INTRODUCTION TO FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE

Hilaire Barnett BA, LLM
Queen Mary and Westfield College
University of London
CONTENTS

Preface vii

PART I THE FOUNDATIONS OF FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE

1 Introduction

THE EVOLUTION AND SCOPE OF FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE AND FEMINIST LEGAL METHODS 3
THE FEMINIST GENDER DEBATE 14
What is a woman? The gender question 14
Woman as 'Other' 15
FEMINIST LEGAL METHODS 19
Consciousness raising 19
Asking the 'woman question' 21
Feminist practical reasoning 23

2 Gender Inequalities and Law

EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE OF CULTURAL PATRIARCHY 31
Chinese footbinding 31
Female circumcision 32
Hindu suttee 33
European witch-murders 33
Wife sale in England 34
Women in marriage 35
Gender-based violence against women in contemporary society 35

LAW'S DEPENDENCE ON CULTURE: THEORETICAL EXPLANATIONS 36
Karl von Savigny, Eugen Ehrlich, William Graham Sumner 36

EARLY STRUGGLES FOR EQUALITY IN WESTERN SOCIETY 38
Rights for women 38

THE FRANCHISE
The franchise in the United Kingdom 40
The franchise in the United States of America 43

EDUCATION FOR WOMEN
Science and medicine 46
The legal profession 49

THE TWO WORLD WARS AND WOMEN'S EQUALITY 49

THE POSITION OF WOMEN IN CONTEMPORARY SOCIETY 51
Participation in employment 51
Occupational differences 52
Part time work 53
Women's pay 53
The British Central Statistical Office Report 1995 53
Women's earnings 54
Occupational data 54
### 3 Patriarchy

**EXPLAINING PATRIARCHY**
- Theoretical explanations of the origins of patriarchy
  - *Early political conceptions of patriarchy*
  - *Lawful patriarchy within the family in earlier times*

**CONTEMPORARY PATRIARCHAL MANIFESTATIONS**
- The ‘public’ sphere
- The ‘private’ sphere
- The invisibility of women
- Extending the private sphere?

**INEQUALITY IN THE PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SPHERES**
- The Subject of law: woman as ‘Other’
  - *Physical violence against women*
  - *Sexual harassment*
  - *Pornography*

**PATRIARCHY AND ESSENTIALISM**

**CONCLUSION**

### PART II CONVENTIONAL JURISPRUDENCE AND FEMINIST CRITIQUE

#### 4 Conventional Jurisprudence and Feminist Critique: I
**Ancient Greek Political Thought and Natural Law Theory**

**INTRODUCTION**

**THE GREEK PHILOSOPHERS**
- Reason in Greek philosophy
- Plato
- Aristotle

**NATURAL LAW THOUGHT**
- Natural law in ancient Greece and Rome
- Christian natural law thought
- Natural law and positive law

#### 5 Conventional Jurisprudence and Feminist Critique: II
**Positive Law and Social Contract Theory**

**THE ORIGINS OF POSITIVISM: THE AGE OF MODERNITY**

**LIBERALISM**
- The rise of legal positivism
- The elements of positivist thought

**SOCIAL CONTRACT THEORY**
- Knowledge and ignorance behind the ‘veil of ignorance’
- The principles of justice
- The communitarian critique of liberalism
PART III SCHOOLS OF FEMINIST JURISPRUDENTIAL THOUGHT

6 Schools of Feminist Jurisprudential Thought: I
   Liberalism and Marxism

INTRODUCTION
   The liberal tradition in Western democracy
   The public and private spheres in liberal philosophy
   The feminist critique of liberalism
MARXIST-SOCIALIST FEMINISM

7 Schools of Feminist Jurisprudential Thought: II
   Difference feminism/cultural feminism

Feminist developmental theories
Carol Gilligan's psychological/developmental research
French feminism
Luce Irigaray
Luce Irigaray and the charge of 'essentialism'
Drucilla Cornell

8 Schools of Feminist Jurisprudential Thought: III
   Radical Feminism

Catharine MacKinnon's dominance theory
Radical feminism and the critiques of 'essentialism'

9 Postmodernism and Critical Legal Studies

INTRODUCTION
   The age of modernity
   The age of postmodernism
   Michel Foucault
   Jean-Francois Lyotard
   Jacques Derrida
CRITICAL LEGAL STUDIES
FEMINISM, POSTMODERNISM AND CRITICAL LEGAL STUDIES
POSTMODERN FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE
   The construction of gender
   Postmodernism/poststructuralism and Critical Legal Studies:
      unravelling law's claim to rationality and objectivity
FEMINISM AND THE CLS DISTURBANCE OF RIGHTS
DECONSTRUCTING THE SUBJECT OF LAW
PART IV  KEY ISSUES IN FEMINIST JURISPRUDENCE

10 Women and Medicine 211

INTRODUCTION 211
THE MEDICAL PROFESSION IN WESTERN SOCIETY 213
   Obstetrics and gynaecology 215
THE MEDICALISATION OF REPRODUCTION 216
STERILISATION 219
   The case law 220
COURT ORDERED CAESAREAN SECTIONS 223
   Treatment under the Mental Health Act 1983 225
INFERTILITY TREATMENT 227
ABORTION RIGHTS 229
   Introduction 229
   The evolution of abortion law in England 230
   ‘Foetal rights’? and the law 232
   The Warnock Committee Report 233
   The legal position of the father of the child 233
   The interaction between abortion, contraception and sterilisation 234
   Abortion rights in the United States of America 234

WOMEN’S REPRODUCTIVE RIGHTS IN
INTERNATIONAL DIMENSIÓN 240
   The religious and cultural inheritance and influence 240
   Population control programmes 241
NON-CONSENSUAL TREATMENT OF PATIENTS SUFFERING FROM
   ANOREXIA NERVOSA 244
   Competence and the ‘mature minor’ 246

11 Women, Violence and the Legal System 251

INTRODUCTION 251
   Defining gender-based violence 251
   Measuring gender-based violence 252
   International data 252
   Violence against women in the United Kingdom 255
   Explaining gender-based violence 256
   The problem of the liberal analysis of the ‘public’ and ‘private’
   spheres of life 258
   A woman’s traditional ‘place’: the home 259
      Marital rape 259
   Evolution of the English law relating to domestic violence 261
   The criminal law 261
   Reconceptualising ‘domestic’ violence 263
### Contents

Female victims and the legal system 264
The failure of traditional defences to a charge of murder for
women victims of violence 265
Provocation 266
Diminished responsibility 268
Recognising the impact of domestic violence 270
Battered woman syndrome 270
*R v Ahluwalia, R v Thornton* 272
Battered woman syndrome in Australia and Canada 273
*R v Lavallee: success for self-defence and battered woman
syndrome* 273
Women on trial: rape 275

**12 Pornography and Prostitution** 281

**INTRODUCTION** 281

**PORNOGRAPHY** 281
The evolution of the pornography industry 281
Defining pornography 282
Legal definitions 283
Differing constitutional contexts 284
Empirical evidence concerning pornography 287
Reformulating pornography from a feminist perspective 289
Alternative theoretical approaches to pornography 290

**FEMINIST APPROACHES TO PORNOGRAPHY** 291
Radical feminism 291
Racial discrimination and pornography 293
The Dworkin (Andrea) and MacKinnon Indianapolis and Minneapolis
Civil Rights Ordinances 295
Freedom of expression reconsidered 297
'Speech act' theory 298

**THE LIBERAL APPROACH: ABSOLUTE AND MODIFIED** 301
An alternative interpretation of John Stuart Mill's 'harm' principle 304

**THE CONSERVATIVE APPROACH TO PORNOGRAPHY** 307

**ALTERNATIVE AND POSTMODERN PERCEPTIONS CONCERNING
PORNOGRAPHY** 309
Arguments for and against the legal regulation of pornography 312

**CONCLUSION** 314

**PROSTITUTION AND LAW: AN OUTLINE** 315
Alternative legal responses to prostitution 317
Competing arguments concerning prostitution 317

_Bibliography_ 321
_Index_ 341