Gender and Human Rights in Islam and International Law

Equal Before Allah, Unequal Before Man?

by

Shaheen Sardar Ali

KLWGER LAW INTERNATIONAL
THE HAGUE / LONDON / BOSTON
# Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations          xiii  
Table of Cases                 xvi  
Table of Treaties              xix  
Table of Statutes              xxi  

Introduction                   1  

## Part I  
Women's Human Rights in Islam:  
Initiating the Discourse        9  

### Chapter I  
Human Rights in Islam and International Law:  
A Conceptual Analysis           11  
The Definitional Debate and Nature of Human Rights  12  
Foundations of Human Rights in the 'Western' Tradition  16  
Sources of Human Rights in Islam  19  
'Secular' and 'Western' versus 'Divine' and 'Islamic':  
A Clash of Traditions?          25  
Islam, Human Rights and Individualism  33  
Human Rights as Hierarchical Entitlements? Rights of White, Free, 
Male, Elite in the 'Western' Tradition and Entitlements of Adult, 
Free, Male, Muslims in the Islamic  36  
Concluding Remarks              40  

## Chapter II  
Women's Human Rights in Islam:  
Towards a Theoretical Framework  42  
From the Saintly to the Evil? Conflicting Images of Women in Quran  
and Hadith Literature and Implications for Women's Human  
Rights in Islam                  44  
Ibadaat and Muamalaat: Esposito's Hierarchical Notion of Rights in the  
Islamic Tradition                47
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women’s Human Rights in Islam as Categories of Entitlement</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Non-Discriminatory Categories of Rights, <em>Ibadaat</em> and Women’s</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Protective and Corrective Category, <em>Muamalaat</em> and Women’s</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Rights</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discriminatory Category of Rights: The Verse 4:34 Debate</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidentiary Value of Women’s Testimony</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inheritance Rights of Women: A Fixed, Unchangeable Share or the</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic Minimum?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Polygamy: An Acknowledgement of ‘Different Needs’ or Statement of</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Superiority?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Hijab</em> (Veiling of Women): A Prescription for Female Modesty or</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symbolic Division of Muslim Space on the Basis of Gender?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gradualism as a Method of Interpretation for Women’s Human Rights</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Islam</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evolutionary Approach to Women’s Human Rights in Islam</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal before Allah, Unequal before Man? Dilemma of Women in the</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslim World</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Part II**

**Women’s Human Rights in Islam: Application in Muslim Jurisdictions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘Public’ and ‘Secular’? Women’s Human Rights Under Constitutional Law</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Public/Private Dichotomy, Legal Pluralism and Women’s Human</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rights in Muslim Jurisdictions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutionally Guaranteed Equality for Women and the ‘Secular’</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Public’ Sphere: Replicating the <em>Ibadaat</em> Category of Non-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discriminatory Rights in Islam?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application of the Equality Norm as Espoused by Article 25 of the</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitution of Pakistan: An Overview in the Light of Reported</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case-Law</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic Provisions and the Constitution of Pakistan: Conflicting or</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complementary Norms?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘Islamisation’ of the Constitution: Redefining the Equality Norm?</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidentiary Value of Women and ‘Islamisation’ of Laws in Pakistan</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The 'Islamic' Criminal Laws: Another Blow to Equal Rights Norms of the Constitution of Pakistan 105
Insertion of Article 2A as a Substantive Provision of the Constitution: The Ensuing Debate and Implications of Women's Rights 109
The Protective/Corrective Muamalaat Category of Women's Human Rights in the Public Sphere in Pakistan: Testing the Limits of Affirmative Action Measures 112
Economic Rights of Women in Pakistan: Rhetoric and Reality 112
'Seek Knowledge from the Cradle to the Grave': Muslim Women and the Right to Education 116
'The Strong Muslim (Believer) is Better and Closer to God than the Weak One.' Women's Access to Basic Health Facilities 121
Women and Employment Rights: Breaking Down the Public/Private Dichotomy? 124
Muslim Women and the Right to Political Participation 129
Concluding Remarks 136

Chapter IV
'Private' and 'Islamic'? A Discussion of Muslim Personal Law and Implications for Women's Human Rights 138
Background to the Legislation Affecting Family Law in Pakistan: An Overview 139
The Period of Muslim Rule in the Sub-Continent 140
The Early Period of British Rule in India 141
The 'Anglicisation' of the Administration of Justice 142
Personal Law left Largely Untouched 143
Custom as Source of Law: Attempt at Codification 144
Codification of Islamic Family Law 146
Child Marriages Restraint Act 1929 147
The Dissolution of Muslim Marriages Act, 1939 (DMMA) 147
The Muslim Family Law Ordinance, 1961 (MFLO) 148
Is An Adult Muslim Woman Sui Juris? A Discussion on the Legal Status of Women in Pakistan with Reference to the Saima Waheed Case 150
Definition of Marriage 151
Dower 153
Valid, Irregular and Void Marriages 154
Marriage in Islam: Civil Contract or Sacrament? 157
Guardianship in Marriage (Jab'), Equality in Marriage (Kafat) and Option of Puberty (Khiyar-ul-Bulugh) 160
Consent in Marriage by Adult Muslim Woman Versus Consent to Marriage by *Wali*: Competing or Complementary Rights? 161

*Kafat* or Equality in Marriage 163

Guardianship in Marriage and *Khiyar-ul-Bulugh* 166

The *Saima Waheed* Case: Opening Up Pandora’s Box? 170

Chapter V

Customary Practices and ‘Cultural Islam’: Emergence of the ‘Operative’ Islam Law on Women’s Human Rights 173

The Role of Customary Practices in Perpetuating Gender Hierarchies in Muslim Jurisdictions: The Case of the North-West Frontier Province of Pakistan 173

Crisis of Muslim Identity, Islamic ‘Revivalism’ and Implications for Women’s Human Rights in Islam 183

Emergence of the ‘Operative’ Islamic Law on Rights of Muslim Women 187

Part III

International Discourses on Women’s Human Rights: Impact on Women in the Islamic Tradition 193

Chapter VI

Developments of the International Norm of Non-Discrimination on the Basis of Sex: An Evaluation of Women’s Human Rights in International Law 195

Development of the International Norm of Non-Discrimination on the Basis of Sex: An Overview 196

The UN and Regional Approach to Women’s Human Rights 198

From Mexico to Beijing: Mainstreaming Women’s Human Rights 206

The Women’s Convention: A Synthesis of the International Legal Norm of Non-Discrimination on the Basis of Sex? 212

Women’s Rights and Child Rights: Making the Linkages 216

‘Complementarity’ Equals ‘Equality’? A ‘Muslim’ View of the Norm of Non-Discrimination on the Basis of Sex 218

Non-Discrimination on the Basis of Sex: An Evolving Norm of Customary International Law? 231
### Table of Contents

**Chapter VII**

- Response of Muslim States to International Human Rights Instruments Affecting Women: A Discussion in the Light of Reservations to the Women's Convention 238
- The Reservations Regime of Multilateral Treaties and its Applications to Human Rights Instruments: An Overview of the Contemporary Position in International Law 240
- Reservations to the Women's Convention: An Overview of the Debate in the Muslim Context 246
- Reservations to the Women's Convention by Muslim States Parties: An Analysis 249
- Categories of Reservations to the Women's Convention: General, Specific, and Reservations based on Repugnancy to Islamic Law and Shari'a 250
- The 'Most Reserved' Articles of the Women's Convention by Muslim States: 'Islamic' or 'Secular' Reservations? 252
- Application of 'Operative' Islamic Law in the Context of International Human Rights: The Case of Pakistan’s Ratification of the Women’s Convention 265
- Addressing Reservations to the Women’s Convention by Muslim States: Response of the International Community 272

**Conclusion**

- International versus Islamic Schemes of Women's Human Rights: A Move Towards Convergence? 277

**Appendix I** 287
**Appendix II** 299
**Appendix III** 307
**Appendix IV** 315

**Glossary** 319
**Bibliography** 325

**Index** 349