JURISDICTION
OF
INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

by

CHITTHARANJAN F. AMERASINGHE

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK
CONTENTS

Acknowledgement xv
Table of Cases xvii
Abbreviations lv

Part I
Introductory

CHAPTER 1 INTERNATIONAL ADJUDICATORY DISPUTE SETTLEMENT—NATURE AND DEVELOPMENT

International disputes 3
International tribunals 9
Third party judicial settlement—development of arbitration 12
Structure of peaceful dispute settlement in modern international relations 16
Adjudicatory methods 18
  (i) Arbitration 19
  (ii) Settlement by a court 26
Proliferation of adjudicatory dispute settlement 33
Representation before tribunals 34
Status of international tribunals 41
Scheme of study 44

Part II
General Principles

CHAPTER 2 MEANING OF JURISDICTION IN INTERNATIONAL JURIDICAL USAGE

Diversity of connotation 49
National legal systems compared with the international system 56
## Usage and applicability 58
- Primary connotation of the term 64
- Other areas examined 66
- Seisin and its relationship to jurisdiction 66

### CHAPTER 3  CONSENT AS THE BASIS OF JURISDICTION OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

- The requirement 69
- Requirements for effective consent 77
  - (a) Consent in more than one step 77
  - (b) Form of consent 82
  - (c) Consent be subsequent conduct or by subsequent agreement 86
- Derivative or indirect consent 89
- International war crimes tribunals and consent 90
- Consent and individuals 93
- The relationship of consent to inherent jurisdiction 95
- Jurisdiction to render advisory opinions and rulings of law 97
- Irrelevance of consent 97
- Parameters of consent 98

### CHAPTER 4  INTERPRETATION OF CLAUSES SUBMITTING TO JURISDICTION

- The *contra proferentem* rule 102
- Restrictive interpretation 105
- Sovereignty 115
- Positive principles applicable 119

### CHAPTER 5  *LA COMPÉTENCE DE LA COMPÉTENCE*

- History 121
- Initial rationale and explanations of the rule 124
- Current status—general jurisprudence 130
- Current status—jurisprudence of the World Court 135
- Current status—conclusion 141
Contents

Possible limitations 142
(1) International arbitrations 142
(2) Established courts 150
Raising proprio motu the issue of la compétence de la compétence 154
Finality of the determination on la compétence de la compétence 155
Jurisdiction of other tribunals to decide on the compétence of a tribunal 157
The issue of conflict of interest 159

CHAPTER 6 COMPÉTENCE—THE CONSTITUTION OF THE TRIBUNAL

The Commonwealth Secretariat International Arbitral Tribunal Case 164
International arbitrations 168
Two international cases 169
(a) International administrative tribunals 169
(b) The ICTY 178
Other tribunals 187

CHAPTER 7 COMPÉTENCE TO SETTLE DISPUTES

Forum prorogatum and compétence 198
The judgment on compétence and res judicata 200
Identifying matters of compétence 202
Time for raising issues of compétence 205
Sources of jurisdiction 207
(a) Multiple sources 207
(b) Validity in time 209
(c) Termination of validity 210
Scope of primary jurisdiction 213
Fundamental limitations on the scope of primary jurisdiction 222
(a) The need for a dispute which is legal 223
(b) The requirement of an interest 227
(c) Mootness or absence of object 228
(d) Constitution of the tribunal 230
(e) The rule in the *Monetary Gold Case* 231
(f) Conclusion 236
(g) Criminal proceedings 236
Exercise of jurisdiction and discretion 238
Proof of jurisdiction 239

**CHAPTER 8  ADMISSIBILITY**

Grounds for inadmissibility 245
A. General 246
B. Nationality of Claims 259
C. Exhaustion of local remedies 284
Waiver and estoppel 286
(a) Express waiver 288
(b) Implied waiver 290
(i) The Optional Clause 291
(ii) Submission by states to international adjudication, including arbitration 291
(iii) The issue of arbitrability 294
(iv) Arbitration agreements between states and private parties 295
(v) Failure to raise preliminary objection 303
(vi) Request for declaratory judgment 303
(c) The principles of estoppel and good faith 305
Time for raising objections to admissibility 308

**CHAPTER 9  INCIDENTAL JURISDICTION**

(A) Intervention 314
(1) Consent of the principal parties 315
(2) Other requirements 329
(3) Scope and procedures 335
(4) The special case of the CJEC 339
(B) Interim measures 344
(1) Basic jurisdiction 345
## Contents

(2) The principles underlying the exercise of the jurisdiction 358
   (a) The CJEC 360
   (b) The PCIJ and the ICJ 368
   (c) Arbitrations 375
   (d) Conclusion 377

(3) The legal effect of orders of interim measures 377

### CHAPTER 10  JURISDICTION VIS-À-VIS REMEDIES

Agreement and specific provision 390
Interpretation of specific provisions 392
Inherent or implied jurisdiction 394
   A. Interpretation of express provisions 394
   B. Absence of provision 396
      (i) The PCIJ and ICJ 397
      (ii) Arbitral tribunals 406
         (a) Negative injunctions 410
         (b) Restitutio in integrum 410
         (c) Specific performance 415
         (d) Damages 416
         (e) Satisfaction 417
         (f) Declaratory judgments 419
      (iii) Conclusion 421
The principle of non ultra petita and jurisdiction 422

### CHAPTER 11  JURISDICTION TO REOPEN CASES

(1) Res judicata and finality 426
(2) Reopening cases 441
   (i) Appeal 441
      (a) The CJEC 442
      (b) International criminal tribunals 444
   (ii) Review 449
      (a) Review on discovery of new facts 450
      (b) An inherent jurisdiction 454
Contents

(c) Review of UNAT and ILOAT judgments by the ICJ 466
(iii) Fraud and corruption 474
(iv) Rectification 477
(v) Interpretation 491
(vi) Annulment 491
   (a) Express provision 491
   (b) Partial nullity and res judicata 497
   (c) Inherent jurisdiction to annul 502

CHAPTER 12 ADVISORY JURISDICTION

The limitation that requests must be within the scope of an organization’s activities 510
The requirement that the question be legal 521
   (a) Abstract or political nature 522
   (b) Object and purpose 525
   (c) The relevance of hypothetical answers 525
   (d) Concrete questions 526
   (e) Questions of fact 526
Specific terms of reference 527
The judicial character of the Court 527
The exercise of the discretion to give an opinion:
   the Court’s status as a principal organ 537
Jurisdiction to reopen advisory opinions 542
   (a) Interpretation 542
   (b) Revision 543

Part III
SPECIFIC COURTS AND TRIBUNALS

CHAPTER 13 THE PERMANENT COURT OF INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE AND THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE

A. Forum Prorogatum 549
   General Considerations 550
   The principle and its evolution 552
Contents

The maturation of consent or agreement 555
Procedure evolved 566
Conclusion 568
B. Jurisdiction under the Optional Clause 568
(1) The content of Article 36(2) and (3) 572
(2) Reciprocity 578
(3) Reservations 584
   (i) Content and application of reservations
      \textit{ratione materiae} 587
   (ii) Subjective reservations 592
   (iii) Reservations \textit{ratione temporis} 595
   (iv) The validity of reservations and declarations 603
(4) Interpretation of declarations and reservations—
special considerations 611

\textbf{CHAPTER 14} \textbf{ARBITRAL TRIBUNALS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CENTRE FOR SETTLEMENT OF INVESTMENT DISPUTES}

Rationale for the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) 617
Outline of the System under the ICSID Convention 621
(a) Proceedings for arbitration 621
(b) Special features of ICSID 624
Institutional Jurisdiction—its Scope and Limitations 626
   (i) Interpretation 626
   (ii) Consent 631
   (iii) Competence \textit{ratione materiae} 635
   (iv) Competence \textit{ratione personae} 643

\textbf{CHAPTER 15} \textbf{INTERNATIONAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNALS}

(1) Fundamental considerations 669
(2) Jurisdictional competence 674
   (a) Competence \textit{ratione temporis} 674
   (b) Competence \textit{ratione personae} 675
   (c) Competence \textit{ratione materiae} 680
(3) Irreceivability or inadmissibility 686
   (a) *Ratione temporis* 686
      (i) Mandatory nature of time-limits 687
      (ii) Extension by agreement between the parties 689
      (iii) Exceptional circumstances 690
      (iv) The *terminus a quo* 692
   (b) Other reasons than *tempus* 693
      (i) Insufficient clarity of grounds 693
      (ii) Agreement of release 694
      (iii) Scope of claims 696
      (iv) Exhaustion of internal remedies 696
      (v) Inappropriate respondent 700
(4) Jurisdiction in regard to granting remedies 700
   (a) Inherent powers 702
   (b) General nature of remedies 704
      (i) Annulment, rescission and specific performance 705
      (ii) Compensation 706
   (a) Material loss and moral injury 707
   (b) *Quantum* of compensation 708
      (iii) Remand 711
      (iv) Costs 711
(5) Jurisdiction to review 715
   (a) *Res judicata* 715
   (b) Review 716

**CHAPTER 16  THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION AND COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS**

Matters Strictly of Competence 730
(1) Competence *ratione loci* 730
(2) Competence *ratione temporis* 732
(3) Restrictions on acceptances of jurisdiction pursuant to Articles 25 and 46 734
(4) Competence *ratione personae* 735
   (A) Inter-state applications 735
   (B) Individual applications 738
      (i) Being a “victim” 739
(C) Passive legitimation with regard to both kinds of applications 750
(5) Competence *ratione materiae* 755

Matters of Admissibility Proper 757
(1) Inadmissibility on the ground that the application was anonymous 757
(2) The application must not constitute an abuse of the right of complaint 758
(3) The application must not be substantially the same as a matter which has already been examined by the Commission or has already been submitted to another procedure of international investigation or settlement unless it contains relevant new information 761
(4) The application must not be incompatible with the provisions of the Convention 764
(5) The application must not be manifestly ill-founded 767
(6) Domestic remedies must have been exhausted 770
  (a) Basic considerations 771
  (b) The relevance of the direct injury 779
  (c) Jurisdictional connection 780
  (d) *Scope of the rule* 782
  (e) Limitations on the rule 792
  (f) Raising the objection based on domestic remedies 799
  (g) The time at which remedies must be exhausted 801
  (h) The continuing situation 801
  (i) The burden of proof 803
(7) The six-months rule 803

The Function and Jurisdiction of the Court under the Old and New System 807

**CHAPTER 17 THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITIES**

(A) Enforcement Actions against Member States 812
(B) The Jurisdiction to Review
   (1) Annulment
   (2) Action for inactivity
   (3) Illegality

(C) Plenary Jurisdiction
   (1) Contractual actions
   (2) Non-contractual actions against the Community
   (3) Liability arising from legislation
   (4) Period of limitation
   (5) Jurisdiction in regard to remedies
   (6) Concurrent liability of the Communities and the member states

(D) Preliminary Rulings
   (1) Jurisdiction ratione materiae
   (2) Preliminary rulings on validity
   (3) Who may refer
      (a) Courts of last resort
      (b) Inferior national courts

Index