The Rome Statute and Domestic Legal Orders

Volume I

General Aspects and Constitutional Issues

Claus Kreß & Flavia Lattanzi (eds.)

Paolo Benvenuti
Antoine Buchet
Michael Cottier
Phani Dascalopoulou-Livada
Helen Duffy
Paula Escarameia
Irene Gartner
Jonathan Huston
Frank Jarasch
Claus Kreß
Sivuyile Maqungo
Daniel D Ntanda Nsereko
Aurea Roldán Martin
Otto Trüller
Juan Antonio Yáñez-Barmuevo

Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft
Baden-Baden

__il Sirente__
##OTTOL. TRIFFTERER
LEGAL AND POLITICAL IMPLICATIONS OF DOMESTIC RATIFICATION AND IMPLEMENTATION PROCESSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

###I. Importanct of ratification and implementation procedures for the Rome Statute and the mission of the International Criminal Court

1. Conditions to get the Court into operation | 3 |
2. An anticipated contribution to the prevention of “the most serious crimes of concern to the international community as whole | 4 |
3. Legal and political advantages for States concerned | 5 |

###II. Options to become a State Party

1. “Signature, ratification, acceptance, approval or accession”, Art. 125 | 10 |
2. Relationship between ratification and the domestic implementing process | 10 |
3. Chance and challenge to harmonize national legislation and to achieve a rapprochement between different legal systems | 12 |

###III. The obligation of States to contribute to international criminal justice

1. The Preamble as guideline | 13 |
2. Operative regulations, especially complementarity between national and international jurisdiction | 14 |
3. Duties of the States Parties
4. To investigate and prosecute “crimes within the jurisdiction of the Court”
   a) Necessary and desirable prerequisites
   b) Comparable demands for substantive and procedural law
   c) Aut dedere aut iudicare, and the principle of universality
5. Vertical cooperation with the Court and the Court’s support of national investigation and prosecution
6. Horizontal cooperation between States Parties and with non-member States

IV. Consequences of non-compliance with the Statute

V. Future perspectives
  1. Globalisation of criminal justice?
  2. Improving “peace, security and well-being of the world”

HELEN DUFFY AND JONATHAN HUSTON
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ICC STATUTE: INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS AND CONSTITUTIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

Introduction

I. Implementation of the Rome Statute
   1. Complementarity: obligation or opportunity?
   2. Implementing the obligation to cooperate

II. The obligation to arrest and surrender and constitutional issues
   1. Immunities
   2. Amendment possibilities
   3. The necessity of amendment?
   4. The probability ratio

III. Other common constitutional issues and interpretative approaches
   1. Extradition
   2. Life imprisonment

Conclusions
IRENE GARTNER
IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ICC STATUTE IN AUSTRIA

I. General outline of the Austrian ratification/implementation process 51
   1. Status of the ratification process 51
   2. Implementation of the Statute into national law 52
      a) Crimes
      b) Jurisdiction
      c) Offences against the administration of justice
      d) Cooperation with the Court
      e) Enforcement of sentences of imprisonment
      f) Enforcement of fines, forfeiture measures and reparation orders

II. Constitutional Issues 56
   1. Immunities 56
      a) Immunity of the President
      b) Immunity of the Members of the Austrian Parliament and of the Members of the Provincial Parliaments
   2. Surrender of Austrian nationals to the ICC 59
   3. Life Imprisonment 61
   4. Pardon 62

Conclusions 63

ANTOINE BUCHET
L’INTEGRATION EN FRANCE DE LA CONVENTION PORTANT STATUT DE LA COUR PENALE INTERNATIONALE HISTOIRE BREVE ET INACHEVEE D’UNE MUTATION ATTENDUE

Introduction 65

I. La négociation du Statut de Rome, étape préparatoire à la future intégration en droit interne 66
   1. L’avis du Conseil d’Etat (29 février 1996) 66
   2. Le projet de Statut “alternatif” de la France (août 1996) 69
   3. La conférence diplomatique de Rome (juin 1998) 74
II. La réforme constitutionnelle, condition *sine qua non* de l'intégration en droit interne 76
   1. L'avis du Conseil constitutionnel (22 janvier 1999) 76
   2. La réforme constitutionnelle (8 juillet 1999) 80

III. La ratification, et ce qui s'en suivra... 82
   1. L'autorisation de ratification (30 mars 2000) 82
   2. Le dépôt des instruments de ratification (9 juin 2000) 82
   3. Et maintenant? 85

Conclusions 88

FRANK JARASCH AND CLAUS KREB
THE ROME STATUTE AND THE GERMAN LEGAL ORDER

I. An outline of Germany's implementation program 91
   1. The Ratification Bill, the amendment of Art. 16 para. 2 of the Basic Law and the elaboration of the implementing law 91
   2. The possible content of the Implementing Law
      a) Criminal Code (Strafgesetzbuch)
      b) Changes in the field of cooperation with the ICC
      c) Code of Criminal Procedure
      d) Enforcement of decisions under Art. 75 of the Statute
      e) Code of Judicial Administration and Organization (Gerichtsverfassungsgesetz)
   3. The possible content of the Code of Crimes under International Law (Völkerstrafgesetzbuch)
      a) General principles of criminal law
      b) Definitions of crimes

II. The Statute and the Basic Law 96
   1. The ICC as a international organization within the meaning of the Basic Law 96
   2. The surrender of Germans to the ICC
      a) The constitutional policy behind the amendment of Art. 16 para. 2 of the Basic Law
      b) The amendment as a mere constitutional clarification
CONTENTS

3. Constitutional immunities 105
   a) The constitutional immunities and Art. 24 para. 1 of the Basic Law
   b) The question of restricting the scope of the constitutional immunities with respect to the commission of international core crimes

4. Life imprisonment 110

5. Legal certainty 111

6. Pardon 112

PHANI DASCALOPOULOU-LIVADA
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ICC STATUTE IN GREECE: SOME THOUGHTS

1. Introduction 113

2. The present state of the ratification and implementation process 113

3. Constitutional issues 114
   a) The surrender of persons to the ICC
   b) Immunities
   c) Life imprisonment

4. An overview about possible changes at the level of ordinary legislation 118

5. Legal certainty 121

PAOLO BENVENUTI
ITALY, IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ICC STATUTE IN NATIONAL LEGISLATION, CONSTITUTIONAL ASPECTS

1. The Italian Law authorizing ratification and ordering implementation of the ICC Statute 123

2. The political reasons for quick ratification and postponement of detailed implementing legislation Concluding remark 124

3. The need of a detailed implementing legislation 125

4. The implementation of the Rome Statute and the Italian Constitution 127

5. The implementation of the Rome Statute and Art. 11 of the Italian Constitution 129

6. The Rome Statute and the core constitutional principles 130

7. The elaboration of the implementing legislation by the Interministerial International Humanitarian Law Commission 135
INTRODUCTION

I. The ratification and implementation process
   1. Constitutional procedure for ratification and implementation
      a) Ratification of treaties
      b) Passage of implementing legislation
      c) Adoption of constitutional amendments
   2. Practical aspects of ratification and implementation
      a) Consultations
      b) Outsourcing
      c) Relationship with cooperation legislation for the ICTY and ICTR
      d) Foreign models
      e) Implementation of crimes

II. Constitutional immunity of the prince
    1. Compatibility of the Rome Statute with the Liechtenstein constitution
    2. Legal basis of the immunity question
       a) In the Liechtenstein constitution
       b) In the Rome Statute
       c) Narrowing the question
    3. Possible solutions
       a) Constitutional amendment
       b) Constitutional interpretation
       c) Probabilities and rationality
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Eventual constitutional amendments</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Revision of Portuguese ordinary law</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conclusions</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DANIEL D NTANDA NSEREKO</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPLEMENTING THE ICC STATUTE WITHIN THE SOUTHERN AFRICAN REGION (SADC)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. The Treaties Ratification/Implementation Process</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The dualist and the monist approaches</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Statutory rules of interpretation in the light of Courts’ practice</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The implementation of the ICC Statute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Need for SADC national legislation to implement the ICC Statute:</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the principle of complementarity and the obligation of repression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of crimes against the law of Nations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The conflict between SADC countries’ legislation and the ICC</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statute</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The need and obligation of cooperation with the Court</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. SADC model enabling law</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SIVUYILE S MAQUNGO</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPLEMENTING THE ICC STATUTE IN SOUTH AFRICA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Implementation Draft Bill</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Justiciability of crimes</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Justiciability of offences against the administration of justice</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Privileges and immunities</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other forms of cooperation with the ICC</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Cooperation with the ICC-Arrest and surrender of persons to the ICC</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Other forms of cooperation with the ICC</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II.  Constitutional considerations 192
   1.  The immunity question 192
   2.  The right to accede to courts and the fair trial 193

Conclusions 194

JUAN ANTONIO YÁÑEZ-BARNEUVO AND ÁUREA ROLDÁN
SPAIN AND THE ROME STATUTE
OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT

Introduction 197

I.  The ratification of the Rome Statute 197
   1.  Preliminary steps towards ratification 197
   2.  Options for the ratification of the Statute 199
       a) Different procedures for the ratification of treaties
       b) The constitutionality of treaties
       c) The legal opinion of the Council of State
   3.  The process of ratification of the Statute 201

II. The implementation of the Statute in Spain 203
   1.  The position of the Statute in the Spanish legal order 203
   2.  International cooperation and judicial assistance 204
   3.  Substantive criminal matters 205

III. The Statute and the Spanish Constitution 206
   1.  The transfer of the exercise of competences to the ICC 206
       a) The application of Art. 93 of the Constitution
       b) The limits to the application of Art. 93
   2.  Specific constitutional issues 208
       a) Principle ne bis in idem
       b) Immunities
       c) Rehabilitation of sentenced persons
       d) The exclusive character of judicial functions
       e) The prerogative of granting pardon

Conclusions 216
I. Status and Procedure of Ratification and Implementation 219
   1. Current Status of Ratification and Implementation 219
   2. Legislative Procedure to be followed for Ratification and Implementation
      a) Ratification and Primacy of International Treaties in Swiss Law
      b) ICC Ratification and Implementing Legislation will be submitted to an Extensive Consultation Procedure
      c) The Ratification of the ICC Statute is Not Subject to a 'Mandatory' Referendum, as it is not a 'Supranational Community' within the Meaning of the Federal Constitution
      d) The Ratification and Implementation of the ICC Statute does Not Require an Amendment of the Federal Constitution
      e) The Ratification of the ICC Statute is Subject to an 'Optional' Referendum
   3. Should Switzerland Adapt its Jurisdiction over International Crimes prior to or after Ratification? 224
      a) Obligations and Incentives to Provide Domestic Jurisdiction over the Crimes within Arts. 5-8 of the Rome Statute
      b) Current Jurisdiction of Swiss Courts over International Crimes
      c) Should Switzerland adapt its Substantive Criminal Law to theDefinitions of the Crimes within Art. 5 only at a Second Stage?

II. The Swiss Federal Constitution and the Rome Statute 238
   1. Preliminary observations 238
   2. The Surrender of Swiss Citizens to the ICC 239
   3. The Immunity for Statements in the Federal Assembly 242
   4. Pardon and Amnesties pronounced by the Federal Assembly 246

Bibliography 247

Floppy disc: ratification/implementing legislation and draft legislation