Contents

Table of Cases xix

Preface xxix

Chapter 1 • Introduction 3
  A. Constitutional History 3
    1. Atlantic Legacy 4
    2. Government in Colonial America 5
    3. Revolutionary State Governments 6
    4. The Articles of Confederation 8
    5. The Constitutional Convention 9
    6. Expounding and Ratifying the Constitution 12
  B. Approaches to Separation of Powers Analysis 14
    1. Textual 14
    2. Original Intent 15
    3. Structural/Functional 16
    4. Institutional Competence 17
    5. Historical Practice 17
    6. Values 17
  C. The Ambiguities of Executive Power: Competing Theories of the
     Presidency 18
    1. Washington 19
    2. Jefferson 21
    3. Jackson 22
    4. Buchanan 23
    5. Lincoln 24
    6. Wilson on the Post-Civil War Presidency 25
    7. Theodore Roosevelt and Taft 25
    8. Franklin Roosevelt 27
    9. Truman through Carter 28
   11. Clinton 30
   12. George W. Bush 30
   13. Obama 31
   14. Trump 31
D. An Institutional Overview
   1. Congress 33
   2. The Executive 35
   3. The Judiciary 40

Chapter 2 · Framework: The Separation and Confluence of Powers

A. Analytic Framework: The Rule of Law and the Realm of Politics 43
   1. The Executive and the Judiciary 43
      *Marbury v. Madison* 46
      Note on Obtaining Judicial Review of Executive Actions 56
   2. The Executive and Congress (as Mediated by the Courts) 60
      Introductory Note on Executive Orders 64
      *United States v. Midwest Oil Co.* 65
      *Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v. Sawyer* 73
      Note on Private Enforcement of Executive Orders 95
   3. Congress and the Judiciary: Statutory Control of Federal Jurisdiction 97
      *Ex Parte McC Cardle* 100
      *United States v. Klein* 102
   4. Judicial Self-Restraint 107

B. Combining Powers in the Executive 115
   1. Delegation of Legislative Powers 116
      Note: Finding an “Intelligible Principle” in Vague Statutory Text 126
   2. Allocating Adjudicative Power Outside the Judiciary 131

C. Fundamental Checks and Balances 139
   1. Veto Powers 140
      a. The President’s Veto 140
         *Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies On Presidential Signing Statements* 151
      b. Pocket Vetoes 153
      c. “Legislative Vetoes” 157
         *Immigration and Naturalization Service v. Chadha* 159
   2. Congress’s “Power of the Purse” 178
      a. Overview of Budget and Spending Processes 178
      b. Congressional Control of Spending 184
         *Brown v. Califano* 188
      c. Executive Control of Spending 193
         *Lincoln v. Vigil* 195
         Note on Impoundment of Funds 197
      d. The Item Veto 202
         *Clinton v. City of New York* 202
   3. Amending the Constitution 215
      *Coleman v. Miller* 217
Chapter 3 • Autonomy and Mutual Accountability among the Branches

A. Congressional Power over the Membership of the Branches

1. Impeachment
   a. "High Crimes and Misdemeanors"
      Constitutional Grounds for Presidential Impeachment
      Impeachment of Richard M. Nixon, President of the United States
      Trial Memorandum of the United States House of Representatives
      Answer of President William Jefferson Clinton to the Articles of Impeachment
   b. A Judicial Role?
      *Nixon v. United States*

2. Membership in Congress
   a. Exclusion and Expulsion
      *Powell v. McCormack*
   b. Term Limits

B. Immunities of Government Officers

1. Congressional Immunity
   *Gravel v. United States*

2. Immunities of Executive Officers from Civil Liability
   a. The President
      *Nixon v. Fitzgerald*
      *Clinton v. Jones*
   b. Other Executive Officers
      *Harlow & Butterfield v. Fitzgerald*
      *Mitchell v. Forsyth*

3. Judicial Immunities

C. Information and Accountability

1. Confidentiality in Congress and the Judiciary

2. Executive Privilege
   a. Courts v. The Executive
      *United States v. Nixon*
      The State Secrets Privilege
      *Mohamed v. Jeppesen Dataplan, Inc.*
   b. Congress v. The Executive
      1.) Executive Branch Procedure for Invoking Executive Privilege
         Memorandum for the Heads of Executive Departments and Agencies
      2.) A Constitutional Requirement of Compromise?
      3.) Litigating Executive Responses to Congressional Subpoenas
Committee on the Judiciary, U.S. House of Representatives v. Miers 361

D. Congressional Power to Regulate Accountability 385
1. Regulating the Executive 385
   a. Control of Presidential Documents 385
      Nixon v. Administrator of General Services 385
   b. The Administrative Procedure Act 392
   c. Freedom of Information Act 400
      Kissinger v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press 400
   d. Federal Advisory Committee Act 405
      Ass'n of American Physicians and Surgeons v. Clinton 407
   e. Other Statutory Restrictions 422
   f. Subjecting Presidential Advisers to Advice and Consent 423
      The Foreign Emoluments Clause 429

2. Regulating the Judiciary 431
   Mistretta v. United States 431

3. Congressional Self-Regulation 437

Chapter 4 • Control of Administration by the Elected Branches 443
A. Personnel 443
1. The Appointments Clause 443
   Buckley v. Valeo 443
2. Alternatives to the Appointments Clause 454
   National Labor Relations Bd. v. Noel Canning 457
3. Appointment of Judges 469
   a. Appointments to the Supreme Court 470
      Note on Supreme Court Appointments 470
      The Coming Crisis in Recovery and What Can Be Done About It 477
      Reorganization of the Federal Judiciary 480
   b. Appointments to the Courts of Appeals and District Courts 482
   c. Recess Appointments of Judges 484
4. Removals (Herein of Independent Agencies) 488
   a. Separation of Powers 488
      Myers v. United States 490
      Humphrey's Executor v. United States 499
      Bowsher v. Synar 505
B. Modern Syntheses of Appointment and Removal Powers 518
   Morrison v. Olson 518
   Free Enterprise Fund v. Public Company Accounting Oversight Board 541
C. Supervision and Coordination of Policymaking 564
1. The President’s Power to Manage Administration  564
   a. Formative Years: Groping for Principles  564
   The Jewels of the Princess of Orange  565
   b. The President’s Statutory Powers to Manage the
      Executive Branch  571
   c. Participation in Administrative Rulemaking  572
      *Sierra Club v. Costle*  572
   d. Coordinating the Regulatory Process  582
      Regulatory Organization  584
      Memorandum for Honorable David Stockman, Director,
      Office of Management and Budget  592
      Note: Post-Reagan Presidential Regulatory Oversight  596
2. Congressional Oversight  599
3. A Unitary or Plural Executive? The Special Status of the
   Independent Agencies Revisited  604
D. The Faithful Execution of the Laws  611
1. Faithful Execution: Duty or Authority?  611
2. Faithful Nonexecution?  614
   a. Unconstitutional Statutes  615
      Presidential Authority to Decline to Execute
      Unconstitutional Statutes  617
   b. Nonexecution and Administrative Discretion  620
      Faithful Nonexecution  620
      Case Study: Obama Administration Deferred Action
      Policies for Undocumented Immigrants  635
      The Department of Homeland Security’s Authority to
      Prioritize Removal of Certain Aliens Unlawfully Present
      in the United States and to Defer Removal of Others  638
   c. Prosecutorial Discretion and Criminal Law Enforcement  664
      Prosecution for Contempt of Congress of an Executive Branch
      Official Who Has Asserted a Claim of Executive Privilege  664
3. Faithful Execution and the Courts  677
   a. A Duty to Defend Congress?  677
      Representation of Congress and Congressional Interests
      in Court  678
      Letter from Attorney General Eric H. Holder to Congress
      on Litigation Involving the Defense of Marriage Act  681
      Note: *Raines v. Byrd* and Congressional Standing  687
   b. The Conduct of Civil Litigation  690
   c. Obedience to Judgments  695
4. Pardons and Reprieves  698

Chapter 5  ·  Foreign Policy and National Security  709
A. Analytic Framework: Sorting the Elected Branches’ Claims to Power  710
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Letters of Pacificus, No. I (A. Hamilton)</td>
<td>711</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: The History of Foreign Affairs and National Security Powers</td>
<td>717</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States v. Curtiss-Wright Corp.</td>
<td>723</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: The Logan Act and the Federal Government's Monopoly in Foreign Policy</td>
<td>732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown Sheet &amp; Tube Co. v. Sawyer</td>
<td>734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zivotofsky v. Kerry</td>
<td>735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: Statutory Interpretation in the Context of the President's Foreign Policy and National Security Powers</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Executive Claims to Inherent and Exclusive Powers</td>
<td>748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The President's Power of Recognition and Role as &quot;Sole Organ&quot; of Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill to Relocate United States Embassy from Tel Aviv to Jerusalem</td>
<td>749</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutionality of Section 7054 of the Fiscal Year 2009 Foreign Appropriations Act</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Treaty Processes</td>
<td>758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Overview of Treaty Powers</td>
<td>758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Presidential Treaty Implementation</td>
<td>766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medellín v. Texas</td>
<td>766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Presidential Treaty Termination</td>
<td>779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goldwater v. Carter</td>
<td>779</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Executive Agreements</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: International Non-Treaty Agreements</td>
<td>785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memorandum Opinion for the United States Trade Representative: Whether Uruguay Round Agreements Required Ratification as a Treaty</td>
<td>786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States v. Pink</td>
<td>794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dames &amp; Moore v. Regan</td>
<td>803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: The Iran Nuclear Agreement of 2015</td>
<td>820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Control of Sensitive Information</td>
<td>823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York Times Co. v. United States</td>
<td>825</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: Applying New York Times After September 11</td>
<td>838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note on Classification and Protection of Government Documents</td>
<td>840</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Power to Conduct Investigations (Herein, of Foreign Intelligence Surveillance)</td>
<td>845</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Electronic Surveillance, Executive Power, and the Fourth Amendment Prior to FISA</td>
<td>845</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 1977</td>
<td>846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States v. United States District Court (Keith)</td>
<td>848</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, 1978–2001</td>
<td>856</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Congress's Role in Regulating Foreign Policy</td>
<td>864</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

1. Direct Regulation of Foreign Affairs and National Security Policy 864
   a. Presidential and Congressional Oversight of CIA and
      FBI Intelligence Gathering 864
      Samuel J. Rascoff, Domesticating Intelligence 872
   b. The Iran-Contra Affair 885
   c. Iran-Contra and Congressional Oversight of
      Covert Operations 893
      Title 50, Chapter One — National Security Subchapter III —
      Accountability for Intelligence Activities 894
2. Foreign Policy and Foreign Commerce 904
   b. Trade Expansion Act 906
      Independent Gasoline Marketers Council v. Duncan 906
3. Immigration and Foreign Policy 911
   United States ex rel. Knauff v. Shaughnessy 912
   Note: The Trump Executive Orders on Immigration 916
4. Regulatory Programs Affecting Foreign Policy 925
   Westinghouse Electric Corp. v. U.S. Nuclear Regulatory
   Commission 925
D. Judicial Review and Foreign Policy 932
   Haig v. Agee 934

Chapter 6 • War Powers 951
A. Power to Commit Troops — From the Founding to Vietnam 953
   1. Scope of the Commander in Chief Clause: Early Views 953
      The Federalist, No. 69 (Hamilton) 953
      Little v. Barreme 954
      The Prize Cases 956
      Note: The 2001 Authorization to Use Military Force 966
   2. The Vietnam Watershed 966
      a. Debating Executive Claims to Power 967
         Meeker, The Legality of United States Participation in
         the Defense of Viet-Nam 967
         National Commitments 973
         Notes and Questions on Vietnam 989
      b. Congress’s Efforts to Limit the President’s Authority to
         Commit Troops: The War Powers Resolution 992
         War Powers Resolution 992
         President Nixon’s Veto of the War Powers Resolution 995
         War Powers: A Test of Compliance — Relative to the Danang
         Sealift, the Evacuation of Phnom Penh, the Evacuation
         of Saigon, and the Mayaguez Incident 998
         Explanation by Senator Jacob Javits of the Conference Report 999
         Questions on the War Powers Resolution 999
CONTENTS

Note: Covert Warmaking and the Neutrality Act 1002
Note: War Powers and Impeachment 1003

B. Unilateral Presidential Initiative After the War Powers Resolution 1006

1. Presidential War-making in the Post-Vietnam Era 1006
   a. Rescuing Americans 1009
      President Carter's Report to Speaker O'Neill Concerning the Abortive Rescue Attempt in Iran 1009
      Legal Opinion by Lloyd Cutler, President's Counsel, on War Powers Consultation Relative to the Iran Rescue Mission (May 9, 1980) 1011
   b. Stabilizing Other Governments in Furtherance of American Foreign Policy 1012
   c. Retaliation for Attacks on United States Persons 1016
   d. Protecting U.S. Persons and Property 1016
   e. Humanitarian Intervention 1018
   f. Antiterrorism Operations 1019
   g. International Peacekeeping 1020
      Memorandum for the Attorney General Re: Authorization for Continuing Hostilities in Kosovo 1025
      Case Study: The Libya No-Fly Zone 1033
      Authority to Use Military Force in Libya 1033
      Harold Hongju Koh, U.S. Department of State, Washington, D.C. 1042

2. Judicial Review of Presidential War-Making 1047
   Mora v. McNamara 1047
   Campbell v. Clinton 1051

3. Reform of the War Powers Resolution 1069
   Robert F. Grimmett, The War Powers Resolution: After Thirty-Six Years 1069

C. Congressionally Authorized Wars After Vietnam: The Persian Gulf and Iraq Wars 1077

1. The Persian Gulf War: A New Watershed? 1077
   a. Managing the Crisis Under Presidential Authority Alone 1077
      Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on the Deployment of United States Armed Forces to Saudi Arabia and the Middle East 1077
      Letter to the Speaker of the House and the President Pro Tempore of the Senate on Additional Economic Measures Taken with Respect to Iraq and Kuwait 1078
   b. The United Nations Authorizes Force 1080
      United Nations Security Council Resolution 678 1080
      Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq Resolution 1082
CONTENTS

Statement on Signing the Resolution Authorizing the Use of Military Force Against Iraq 1083
2. The Iraq Invasion of 2003 1085
   a. From the Persian Gulf War to the 2003 Invasion 1087
   b. Constitutional War Powers and International Law 1091
      David Ackerman, International Law and the Preemptive Use of Force Against Iraq 1091
      Mary Ellen O’Connell, UN Resolution 1441: Compelling Saddam, Restraining Bush 1092
   c. The Necessity and Scope of Congressional Authorization 1096
      Authorization for Use of Military Force Against Iraq Resolution of 2002 1096
      Doe v. Bush 1101
   d. Interbranch Accountability for Preemptive War-Making and the Separation of Powers 1110
      Note: Congressional Authority to Regulate How the President Makes War 1118
      Scholars’ Letter to Congressional Leaders on the Proposed Iraq Troop Surge 1119
D. Presidential Wartime Powers Off the Battlefield 1123
   1. Civil Liberties 1123
      Ex Parte Milligan 1125
      Korematsu v. United States 1132
      Notes and Questions on Japanese Internment and Its Aftermath 1147
   2. Mobilization and Regulation of the Economy 1151
      Note: Presidential Economic Controls During World War II 1151
      Powers of the President under the War Labor Disputes Act to Seize Properties Affected by Strikes 1155
Chapter 7 • The “Long War” and the Separation of Powers 1159
A. Wartime Powers During the “War” on Terror 1160
   1. The Treatment of Enemy Combatants 1160
      Stephen J. Shapiro, et al., Report of the Bar of the City of New York 1161
      Notice, Detention Treatment, and Trial of Certain Non-Citizens in the War Against Terrorism 1161
      Hamdi v. Rumsfeld 1168
      Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush’s Lawyers in the War on Terror 1195
      Hamdan v. Rumsfeld 1204
      Boumediene v. Bush 1221
      Notes and Questions on the Guantanamo Detainee Cases 1237
      Note: Government Lawyering, September 11 and the Iraq War 1250
CONTENTS

Harold H. Bruff, Bad Advice: Bush's Lawyers in the War on Terror 1252

2. Targeted Killing 1274

  Al-Aulaqi v. Obama 1276


B. Congressional War-Making Authority and the "Long War" 1303


Note: Competing Proposals for an AUMF Regarding the Islamic State 1311

Obama Administration Proposed AUMF Against ISIL (2015) 1312

Consolidated Authorization for Use of Military Force Resolution of 2017 1314

C. Foreign Intelligence Surveillance After 9/11 1318

1. FISA After September 11 and the Wall of Separation Problem 1318


  a. Targeted Surveillance of Telephone and Internet Communications 1325

  b. Telephone Metadata 1327

  c. Internet Metadata 1328

3. The FISC and Congressional Responses: The 702 Programs 1328

4. The Administration's Legal Defense for Ignoring FISA 1332

Unclassified Report on the President's Surveillance Program 1332

Letter from William E. Moschella, Assistant Attorney General in charge of the Office of Legislative Affairs, U.S. Department of Justice, to Hon. Pat Roberts, Chairman, Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, et al. 1335

January 9, 2006 Letter from Scholars and Former Government Officials to Congressional Leadership in Response to Justice Department Letter of December 22, 2005 1338

5. Evaluating the Justice Department as Legal Advisor 1344

6. Litigation and Accountability 1347

  Clapper v. Amnesty International USA 1348

Chapter 8 • Power and Institutional Design: The Case of the Presidency 1369

A. Presidential Elections 1370

  1. The Role of States in Presidential Selection 1370

    a. The Mechanics of the Electoral College: A Primer 1370

      1. The Constitutional Basics 1370

      2. The Statutory Framework 1371
3. The Nature of the Elector's Office 1372
   b. The Merits of the Electoral College: A Debate 1373
      Direct Popular Election of the President and Vice President of the United States 1373
      J. A. Best, Prepared Statement on “The Case for the Electoral College” 1382

   Peter M. Shane, Disappearing Democracy: How Bush v. Gore Undermined the Federal Right to Vote for Presidential Electors 1392
   Bush v. Palm Beach County Canvassing Board 1398
   Bush v. Gore [I] 1404
   Bush v. Gore (II) 1407

B. Presidential and Vice-Presidential Succession 1445
   R. Celada, Presidential Continuity and Vice Presidential Vacancy Amendment 1446
   Note: Reagan-Bush Temporary Power Transfer 1451

C. Redesigning the President’s Political Role 1452
   1. Diagnosis One: Presidents Can Accomplish Too Little 1453
      Lloyd N. Cutler, To Form a Government 1453
   2. Diagnosis Two: “The Most Dangerous Branch” 1457
      Sanford Levinson and Jack M. Balkin, Constitutional Dictatorship: Its Dangers and Its Design 1458
   3. Diagnosis 3: The Patient Is Healthy 1464
   4. Diagnosis 4: Something Is Rotten . . . and Not in Denmark 1464
   5. A Model Redraft of Article II 1465
      Garrett Epps, The Ill-Made Prince: A Modest Proposal for a New Article II 1465

Appendix 1473
   Constitution of the United States 1473
   Authorization for the Use of Force (2001) 1489
   Proclamation of January 1, 1863 (Emancipation Proclamation) 1490
   Exec. Order No. 12866, Regulatory Planning and Review 1491

Index 1505