Legal Ethics
Text and Materials

Richard O’Dair

Senior Lecturer, University College, London

Butterworths
London Edinburgh Dublin
2001
Table of Contents

Preface v
Acknowledgments vii
The Alexander Maxwell Law Scholarship Trust x
Abbreviations xvii

Part I: Pervasive issues in legal ethics

Chapter One
Introduction to legal ethics 1
1 The importance of legal ethics 1
2 Legal ethics: something old or something new? 5
   What is legal ethics? 5
   Legal ethics and legal education 7
   Legal ethics and the liberal legal education 7
   Legal ethics, judicial ethics and legislative ethics 13
   Legal ethics and codes of conduct 15
3 United Kingdom and United States 17
4 Legal profession(s): barristers and solicitors 18

Chapter Two
Philosophical foundations of legal ethics 27
1 Ethics – a house on firm foundations? 28
2 Character and community 47
3 Feminism and the ethic of care 56
CHAPTER THREE

Professionalism 65
1 Market control theory 69
2 Evaluating market control theory 76
   The evidence 76
   Methodological issues 77
3 Renegotiating professionalism 78
4 Redeeming the professional ideal 81

CHAPTER FOUR

Regulation and legal education 89
1 Professional regulation 90
   How to regulate the lawyers 90
   Who should regulate the lawyers – the independence of lawyers 111
2 Legal education 116
   History and context 116
   Academic legal education and legal ethics: possibilities and problems 119

CHAPTER FIVE

The Standard Conception of legal ethics 133
1 The Standard Conception of Legal Ethics 134
   The Standard Conception described 134
   How standard is the Standard Conception? 135
2 Stephen Pepper and first class citizenship 137
3 David Luban and moral activism 144
   Lawyers and institutional excuses 144
   Lawyers and institutional obligations 155
4 William Simon and ethical discretion 161
   A contextual approach 161
   Law and morality – law and legal merit 170

Part II: Particular problems in legal ethics

CHAPTER SIX

Criminal defence and prosecution 187
1 Criminal defence 188
   Under and over representation 188
   Over representation of client interests 192
2 Constraints on the zealous advocate 193
Misleading the court 193
Witnesses 196
Justifying zealous advocacy 199
3 Extending the criminal defence paradigm: problems and possibilities 215
4 Criminal defence and coloured collars 221
5 The case for the prosecution: prosecutorial ethics 224
   The decision to prosecute 224
   The evidential standard 226
   The public interest 230
   Negotiated justice 232
   The prosecutor at trial 235
   Conclusion 238
Appendix: The Code of Practice for Crown Prosecutors 239

CHAPTER SEVEN

Lawyer-client confidentiality 247
1 The American experience 249
2 Clarifying confidentiality 254
3 The UK position 257
   Rights based justification for confidentiality 262
4 Exceptions to confidentiality 265
   Crime/fraud 266
   Comment 267
5 The equitable duty of confidence 271
6 Lawyers and whistleblowing 275
Appendix: Anglo-American Confidentiality Provisions 280

CHAPTER EIGHT

Negotiation 289
1 Introduction 289
2 The ethics of negotiation 292
3 Reform of negotiating practices 305
   Structural reform 305
   Reforming the code of ethics 311
4 Lawyers’ ethics and negotiations: a case study 318

CHAPTER NINE

Lawyers, clients and power 325
1 Models for the lawyer-client relationship 325
   The godfather and client victory 326
The hired gun and client autonomy 326
The lawyer as guru and client rectitude 326
The lawyer as friend and client goodness 327

2 Autonomy in law and in conduct 328
3 Autonomy and morality 331
4 Autonomy and third parties 335
5 Autonomy and paternalism 336
   Soft paternalism 336
   Hard paternalism 342
6 Client autonomy and advising on the limits of the law 347
7 Concluding comments on the lawyer-client relationship 363

CHAPTER TEN

Lawyers, ethics and access to justice 365

1 Judicare legal aid 366
   The judicare model 367
   Legal Aid in crisis 375
2 Reform of the legal aid scheme – contracting 378
   Particular ethical problems: rationing and quality control 381
   Quality control 383
3 Reforming legal aid – conditional fees 389
   Conditional fees: for and against 391
   Conditional fees in the UK 398
4 Lord Woolf and procedural reform 402
   The problem diagnosed 402
   The solution prescribed 408
   Prognosis 414
5 Pro bono – the lawyer as altruist? 416
6 Legal expenses insurance 423
Appendix 425

CHAPTER ELEVEN

Conflicts of interest 435

Introduction 435
1 Conflict of interest between lawyer and client 437
2 Simultaneous conflict of interests 440
   Family representation – the lawyer for the situation? 446
   Multi-party litigation 451
3 Successive conflicts of interest 465
   Receipt of confidential information 465
Disclosure of confidential information and Chinese Walls 467
Conflict of interest and occupational mobility 483
4 Conflict of interest and restrictive settlements 487

Index 491