AN INTRODUCTION TO THE LAW OF INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS

A Comparative Study

GEERT-JAN ALEXANDER KNOOPS

Transnational Publishers, Inc.
Ardsley, New York
Chapter II
Classification and Identification of International Crimes by ICT

1 Introduction

2 The Evolution of the Crime of Genocide within the Law of the Tribunals

3 Proliferation of ICTY-ICTR Case Law on the Crime of Genocide

4 The ICTY-ICTR Statutory and Jurisprudential Elements of the Crime of Genocide

5 Crimes against Humanity before ICT

5.1 The Characteristics of Crimes against Humanity

5.2 ICTY and ICTR Requirements

5.3 The Context Element as a Requirement to Qualify Crimes against Humanity before ICT

6 Requirements of the Context Element under ICT Statutes

6.1 Widespread or Systematic Attack

6.2 The Element of "Any Population"

6.3 The Element of Civilian Population

6.4 The Element of Policy

6.5 The Individual Act and the Element of Knowledge of the Attack

6.6 Comparison of ICTY/ICTR and ICC

6 The Concept of War Crimes before ICT

7.1 Introduction

7.2 War Crimes and Armed Conflict under the ICTY and ICTR Statutes

7.3 War Crime and Armed Conflict under the ICC Statute

7.4 Comparison with Genocide/Crimes against Humanity

Chapter III
General Principles of Substantive Criminal Law Envisioned by ICT

1 Emergence of General Principles

2 Modes of Criminal Responsibility within the ICT System

2.1 ICTY-ICTR

2.1.1 Individual Criminal Responsibility

2.1.2 Superior Responsibility under Article 7 (3) ICTY Statute
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3</td>
<td>Criminal Participation de novo: Joint Criminal Enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>ICC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1</td>
<td>Forms of Individual Criminal Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2</td>
<td>Superior Responsibility under Article 28 of the ICC Statute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3</td>
<td>Comparison ICC and ICTY Superior Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Defenses as General Principles of ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Immunities of Former Heads of States and other State Officials as Defenses before ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>ICJ Jurisprudence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>ICJ's Jurisprudential Influence on the Law of the ICC and ICTY-ICTR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Duress and Necessity as Defenses before ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Doctrinal Distinctions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>The Approach of ICTY-ICTR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>The Approach of the ICC Statute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The Limited Scope of Superior Orders under the Law of ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>International Criminal Law Parameters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>ICTY-ICTR Case Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>Superior Orders under the ICC Statute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>The Defenses of Mental insatiety, Diminished Responsibility and Intoxication before ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Expanding the Boundaries of Criminal Law Defenses before ICT: Mental Insanity and Diminished Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2</td>
<td>The Insanity Defense and Defense of Diminished Responsibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3</td>
<td>The Interrelationship of the Insanity/ Diminished Responsibility Defense and the Intoxication Defense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4</td>
<td>The Interrelationship of the Insanity Defense and the Diminished Responsibility Defense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.5</td>
<td>The Insanity Defense and Forensic Expertise before ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Jurisprudential and Statutory Self-Defense under the Law of ICT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter IV
General Principles of Procedural Criminal Law Envisioned by ICT

1 Procedural Nature and Characteristics of Proceedings before ICT

1.1 The ICTY-ICTR System: A Merger of Common Law and Civil Law Procedural Elements

1.1.1 Introduction

1.1.2 Procedural Reform as Basis for System Change

1.1.3 The Recent ICTY RPE and Amendments

1.1.4 Impact on ICTY Law Practice

1.1.5 The Recent ICTR RPE and Amendments

1.1.6 Influence on the ICC Statute

1.1.7 Conclusions

1.2 The Legal Nature of the ICC Statute

2 Contemporary Procedural Pre-Trial Aspects of ICT

2.1 Introduction

2.2 The Nature of Pre-Trial Proceedings before ICT

2.2.1 Purpose of Pre-Trial

2.2.2 ICTY-ICTR: Rule 61 Hearings

2.2.3 ICC

2.3 The Indictment and the Principles of nullum crimen sine lege, nulla poena sine lege

2.3.1 ICTY-ICTR Requirements

2.3.2 ICC Requirements

2.4 Ne bis in idem before the ICC and ICTY-ICTR

2.5 The Presumption of Innocence before ICT

2.6 Provisional Release before ICT

3 Contemporary Procedural Trial Aspects of ICT

3.1 Introduction

3.2 The Emerging Adjudicatory Concept of Plea Agreements before ICT

3.3 Contemporary Sentencing Procedures and Policies before ICT

3.4 Appeals Procedures before ICT: Some Contemporary Issues

3.5 The ICC and Forensic Evidence: Prosecutorial and Defense Implications of the Principle of Procedural Equality of Arms

3.5.1 Introduction

3.5.2 Legal-Forensic Framework of Equality of Arms
3.5.3 Equality of Arms in International Law: Balancing Prosecution and Defense Interests ... 125

3.6 The ICC Statute and Neurosciences ................................. 126

Chapter V

Principles of Criminal Evidence before ICT .......................... 127

1 Introduction .................................................................. 127

2 Requisite Standards of Proof before ICT ......................... 128
  2.1 Introduction ............................................................ 128
  2.2 Standard of Proof for Indictment ............................. 128
  2.3 Procedure for Judgment of Acquittal ....................... 129
  2.4 Standard of Proof for Conviction ......................... 130
  2.5 Standard of Proof for Defenses ......................... 130

3 Disclosure of Evidence ................................................. 131
  3.1 Introduction .......................................................... 131
  3.2 Modalities of Disclosure under ICT Systems ............. 131
    3.2.1 Prosecution Disclosure under the ICTY-ICTR System ........................................ 131
    3.2.2 Defense Disclosure under the ICTY-ICTR System ........................................... 134
    3.2.3 Prosecution and Defense Disclosure under the ICC System .................................. 135

4 Admissibility of Evidence ............................................... 135
  4.1 Different Types of Witness Evidence before ICT .......... 135
  4.2 Hearsay before ICT ................................................ 136
    4.2.1 ICTY Case Law on Hearsay Evidence ................ 137
    4.2.2 ICTY Case Law on Hearsay Evidence: Conclusion ............................................ 139
    4.2.3 ICTR Case Law on Hearsay Evidence ................ 139
    4.2.4 Hearsay Evidence under the ICC .................... 140
  4.3 Use of Anonymous Witnesses before ICT .................... 141
    4.3.1 ICTY Approach Regarding Anonymous Witnesses ........................................... 141
    4.3.2 Conclusions and Practical Reflections on ICTY Case Law Referring to Anonymous Witnesses ........................................ 143
    4.3.3 ICTR Approach Regarding Anonymous Witnesses ........................................... 144
    4.3.4 The ICC Approach Regarding Anonymous Witnesses ........................................ 145
    4.3.5 Conclusion and Comparison with ECHR View on Anonymous Witnesses .............. 146
  4.4 Circumstantial Evidence before ICT and Exclusion of unus testis, nullus testis .............. 148
Chapter VI
The Emergence of Uniform Standards of Due Process before ICT: Influence on (Inter)national Criminal Law(s)

1 Introduction ................................................. 157

2 Definition of Due Process Rights Relevant to ICT .......... 158

3 The Influx of Common Standards of Due Process to ICT Systems ................................................. 159

3.1 Introduction ................................................. 159

3.2 Fair Trial as an Exponent of Due Process before ICT ........ 160

3.2.1 ICTY-ICTR ................................................. 160

3.2.2 ICC .................................................. 163

3.3 *Habeas Corpus* as Due Process Right under ICT .......... 164

3.3.1 Introduction ................................................. 164

3.3.2 *Habeas Corpus* Writs under International Human Rights Conventions ................................................. 164

3.3.3 The Right to *Habeas Corpus* Writs under the ICTR System: Substantive and Procedural Aspects ................................................. 166

3.3.4 ICTR *Habeas Corpus* Restrictions Ratione Materiae ................................................. 169

3.3.5 Effects of *Habeas Corpus* Writs: Relativism and Material Prejudice ................................................. 170

3.3.6 ICTR and ICC *Habeas Corpus* Remedies Compared ................................................. 171

3.3.7 *Habeas Corpus* Writs before the ICTR: Distinct Nature? ................................................. 174

3.4 Due Process and Admissibility of Evidence before ICT ................................................. 173

3.5 Due Process and Trial Rights under ICT ................................................. 175

3.6 Due Process and Pre-Trial Proceedings before ICT ................................................. 176

3.7 Due Process and Supervisory Mechanisms before ICT ................................................. 177

Chapter VII
International State Cooperation with ICT:
Obtaining Evidence Abroad ................................................. 179

1 Introduction ................................................. 179
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cooperation Distinctions between the ICTY-ICTR and ICT systems</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The State Cooperation System under the ICC Statute</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Treaty-Based Cooperation</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>ICC-UN Mutual Cooperation: Comparison with ICTY-ICTR</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Surrendering to ICT: Practical Implications</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter VIII</td>
<td>Redressing Wrongful Prosecutions and Convictions or Miscarriages of Justice by ICT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rationale of ICT Review Proceedings</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The Revision System under the ICTY and ICTR</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>ICTY-ICTR Criteria</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>ICTY-ICTR Case Law on Review Proceedings</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>ICTR's Extensive View on the &quot;New Fact&quot; Criterion</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Revision System under the ICC Statute</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Redressing Wrongful Prosecutions and Convictions by ICT through Financial Compensation</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>ICTY-ICTR</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>ICC</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix I</td>
<td></td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biography</td>
<td></td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td></td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>