

**Adversarial versus  
Inquisitorial Justice**  
*Psychological Perspectives  
on Criminal Justice Systems*

**Edited by**

**Peter J. van Koppen**

*Netherlands Institute for the Study of Crime and Law Enforcement  
Leiden, the Netherlands*

and

*Department of Law, University of Antwerp  
Antwerp, Belgium*

**and**

**Steven D. Penrod**

*John Jay College of Criminal Justice  
New York, New York*

**KLUWER ACADEMIC / PLENUM PUBLISHERS**  
**NEW YORK/BOSTON/DORDRECHT/LONDON/MOSCOW**

# Contents

CHAPTER 1. ADVERSARIAL OR INQUISITORIAL: COMPARING SYSTEMS . . . .	1
<i>Peter J. van Koppen and Steven D. Penrod</i>	
Comparing Systems . . . . .	2
Dutch Inquisition and American Adversaries . . . . .	5
The Lives and Times of a Dutch and an American Suspect . . . . .	6
Which System Is Better? . . . . .	15
Subjects Not Covered . . . . .	17
This Volume . . . . .	17
CHAPTER 2. ADVERSARIAL OR INQUISITORIAL: DO WE HAVE A CHOICE? . . . . .	21
<i>Hans F.M. Crombag</i>	
CHAPTER 3. AN EMPIRICALLY BASED COMPARISON OF AMERICAN AND EUROPEAN REGULATORY APPROACHES TO POLICE INVESTIGATION . .	27
<i>Christopher Slobogin</i>	
Search and Seizure . . . . .	28
Interrogation . . . . .	40
Conclusion . . . . .	52
CHAPTER 4. "WE WILL PROTECT YOUR WIFE AND CHILD, BUT ONLY IF YOU CONFESS": POLICE INTERROGATIONS IN ENGLAND AND THE NETHERLANDS . . . . .	55
<i>Aldert Vrij</i>	
Attitude Change in the Interrogation Room . . . . .	57
Interviewing Suspects in England . . . . .	59

Reasons to Confess .....	59
Quality of the Interview .....	63
Search for the Truth .....	63
Open-mindedness .....	64
Fair Interviewing and the Use of Tactics .....	66
The Presence of an Appropriate Adult .....	67
The Presence of a Legal Adviser .....	69
Summary .....	70
Interviewing Suspects in the Netherlands .....	70
Conclusion .....	79
 CHAPTER 5. VIOLENCE RISK ASSESSMENT IN AMERICAN LAW .....	 81
<i>John Monahan</i>	
State of the Science .....	82
State of the Law .....	85
Conclusion .....	88
 CHAPTER 6. THE DUAL NATURE OF FORENSIC PSYCHIATRIC PRACTICE: RISK ASSESSMENT AND MANAGEMENT UNDER THE DUTCH TBS-ORDER .....	   91
<i>Corine De Ruiter and Martin Hildebrand</i>	
Juridical Framework .....	92
Competence to Stand Trial .....	95
The Diminished Responsibility Doctrine .....	96
Psychiatric Disorders in TBS Patients .....	98
Treatment under the TBS Order .....	99
Violence Risk Assessment and Management under the TBS Order .....	103
Strengths and Weaknesses .....	105
 CHAPTER 7. THE DEATH PENALTY AND ADVERSARIAL JUSTICE IN THE UNITED STATES .....	  107
<i>Samuel R. Gross</i>	
Inadequate Resources for Legal Representation .....	108
Arbitrariness and Discrimination .....	110
Errors .....	113
Conclusion .....	116

CHAPTER 8. TAKING RECOVERED MEMORIES TO COURT .....	119
<i>Harald Merckelbach</i>	
A Prototypical Case .....	120
What Does It Mean When You Say That Recovered Memories Are Essentially Accurate? .....	121
Some More Statistics .....	123
Professional Attitudes .....	125
Mounting the Witness Stand .....	126
Clinical versus Judicial Decision-Making .....	127
Conclusion .....	129
CHAPTER 9. ADVERSARIAL INFLUENCES ON THE INTERROGATION OF TRIAL WITNESSES .....	131
<i>Roger C. Park</i>	
Precepts of Contemporary Cross-Examination .....	132
Exceptions to the Low-Risk Precepts .....	142
Comparison of Adversarial and Inquisitorial Incentives .....	143
When Can Adversarial Cross-Examination Elicit New Facts? ..	145
Prophylactic Effect of Cross-Examination in Deterring Deception .....	160
Caveat: Other Benefits of Cross-Examination .....	163
The Costs and Harms of Cross-Examination .....	163
Caveat: Trial Cross-Examination in the Context of Associated Procedures .....	165
Closing Comment .....	166
CHAPTER 10. CHILDREN IN COURT .....	167
<i>Ingrid M. Cordon, Gail S. Goodman, and Stacey J. Anderson</i>	
Background on Assumptions of the Adversarial System .....	168
Children’s Knowledge of the Court .....	169
Children’s Understanding of Legal Terminology .....	170
Competence Examinations .....	173
Direct-Examination and Cross-Examination .....	175
Children’s Ability to Cope Emotionally .....	177
Emotional Effects of Children’s Courtroom Experiences .....	179
Alternative Methods for Obtaining and Admitting Children’s Evidence .....	180
Conclusions .....	189

CHAPTER 11. IDENTIFICATION EVIDENCE IN GERMANY AND THE UNITED STATES: COMMON SENSE ASSUMPTIONS, EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE, GUIDELINES, AND JUDICIAL PRACTICES . . . . .	191
<i>Siegfried L. Sporer and Brian L. Cutler</i>	
Identification Evidence in the German Legal Literature:	
From Past to the Present . . . . .	192
Procedural Rules and Recommendations for Lineups in Germany . . . . .	194
German Supreme Court Decisions . . . . .	197
Identification Procedures in the United States . . . . .	201
Conclusions . . . . .	207
CHAPTER 12. EXPERT EVIDENCE: THE STATE OF THE LAW IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED STATES . . . . .	209
<i>Petra T.C. van Kampen</i>	
Securing Expert Assistance . . . . .	211
The Rules of Discovery . . . . .	216
Admissibility and Decision Rules on Expert Evidence . . . . .	220
The Right to Confrontation . . . . .	226
The Right to Compulsory Process . . . . .	231
Expert Evidence in the Netherlands and the United States: Different Shades of Gray . . . . .	233
CHAPTER 13. EXPERT WITNESSES IN EUROPE AND THE UNITED STATES . . . . .	235
<i>Michael J. Saks</i>	
Preliminary Considerations . . . . .	235
The Adversarial System: In Theory and In Practice . . . . .	236
The Civil Law System: In Theory and In Practice . . . . .	240
Conclusion . . . . .	243
CHAPTER 14. THE ROLE OF THE FORENSIC EXPERT IN AN INQUISITORIAL SYSTEM . . . . .	245
<i>Ton Broeders</i>	
Written Reports . . . . .	246
Evaluation of Forensic Evidence . . . . .	247
Quality Assurance . . . . .	248
Limitations of Quality Assurance . . . . .	248
Independent Experts, Partisan Experts, and Hired Guns . . . . .	250

Recent Developments: DNA, the European Court of Human Rights .....	252
Conclusion .....	253
CHAPTER 15. PSYCHOLOGICAL EXPERT WITNESSES IN GERMANY AND THE NETHERLANDS .....	255
<i>Claudia Knörnschild and Peter J. van Koppen</i>	
Diversity within Unity .....	255
Method .....	256
Forensic Psychological Assessment .....	257
Restriction to Credibility Assessment .....	258
Appointment of an Expert Witness .....	258
Ordering a Credibility Assessment .....	260
The Instructions to Psychological Experts .....	262
Conducting a Credibility Assessment .....	262
The Main Hearing .....	269
The Quality of the Assessments .....	274
Conclusions .....	281
CHAPTER 16. PREVENTING BAD PSYCHOLOGICAL SCIENTIFIC EVIDENCE IN THE NETHERLANDS AND THE UNITED STATES .....	283
<i>Peter J. van Koppen and Michael J. Saks</i>	
Two Prostitutes and Their Pimp .....	283
Evidence for Courts and Juries .....	284
The Standards for Expert Witnesses .....	286
Psychologists versus Forensic Psychologists .....	287
The Expertise of the Psychologist .....	290
Methods for Evaluating Witness Statements .....	293
Protecting Courts against CBCA .....	294
Experts and Counter Experts .....	298
Standards for Expert Psychologists .....	304
CHAPTER 17. STYLES OF TRIAL PROCEDURE AT THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE FORMER YUGOSLAVIA .....	309
<i>Francis J. Pakes</i>	
Characteristics of the ICTY .....	311
The Performance of the Tribunal .....	312
The Present Study .....	313
Concluding Remarks .....	318

CHAPTER 18. CONVERGENCE AND COMPLEMENTARITY BETWEEN PROFESSIONAL JUDGES AND LAY ADJUDICATORS .....	321
<i>Shari Seidman Diamond</i>	
Through the Eyes of the Judge .....	322
Agreement and Disagreement between LayPersons and Professional Judges .....	325
Beyond Agreement: Other Jury Attributes .....	328
Conclusion .....	331
CHAPTER 19. THE PRINCIPLE OF OPEN JUSTICE IN THE NETHERLANDS ..	333
<i>Ruth Hoekstra and Marijke Malsch</i>	
Side-Effects of Open Justice .....	334
Transparency of Criminal Process: The Right of Access to the Documents in a Case .....	335
Public Hearing .....	338
The Principle of Immediacy .....	339
The News Media versus the Public Gallery .....	341
Study on the Public Gallery .....	342
Conclusions .....	345
CHAPTER 20. THE JOHN WAYNE AND JUDGE DEE VERSIONS OF JUSTICE	347
<i>Peter J. van Koppen and Steven D. Penrod</i>	
Different Forms of Justice? .....	348
The Compromising Society .....	349
The Judge Dee Model of Justice .....	351
The Contending Society .....	351
The Criminal Justice Systems .....	354
Pretrial .....	355
At Trial .....	357
Conclusions .....	367
REFERENCES .....	369
ABOUT THE EDITORS .....	407
ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS .....	409
TABLE OF CASES .....	415
AUTHOR INDEX .....	419
SUBJECT INDEX .....	427