

THE ADMISSIBILITY OF HUMAN RIGHTS PETITIONS

THE CASE LAW OF THE EUROPEAN
COMMISSION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND
THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE

by

TOM ZWART



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 The Growing Caseload	1
1.2 Possible Ways to Deal with the Caseload	3
1.3 The Structure of the Present Study	6

CHAPTER 2 PROCEDURE

2.1 Consideration of Communications by the HRC	7
2.1.1 Introduction	7
2.1.2 An outline of the procedure	8
2.1.3 The changing role of the respective organs	10
2.1.4 Evidence and burden of proof	11
2.1.5 Interim protection	14
2.1.6 Review of the decision on admissibility	16
2.1.7 Views	19
2.2 Examination of Applications by the European Commission	23
2.2.1 Introduction	23
2.2.2 An outline of the procedure	23
2.2.3 The changing role of the respective organs	29
2.2.4 Evidence and burden of proof	31
2.2.5 Interim protection	34
2.2.6 The establishment of a single court in Strasbourg	37
2.3 Appraisal	38

CHAPTER 3 COMPETENCE RATIONE PERSONAE

3.1 Standing: Individuals, Groups and Organisations	41
3.1.1 The Optional Protocol	41
3.1.2 The Convention	45

3.2 Standing: the Victim-Requirement	50
3.2.1 Introduction	50
3.2.2 The concrete application of a law or practice	51
3.2.3 The risk of being affected by the law or practice is more than a theoretical possibility and poses an actual threat	55
3.2.4 The domestic legislation by its mere existence directly violates the petitioner's rights	56
3.2.5 The petitioner may no longer claim to be a victim	62
3.2.6 Direct and indirect victims	69
3.3 Third Party Involvement	71
3.3.1 Third party involvement under the Optional Protocol	71
3.3.2 Third party involvement in Strasbourg	78
3.4 State Responsibility	87
3.4.1 General	87
3.4.2 The HRC and State responsibility	90
3.4.3 The European institutions and State responsibility	99
3.5 Appraisal	120

CHAPTER 4 COMPETENCE RATIONE TEMPORIS

4.1 Introduction	123
4.2 Events Prior to the Entry into Force of the Treaty	123
4.3 Continuing Violation	126
4.4 The Retroactive Effect of Jurisdictional Clauses	134
4.5 Appraisal	138

CHAPTER 5 INADMISSIBILITY RELATED TO THE MERITS

5.1 Introduction	139
5.2 Incompatible <i>Ratione Materiae</i>	139
5.3 The Allegations are not Substantiated	144
5.4 No Appearance of a Violation	146
5.5 No Fourth Instance	150
5.6 Appraisal	152

CHAPTER 6 ANONYMOUS AND ABUSIVE COMPLAINTS

6.1 Anonymous Complaints	155
6.2 An Abuse of the Right of Submission	156
6.2.1 Introduction	156
6.2.2 Abuse proper	156
6.2.3 A succession of similar complaints	164
6.2.4 Time limit	169
6.3 Appraisal	170

CHAPTER 7 SIMULTANEOUS EXAMINATION UNDER ANOTHER INTERNATIONAL PROCEDURE

7.1 The HRC	173
7.1.1 Introduction	173
7.1.2 Another procedure of international investigation or settlement	174
7.1.3 The same matter	175
7.1.4 Is not being examined	177
7.2 The Commission	180
7.2.1 Introduction	180
7.2.2 A petition which is substantially the same	181
7.2.3 Another procedure of international investigation or settlement	182
7.2.4 Has already been submitted	183
7.3 Appraisal	184

CHAPTER 8 EXHAUSTION OF DOMESTIC REMEDIES

8.1 General	187
8.2 The Nature of the Remedies which have to be Exhausted	187
8.2.1 Introduction	187
8.2.2 Available remedies	188
8.2.3 Effective remedies	191
8.2.4 Sufficient remedies	198
8.2.5 Judicial and administrative remedies	203

8.3 The Way in which Remedies have to be Exhausted	205
8.3.1 General	205
8.3.2 The complaint has to be raised in substance	206
8.3.3 Doubts about the effectiveness of the remedy	210
8.3.4 Procedural mistakes	213
8.4 Special Circumstances which might Absolve the Petitioner from Exhausting the Domestic Remedies	214
8.4.1 General	214
8.4.2 The application of the remedies is unreasonably delayed	216
8.5 The Six Months Rule	219
8.5.1 Introduction	219
8.5.2 The final decision	220
8.5.3 Events other than the final decision	221
8.5.4 The six months period is set aside	224
8.5.5 Delays in the pursuit of the application	228
8.6 Appraisal	229

CHAPTER 9 CONCLUSIONS

9.1 The Results of the Research	231
9.2 The Way Forward	232
9.3 Discretionary Review: Deciding which Cases to Decide	234

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	239
---------------------------------	-----

INDEX	245
-----------------	-----