different Areas of Indigenous Resources 49  
Section 1. Traditional Knowledge 49  
*Matthias Leistner*  
I. Findings at the Factual Level 49  
   1. The Growing Importance of Traditional Knowledge 49  
   2. Sources of Factual Information 51  
   3. Terms and Definitions 52  
   4. Characteristics of Traditional Knowledge 56
5. The Positive and Negative Aspects of Traditional Knowledge Protection 58
6. Practical Needs: Documentation, Assistance and Advice 60
7. The Role of Customary Law 62
8. Use of Collective Marks and Geographical Indications (Annette Kur) 63

II. Existing Legal Provisions Regarding the Protection of Traditional Knowledge 64
1. Intellectual Property Rights 64
   (a) International Level 64
   (b) Regional Level 73
   (c) National Level 76
2. Legal Protection Outside Intellectual Property Rights 106
   (a) International Level 106
   (b) Regional Level 114
   (c) National Level 115

III Draft Laws and Other Models 120
1. International Level 120
   (a) Developments at the WIPO 120
   (b) Discussions Relating to the WTO 122
   (c) Discussions Relating to the CBD 124
   (d) Other Discussions at the United Nations 126
2. Regional Level 127
   (a) Organization of African Unity 127
   (b) FTAA Draft Agreement 128
   (c) Others 129
3. National Level 129
   (a) IPR-Similar sui generis Approaches 129
   (b) Biodiversity-Oriented Approach: The example of the Brazilian Draft Bill 131
   (c) Propositions Aimed at Adapting Existing IPR 133
   (d) Provisions on Assistance and Advice at the National Level 133

IV. Conclusions 134
1. Analysis of the Legal Situation 134
2. Short- and Medium-Term Measures 139
3. Long-Term Measures: Features of a New Protection Right 141

Bibliography 144

Section 2. Genetic Resources 151

Michael Hassemer 151

I. Findings at the Factual Level 151
   1. Genetic Resources 151
Section 4. Folklore
Agnès Lucas-Schloetter

I. Findings at the Factual Level
1. The Commercial Value of Folklore
2. The Different Forms of Exploitation of Folklore
3. The Expectations of Indigenous Peoples with Respect to their Folklore
4. The Definition of Folklore

II. Existing Legal Regimes Regarding the Protection of Folklore
1. Intellectual Property Rights
   (a) International Level
   (b) Regional Level
   (c) National Level
2. Legal Protection of Folklore Outside Intellectual Property
   (a) Customary Law
   (b) Cultural Heritage Legislation
   (c) The Legal Instruments in the Field of Human Rights and the Rights of Indigenous Peoples

III. Draft Laws and Other Models
1. The Tunis Model Law on Copyright (WIPO/UNESCO, 1976)
4. Draft Declarations and National Legislation in the Field of Indigenous Peoples’ Rights
   (a) Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (United Nations, 1994)
   (b) Draft Regional Declarations and National Laws in the Field of Indigenous Peoples’ Rights
5. Recent WIPO and UNESCO Activities in the Field of Folklore
6. The Initiatives of Various Semi-Official and Unofficial Groups in the Field of the Protection of Folklore
   (a) International Level
Table of Contents

(b) Regional Level 358
(c) National Level: The Example of Australia 359
IV. Conclusions 363
Bibliography 368

Part IV. Final Considerations 379
Silke von Lewinski

Section 1. Preliminary Remarks 379

Section 2. The Needs as Expressed by Indigenous Peoples 380

Section 3. Protection by Existing Intellectual Property Regimes 381
I. Protection of Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore per se 381
II. Protection of “Derivates” 383
1. “Derivates” Produced by Indigenous Peoples 383
2. “Derivates” Produced by Outsiders 384
(a) Opposition to Intellectual Property Rights of Outsiders of Indigenous Communities 384
(b) Possible Responses to Claims for Defensive Protection 385

Section 4. Protection of Genetic Resources, Traditional Knowledge and Folklore by Legal Regimes beyond Intellectual Property 386
I. Customary Law 386
1. Problematic Issues 386
2. Basic Approaches 387
II. Non-Economic and Economic Privileges 388
1. Holders of rights 389
2. Object of Protection and Uses Covered 390
3. Other Issues 390
4. Objections to Sui Generis Protection: Public Domain 391
5. Usefulness of Databases 393
6. Collecting Societies 394

Section 5. The Level of Legal Measures 395

Section 6. Additional Instruments 395

Section 7. Practical Measures 396

Bibliography 397

Index 399