CONTENTS

Preface xiii
Cases xvii
Prologue: A Brief History of the Ancient Juridical City of Fictionopolis 1

Part I: Context

1 Contradiction, Critique and Criminal Law 8
   1 Introduction 8
   2 Rationality and Legality 10
   3 Individual Justice 12
   4 Understanding the Contradictions 14

2 The Historical Context of Criminal Doctrine 17
   1 Introduction 17
   2 Legal Individualism and Social Individuality 18
      (i) Justice and Deterrence in the Penal Theory of the Enlightenment 18
         (a) The Reformers’ Task 18
         (b) Retributive Justice 19
         (c) Utilitarian Deterrence 20
         (d) The Need for Legality 21
      (ii) Interests and Ideology in the Reform Movement 22
         (a) Middle-Class Interests 22
         (b) Middle-Class Interests and Moral-Legal Individualism 23
         (c) Abstractions and Realities 23
         (d) The Character of Law 26
   3 Legal Individualism and Social Control 27
      (i) The Common Law and the Criminal Law 27
      (ii) Logic, ‘Policy’ and Social Class 29
   4 The Foundational Tensions of Criminal Doctrine 31
Part II: Mens Rea

3 Motive and Intention

1 Introduction

2 Motive and Intention: Desocialising Individual Life
   (i) Conflicting Motives and Common Intentions
   (ii) Hidden Motives
      (a) Individual Morality
      (b) Political Morality
      (c) Social Mores
   (iii) Conclusion: the Formal Politics of Denial

3 Being Constructive: Intention and Legal Politics
   (i) Direct and Indirect (Oblique) Intention
   (ii) The Law of Oblique Intention
      (a) Loose Talk About Foresight
      (b) Guidelines to a Jury
      (c) Moloney's Intended Practical Impact
   (iii) On Having One's Subjectivist Cake and Eating It
   (iv) Further Tensions: Dancing Between the Poles

4 Conclusion

4 Recklessness

1 Introduction

2 Subjectivism and Objectivism in the Law of Recklessness
   (i) The Judgment in Caldwell
   (ii) Contradiction Within Caldwell
   (iii) A Limitation of the Orthodox Subjectivist Approach
   (iv) A Problem with the Objectivist Approach
   (v) Conclusion: Is a Synthesis Possible?

3 Recklessness as Practical Indifference
   (i) The Concept of Practical Indifference
   (ii) Two Questions About Practical Indifference
      (a) Practical Indifference and Determinacy
      (b) Is Practical Indifference Subjective?
   (iii) The Political Limits of Practical Indifference

4 The Historical Roots of Recklessness

5 Conclusion

5 Strict and Corporate Liability

1 Introduction

2 Differentiation: Strict Liability
   (i) Introduction
(ii) The Ideological and Practical Context of the Strict Liability Offence 87
(iii) Strict Liability and 'Real' Crime 89
(iv) Conclusion 93
3 Assimilation: Corporate Liability 95
(i) Introduction 95
(ii) Conflating Individual and Corporate Fault: the Identity Doctrine 96
(iii) The Responsibility of a Social Organisation 98
(iv) Responsibility, Social Complexity and the Corporate Form 101
(a) Economic Integration and Corporate Responsibility 102
(b) Social Coordination and Corporate Punishment 102
4 Conclusion 105

Part III: Actus Reus

6 Acts and Omissions 110
1 Introduction 111
2 Acts 113
(i) Conflicting Conceptions of Voluntariness 113
(a) Physical Involuntariness Versus Moral Involuntariness 113
(b) Physical Involuntariness Versus Moral (Normative) Voluntariness 116
(ii) Limiting Involuntariness 117
(a) The Requirement of Unconsciousness 117
(b) Intoxication, Physical and Moral Voluntariness 118
(c) Denying Involuntariness in Situational Liability Cases 120
(iii) Conclusion 122
3 Omissions 122
(i) Constructing the Concept of an Omission 123
(ii) Juridifying the Concept of an Omission 126
(iii) Abstract Right and Social Need 128
(iv) Beyond Individualism? 129
4 Conclusion 133

7 Causation 136
1 Introduction 136
2 A Critical Approach to Causation 138
3 Liberal Principles for the Imputation of Causation 139
4 Analysing the Causation Cases 143
(i) The Intervention of a New Voluntary Act 144
(ii) The Intervention of an Abnormal Occurrence 146
(a) The Medical Treatment Cases 147
(b) The 'Eggshell Skull' Case 149
## Part IV: Defences

### 8 Necessity and Duress
1. Introduction 154
2. Necessity
   (i) Necessity’s Ambiguous History 156
   (ii) Judgment and Context: the Case of Dudley and Stephens 157
   (iii) Necessity as a Pandora’s Box: Some Recent Cases 161
3. Duress
   (i) Conflicting Positions in the Recent Murder Cases 164
   (ii) The Conflict Within the Basic Arguments 164
   (iii) Further Anomaly 168
4. Conclusion 169

### 9 Insanity and Diminished Responsibility
1. Introduction 172
2. Between Law and Psychiatry: The Social Control of Madness 174
3. Between Law and Psychiatry: The Legal Defences 177
   (i) Insanity 178
     (a) The Breadth of the Rules: ‘Disease of the Mind’ 178
     (b) The Narrowness of the Rules: the Two Cognitive Tests 179
   (ii) Diminished Responsibility 181
4. Law and Psychiatry in Conflict: The Politics of Law Reform 183
5. Law and Psychiatry Combined: The Decontextualisation of Madness 187
   (i) Covering up for the Law 188
   (ii) Covering up for Society 190
6. Conclusion 191

## Part V: Concluding

### 10 Sentencing
1. Introduction 196
2. Deterrence
   (i) Individual Deterrence and Its Social Context 200
   (ii) Individual versus General Deterrence 203
3. Retributivism
   (i) Introduction: ‘Just Deserts’ and Sentencing 205
   (ii) Legitimating the Allocation of Punishment 207