Towards an EU Right to Education

by

Dr. Gisella Gori
# Table of contents

Preface ......................................................................................................................... vii  
Abbreviations .............................................................................................................. xviii  
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ xx  
About the author ........................................................................................................... xxi  
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1  

## Part I – Community education and vocational training rights and policies: Origin and evolution

Introduction to Part I ...................................................................................................... 11  

## Section I – The emergence, evolution and institutionalization of the education and vocational training rights and policies

Chapter 1 – From Rome to Maastricht: The emergence and the evolution of the education and vocational training competence ........................................... 17  
1. First steps in the area of education and vocational training: Member states’ co-operation .................................................................................................................. 19  
2. The interaction between the Court of Justice and individuals: The evolution of education and vocational training competence under the cover of the internal market ........................................................................................................ 24  
   2.1 Individual education and vocational training rights as a component of the freedom of movement for Community workers ........................................... 24  
      A. The legal framework: Regulation No 1612/68 ................................................. 24  
      B. The Casagrande ruling: Establishing the foundations ....................................... 26
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C. The subsequent case law in the framework of the internal market rules</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Mademoiselle Gravier, or individual education and vocational training rights for everyone</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The Forcheri case</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Gravier case</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Improving equal access to education for Community nationals</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. The features of the judicial development of Community competence</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The market</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The individual</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The interaction between the Court of Justice and the institutions:</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A policy is being established</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. The implementation of the Community competence</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. The judicial establishment of the Community competence</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Erasmus and Comett under scrutiny</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The case of the right of residence for students</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Conclusions</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 – Preparatory steps to the institutionalization of the education and vocational training competencies</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Commission: Consolidating the status quo</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Defining education and vocational training competencies</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. The issue of higher education</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Which kind of competence for the Community?</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Member States: Containing Community competence</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Drawing the line between education and vocational training</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. The Member States’ interpretation of the new competencies</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Conclusions</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 – The consolidation of Community education and vocational training competencies: Improvement, status quo or setback?</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The content of Articles 149 and 150: Consolidating the acquis communautaire and beyond</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. The content of Article 149</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. The content of Article 150</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Which kind of competence for education and vocational training policies?</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. The scope of Article 149</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The extent of Community competence</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The nature of Community intervention: ‘Incentive measures’</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE OF CONTENTS

2.2. The scope of Article 150 ................................................................. 92
   A. The extent of Community competence ........................................ 92
   B. The nature of Community intervention: ‘Measures’ .................... 95

3. The relation between higher education and vocational training .......... 95
   3.1. The levelling down of Community competencies ..................... 96
   3.2. The blurring of education and training .................................... 98

4. Conclusions ..................................................................................... 100

Section II – The implementation of Articles 149 and 150

Chapter 4 – First implementation: The Leonardo da Vinci and the
Socrates programmes ....................................................................... 105

1. Sketching the blurring of higher education and vocational training:
   The issue of the legal basis ............................................................ 106
   1.1. The role of universities in the framework of the Leonardo I programme 107
   1.2. The Socrates I programme and its double legal basis ............... 111
      A. Preparatory steps and the decision-making process ................ 112
         a. The Commission proposal .................................................... 112
         b. Reactions in the decision-making process .......................... 113
         c. The balance between legal and political arguments in the decision-
            making process ................................................................ 116
      B. The analysis of the aim and content of the Socrates I programme .... 117

2. The levelling down of competencies: A comparison of the implementation
   of Articles 149 and 150 .................................................................. 120
   2.1. The Socrates I and Leonardo I decisions as Community atypical acts 121
   2.2. The Socrates I and Leonardo I programmes: Their functioning ........ 122

3. The Socrates II and Leonardo II programmes: An even more integrated
   approach ....................................................................................... 123

4. Conclusions ..................................................................................... 127

Chapter 5 – Beyond Leonardo and Socrates: Which implementation for
Articles 149 and 150? ...................................................................... 132

1. Soft law and the evolution of its application to education and training policies 134
   1.1. The definition of soft law ....................................................... 134
   1.2. The evolution of the application of soft law to education and training
        policies ................................................................................ 136
   1.3. An analysis of recent education and training soft law ............... 141
   1.4. Conclusions: Emerging patterns of intergovernmental co-operation 148
      A. The resolution on the Action Plan for mobility ....................... 149
TABLE OF CONTENTS

B. The Bologna Declaration and its follow-up .................................................. 150
2. The meaning of the double legal basis in education and training soft law .... 153
   2.1. The resolution establishing new working procedures for European
       co-operation in the field of education and training ................................. 156
   2.2. The Recommendation on European co-operation in quality assurance in
       higher education ....................................................................................... 157
   2.3. Soft law on lifelong learning ................................................................. 158
3. Conclusions .................................................................................................... 159

Chapter 6 – External relations in Community education and vocational
training policies .................................................................................................. 162
1. Recent developments of the Community external relations competencies
   affecting education and training ................................................................. 164
2. Pre-Maastricht education and training external co-operation .................... 167
3. Post-Maastricht education and training external co-operation ................... 172
   3.1. The external power in education and training: Articles 149(3)
       and 150(3) ............................................................................................... 175
       A. United States of America and Canada ................................................. 176
   3.2. Community general external competencies in relation to education and
       training: Articles 310 and 181 ............................................................... 178
       A. European Free Trade Area (EFTA) countries ................................... 180
       B. Central and Eastern European countries (CEECs) ............................ 181
       C. Mediterranean non-member countries (MNMCs) ............................ 184
       D. Latin American countries ................................................................. 186
   3.3. Keeping the status quo: Co-operation on the basis of Article 308 ......... 187
       A. Central and Eastern Europe non-associated countries, new independent
          states of the former Soviet Union and Mongolia ............................... 187
       B. Mediterranean and Latin American countries ................................... 188
4. Conclusions .................................................................................................... 189

Conclusions to Part I ......................................................................................... 192

Part II – Beyond Community education and vocational training policies:
Community education rights or a European Union right to education?
Introduction to Part II ....................................................................................... 199
Section I – Which status and which rights for individuals? Education, training and beyond

Chapter 7 – The meaning and scope of educational rights in the EC context ........................................ 205
1. The judicial development of a legal status for individuals ......................................................... 206
2. The nature of Community educational rights ................................................................. 210
3. The personal scope of educational rights: To whom do they apply? .................. 213
4. The content of educational rights for ‘classical actors’ .................................................. 217
   4.1. Access to education and training: Free movement and right of residence .................. 217
      A. Community workers and their families ................................................................. 217
      B. Students ............................................................................................................. 221
      C. Researchers and teachers ................................................................................... 225
   4.2. The social dimension of educational rights ...................................................... 228
      A. Community workers and their families ................................................................. 228
      B. Students ............................................................................................................. 234
      C. Researchers and teachers ................................................................................... 235
   4.3. Profiting from the education received: Professional and academic recognition of qualifications ................................................................. 235
5. Conclusions ...................................................................................................................... 239

Chapter 8 – The evolution of Community educational rights .................................................. 241
1. The way towards a single legal status for individuals ................................................................. 242
   1.1. What does European citizenship stand for? .............................................................. 243
   1.2. The Commission proposal for amending free movement rules .......................... 247
      A. The forward looking approach ......................................................................... 247
      B. The concrete proposal for amending Regulation no 1612/68 .......................... 250
   1.3. The judicial development of individual rights: ‘Riding the old horse’ ............. 251
      A. The Martinez Sala case: Facts and ruling of the Court ........................................ 254
      B. The implications of the ruling .......................................................................... 257
2. The evolution of education rights .................................................................................. 261
   2.1. Citizenship as the source of educational rights ................................................ 261
      A. Does Martinez Sala affect equal treatment of students? ................................ 263
         a. Students .............................................................................................................. 264
         b. Workers who become students ....................................................................... 268
   2.2. The traditional track: The application of free movement and equal treatment provisions to educational rights ................................................................. 271
      A. The traditional track: Free movement of workers ........................................ 272
      B. The combination of Articles 149 and 12: Still a magic formula? ................ 275
3. Improving equal conditions of access for students .................................................. 277
4. Conclusions ............................................................................................................. 280

Chapter 9 – The growing relevance of training rights as individual rights in the EC context ................................................................. 282

1. The personal scope of the status of trainee in the EC context .................... 284
2. The significance of the provisions on employment to education and training ... 287
3. The evolution of training rights in the educational dimension ...................... 290
   3.1. The background .............................................................................................. 290
   3.2. European pathways for work-linked training: Towards a global notion of trainee .............................................................. 293
4. The consolidation of training rights in the free movement of worker dimension: The ‘to be’ worker .......................................................... 296
   4.1. The draft proposals of the Commission on the rights to free movement and residence ......................................................... 297
   4.2. The implications of the enlarged scope ratione personae of the Community legislation on the free movement of workers .......... 301
   4.3. The recognition of professional experience .................................................. 303

5. Conclusions ............................................................................................................. 307

Section II – Is there a European Union right to education?

Chapter 10 – The Member States’ common constitutional traditions with respect to the right to education ............................................. 313

1. The right to education in the Member States’ constitutions: Preliminary remarks ..................................................................................... 315
   1.1. The nature of fundamental rights .................................................................. 315
   1.2. The nature of the right to education ............................................................... 318
2. The individual right to education ......................................................................... 321
   2.1. The right to free compulsory education ...................................................... 320
   2.2. The right to post-compulsory education ..................................................... 324
      A. Restrictions to access .................................................................................... 328
   2.3. foreigners’ right to education ...................................................................... 332
3. Freedom of education ............................................................................................. 333
   3.1. Freedom of teaching ...................................................................................... 335
   3.2. Freedom to be taught .................................................................................... 336
      A. The freedom to choose education .................................................................. 336
      B. Private schooling ......................................................................................... 338
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 11 – The European protection of the fundamental right to education

1. The European protection of fundamental rights in the light of recent evolution:
   Who is protecting what? ............................................................................................................. 345
   1.1. The evolution of the Community system of protection of fundamental rights .................. 346
      A. The amendment of the Treaty ......................................................................................... 346
      B. The Charter of fundamental rights of the European Union ........................................ 349
         a. The political added value of the EU Charter ................................................................. 351
         b. The legal added value of the EU Charter ................................................................. 353
   1.2. The European Court of Human Rights’ reaction to the evolution in the Community legal order
      A. The Matthews judgment ............................................................................................ 358
      B. The relation between the European Convention on Human Rights and the EU Charter of fundamental rights ....................................................................................................................... 363

   2.1. Content and scope of Article 2, Protocol no 1 ............................................................... 367
      A. The individual right to education .................................................................................. 367
         a. The content .................................................................................................................. 367
         b. The personal scope ..................................................................................................... 369
      B. Freedom of education ................................................................................................. 371
         a. Parents’ religious and philosophical convictions ...................................................... 372
         b. Private education ........................................................................................................ 374

Chapter 12 – The emergence of a European Union right to education:
   Meaning and implications ..................................................................................................... 377

1. The meaning of a European Union right to education ............................................................ 378
   1.1. The content of the European right to education: A comparison among Community educational rights, the national and the international notions of the right to education ................................................................................................................................. 378
      A. Community educational rights versus the Member States’ core notion of the right to education ............................................................ 379
      B. Community educational rights versus the ECHR right to education ......................... 384
   1.2. Three different contexts ............................................................................................... 385
      A. The Community context versus the national context .................................................... 385
      B. The Community context versus the Convention context .......................................... 387
   1.3. The special meaning of the EU right to education and Article 14 of the EU Charter of fundamental rights ......................................................................................................................... 389
TABLE OF CONTENTS

2. The implications of the emergence of a European Union right to education:
   Its protection ........................................................................................................................................ 393
   2.1. The protection of the right to education as a general principle of
       Community law .................................................................................................................................. 393
   2.2. The added value of the EU Charter of fundamental rights ...................................................... 399
3. Conclusions ...................................................................................................................................... 400
   Conclusions to Part II ...................................................................................................................... 403

Conclusions ...................................................................................................................................... 407
Bibliography ...................................................................................................................................... 419
Index .................................................................................................................................................. 445