Emergency Powers and the Courts in India and Pakistan

Imtiaz Omar
Senior Lecturer, School of Law, University of New England, Australia

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / NEW YORK
CONTENTS

Preface xiii

Introduction 1

INDIA & PAKISTAN: INDEPENDENT STATEHOOD & ADOPTION OF CONSTITUTIONS 1

SOME CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CONSTITUTIONS OF INDIA AND PAKISTAN 2

Parliamentary Democracy 2

Federalism 3

Fundamental Rights and Safeguards to Preventive Detention 4

Courts, Judicial Power and Jurisdiction 5

Emergency Powers 6

STATES OF EMERGENCY IN INDIA AND PAKISTAN:
ISSUES OF CONSTITUTIONALISM 7

OBJECTIVE OF THIS STUDY 9

Chapter I: Emergency and Constitutionalism 11

RATIONALE FOR ENTRENCHED EMERGENCY POWERS 11

EMERGENCY AS A CONSTITUTIONAL PROBLEM 12

Constitutional Limitations and Executive Power 13

Constitutional Limitations and Federalism 14

EMERGENCY AS A CONSTITUTIONAL NORM IN INDIA AND PAKISTAN 17

The Proclamation of Emergency 18

Executive Emergency Powers and the Legislature 20

Legal Consequences of a Proclamation of Emergency 21

PREVENTIVE DETENTION 23

Preventive Detention in Colonial India 23
Contents

Preventive Detention as a Constitutional Norm 24

Chapter II: Constitutional Emergency Powers of the Executive 27

THE POWER TO PROCLAIM AN EMERGENCY 27

The Condition Precedent 28


Emergency on the Grounds of Internal Disturbances (1975) 31

The Context of the 1975 Internal Emergency in India 31

The Internal Emergency of 1975 in the Courts 34

AMENDMENT OF PROVISIONS IN INDIAN CONSTITUTION ON PROCLAMATION, APPROVAL, AND DURATION OF EMERGENCY (1978) 36

Cabinet Participation in Decision to Proclaim an Emergency 37

‘Internal Disturbance’ and ‘Armed Rebellion’ 38

JUSTICIABILITY OF A PROCLAMATION OF EMERGENCY: NEW HORIZONS 39

India 39

Pakistan 41

THE POWER TO SUSPEND THE ENFORCEMENT OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS DURING EMERGENCY 44

The Background 44

The Justiciability of a Presidential Order Suspending the Enforcement of Fundamental Rights 45

RECENT CHANGES TO THE TEXT AND INTERPRETATION OF CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS ON SUSPENSION OF ENFORCEMENT OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS 48

India: Amendment of Article 359 49

Pakistan: Invalidation of Presidential Orders 49


COMMON LAW DOCTRINE OF MARTIAL LAW 53

STATES OF MARTIAL LAW IN PAKISTAN 55
PROCLAMATION OF MARTIAL LAW: 1958 56
SECOND PROCLAMATION OF MARTIAL LAW: 1969 58
THIRD PROCLAMATION OF MARTIAL LAW: 1977 61
FOURTH PROCLAMATION OF "MARTIAL LAW" ("EMERGENCY"): 1999 63

Chapter IV: Emergency, Fundamental Rights and the Courts 69

SUSPENSION OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS DURING EMERGENCY 71
Suspension of Fundamental Rights and Legislative Competence 71
Suspension of Fundamental Rights and Executive Action 73

SUSPENSION OF THE ENFORCEMENT OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS DURING EMERGENCY 73
Fundamental Rights and Legislative Competence 76
Effect of a Suspension of Enforcement of Fundamental Rights on the Scope of Executive Power 78

SUSPENSION OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS DURING MARTIAL LAW 80

Chapter V: Jurisprudence of the Indian Supreme Court during the 1962-1969 Emergency 85

THE EMERGENCY OF 1962 85
Presidential Order Suspending the Enforcement of Fundamental Rights 86

DETENTION JURISPRUDENCE OF MAHKAN SINGH 87
Background to the Supreme Court appeal in Makhan Singh 87
Effect of Presidential Order on 'Procedural' Statutory Rights 87
Effect of Presidential Order on 'substantive' statutory rights 89
Makhan Singh and the Scope of Judicial Review 90

POST-MAHKAN SINGH DECISIONS 92
Effect of the Suspension of the Enforcement of Article 22 92
Judicial Review of the Face of a Detention Order 93
Mandatory Statutory Requirements 95
Contents

EMERGENCY POWERS, FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE SUPREME COURT'S DETENTION JURISPRUDENCE 96

Chapter VI: Jurisprudence of the Indian Supreme Court during the 1971-1977 Emergency 97

THE EMERGENCIES OF 1971 AND 1975 IN INDIA 97
- Proclamation of the 1971 Emergency 97
- Presidential Orders of 1974 98

EMERGENCY JURISPRUDENCE OF SHIVAKANT SHUKLA 101
- Context of the Supreme Court Decision in Shivakant Shukla 101
- Right to Life and Personal Liberty 102
- Article 359 and the Content of the Emergency Power 103
- Enforcement of Statutory Rights 105
- Emergency and the Power of the High Courts under Article 226 106
- Saga of the Final Order in Shivakant Shukla 109

SHIVAKANT SHUKLA AND THE COURT'S SELF-DENIAL OF JUDICIAL POWER 110

Chapter VII: Jurispurdence of the Pakistan Supreme Court during Emergency 113

THE EMERGENCIES OF 1965 AND 1971 IN PAKISTAN 113

EMERGENCY POWERS AND THE INALIENABLE RIGHT TO BE TREATED IN ACCORDANCE WITH LAW 115

LEGALITY OF EXECUTIVE ACTION DURING AN EMERGENCY 116
- Defence of Pakistan Rules and the Legality of Executive Action 116
- Legality as a Constitutional Principle 119
- The Constitutional Obligation to give Effect to the Safeguards Relating to Preventive Detention 119

THE PRINCIPLE OF LEGALITY DURING EXTRA-CONSTITUTIONAL EMERGENCY (MARTIAL LAW) 122
Chapter VIII: Emergency, Constitutionalism and the Political Function of the Courts 129

The Problem 130
Judicial Power as a Basic Feature of the Indian Constitution 133
Judicial Power and the Emergency Provisions of the Constitution 134
Politics, Emergency and the Courts 136

FUTURE EMERGENCIES AND THE COURT’S ROLE IN INDIA AND PAKISTAN: ISSUES AND PROSPECTS 138

INDIA 138
Constitutional Developments since the Last Emergency 138
Post-Emergency Jurisprudential Trends of the Indian Supreme Court 139

PAKISTAN 142
Recurrent Emergency Rule 142
Vulnerability of the Judiciary 142
Continuing Judicial Activism 144

Appendix A 147

THE CONSTITUTION OF INDIA 147

Appendix B 165
CONSTITUTION OF THE REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN 1962 165

Appendix C 175
CONSTITUTION OF THE ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN 1973 175

Table of Cases 193
Table of Legislation 199
Bibliography 205
Index 213